Review: Renaissance Man
Author(s): James Chater
Review by: James Chater
Published by: Musical Times Publications Ltd.
Stable URL: http://www.jstor.org/stable/961703
Accessed: 09-03-2015 10:06 UTC

Your use of the JSTOR archive indicates your acceptance of the Terms & Conditions of Use, available at http://www.jstor.org/page/info/about/policies/terms.jsp

JSTOR is a not-for-profit service that helps scholars, researchers, and students discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content in a trusted digital archive. We use information technology and tools to increase productivity and facilitate new forms of scholarship. For more information about JSTOR, please contact support@jstor.org.
with dabs of true colour visible here and there and a good many fresh blurs. The translation seems clear and faithful, but the language has a hint of the smug and the pretentious that does not come over too well in English.

*  

A brief note on some other recent Mozart literature. Robbins Landon's Mozart and the Masons is a short book, generously illustrated, based on a recent lecture. It looks carefully into Mozart's connections with freemasonry and particularly thoroughly at an anonymous picture of a meeting of a Viennese lodge (it was partly reproduced in the March 1983 MT, p.154). Landon persuasively suggests that Deutsch's ironic 'identification' of Mozart in that picture, in the right foreground, is, in fact correct; he also identifies several others present, including C.L. Giesecke and members of the Este family, and dates the picture to early 1790.

Of the three opera books, the Cambridge volume has the most to offer. Edward Foreman contributes a useful essay on the story before Da Ponte, Bernard Williams a perceptive one on the Don Giovanni idea; the remainder, by Julian Rushton, includes a detailed synopsis (rather inconsistent in layout), a valuable discussion of the libretto, an essay on its stage history (somewhat superficial, and insular, on the 20th century), a substantial, closely argued though not indisputable analytical discussion of the music, and a small anthology (I found it of little interest) of writings on the opera. There are things to disagree with, but plenty to stimulate. Neither Rushton nor David Wyn Jones, who contributes an essay to the Opera Guide, seems to realize that Mozart at first expected to write the opera in four acts. The material in the latter volume, in spite of a sensible article by Michael Robin- son on the comic element, is more slender, and not distinguished; while the translation by Norman Platt and Laura Sarti printed here has, as I have indicated in these columns before, serious deficiencies in meaning and accentuation. There is an article here on Da Ponte; the Figaro volume includes one on Beaumarchais. Here again, however, the musical discussions have little to offer. The translation is Dent's. It seems a shame that a disinguishing to include a note on the order of events in Act 3, arguing in favour of the Mobley-Raeburn reordering but ending with two lines referring to Alan Tyson's MT article (July 1981) on the subject without saying that his evidence effectively quashes the Mobley-Raeburn theory; still odder to cite in the bibliography for 'readers interested in the autograph score' an article on a copy of Mozart's later revisions but not the Köhler Mozart-Jahrbuch 1967 article or Tyson's, the only studies dealing with the autograph itself.

STANLEY SADIE

European Music Year 1985 has been launched at the Giorgio Cini Foundation, Venice. Objectives include making known the works of living composers and improving musical education and training as well as the social situations of musicians, whether composers, performers or teachers.

Magister Dufay

Dufay by David Fallows (Master Musicians) J. M. Dent (London, 1982); 321pp.; £9.95

David Fallows's book on Guillaume Dufay has all the old-fashioned virtues: it begins with a fairly straightforward account of the composer's life and continues with an intelligent survey of the works. It is well written, well documented and well thought out. Its novelties come in the new hypotheses Fallows tries out in the course of bringing together everything that has been written about Dufay until now. Thus he makes much of Dufay's presumed presence at the Council of Constance, a possibility no one before has suggested so seriously or explored so fully. It was in Constance, Fallows would have us believe, that Dufay had his first encounter with English music, and also with his future employers in Italy, the Malatesta of Rimini. And the most interesting and novel chapter on Dufay's music re-examines various mass cycles and other mass music that might or might not be by the composer. Fallows suggests that Dufay's Saint Anthony Mass is actually for Saint Anthony of Padua rather than Saint Anthony Abbot, as we have previously supposed, and uses that hypothesis to lead him into a discussion of various other mass cycles and mass music, some in the Trent Codices and some in other MSS, that might or might not be by Dufay. His conclusions are sensibly tentative but, quite unusually in a book of this sort, he offers stimulating suggestions for further research, and asks good questions that might well yield answers which will bring us further towards understanding Dufay's music, or at the very least that of his contemporaries.

Fallow's is arguably better when he writes on Dufay's life than when he writes on Dufay's music. If he has a slight tendency to believe his own hypotheses more easily than those of other people, that is, perhaps, only human, and it is a quality that at least makes his account of the composer fresh and provocative. When he comes to the music, the fact that the book appears in the Master Musicians series may weigh too heavily on the author, who slightly over-explains some musical matters, presumably on the grounds—possibly sensible—that a general audience cannot be expected to understand what are, after all, not very technical terms; and Fallows does not always seem convincing when he tries to relate two pieces by means of snippets of conventional melodic material which they have in common.

I do not mean to suggest, however, that Fallows is anything but intelligent and stimulating when he writes of Dufay's music. The mixture of analysis, opinion, historical fact and hypothesis that informs his comments on particular pieces very often comes squarely on target. Even if every reader will disagree about one or another of his insights, it is clear that Fallows writes with conviction and from a detailed and committed knowledge of the scores, virtues that ought not to be undervalued.

Not the least helpful part of the book are the three appendices, containing a very full and detailed calendar of events, both in Dufay's own life and in the greater world; a classified list of his works, which every student of Dufay will constantly consult (and doubtless annotate); and finally a catalogue of the more important persons mentioned in the text, with useful thumbnail sketches of their careers and contributions. Of course, the most important thing about the book is that it appeared at all in the Master Musicians series, for its publication marks a new stage in the long process of 'early music' coming of age. The world at large has acknowledged that a composer of the 15th century can be important to us today. May there soon be a companion volume on Josquin. HOWARD MAYER BROWN

Renaissance man

Leonardo da Vinci as a Musician by Emanuel Winternitz Yale UP (New Haven and London, 1982); xxv, 241pp.; £20

'The shaping of the invisible.' Starting from Leonardo's breathtaking definition of music, the author explores a neglected side of the man who is rightly regarded as the prototype of the universal genius. The book is divided into three parts, entitled 'Roots and growth', 'The performer' and 'The thinker'. In 1482 Leonardo set off for Milan where, under the rule of Lodovico il Moro, the arts and sciences flourished. The author singles out Gaffurius, Pacioli and Guncasco (music theorist, mathematician and instrument maker respectively) as important influences and emphasizes Leonardo's reputation as a musician, teacher and improviser. Leonardo played the lira da braccio and, more unusually, invented a lira in the shape of a horse's skull—a bizarre idea reflecting contemporary preoccupations with the grotesque, but one which was probably based on acoustical observation, owing to the resemblance between the shape of a lira's soundboard and the skull of a horse. Winternitz also examines Leonardo's role in the feasts and entertainments at the Milanese court, the chief evidence for which are drawings for costumes and a few inconclusive fragments of musical notation.

The most fascinating section of the book concerns Leonardo as a thinker (in this section, only two of the six chapters have not previously been published). In the chapter on Leonardo's researches into acoustics, Winternitz gathers into a rational sequence the random observations scattered through Leonardo's notebooks. Leonardo's methods derive from his belief in the universe as an indivisible, homogeneous organism in which the same basic laws operate in different circumstances. Thus he proceeds by analogy to show how sound waves behave in the same way as light, or as waves on water. Leonardo is easi-
ly led into the realms of poetry: when he com-
poses the wind needed to activate an organ or
wind instrument with the human spirit, he hits
on an idea which foreshadows the poetry of the
19th century. Leonardo invented the viola
organista, the technique of which is based on
the hurdy-gurdy, but with a much more compli-
cated mechanism, on which it is possible to play
polyphony. Other invenctures include a drum
whose pitch can be changed during performance,
thereby anticipating the pedal machine drum by
nearly four centuries, and the ‘gлисаndо’ flute,
one of a number of instruments designed by
 analogy with the human anatomy (in this case,
the larynx). Finally, Winternitz examines the
Paragone, a treatise comparing the respective
merits of painting, poetry and music with the
aim of showing that painting is the most noble.
Here Leonardo’s ideas disappoint (and Wint-
nitz does not shirk from exposing Leonardo’s
inconsistencies and ambiguities): the argument
is of course a completely sterile one, as Molière
has brilliantly shown in Le bourgeois gentilhomme.

This is an impressive and thorough contribu-
tion to our knowledge of Leonardo’s musical in-
terests and will be of use to organologists and
instrument-makers (who may be inspired to
undertake reconstructions) and historians of the
philosophy of music. All the more obvious, then,
are some of the book’s defects. It is difficult to
distinguish between supposition and proven fact
in chapters 2 and 3, where Leonardo’s connec-
tions with his contemporaries are discussed. A
more thorough acknowledgment of secondary
sources (especially with regard to the friendship
of Leonardo and Gaffurius) would have been
helpful. The second problem, one suspects, is
connected with the first: there is no bibliography
(only a few references to other literature in the
footnotes and, rather eclectically and uncon-
systematically, in the index). This is a surprising
omission, given that the publication is in other
respects quite lavish (e.g. the admirably clear
photographs and wide margins). Winternitz is
happier in those sections dealing directly with
Leonardo’s sketches without the intervention of
secondary sources, and it is these sections which
are the most readable and informative.

JAMES CHATER

The Viola: Yearbook of the International
Viola Society contains 12 articles on the instru-
ment, each in English and in German; obtainable
from Bärenreiter, £9.24.

Sure guides

Die Meistersinger von Nürnberg edited by
Nicholas John (Opera Guide 19)
Il trovatore edited by Nicholas John (Opera
Guide 20)
Calder (London, 1983): 80pp.; £2.50

Verdi remains top favourite in this series of Opera
Guides, making six out of 20. With Meistersinger
I’d rather be reviewing Falstaff; yet it’s still as
hard to resist the elemental power with which
Verdi conjures white hot emotion from wild situa-
tions of swapped babies and incinerated gipsies
as it was when I first learnt these tunes from the
local organ-grinder. In the first of the three essays,
Marcello Conati rehearses many of the reasons
why people have found Il trovatore impossible
and absurd. Yet within a decade of the first per-
formance Verdi could glibly write that ‘when you
go to India and to the interior of Africa you
will hear Trovatore’. It’s about as true today.
If Hanslick castigated Verdi’s ‘depraved aesthetic
instinct’, he was equally harsh on the ‘painful
artificiality’ of the Meistersinger prelude. Roland
Matthews’s introductory Wagner essay deals
mostly with the many complexities of the opera,
touching on Wagner’s sense of humour, the
significance of ‘Wahn’, the lurking violence so
marvellously controlled and true to life.

The relationship of music to drama in the two
works is dealt with by D. R. B. Kimbell and
Arnold Whittall, the one paying proper tribute
to Verdi’s structural powers as well as his im-
mediacy, the other revelling in the Wagnerian
inspiration and technique that make of Die
Meistersinger so wondrous a tapestry of sound
and sense. The third Verdi essay, by Donald
Shaw, concentrates on the Gutiérrez play El
trovador from which Cammarano derived his
libretto, showing the gains and losses en route;
for Wagner, Timothy McFarland discusses on the
significance of Nuremberg in German history and
thought, how Wagner idealized its greatness
at the moment industrial Germany was finally
undermining it. The librettos form the bulk of
both guides; the English translations have sur-
vived much use and are serviceable. If I prefer
the Trovatore ‘It’s’ to Meistersinger ‘Ts’, this
pair is readily interchangeable, and little else
obtrudes. In the case of Trovatore, the enigmatic

Wagner as producer

Wagner rehearsing the Ring by Heinrich
Porges, translated by Robert L. Jacobs
Cambridge UP (Cambridge, 1983) [vii, 145pp.;
£9.95]

A devotee for many years, Porges stood high
enough in Wagner’s esteem to be offered life
companionship with him in 1864. But then
Cosima swept in. A photograph in the book
shows Porges with dank locks and flaccid
features; there seems no doubt Wagner got the
better bargain. But the enthusiasm never waned,
and Porges was at hand to take detailed notes
of all Wagner was up to in preparation for the
1876 Ring. It’s odd his account has never been
engaged before: Robert Jacobs fills an obvious
gap. The translation reads well, and Wagner the
producer makes excellent eavesdropping.

Porges considered him a ‘Gesamtschauspieler’,
and here he is buzzing about, tipping down Wotan’s
spear when Freia and the fresh apples are with-
drawn, chiding the Valkyries when they huddle
in groups, obviating Siegfried not to suggest he was
‘violating the standards of civilized society’,
demanding drama in the ‘Todesverkündigung’,
persuading the orchestra to keep singers afloat
rather than drown them, bursting into song as
Brünnhilde prophesying the birth of Siegfried.
He was ubiquitous, sempre in calzabande, exhaust-
ing, and inspiring.

Porges knew the Ring inside out, text and
music. Or so he thought. A careful read, though,
reveals soon enough that words and music
examples don’t always represent the Ring Wagner
wrote. Sometimes they distort it and even mock.

The preface suggests that ‘the extracts from the
libretto and reduced score of the Ring are as given
by Porges’. This is largely true, as the original
Bayreuther Blätter show. But why perpetuate
Porges’s choices? There are at least 100, some of
them howlers (such as wrong key-signatures, ac-
dentals, rhythms and so on). And why add a
further 30 to the total? The book has delights and
uses, but scores little for accuracy. The weight
of my Beckmessnerish task was slightly in-
creased by a wrong reference to the Blätter. Act 3
of Siegfried will be found in 1896, not 1893. So Mr
Jacobs has insufficiently looked after us. And the
proofreaders at Cambridge, I suspect, have insuf-
ciently cared for it. A commendable venture,
then, much spoil in the detail. ‘Hoitoho’ (p.65)
is about all I can manage too.

ROBERT ANDERSON

618