



OXFORD JOURNALS
OXFORD UNIVERSITY PRESS

Review

Author(s): Madeau Stewart

Review by: Madeau Stewart

Source: *Early Music*, Vol. 11, No. 4, Rameau Tercentenary Issue (Oct., 1983), pp. 537+539+541

Published by: [Oxford University Press](#)

Stable URL: <http://www.jstor.org/stable/3137888>

Accessed: 09-03-2015 10:06 UTC

Your use of the JSTOR archive indicates your acceptance of the Terms & Conditions of Use, available at <http://www.jstor.org/page/info/about/policies/terms.jsp>

JSTOR is a not-for-profit service that helps scholars, researchers, and students discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content in a trusted digital archive. We use information technology and tools to increase productivity and facilitate new forms of scholarship. For more information about JSTOR, please contact support@jstor.org.



Oxford University Press is collaborating with JSTOR to digitize, preserve and extend access to *Early Music*.

<http://www.jstor.org>

ing of correct standards and traditions in performance, and some pungent criticism of various London productions. Dean writes that 'the greatest of them—they are of course unequal in merit, like the works of any artist—are among the supreme masterpieces of opera' and adds, in his last paragraph, that the greatest amount to 'perhaps ten or a dozen'.

In 'Purcellian passages in the compositions of G. F. Handel', Franklin Zimmerman explores a wide range of what he calls 'borrowings of scene, mood, atmosphere or affect'—that is, the spirit of a passage rather than the musical notes. For 'The intellectual contexts of Handel's oratorios', Ruth Smith has delved deep into the 'raw material' of his librettos and 'the literary, religious and political commonplaces of the mid-eighteenth century'—these being the 'contexts'. This essay displays formidable erudition fortified by huge clusters of references to contemporary literature. A penetrating essay by Anthony Hicks, 'The late additions to Handel's oratorios and the role of the younger Smith', examines these pieces of 1753–9 written after Handel's blindness. He shows how Smith's role in providing such additions from adaptations of Handel's earlier music may have been 'more creative than has hitherto been generally recognised'. The younger Smith is central to another important essay, 'Handel's successor: notes on John Christopher Smith the younger' by Alfred Mann, written with particular emphasis on his roles as oratorio conductor and as royal Music Master.

And so to Haydn, with a notable contribution by Nicholas Temperley, 'New light on the libretto of *The Creation*', another masterly study of textual transmission. From a complex examination of early editions of the music, the rival London librettos issued by Ashley and by Salomon, and other evidence, he shows convincingly that the English text as printed in the first edition of the full score is, despite its shortcomings, preferable to any other, German or English, for performances

in the English-speaking world'.

The rest of the book relates to Cudworth himself. Jan LaRue provides a short essay on 'The English symphony: some additions and annotations to Charles Cudworth's published studies', by way of an introduction to a rearranged, expanded version of Cudworth's 'Thematic index', first printed in 1953. With LaRue's additions the new index occupies 24 pages following the essay. The final item is 'A bibliography of the writings of Charles Cudworth', compiled by Richard Andrewes—a notable labour of love, classified in 15 groups. Even with the exclusion of a large quantity of short record reviews, sleeve notes, book reviews and programme notes, Cudworth's was an enormous output, of well over 350 items spanning some 40 years. Besides plays and librettos, there are articles in many musical journals and works of reference on a wide variety of topics and composers, the two largest categories of composer being those born between 1670 and 1720 and between 1720 and 1770. The range of titles in Andrewes's ingenious classification shows that Cudworth was a man of many parts, with a fertile, imaginative mind, a lively critic and a writer with an endearing sense of humour. Even if he had written nothing else, that marvellously entitled article 'The Old Spuriousity Shoppe or Put it in the Anhang' would be enough to guarantee him a place in any future dictionary of English quotations.

Cudworth's personal qualities are described in the sympathetic, generous tribute that Stanley Sadie has written as an introduction to this book. I should like to supplement one point in its penultimate paragraph, where Sadie rightly remarks that 'in the community of music librarians [Cudworth] was always an outstandingly popular figure'. This does rather less than justice to his professional authority and achievement. At the conferences of the International Association of Music Libraries, from 1951 onwards, he brought a strong, refreshing voice of realism into its often cloudy deliberations. When

the UK branch was founded in 1953, its tentative beginnings and subsequent growth owed much to Cudworth's enthusiasm and expertise. These qualities were put to good use in 1959 when IAML and the Galpin Society combined to hold a conference in Cambridge, where the Senate House was the scene of a memorable exhibition of instruments and music. Its successful mounting was due in no small measure to Cudworth's drive and practicality.

This excellently printed volume should enjoy a wide and prolonged readership. It is a pity that the illustrations do not include a photograph of Charles Cudworth which would convey to those who did not know him some idea of the strong, sensitive features of a very remarkable man.

ALEC HYATT KING

Leonardo da Vinci as a Musician

EMANUEL WINTERNITZ

Yale University Press, New Haven and London, 1982, £20

After his death in 1519, Leonardo da Vinci's manuscripts were at first regarded as unimportant. Then, as their value became recognized, they were split up, dispersed, shifted from country to country, confiscated and finally vandalized and mutilated; much was lost for ever, including the vast majority of engineering drawings. The Madrid Codices, which yielded new material on musical instruments, lay undiscovered until 1965 (not 1967, as often stated). As a result of these staggering examples of human indifference, rapacity and lack of conservation, the chronology of what has survived is hopelessly muddled. This partly explains why no major work dealing exclusively with the musical aspect of Leonardo's life and drawings should have been published until now. Moreover, just as no one would study Leonardo's aeronautical drawings to prepare a survey of aviation in his time, so the musical matter reveals little about instruments and practices of the period. The interest lies almost entirely in seeing the present outlined or sketched 300 and more years ago.

In his experiments with a hammer and piles of dust, Leonardo noted the geometric patterns formed and in this anticipated the Chladni *Klangfiguren*. Keyed pipes are foreseen, as is a form of chromatic drum not known in art music until the end of the 19th century. Some sketches show a method by which multiple tuned drums could be played in harmony by one person, and there are also complex drawings of mechanical keyboard bowing instruments, similar to the *Geigen Clavicymbel*. It is believed that Leonardo deliberately introduced errors into his drawings as a way of preventing others from making instruments from them; there is no evidence that he built any himself. The tragedy is that there could be no continuity in the development of his theories or machines, all of which had to be reinvented.

Professor Winternitz has been studying Leonardo as a musician for two decades or more, and several chapters in this book are adapted from articles that appeared as long ago as 1964. The book, which is divided into three parts, presents most of what little is known about Leonardo's musical friends, activities, inventions and writings, and it is surprising to find how sporadic any reliable documentation is. This leads Winternitz to introduce a degree of speculation which, though tantalizing, is also troubling.

Gaffurius, the prolific writer of musical treatises, died three years after Leonardo (not six as the author states; and if the *Trilogia Gaffuriana* was published in 1518, this was before, not after, Leonardo's death in May of the following year). Both were living in Milan when Gaffurius's *Practica musicae* was published in 1496, and some historians believe Leonardo produced the woodcuts for the treatise. Winternitz does not mention this, but does suggest (p.6) that Gaffurius 'must have been of great interest to Leonardo' and that Leonardo 'may also have been curious to acquaint himself' with the theories of Gaffurius, who 'could not have failed to be impressed by Leonardo's mastery of improvisation on the

lira da braccio'.


In writing about the instrument maker Gusnasco, Winternitz says that 'in all probability' he made *lira da braccio* and must also 'have been of great interest to Leonardo' (p.18). Of a *spinettina* made for the Duchess of Urbina in 1540 (illustrated here in some detail), the author suggests that it is not 'farfetched' to credit Gusnasco or his artistic tradition with the instrument. But Gusnasco died before 1539, and his style of artistic tradition was certainly common to more than one workshop.

Winternitz has established that during the Renaissance the term 'lira' identified the 'most subtle, bowed instrument ever known', one capable of playing polyphony, and possessing an 'unearthly sound': the *lira da braccio*. It was this instrument that Leonardo played to accompany his own singing. This form of *lira* has five or more melody strings and, running free of the fingerboard from a jutting peg in the headpiece to the tailpiece, two others 'often mistakenly called "drones" or "bourdons"' (p.25). But according to other sources the *lira* was a harmonic instrument and the free strings were indeed drones.

Chapter 5 investigates 'The Mystery of the Skull Lyre', which Winternitz believes was a *lira*, made partly of silver and 'fashioned in the shape of the front of a horse skull from the noble brow to the soft nostrils . . . It is hard to resist the assumption that [it] was taken [to Milan] to remind his patron of how familiar he was with horse anatomy' (p.44). No drawings of the instrument survive.

The third part of the book covers Leonardo's studies of nature—and of water in particular—and its relation to the behaviour of sound. He examined decay, volume, pitch and echo, using among other devices firearms and calculations based on gun-barrel lengths (not the 'length' of a gun). The book closes with a valuable section giving texts and translations of Leonardo's writings connected with music, together with a commentary on them.

It is unfortunate that a book of this



Theatrum
INSTRUMENTORUM

**RENAISSANCE
RECORDERS
AFTER
PRAETORIUS
AND VIRDUNG**

**ALSO FLUTES
CORNAMUSE
AND SORDUNS**

Brochures from
CARL D. HANSON
23 The Crescent,
Hipperholme, Halifax,
West Yorkshire HX3 8NQ,
England
or
JOHN COUSEN
393 Bradford Road,
Huddersfield,
West Yorkshire, England

**Early
Keyboard
Agency**

Harpsichords, Spinets,
Clavichords, Virginals,
supplied in excellent order

Quality instruments required
for prospective purchasers

English Spinets after
John Kirshaw
craftsman-built to order

Reconditioning
Tuning—Maintenance to
highest standards

Covered Strings—
soundboards

Martin Robertson
43 Kennett Road
Headington, OXFORD
Telephone—0865-65989

importance—and cost—should be flawed by excessive speculation and some questionable dates, as well as by confusion in the reproduction and numbering of the illustrations and an unreliable index. The sketches on p.189 are reproduced upside down, that on p.152 sideways. On p.183 both the footnote and the illustration numbers are wrong, while on pp.69 and 71 the sets of illustrations have become reversed, making nonsense of the text and leading to bafflement if the list of illustrations is consulted. The 'e' missing from the end of 'scrape' (whoever heard of a scrap pot?) is one of the finer misprints. Confidence in many statements and observations are sapped by this form of carelessness, and this sadly lessens our enjoyment in reading for the first time about Leonardo as a Musician.

MADEAU STEWART

The Harpsichord: A Dialogue for Beginners

FERNANDO VALENTI

Jerona Music Corporation, Hackensack, NJ, 1982, \$10.50

The huge expansion of the repertory available to the harpsichordist in recent years has been mirrored by a lesser though corresponding growth in the number of manuals intended for the beginner on the instrument. The range of help offered to the newcomer has varied from the step-by-step approach, in which each stage is painstakingly explained, to the more recent *laissez-faire* attitude where the player is given pieces with original fingering and left to find his own salvation. To these must be added the facsimiles and modern editions of a number of pedagogical works, all of them vital to our understanding of contemporary performing practice, though not always as explicit as either expert or novice might wish.

Fernando Valenti's recent addition to the literature is nothing if not explicit. Aimed at the competent pianist who is about to tackle the harpsichord, Mr Valenti's tutor favours patient explanation of each stage, erring on the side of overkill in his advice to the performer

and leaving nothing to the imagination. In the manner of Morley's *Plaine and easie Introduction*, the reader is presented with a number of question and answer sessions. One wonders, however, what Morley's Master would have made of a Philomathes whose response to the question 'are you relaxed?' is 'Relaxed? I am *narcomatous!*'. The boot is firmly on the other foot later when we are informed authoritatively that *peau de buffle* is pronounced 'Po de Boof' (this is just one of the many occasions when I would happily second the pupil's outburst of 'I am less than enraptured by your pedagogical attitude').

But apart from such infelicities, and a text that often recalls the idiom of *Dallas*, there is much sound sense between the covers of this book. It is based on (undoubtedly highly effective) methods of master-class tuition, yet the literal transfer to the printed page, though frequently hilarious, is not unrealistic. The questions are devised with insight and sympathy for the needs of the learner, and are on balance answered in a commendably straightforward fashion. Occasionally a sensible description is scuttled by a desire to provide an effective catch-phrase: the perfectly reasonable discussion of volume and dynamics in chapter 6 can only suffer from the embracing epithet 'dynamics by illusion'. Scholars may also baulk at the slightly cavalier approach to double dotting where 'general agreement' is invoked as the principal justification for the practice. Similarly, the author's role as evangelist leads him to an exaggeratedly black view of modern prejudice: there cannot be many who still view ornaments as 'esoteric, patience grinding gew-gaws'.

Elsewhere there are subjects that might more sensibly have been dealt with by recourse to diagrams, for instance the explanation of jacks and action in chapter 2. The pitch of the argument and the fact that most of the examples come from François Couperin, J. S. Bach and Domenico Scarlatti tend to exclude the genuine keyboard beginner. This is a pity since the judgements, largely based on attentive study of

authentic performance practice, are helpful in stripping away many a misconception concerning harpsichord technique and would be of assistance at an elementary stage. This aside, proficient pianists will find the *Dialogue* useful during the uneasy transition from one keyboard instrument to another. Where live tuition is not available the aspiring harpsichordist could do worse than invest in Mr Valenti's tutor, fasten his seat-belt and 'Have a nice play!'.

JAN SMACZNY

EARLY MUSIC 1983

New subscribers to the Journal can still take out a subscription to this year's issues at half price, i.e.

£9 (UK), \$20 (USA),
£11 (elsewhere).



FOR SALE: *Anonymous Italian Harpsichord*

Late 17th Century,
2 x 8', 1 x 4'

Unrestored, in outer case.
Workmanship is quite fine.
4' appears original
Beautiful outer case gessoed
with découpage.

Send \$30.00 for colour pictures,
x-ray of instrument, and
detailed description.

**JEROME PRAGER
HARPSICHORD MAKER
2611 Woodstock Road
Los Angeles, California 90046
(213) 656-1888**