

Kirsten Yri

Thomas Binkley and the Studio der Frühen Musik: challenging ‘the myth of Westernness’

ARGUABLY the most unusual and acclaimed of the performances by Thomas Binkley and the Studio der Frühen Musik in the 1960s and early 1970s were those of songs from the Carmina Burana manuscript and troubadour and trouvère chansonniers.¹ These performances developed the Studio’s signature ‘Arabic style’ through the use of ‘oriental’ instruments, Arab-inflected ornamentation and embellishment of musical lines, and the use of elaborate instrumental improvisations and accompaniments following Arab-Andalusian traditions still at work in North Africa.²

The Studio’s justification for incorporating Arabic musical instruments and traditions hinged on knowledge that there had been Muslim rule in the Iberian peninsula for 700 years. During the Middle Ages, many formerly ‘Spanish’ cities—Seville, Toledo, Granada and Cordoba among others—had been sites of a flourishing Arabic culture. And *Al-Andalus*, the Muslims’ term for their Spanish territory, soon became a region where Arabic culture was the dominant, prestige culture. Orientalists, Arabists and Hispanists had long argued that cultural interaction between Arabs in Spain and Caucasians in France and Italy was fostered by the travelling and migration of peoples from and into different regions, and that Arab musicians had interacted with non-Arab musicians in Spain and beyond, spreading Arabic poetic forms and musical instruments.

The Arab-Andalusian poetic and musical forms of the *muwassah* and *zajal*, developed in Spain during the period of Muslim rule, were exported to North

Africa after the Spanish *Reconquista*. Accordingly, it was to these performances that the Studio turned in an attempt to construct what was believed to be medieval music’s ‘original’ context and expressive voice. On their many tours—to the Near and Far East in 1961; Morocco in 1963; Morocco and the Far East in 1964; and Turkey, Lebanon, Jordan, Syria and Iraq in 1968—Binkley and the Studio met with unfamiliar instruments and performance practices that they considered carefully in their reconstructions of medieval monophonic music. In Morocco especially, as John Haines has thoroughly discussed, the Studio explored the rhythmic patterns, instrumental accompaniment forms and timbral contrasts of the *nubah* musical genre that Binkley felt spoke to the Andalusian tradition of Iberian and southern French music.³ Rhythmic inflections and, on later recordings, an increase and decrease of speed and abrupt shifts in tempo, were also intended to contribute to the music’s Arab-Andalusian sound.

In the development of their ‘Arabic style’, the Studio’s performances appear to reinscribe the discourse of Orientalism defined by Edward Said as ‘a Western style for dominating, restructuring, and having authority over the Orient’.⁴ As Haines has argued, by adopting North African and Arabic musical practices, the Studio participates in the discourse of Orientalism by ‘looking to the Islamic Orient for its own roots’.⁵ Indeed, as Jonathan Shull notes, ‘many have criticized this approach as an appeal to the exotic and as an extension of 19th century orientalizing projects’.⁶ Drawing on contemporary musical models as sources of past practices, the Studio’s



1 Thomas Binkley, Örebro, Sweden, c.1963

cultural work does seem to suggest the Arab 'Other' and its cultural traditions are frozen in the past, even though, as Haines points out, the 'traditional Andalusian ensemble has changed drastically in instrumentation, repertory, and practice since the Middle Ages'.⁷ One of the problems with claiming the contemporary Other as distanced in time as well as space, is that difference is constructed in problematic, Eurocentric terms, and denies Others the rights to represent themselves.⁸

Yet a focus on the problems of assuming musical practices in North Africa to be the same as they were in medieval *Al-Andalus* is not typically an aspect of the Orientalist charges against the Studio. Criticism focuses instead on narratives of Orientalism that, against the convincing argument of Said's

book, would be difficult to dismiss. In the introduction to his discussion of the Studio's Arabic-styled performances, Haines, for instance, summarizes key features of Said's *Orientalism* by writing: 'Novels such as Gustave Flaubert's *Salammbô* (1862) evoked a primitive and sensuous East', and 'An oriental Middle Ages emerged in such works as Sir Walter Scott's *Ivanhoe* (1819)' where Scott described the 'wild barbaric music' of a tournament procession: 'it was of Eastern origin having been brought from the Holy Land'.⁹ I suggest, however, that the application of Said's concept of Orientalism to the Studio's performances misconstrues the Studio's actions in several ways. Binkley's own statements and choices demonstrate he did not subscribe to any 'primitivist' notions about the Middle Ages or the Arab Middle East, and that on the contrary he viewed both civilizations as highly developed and sophisticated. The problem is that Said's model of Orientalism does not leave room for the interpretation of Binkley's actions nor does it allow for meanings constructed in cultural discourse. Binkley's activities, the cultural context of the 1960s, and the Arabic and Hispanic scholarship that argued convincingly for the influence of Arabic culture in medieval Spain, France and Italy suggest the Studio's performances are better viewed as anti-Eurocentric undertakings that complicate the West-versus-East paradigm.

Indeed, I suggest that Binkley's Arab-Andalusian-inspired performances offer a corrective to what Hispanist Maria Rose Menocal, among others, has called 'the myth of Westernness', the systematic attempt to censor the Arabic or Semitic elements from European and Western history. Starting in the Renaissance and culminating in the late 19th century, Menocal argues, historical writings deliberately ignore evidence that during the 700-year occupation of the Iberian peninsula and after, Arabic culture participated in the making of Europe.¹⁰ Musicologist Philip Bohlman puts it more gently, 'Muslim theorists working in Arabic and Latin such as al-Fārābī and Ibn Sina (better known as Avicenna) wrote works seminal to the thinking about music in Europe's Christian monasteries. So powerful was the influence of North Africa on music and the science of music that later generations took it for granted and overlooked the presence of Arabic music in European music.'¹¹

Menocal questions why, despite the wealth of scholarly books and articles discussing Arabic or Semitic elements in European culture of the Middle Ages, 'such perspectives have never become part of the mainstream within the community of scholars who regularly deal with medieval European studies'.¹² The answer is caught up in the same discourses responsible for Orientalism and colonialism. The concept of the 'West' is one purged of Semitic and Arabic influences and is politically and ideologically motivated to assert Western superiority over the East. The politics seem clear—medievalists and Romance scholars are sceptical of an influence that Hispanists, Orientalists and Arabists argue for.

My purpose is not to rehearse the very complicated debates about Arabic musical influence in Spain, France and Italy, but I will offer several reasons why the Arabic hypothesis has become so easy to dismiss, and suggest, along the lines of Menocal, that what constitutes evidence needs to be revised, in much the same way that feminists have had to explore alternative sources to piece together the roles women have played in music history. In his book *The modern invention of medieval music*, Daniel Leech-Wilkinson suggests that the 20th-century practice of accompanying medieval monophonic song with instruments was based on the assumption of Oriental influence. His masterful study traces the 20th-century espousal of this 'Oriental hypothesis' back to an admittedly flimsy statement on performance practice made by German musicologist Marius Schneider in 1931. The Schneider passage is clearly problematic in its romanticized image of the Orient as frozen in the past:

Perhaps we can on the basis of the music still living in the Orient today, with which the 14th century shows so many connections, imagine the performance of these works as a free, simultaneously vocal and instrumental performance, that always bears the character of an improvisation. The Oriental sings melodies, whose texts now, are underlaid in quite syllabic style, now spread out in wide stretched melismas.¹³

To be sure, one of the reasons why it has been easy for scholars to dismiss the Arabic hypothesis is that music historians from the late 19th and early 20th centuries relied on language that was decidedly evolutionist and teleological. This evolutionary model of history dictates that particular features

are chosen and interpreted against a somewhat rigid model of 'development' or 'progress', and the ultimate mode of discourse here is 'romance'. Thus we read, as Haines has done, that Jean François-Joseph Fétis believed troubadour songs to be 'nothing more than memories of oriental songs put to new words', and that Curt Sachs 'placed the beginnings of *Our Musical Heritage* in "The Orient"'.¹⁴ In such cases, it would be difficult not to agree with Haines that these authors have an image of the Middle Ages and the Other that conforms to Orientalism.

The debates about Arabic influence in France, Italy and Spain were also hotly debated in nationalist and ideological terms. As Binkley was aware, various nations constructed their medieval pasts to lay claim to traditions. In his words, 'What was at first regarded as the field for international experts and aficionados today also involves national currents. Folk culture has come to identify with it. Spanish, Occitan, French, Italian, English and German exponents guard their national heritage with an almost jealous zeal; they are intent on warding off any appropriation by foreigners.'¹⁵ In the case of early 20th-century musicology or historiography of the Middle Ages, any lack of evidence for Arabic influence may indeed be caught up in nationalist agendas. There had been ample work done on the subject in French and German that Schneider and his dissertation adviser Arnold Schering could have read. Among early scholars discussing the relationship between Hispano-Arabic poetry and the poetry of the troubadours were the Dutchman R. P. A. Dozy, whose dissertation was published in 1846 as *Scriptorum Arabum Loci de Abbadidas, nunc primun editi*, and Joseph Aschbach's 1829 *Geschichte der Ommaijaden in Spanien* and 1833 *Geschichte Spaniens und Portugals zur Zeit der Herrschaft der Almoraviden und Almohaden*. There had been Joseph Baron von Hammer-Purgstall's *Literaturgeschichte der Araber, von ihrem Beginne bis zu Ende des Zwölften Jahrhunderts der Hid-schret* (1850–56) dealing with Andalusian poets and the *muwassah*, and Count Adolph Friedrich von Schack's *Poesie und Kunst der Araber in Spanien and Sizilien* (1865) among countless other works. I include this list simply to point out that there were numerous sources that had discussed and documented the culture and work of Arab-Andalusian

poets in Spain, and many had gone so far as to draw relationships between this poetry and the work of the troubadours.

Looking at the evidence Leech-Wilkinson cites in his monograph, it would be easy to agree. And yet, the lack of evidence Leech-Wilkinson underscores in the German musicology he examines points more to the German nationalist enterprise than to any 'real' absence of influence. Indeed, as he later discusses, musicologists such as Arnold Schering and Heinrich Bessler (during the 1920s and the Third Reich) formulated a 'Nordic' view of music that showed a lineage from medieval works up to the great works of Bach, Beethoven and Brahms. For instance, Leech-Wilkinson remarks that

like Ficker, Bessler continually emphasized concepts of Nordic and Gothic, annexing French and English medieval music (Leonin, Perotin, and Franco-Flemish masters) into a greater Northern alliance with Germany . . . For both writers Northern and Italian approaches combine to lead music towards its tonal destiny, and . . . manage indirectly, by their continual use of evocative Northern adjectives and frequent references to Minnesang, to imply that German values remain central to music's onward march through history.¹⁶

In this case, I suggest that the racial theories that 'made' medieval music part of the 'Nordic' discourse are the very same that are responsible for the 'writing out' of elements of music associated with the 'South'.

In his 1977 paper presented at the Basel Symposium on the Studio's performance practices of medieval monophonic song, Binkley noted that he had read all the standard works on the subject of the influence of Arabic culture on European culture—Nykl, Gomez, Ribera, Farmer, Menéndez-Pidal, Briffault, Le Gentile, Lévi-Provençal, Chottin and Barriuso.¹⁷ Binkley would have known, thus, like Arabists, Orientalists and Hispanists, that William IX, Duke of Aquitaine, claimed by scholars as the 'first' troubadour, had direct ties to Arab and Andalusian culture, and was known to cultivate a polymorphous, polyglot, Arabized culture at his court; that he married Philippa of Aragon (Aragon being a Christian kingdom with many Muslim cities in it) while his two sisters married Al-Andalusians, Pedro I of Aragon, and Alfonso VI of Castile; that he travelled with the Crusades to Jerusalem, travelled to Muslim Spain numerous times, and visited courts

of Aragon, Castile and Barcelona, where the prestige culture was Arabic. Binkley would also have known that Nykl, Briffault and Lévi-Provençal all suggested William's fifth poem used Arabic. The scholarship Binkley drew on discussed assimilated Arabs (the Mozarabs) and assimilated Christians (the Mudejars) and a cultural interaction that was often described as something 'unknown' to modern man. The arguments set out by Nykl, Ribera or Chottin, for instance, defied other European scholars' claims that the religious dogmas of Christians and Muslims were obstacles for cultural interaction. They maintained instead that borrowing from Arab culture did not presuppose approval of Muslim dogma. Binkley also knew of the 'discovery' of the *muwassah*, a genre of medieval Arab poetry written in *Al-Andalus* with refrains in the romance vernacular Mozarabic that also spoke to bi- and trilingualism and cultural interaction. The very convincing evidence that Nykl, Ribera, Farmer and Menéndez-Pidal put forth incorporated and cited medieval Arabic writings from al-Kindi (d.874) and al-Fārābi (d. 950 [*sic*]) to Ibn Sina (d.1037), and compared early troubadour lyrics with the poetry of the Arab-Andalusian *zajal*, illustrating connections in rhyme and metre.

Given Binkley's knowledge of Orientalist, Hispanist and Arabist views on the mingling of cultures during the Middle Ages, the Studio's Arabic-inspired renditions of medieval monophonic music can be understood as progressive and non-Eurocentric. In place of a Western medieval past, Binkley's renditions asserted the assimilation of Arabic and European (read 'Western') elements. In fact, the Studio's performances and liner notes literally 'wrote' the Arabic back into the European Middle Ages. On his troubadour and trouvère recording, Binkley makes the point that 'the importance of Islamic influence on European culture in the 10th to 13th centuries applies to music no less than to poetry'.¹⁸ Besides his knowledge of Arabic rule in the Iberian peninsula, Binkley also believed that musics from different regions intermingled because of the Crusades and used this as a rationale in his liner notes to the Studio's *Carmina Burana*:

The accompaniments reveal the extensive influence exerted on medieval European musical performance by Arab culture. This influence came through early contact

with Persian scholars, through the Crusades and through the Moors in Spain, and was particularly apparent in the adoption of exotic instruments. Many of these such as the lute and rebec remained in use in the Occident for centuries, while others such as the long-necked lute (Balowa) and the hour-glass drum (Darabukka) passed out of use in the fourteenth century.¹⁹

The general consensus during the 1960s was that when the Muslims were forced out of the region of Spain they brought with them the Andalusian character of the music. These Andalusian forms are reputed to live on in Morocco, Algeria and Tunisia. (I should note that North African *nubah* practitioners also hold this view.) The Studio turned to *contemporary* Arab-Andalusian music because they saw it as 'a model for creation of the accompaniments since it is a form that seems to have changed little since the time when Arabian culture exerted such a positive influence on Western Europe'.²⁰ The Studio's account, that one could reach the Middle Ages via contemporary Arab-Andalusian music, can, following Said, be read as an Orientalizing statement, but Said's model ignores intentionality that, when considered, problematizes aspects of these claims. Binkley did not maintain a romanticized image of the Arab as frozen in time. Looking carefully at the language, we can see that Binkley is not saying the 'sound' or 'performance practice' is the same as it was in the Middle Ages, but that the 'form' has changed little. Indeed, in other writings, Binkley is careful to note that the music of contemporary Arabs is undoubtedly different from music of the medieval Orient, but that he is 'forced to leap over history in order to implement the sound'. He stresses instead that the general character of the instruments 'would likely not have changed a great deal' so that one can try to piece together accompaniments based on what the instruments are capable of doing.²¹ In this way, Binkley did not strive simply to 'imitate' Arab-Andalusian music, but wanted to use it as a formal model for composing accompaniments. So while he may have imitated some of the flourishes or ornamentations of Arabic music, he claimed to be more interested in the *nubah*'s formal elements he felt could be applied to the performance of strophic songs.

Nor did Binkley's view of medieval Arab-Andalusian music or culture conform to the Orientalist para-

digm of the Arab Other as dangerous and irrational, or as a threat to 'Western' civilization. Indeed, if Arabic Others were often considered 'primitive' or 'barbaric', Binkley stressed they were 'civilized' and 'cultured'. Like musicologist Karl Geiringer, who referred to the Orient as 'highly civilized', Binkley drew attention to the highly developed nature of Arabic culture during the Middle Ages. Possibly following Henry George Farmer, whose outlook was that Arab culture had reached its zenith during the Arab Middle Ages (c.10th century), Binkley understood medieval Middle Eastern and North African musical practices as examples of highly sophisticated and cultivated traditions.²² In his description of the virtuosity of contemporary Arab-Andalusian music, Binkley made a point of saying about the Middle Ages, 'I believe that at that time, too, such technical virtuosity existed'.²³ The liner notes to his recordings suggest that Binkley even deemed it necessary to include details stating that Arabic culture was civilized and technologically advanced. In his notes for *L'Agonie du Languedoc*, Binkley places Spanish Arabic culture at the forefront of civilization, saying that the Albigensian Crusade destroyed the south, 'thereby breaking apart the old and established social structure which had provided Europe with its most advanced civilization after that of the Spanish Arabs'.²⁴ Speaking of a 13th-century Toulouse musician's familiarity with Arab sounds, Binkley notes, for instance:

To him, a particular sound common to the streets of Toulouse in the south, in the heart of the Languedoc (Troubadour country) might have its roots in the Moorish occupation of that city when the Arabs worked out a sanitation system for the city (still function[ing] with modifications) and a (still existent) irrigation system for the countryside. That Arab sound would perhaps not be noticed as anything unusual. Not so in the North, where that Arab sound would have great meaning, would be quickly identified as 'foreign' and would have symbolic significance.²⁵

Although the context of this quote speaks to stylistic distinctions between north and south, it is interesting that Binkley felt it was necessary to mention these 'still-functioning' systems. Accordingly, Binkley appeared to be interested in presenting the medieval Arab world as a highly developed culture, technologically advanced, and thus far from the barbaric or irrational stereotypes of other Orientalist projects.



2 Studio der Frühen Musik: Andrea von Ramm, Nigel Rogers and Thomas Binkley, Örebro, Sweden, c.1963

In this way, Binkley came closer to the Boasian view that non-Western peoples had histories as long as so-called civilized peoples, and that their ways of life were equally valid and should be respected.²⁶

Such statements about the advanced nature of Arabic culture were equally applied to the medieval repertory that had been influenced by it. Binkley asserted, through the prestige of Arabic music, medieval music's status as a form of high art. In some ways, Binkley's achievements may also be viewed as contesting the notion that Renaissance music was the pinnacle of musical achievement in pre-Bach repertory. In his recording, *Secular Music c.1300*, Binkley writes, for instance, 'We have attempted elsewhere to demonstrate that secular monophony was in fact a highly developed art, subtle, forceful, and eloquent'. In the note to *Musik der Spielleute*, Binkley says 'Just how developed the instrumental music of the time actually was is apparent from a famous treatise written by Johannes de Grocheo, a music theorist who worked in Paris, around 1300, for educated laymen'.²⁷ And in his paper

on instrumental practices of the Middle Ages, Binkley wrote

I view the neum obviously, *not* as a primitive sign, but as an indicator of a nuanced expression whereby absolute pitch and rhythm are not privileged. The style of performance, in my opinion, should thus be rendered so that the inscribed pitch and rhythm are not accorded central importance.²⁸

As these statements show, Binkley was interested in the complexity of the music in direct opposition to and refutation of the idea that the tradition was a simple or underdeveloped one. He emphasized that trouvère music was 'not simply a tremendous number of simple songs' but that they had a 'high artistic level',²⁹ a view that refutes the evolutionary model of Western music history.

Through his readings and certainly on his travels, Binkley also developed a nuanced view of various musical traditions on Middle Eastern and North African soil that cannot be reduced to any typical West and 'the rest' stereotype. He distinguished between various musics, whether Classical Arabic,

Gnawa, Berber, Arabic popular or Arab-Andalusian and asserted it was necessary to distinguish between these traditions. Conveniently perhaps, connecting medieval music with sophisticated 'high art' forms that survive in Arab North Africa affirmed a high status for medieval repertory and wiped it clean of associations with popular culture arguably forged by ensembles Binkley felt were 'amateur'.

Another critical factor in the interpretation of the Studio's Arabic-style recordings as challenging the 'myth of Westernness' is the cultural context of the 1960s, since this context was responsible for constructing meanings in the music's reception history. North America and Europe in the 1950s and 1960s showed a marked interest in Islam, Arabs and North Africa. Middle-class youth, artists and writers of the Beat Generation and ensuing counterculture, travelled to, read about and adopted cultural conventions of the North African and Arab countries they visited. Morocco and North Africa were also sites of romantic contact with alternative cultures, religions and lifestyles. And, like the folk movement, the extent to which this engagement with the Other was politically potent or merely responded to the corrupted values of a commercial culture is still largely debated. While scholars have discussed the apparent romanticizing and orientalizing of such places in the minds of some travellers, it is important to remember that visiting such places was viewed by those involved as a sign of resistance to the idea of the West as superior or more 'advanced'.³⁰ This interest can be found in the increase in the number of books written about the construction of history and culture of the West and of the Middle Ages, such as Norman Daniel's *Islam and the West: the making of an image* (1960), or R. W. Southern's *The making of the Middle Ages* (1953) and his *Western views of Islam in the Middle Ages* (1962). What these books demonstrate is an interest in Western misconceptions of the Islamic world (Said's book is also a later product of this interest). One of the other notable issues regarding Said's *Orientalism*, as Menocal details, is that the notion of the Arab on Western medieval soil is not addressed in his book. In her words, Said 'is not altogether immune to what is certainly part of that discourse—its segregation of Arabic or Arabized Europe. Said's Europe is 'a Europe almost

completely unaffected by hundreds of years of Arab domination, that the only real Orientalism, or Arabism, is that practised solely by those who have always been colonizers of the Arabs, not those who were transformed by Arabic colonization'.³¹

In discussing and perhaps defending Binkley's work in reconstructing medieval performances from contemporary Arab-Andalusian practices, I do not intend to absolve him from charges that the Studio's performances reinscribe aspects of the discourse of Orientalism. By claiming these traditions for medieval music, the Studio runs the risk of essentializing Arab-Andalusian traditions, and mapping them onto the past. Such a practice becomes problematic when listeners assume the Studio's renditions are authentic to the Middle Ages, and authentic to Arab-Andalusian music. And yet, I do not believe Binkley claimed this. Indeed, that his process of reconstruction could be viewed as an Orientalizing of the Arabic Other from the perspective of scholars like Said and Fabian would probably have come as a surprise. For one, Binkley supported the representation asserted by the very musicians with whom he worked—the continuity of Andalusian musical forms in Arabic culture. For another, Binkley's actions spoke to a desire not to segregate or colonize the Arab, but to acknowledge and respect the influence he felt Arabic culture had on the making of southern European music. One of peculiar ironies of Said's monograph on Orientalism is that it itself constructs a world divided into Occident and Orient.

Given Binkley's view of the Arabic Middle Ages as a manifestation of a highly developed culture that informed musical practices in southern France and Spain, the Studio's performances may be read as challenging colonialist attitudes that insisted on a West–East dichotomy. By adopting Arab-Andalusian practices and highlighting the cultivated traditions that existed on medieval soil, the Studio not only contested the assumption of an undeveloped, so-called, 'dark' Middle Ages, they undermined the idea of Western superiority at the very basis of Orientalism. In this way, Binkley's performances of medieval music were innovative, questioned the status quo, and challenged the 'myth of Westernness' by remaking European medieval music to include Arabic influence.

Kirsten Yri is an Associate Professor of Music History at Wilfrid Laurier University. She received a PhD in musicology from the State University of New York at Stony Brook for her dissertation *Medieval unclonished: uses of medieval music in twentieth-century culture*. She has published articles on the historiography of medieval music in American music, women and music, and *Current Musicology*. kyri@wlu.ca

I would like to thank Joseph Auner, Jane Sugarman and Sarah Fuller for their insightful comments and criticisms on earlier drafts. My appreciation also extends to Raglind Binkley for permission to use photographs of Thomas Binkley, and to Sterling Jones, Philip V. Bohlman, Maria Rose Menocal and George Sawa for their support and answers to my queries. I also gratefully acknowledge the financial support for this research from a grant partly funded by Wilfrid Laurier University Operating funds and partly by a SSHRC Institutional grant.

- 1 These included the recordings: *Chansons der Troubadours und Trouveres*, Teldec LC 0366 (1981), *Carmina Burana*, 20 Lieder aus der Originalhandschrift, Teldec SAWT 9455-A (1964) and *Carmina Burana (II)*, 13 Songs from the Benediktbeuern Manuscript, Teldec SAWT 9522-A (1967).
- 2 Binkley's detailed liner notes, and his 'Zur Aufführungspraxis der einstimmigen Musik des mittelalters', *Basler Jahrbuch für Historische Musikpraxis* 1: Sonderdruck (Winterthur, 1977), outlined features of this 'Arabic style'.
- 3 J. Haines, 'The Arabic style of performing medieval music', *Early Music*, xxix (2001), pp.369–78.
- 4 E. Said, *Orientalism* (New York, 1978), p.3.
- 5 Haines, 'The Arabic style', p.369.
- 6 J. Shull, 'Locating the past in the present: living traditions and the performance of early music', *Ethnomusicology Forum*, xvi/1 (2006), p.87.
- 7 Haines, 'The Arabic style', p.376.
- 8 J. Fabian, *Time and the Other: how anthropology makes its object* (New York, 1983).
- 9 Haines, 'The Arabic style', p.369.
- 10 M. R. Menocal, *The Arabic role in medieval literary history: a forgotten heritage* (Philadelphia, 1987), p.9. See

also J. L. Abu-Lughod, *Before European hegemony: the world system A.D. 1250–1350* (New York, 1989); N. Bisaha, *Creating East and West* (Philadelphia, 2004) and J. M. Hobson, *The Eastern origins of Western civilisation* (Cambridge, 2004).

- 11 P. Bohlman, *World music: a very short introduction* (New York, 2002), pp.51–2.
- 12 Menocal, *The Arabic role*, p.9, though she is speaking particularly about literary studies, her work is transferable to other academic domains.
- 13 D. Leech-Wilkinson, *The modern invention of medieval music* (Cambridge, 2002). The reference is to M. Schneider, 'Die Ars Nova des XIV. Jahrhunderts in Frankreich und Italien' (Potsdam University, 1931), p.70.
- 14 Haines, 'The Arabic style', p.370.
- 15 Binkley, 'Zur Aufführungspraxis', p.33.
- 16 Leech-Wilkinson, *The modern invention of medieval music*, p.71.
- 17 Binkley, 'Zur Aufführungspraxis', p.24.
- 18 Binkley, liner notes for *Chansons der Troubadours und Trouveres*, p.1.
- 19 Binkley, liner notes for *Carmina Burana (II)*.
- 20 Binkley, liner notes for *Carmina Burana*.
- 21 Binkley, 'Zur Aufführungspraxis', p.52.
- 22 See especially, H. G. Farmer, *A history of Arabian music to the 13th century* (London, 1967).
- 23 Binkley, 'Zur Aufführungspraxis', p.42.
- 24 Binkley, liner notes to *L'Agonie du Languedoc*, EMI 06330132 (1976).
- 25 Binkley, liner notes for *Chansons der Troubadours*.
- 26 G. Boas, *Essays on primitivism and related ideas in the Middle Ages* (Baltimore, 1948), p.vi.

27 Binkley, liner notes for *Musik der Spielleute*, Teldec, reissued as Telefunken 6.41928 AW (1975).

28 'Ich betrachte die Neumen selbstverständlich nicht als eine primitive Aufzeichnung, sondern als einen Hinweis auf Ausdruck von Nuancen, wobei Tonhöhe und Rhythmus nicht besonders ins Gewicht fielen. Der Stil der Aufführung, so schien es mir, sollte so beschaffen sein, daß der festgelegten Tonhöhe wie dem Rhythmus keine zentrale Bedeutung zukamen. Offenbar wurde mit der Notation nicht versucht, eine Aufführung zu fixieren, da das Klangbild Änderungen erleiden konnte.' 'Zur Aufführungspraxis' (my translation), p.21.

29 Binkley, liner notes for *Chansons der Troubadours*.

30 Julie Stephens, for instance, argues that 'In a more general sense, the exotic had come to stand for a rejection of the constraints of both industrialized society and "straight" politics, as in the levitation of the Pentagon, or in the celebration of native Americans, Zen Buddhism, anything to do with Mayan civilization, Chinese Taoism, and Islamic Sufism'. *Anti-disciplinary protest, sixties radicalism and postmodernism* (Cambridge, 1998), p.51.

31 Menocal, *The Arabic role in medieval literary history*, p.22.

Advertisers!

Contact

Jane Beeson

on

+44 (0) 1652 678230

or at

em.adverts@btopenworld.com