

# UNIVERSITY OF CINCINNATI

Date: August 2, 2004

I, Eriko Aoyama,

hereby submit this work as part of the requirements for the degree of:

Master of Music

in:

the Division of Composition, Musicology, and Theory of the College-Conservatory of Music (Music History)

It is entitled:

Noah Greenberg and the New York Pro Musica: The Career, Reception,  
and Impact

This work and its defense approved by:

Chair: Dr. Stephanie P. Schlagel

Dr. Mary Sue Morrow

Dr. Edward Nowacki

NOAH GREENBERG AND THE NEW YORK PRO MUSICA:  
THE CAREER, RECEPTION, AND IMPACT

A thesis submitted to the

Division of Research and Advanced Studies  
of the University of Cincinnati

in partial fulfillment of the  
requirements for the degree of

MASTER OF MUSIC

in the Division of Composition, Musicology, and Theory  
of the College-Conservatory of Music

2004

by

Eriko Aoyama

B.A., Whitman College, 1997

Committee Chair: Dr. Stephanie P. Schlagel

## ABSTRACT

The early music revival or the early music movement of Western classical music gained remarkable momentum in the second half of the twentieth century. The field of early music saw much progress not only in academic research, but also in the performance of the music. Through the performances, both live and on records, a wider public became interested in early music and this in turn lit a spark that brought the movement forward. In post-World-War-II United States, Noah Greenberg and the New York Pro Musica was one of the first and most prominent early music ensembles that brought early music closer to public. This thesis closely examines the work of Greenberg and the New York Pro Musica and their contributions to the field of early music performance.

With its unusually extensive scope of activities, which ranged from research, education, publication, and recording, to live performance, the New York Pro Musica brought early music to life and established a firm foundation for the field of early music performance in general. An instrumental factor that catalyzed the career of Greenberg and his ensemble was the post-war development of the recording technology and industry. In fact, the New York Pro Musica was initially formed as a recording ensemble and recording continued to serve as a major medium of communication throughout the group's activities, especially under Greenberg.

This thesis first examines a wide scope of background conditions that enabled Greenberg and the Pro Musica to succeed as a professional early music ensemble. Then the impact and reception of the group is assessed through an analysis of the published reviews of their recordings. This study offers a deeper understanding of the work and achievement of Noah Greenberg through a thorough observation of his time and situation, and through a focused evaluation of the impact and reception of him and his New York Pro Musica.

Copyright 2004, Eriko Aoyama

## ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

I wish to thank my committee members Dr. Mary Sue Morrow and Dr. Edward Nowacki for their helpful comments. Very very special thanks to my thesis advisor, Dr. Stephanie P. Schlagel, for her many hours of work on my thesis. This project (truly a product of international communication) would not have been possible without her expertise and endless patience. And last but not least, thanks to my husband Diethard Pabel for his love and support.

## CONTENTS

INTRODUCTION .....	3
CHAPTER 1: SETTING THE STAGE FOR NOAH GREENBERG AND THE NEW YORK PRO MUSICA .....	7
Early Music Activities in the United States Before 1953	9
Biography of Noah Greenberg to 1953	16
The United States and New York in the 1950s: An Economic and Cultural Background	22
Early Music Recordings and the Development of the Long-Playing Record	26
CHAPTER 2: THE NEW YORK PRO MUSICA .....	36
The Forming of the New York Pro Musica	37
The Career of the New York Pro Musica	42
CHAPTER 3: THE INFLUENCE OF NOAH GREENBERG .....	65
Noah Greenberg's Character and How It Shaped the New York Pro Musica	65
The New York Pro Musica After Noah Greenberg	69
CHAPTER 4: RECORDING PROJECTS OF THE NEW YORK PRO MUSICA . . . .	80
Significance of the Recordings	81
Recording Projects and Their Reviews: What They Reveal About the New York Pro Musica	89
Authenticity	92
Performance Practice and Musical Interpretation	97
Audience Building	117
Programming and Marketing	122

CHAPTER 5: THE NEW YORK PRO MUSICA IN THE CONTEXT OF THE EARLY MUSIC REVIVAL .....	138
Contemporaries of the New York Pro Musica	139
Contributions of the New York Pro Musica	144
CONCLUSION .....	155
BIBLIOGRAPHY .....	158
APPENDIX 1: DISCOGRAPHY AND RECORD REVIEWS .....	163
APPENDIX 2: PUBLICATIONS OF THE NEW YORK PRO MUSICA .....	174

## INTRODUCTION

What is known as the early music revival or early music movement in the Western classical music may have started in the nineteenth century, perhaps with the performance of J. S. Bach's *St. Matthew Passion* by Felix Mendelssohn in 1829.<sup>1</sup> Since then, general interest in early music continued to be cultivated, but mostly by small-scale groups of performers and amateurs in isolated or regional environments. The movement gained more momentum in the early twentieth century with the establishment of numerous *scholae cantorum* and amateur groups, chant revival emanating from Solesmes, and the activities of influential individuals such as Arnold Dolmetsch. However, it was not until after the Second World War, in the 1950s and '60s, that the early music revival became a clearly visible and audible part of the musical culture.

The post-war interest in and awareness of early music is evident in the depth of musicological scholarship and research, and the growing number of publications and anthologies such as the *Corpus Mensurabilis Musicae*. However, a vital link between scholars and general public awareness of early music lies in the performance of these works. Beginning in the 1950s numerous professional performers emerged who enthusiastically presented the "unknown" music employing highly original and personal approaches. Additionally, the growing availability and popularity of sound recordings provided a new means for performers to communicate their discoveries.

In the United States, Noah Greenberg was such a pioneer, who brought forth the repertory of early music with his ensemble, the New York Pro Musica. In this era of the post-World War II

---

<sup>1</sup> Harry Haskel, *The Early Music Revival: A History* (London: Thames & Hudson, 1988), 10.



early music revival,<sup>2</sup> the New York Pro Musica represents one of the earliest and most musically and commercially successful American groups featuring skilled, professional-level vocalists and virtuoso instrumentalists. The ensemble's contributions are significant for the wide range of audiences it attracted, the recognition it received, and in the research on and presentations of the early music literature that it conducted.

This thesis closely examines the career and achievements of Noah Greenberg and the New York Pro Musica and their contributions to the field of early music performance. With their live and recorded performances, research, and educational activities, Greenberg and the Pro Musica directly influenced those interested and involved in early music, such as scholars and amateur musicians. At the same time, by making early music available to and appreciated by a wider public, the group fostered further advancements in the field in general. The publications of two extensive studies on this topic, a master's thesis by Sarah Jane Gaskill<sup>3</sup> and a full-length biography of Noah Greenberg by James Gollin,<sup>4</sup> in addition to numerous articles on Greenberg and the New York Pro Musica, attest to the significance of Greenberg and the Pro Musica's efforts and their historical value.

Although early music ensembles existed before Greenberg's group, the New York Pro Musica was the first to be commercially successful and widely recognized in the United States. In addition, the unusually extensive scope of their activities, ranging from research, education, publication, and recording, to live performance distinguished the Pro Musica from other early music ensembles and musicians. A group with such depth of resources and commitment had

---

<sup>2</sup> From the 1950s to the '70s there were increasing activities and advancements in early music performance with artists such as Thomas Binkley with Studio der Frühen Musik; Nikolaus Harnoncourt and Concertus Musicus of Vienna; Anthony Rooley and Consort of Musicke; Gustav Leonhardt; and Frans Brüggen, to name a few.

<sup>3</sup> Sarah Jane Gaskill, "The Artist as Manager: Noah Greenberg and the New York Pro Musica" (M. A. thesis, The American University, 1984).

<sup>4</sup> James Gollin, *Pied Piper: The Many Lives of Noah Greenberg*, Lives in Music Series, no. 4 (Hillsdale, New York: Pendragon, 2001).

never yet existed, and its contributions were and still are considered extraordinary by musicologists and the general public alike.

To investigate how this was possible and to assess the impact of their efforts, the career of Greenberg and the New York Pro Musica will be examined in five steps. Chapter one presents the historical and social conditions pertaining to the Pro Musica. A recounting of a history of early music performance up to 1952, when Greenberg founded the New York Pro Musica, a brief biography of Noah Greenberg, and a consideration of the cultural and social settings in the 1950s will reveal the conditions that made it possible for the Pro Musica to succeed as a professional early music ensemble. Furthermore, since the recording industry played a crucial role in the career of the New York Pro Musica, a closer look at the development of recording technology serves to complete the necessary background information.

The second chapter examines the career and achievement of the New York Pro Musica in two sections. First, the process of forming the New York Pro Musica is recounted. Then a discussion of the Pro Musica's career and its various projects, including the challenges and difficulties it faced as one of the first professional early music ensembles, follows.

Noah Greenberg was the leading and driving force behind the New York Pro Musica. In chapter three, a discussion of the character and influence of this extraordinary music director will be presented. A report on the career of the New York Pro Musica after Greenberg's death concludes the chapter.

The fourth chapter assesses the impact and reception of the New York Pro Musica by analyzing published recording reviews. Some observations on the significance of the recordings in the Pro Musica's career will be made, which will prepare the reader for the main topic of this chapter. After an explanation of the methodological approach of this research, the study will be presented. It is categorized in four topics: first, a discussion of the notion of authenticity in early

music performance, followed by the group's recording projects in three key topics: musical interpretation, audience building, and programming and marketing tools. These issues will be considered from the perspective of the Pro Musica and from the perspective of the audience as seen in recording reviews. The assimilation of the two points of view reveals the resulting effect of the Pro Musica's achievements and its impact, in other words, what the group managed to communicate.

The last chapter considers the role of the New York Pro Musica and its achievements in a broader context of the early music revival. First, other contemporaneous early music ensembles will be introduced to provide a wider perspective and points of comparison. Finally, a discussion of the unique contributions of Noah Greenberg and the New York Pro Musica concludes the thesis.

This thesis provides a new perspective to the existing research by thoroughly examining the background conditions for the group's success. In addition, an analysis of recording reviews to assess the impact and reception of the ensemble offers an original approach in the study of Noah Greenberg and the New York Pro Musica.

CHAPTER 1  
SETTING THE STAGE FOR NOAH GREENBERG AND  
THE NEW YORK PRO MUSICA

In the first sentence of his history of the early music revival Harry Haskell asks, “What is early music?”<sup>1</sup> This is a difficult question to answer, since the meaning of the term has changed over the years, and the period and style of music it refers to can vary according to the writer or the situation. Nevertheless, to avoid confusion, the answer must be clarified, especially in a discussion about early music. For Noah Greenberg, early music was the music of the medieval, Renaissance, and early Baroque eras. Before the 1950s this repertory was mostly unknown and unfamiliar to the general public in the United States. The music was known and studied to a limited extent by musicologists and performed within academic spheres and in local contexts, but even Greenberg, who lived in New York and was interested in this repertory, often had to rely on the musical scores and his musical imagination to “hear” the works before the post-World War II renaissance of early music performance began.<sup>2</sup>

Indeed, what is now known as the early music movement or the early music revival, in other words a heightened interest and awareness of the music written before the periods covering the mainstream classical repertory, made remarkable progress in the decades following the Second World War. The advent of the early music revival, indicated by the emergence of professional early music ensembles and performers, by the growing tendency to feature

---

<sup>1</sup> Harry Haskell, *The Early Music Revival: A History* (London: Thames & Hudson, 1988), 9.

<sup>2</sup> James Gollin, *Pied Piper: The Many Lives of Noah Greenberg*, Lives in Music Series, no. 4 (Hillsdale, New York: Pendragon, 2001), 39.

unfamiliar composers and repertory, and by the rise in the number of recordings and performances, was so significant that it was clearly noticeable. For example, in 1973, J. M. Thompson begins the first issue of *Early Music* with this editorial paragraph:

Ten years ago a journal such as this would have been impossible: there were then no early music consorts such as those whose reputation now begins to reverberate beyond these shores. There were relatively few instrument makers and those interested in early music tended to be divided into members of the various separate societies for recorder, lute or gamba, or they were readers of specialist journals. Now all is mysteriously changed.<sup>3</sup>

Writing in England, Thompson probably had the British groups such as the Musica Reservata and the Early Music Consort of London in mind, but this recent phenomenon of the early music movement was also becoming apparent in the United States, specifically with the activities of Noah Greenberg.

The revival of early music is an ongoing process shaped by contributions of many individuals. Like any other historical movement, its course is also influenced by developments in other fields and the social and cultural circumstances. Therefore, an examination of the historical background pertaining to Noah Greenberg and the New York Pro Musica gives a point of reference to gain a better understanding of their work. First, a brief overview of a history of early music activities in and related to the United States up to the beginning of Greenberg's career serves to place Greenberg's contributions in the larger picture of the revival of early music. Second, a biography of Noah Greenberg sheds a light on this extremely influential personality and how early music performance became his life work. Third, a discussion of social and cultural conditions of the 1950s United States explains how the extra-musical situations also helped contribute to Greenberg's commercial success. Finally, an examination of the development of the

---

<sup>3</sup> J. M. Thomson, Editorial, *Early Music* 1, no. 1 (January 1973): 1.

recording industry and its technology in relation to early music reveals the importance of the recording media for Greenberg and the Pro Musica.

### **Early Music Activities in the United States Before 1953**

The first early music center in the United States was Boston. Since the nineteenth century Boston has been well known for the various early music activities, and later for its collections of early instruments. Here, however, early music rarely extended back before Bach's and Handel's time. Nevertheless, Boston's Handel and Haydn Society, founded in 1815, was instrumental in providing the public with a taste of pre-Romantic music, although the trend of the time was to perform such music in a romanticized fashion with large choirs and orchestras.<sup>4</sup>

An influential figure around the turn of the century was Sam Franko. Interested in performances of pre-Romantic music in a more authentic style, he founded the American Symphony Orchestra in New York, with which he employed smaller ensembles with harpsichord to present early orchestral music. During his visits to Europe he collected many of the scores of music his group would present. Likened to an archaeologist when a critic referred to him as "the musical Schliemann,"<sup>5</sup> Franko was one of the first American early musicians to explore the unknown field of historical performance practice and research.<sup>6</sup> Another of Franko's important contributions was introducing Arnold Dolmetsch to the United States' early music scene in 1903.

The influence of Dolmetsch in shaping early music activities not only in England, but also in the United States was significant.<sup>7</sup> A controversial figure, Dolmetsch was known for his

---

<sup>4</sup> Haskell, 94-96.

<sup>5</sup> Heinrich Schliemann was a German archaeologist and scholar who discovered the site of ancient Troy on the west coast of Asian Turkey in 1871. E. D. Hirsch, Jr., Joseph F. Kett, and James Trefil, *The Dictionary of Cultural Literacy*, 2<sup>nd</sup> ed., (Boston: Houghton Mifflin Company, 1993), 388.

<sup>6</sup> Haskell, 99.

<sup>7</sup> For example, Arthur Whiting, after studying with Dolmetsch, became a promoter of the clavichord and harpsichord. In addition to performing with these instruments, he organized a series of educational concerts at Ivy

unconventional lifestyle as well as for his unique approach to performing less well-known music of pre-Romantic eras.<sup>8</sup> However, his all-round interest in early music, from instrument making, to research in performance practice, to performing on several instruments, made him one of the most influential figures in the early music revival.<sup>9</sup> In the United States, his work in the reproduction of early instruments, with the establishment of one of the first workshops, was highly valued and set a foundation for early instrument manufacturing.<sup>10</sup> As a result, New York and Boston, the two cities where Dolmetsch based his activities, became the major early music centers in America in the early twentieth century.

Dolmetsch's performance style with period costumes and stage settings was so popular that it became a standard procedure in presenting early music. Haskell notes that "Americans did not attend early music concerts purely to be edified or instructed," and the "performers' personalities were an important attraction"<sup>11</sup> – often more so than the music itself. In the nineteen-teens and twenties many early music performers from Europe came on tour and the "vaguely exotic atmosphere" that they offered attracted audiences as well. Among such performers was the harpsichordist Wanda Landowska, who created a sensation, although it took some years until she would gain the kind of recognition in the United States that she enjoyed in Europe.<sup>12</sup> Nevertheless, with her metal-cast Pleyel harpsichord in live performances and on recordings, Landowska reached a wider audience than any other early music performers before her time. Joel Cohen notes that "while Dolmetsch proselytized among amateur musicians and

---

League schools. Paul Kéfer, at the time the principal cellist of the New York Philharmonic who owned and played a Dolmetsch gamba, joined Whiting on these concerts. Haskell, 100-01.

<sup>8</sup> Dolmetsch was known for his ensemble comprising his family members, the wearing of period costumes, and sometimes the obvious deficiency in performance skills.

<sup>9</sup> Howard Mayer Brown, "Pedantry or Liberation? A Sketch of the Historical Performance Movement," in *Authenticity and Early Music*, ed. Nicholas Kenyon (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1988), 39-41.

<sup>10</sup> Haskell, 100.

<sup>11</sup> *Ibid.*, 101.

<sup>12</sup> *Ibid.*, 103. Landowska's American debut was in 1923.

in literary-artistic circles, Landowska was giving solo recitals in the same halls, and for the same audiences, as the famous violinists and pianists of those times.”<sup>13</sup>

Around this time collections of historical instruments expanded as museums and musical societies eagerly acquired instruments.<sup>14</sup> In the 1920s and 1930s the availability of historical instruments triggered what Haskell calls “America’s first flush of early music groups,”<sup>15</sup> as well as the founding of many Bach festivals and pre-Classical choral groups, and the emergence of a line of notable harpsichordists.

Some American musicians pursued careers in early music performance before the 1950s, but interestingly, the two most well known of them, Safford Cape and Guillaume de Van, lived and worked in Europe. In 1932 Cape founded the Pro Musica Antiqua in Belgium with a specific goal to perform medieval and early Renaissance music. His conviction that polished performances of such music could appeal to a wider public led him to pursue tours, festivals, and recording projects with his small group of singers and instrumental ensemble using historical reproductions. At the time the pre-Baroque repertory was deemed too archaic and arcane to be appreciated by non-specialists, and the performance of such music was mostly limited to venues such as “musicological congresses, university seminars and the occasional festival programme.”<sup>16</sup> However, with their great passion and musical precision, Cape and his ensemble performed their well-conceived programs based on careful but not too strict scholarship and attracted audiences not only of “savants” but also of “ordinary listeners.”<sup>17</sup> Cape actively participated in recording projects, notably for *Anthologie Sonore* and Deutsche Grammophon’s *Archiv* series. Although his

---

<sup>13</sup> Joel Cohen and Herb Snitzer, *Reprise: The Extraordinary Revival of Early Music* (Boston: Little, Brown & Co., 1985), 25.

<sup>14</sup> Haskell, 102. Some examples include the Cassadesus collection of the Boston Symphony Orchestra; the Galpin collection of the Boston Museum of Fine Arts; and other collections at Yale, the Metropolitan Museum of Art in New York, the University of Michigan, Ann Arbor; and the Smithsonian Institution in Washington, D.C.

<sup>15</sup> *Ibid.*, 102.

<sup>16</sup> *Ibid.*, 60.

<sup>17</sup> Critic A. L. Flay, quoted in Haskell, 61.



group never reached mainstream popularity,<sup>18</sup> their concert tours and recordings did enable them to be heard by a larger audience, including those in the United States.

Another American, Guillaume de Van (originally William Devan from Memphis, Tennessee) was a musicologist who headed the Bibliothèque Nationale's music department in Paris during the Second World War. He founded the Paraphonistes de St Jean-des-Matines in 1936, which specialized in music of the thirteenth to sixteenth centuries. De Van brought medieval repertory to the attention of French audiences who were already familiar with Renaissance and Baroque music through Wanda Landowska, Nadia Boulanger, and Geneviève Thibault.<sup>19</sup>

A noteworthy event in early music revival, although not directly connected with the United States or Greenberg, was the founding of the Schola Cantorum Basiliensis in Basle, Switzerland, in 1933 by August Wenzinger and Paul Sacher. The Schola Cantorum was the first music academy solely dedicated to the performance and research of early music of all fields. With the motto that "early music should not be an elitist pursuit, open only to a guild of professionals, but part and parcel of everyday life," and meanwhile "determined to root out 'dilettantism' and inculcate their students with a more professional attitude,"<sup>20</sup> the Schola Cantorum brought early music to a higher level of performance standard and recognition.

With the outbreak of the Second World War and political unrest in Europe, a significant shift of activities in the arts, including early music, took place in the late 1930s and '40s. Many scholars, intellectuals, writers, artists, and musicians emigrated to the United States, taking with

---

<sup>18</sup> Joel Cohen states that Cape's ensemble was "known primarily to a small group of scholars and specialists" at the time. Cohen claims that "Cape's musicians were perhaps most successful when they sang French-language texts; in some other repertoires, certain limitations of instrumental and vocal technique prevented the ordinary listener from entering fully into the spirit of the music" (Cohen, 27). He is rather critical of Cape's approach in performance, calling it an academic, inward style that did not attract enough public attention. However, to a great extent, this is a matter of personal musical taste.

<sup>19</sup> Haskell, 61.

<sup>20</sup> *Ibid.*, 63.

them their traditions and ideas. In the field of early music the influence of musicologists and performers was quite significant. Boulanger moved to the United States in 1938, and Landowska in 1941. Among the music scholars who continued their work on American campuses were Alfred Einstein, Erwin Bodky, Willi Apel, Manfred Bukofzer, Hans T. David, Otto Gombosi, Paul Henry Lang, Curt Sachs, Leo Schrade, Edward Lowinsky, Karl Geiringer, and Hans Tischler.

The emerging tradition of applied musicology and lively interaction of scholars and performers encouraged new endeavors in the research and presentation of historical performance practices. The prime example of such academic ensembles was the Yale Collegium Musicum led by Paul Hindemith. For Hindemith, early music was a “living art, part of the ongoing tradition to which he as a composer belonged,”<sup>21</sup> and he often took liberties in his performance practice decisions. He tried to emphasize the interest in musical structures and compositional techniques in his performances, which resulted in an “eloquent, elegant, passionate rendering”<sup>22</sup> as one critic wrote. His approach in bringing early music to life and presenting theme-oriented programs set a new standard, and many of his notable students who became central figures in the field of early music performance in the United States carried on this tradition.<sup>23</sup>

Another composer-musicologist who is not as well known as Hindemith, but who is nevertheless important for the American early music revival, is Erich Katz. Katz had led a successful musical career in Freiburg, Germany, but was forced into exile in 1939 and emigrated to the United States in 1943. He taught at the New York College of Music and helped with the creation of the American Recorder Society. Many of his students became major figures in early music, including LaNoue Davenport, who played with the New York Pro Musica

---

<sup>21</sup> *Ibid.*, 108.

<sup>22</sup> Critic Jay S. Harrison, quoted in Haskell, 119.

<sup>23</sup> *Ibid.*

in 1953 and became a permanent member and associate director in the 1960s.<sup>24</sup> Bernard Krainis, one of the founding members of the Pro Musica and director of its instrumental ensemble, was also in contact with Katz through the Musicians' Workshop that Katz directed at the New York College of Music.<sup>25</sup>

To conclude, the performance of early music in the United States before the 1950s was, on the whole, a limited endeavor. A handful of American musicians and scholars left significant marks on the field of early music performance, both in the United States and in Europe, and institutions and organizations were beginning to be established.<sup>26</sup> However, the repertory performed rarely included music before the Baroque era, and performance venues were limited. Concerts took place either in academic settings or in larger cities that could support specialist interests. Elaine Brody supports this point: "Before 1945 early music was a subject researched by scholars, discussed in colloquia and graduate seminars, and heard almost exclusively in the mind. . . . those few persons interested in early music worked principally in the confines of academia."<sup>27</sup>

If Baroque music was considered a specialist interest, music of the medieval and Renaissance eras was even more removed from the public's awareness. Owing to the increasingly popular choral movements and the existence of numerous choral ensembles, pre-Baroque vocal music was performed to a certain extent. However, because of the lack of availability of instruments, repertory, and performance tradition in terms of technique, performance practice, and resources, professional performance of pre-Baroque instrumental repertory, except for keyboard music, could not fully bloom. Another important point is that before the 1950s there

---

<sup>24</sup> Mark Davenport, "American Recorder Pioneer LaNoue Davenport Dies at Age 77," *The Recorder Magazine* (Summer 2000): 47.

<sup>25</sup> Sigrid Nagle, "An Interview with Bernard Krainis," *American Recorder* 30 (August 1989): 98.

<sup>26</sup> For example, the American Recorder Society was formed in 1939, and the Society of Ancient Instruments in the late 1930s in Boston.

<sup>27</sup> Elaine Brody, "The Performance of Early Music in the United States Today," in *Musica Antiqua* 5, ed. Anna Czekanowska (Bydgoszcz, Poland: 1978), 459.

was no authoritative public advocate of medieval and Renaissance music until, as Cohen states, “Alfred Deller, Noah Greenberg, and, a few years later, David Munrow, director of the Early Music Consort of London, arrived on the scene.”<sup>28</sup>

Logically, until there was a professional musician to champion the repertory, medieval and Renaissance music could not attract a non-specialist audience. Moreover, many conservatory-trained musicians were simply not aware of early music,<sup>29</sup> and of those who were familiar, most shied away from delving into the early music repertory because of the absence of a supportive audience and marketing potential. This is what Martin Mayer called the “vicious circle of classic dimension” that restricted “the enjoyment of medieval and Renaissance music to a cult of devotees.”<sup>30</sup> In the United States, this circle would be broken with the activities of Noah Greenberg and the New York Pro Musica beginning in 1953.

For Greenberg, early music offered a fertile ground worthy of serious exploration. Although general interest in early music had increased in the past several decades, it was still at a beginning stage, with a vast potential in academic and performance areas. In addition to the new possibilities in repertory and research, issues concerning historical performance practice were just beginning to be recognized as a topic in itself. Lacking a performance model or a standardized procedure to follow, musicians were often confronted with making their own decisions to the best of their knowledge and musical sense. This allowed ample room for the performers’ individual creativity and imagination to guide the interpretation of the music, and offered more possibilities to take liberties and experiment with new ideas. Greenberg was such a performer, who welcomed

---

<sup>28</sup> Cohen, 26.

<sup>29</sup> For example, Russell Oberlin, who studied at the Juilliard School of Music, told Martin Mayer that it was through meeting Greenberg and not at the conservatory that he learned early music repertory and discovered his talent as a counter tenor. Martin Mayer, “Musical Echoed of the Renaissance,” *Reporter* 17 (5 September 1957): 39.

<sup>30</sup> Mayer, 38.

the challenges and the excitement of reaching out to something new and had the will and ability to carry out his dreams.

### **Biography of Noah Greenberg to 1953**

Early music performer Joel Cohen makes the following comment in his discussion of Safford Cape and the Brussels Pro Musica Antiqua: “It requires courage and independence to defend repertoires that the world considers secondary, trivial, or just too unfamiliar.”<sup>31</sup> This statement was meant for Cape, who had led his early music ensemble in Europe since the 1930s, but it can be easily applied to Noah Greenberg in the United States in the 1950s as well. Both of these individuals made pioneering efforts in the professional performance of medieval, Renaissance, and early Baroque music.

Judging from comments made by his friends and colleagues, Noah Greenberg’s personality played a crucial role in making him a successful leader. His biographer, James Gollin, remarked that “the term his family, friends and colleagues used, and still use, to describe the man . . . [that] recurs most often is ‘enthusiastic,’”<sup>32</sup> an observation borne out by the comments of his long-time friend and colleague Jesse Simons (“enormous enthusiasm”<sup>33</sup>), and the musicologists Harry Haskell (“keen enthusiam”<sup>34</sup>), and Barry S. Brook (“boundless energy and enthusiasm”<sup>35</sup>). No matter how infectious, however, simple enthusiasm would have not sufficed to sustain the Pro Musica, and as Joel Newman, the musicological consultant for the New York Pro Musica, noted in his obituary: “Noah Greenberg was endowed with an abundance of energy and initiative, and

---

<sup>31</sup> Cohen, 27.

<sup>32</sup> Gollin, 4-5.

<sup>33</sup> Mark Davenport, “Noah Greenberg: The Man Behind the Music,” *Early Music America* 3 (Fall 1997): 41.

<sup>34</sup> Haskell, 109.

<sup>35</sup> Barry S. Brook, “Obituary,” *Journal of American Musicological Society* (Fall 1967): 511.

the ability to follow through his plans to fruition.”<sup>36</sup> Along the same lines, musicologist Jeremy Noble admired Greenberg’s dynamic guidance with which he led his group, and for his “organizing genius and of his readiness to chance his arm,”<sup>37</sup> or to take risks.

Noah Greenberg was born in the Bronx, New York, on April 9, 1919, the first and only child of Lillie and Harold Greenberg, who had recently emigrated from Warsaw, Poland. Already at an early age, Noah was an active child with a curious mind. In a photograph of Noah’s baseball team, Noah, who is a year or two younger than the other boys, stands out with his size and confident smile. James Gollin interprets it as “the determination of somebody who will never let himself be left out or overlooked, even if he’s not fully part of whatever it is that’s going on.”<sup>38</sup>

Music was a great and important part of the life of the Greenberg family. As Gollin aptly puts it, the “Jewish Bronx . . . was steeped, was virtually marinated, in music.”<sup>39</sup> Families and friends gathered regularly to sing, play instruments, or listen to and talk about music, from folksongs and workers’ songs to operas and classical music. At age fourteen, Noah began to study composition with Arnold Zemachson, a highly promising Russian composer who had his recent orchestral work premiered by the Philadelphia Orchestra under Leopold Stokowski. In the two years of study with him, Noah learned some basic theory and harmony and the potential of “the drama that could be gained by combining rigorous musical structure with novel and expressive sonorities,” and developed his notable skill in music notation and copying.<sup>40</sup>

Around 1935 Greenberg met Harold Brown, who was then one of the substitute teachers at James Monroe High School, which Greenberg attended. Brown, a graduate of Columbia, was an aspiring but struggling composer, who, in his “introverted, intense argumentative” style, was

---

<sup>36</sup> Joel Newman, “Noah Greenberg: April 9, 1919 – January 9, 1966,” *Current Musicology* (Spring 1966): 35-36.

<sup>37</sup> Jeremy Noble, “Obituary: Noah Greenberg,” *Musical Times* (March 1966): 241.

<sup>38</sup> *Ibid.*, 20.

<sup>39</sup> *Ibid.*, 23.

<sup>40</sup> *Ibid.*, 24-25.

said to have had “very strong views on music and everything else, most especially on politics.”<sup>41</sup>

It was because of Brown that Greenberg gave up piano and started on double bass, and got heavily involved with the leftist socialist and Trotskyite movements.<sup>42</sup> Thus Greenberg’s formative teenage years were dedicated to political activities and music. Among his circle of musicians were Robert Levenstein, Barry S. Brook, Israel Horowitz, and Harold Brown; all of them became professional musicians.<sup>43</sup> They gathered to listen to music, attend concerts, study music scores, and exchange their thoughts on music.

After graduating from high school at age seventeen, Greenberg moved in with Harold Brown. It was Brown who introduced Greenberg to early music. Brown, an accomplished violist and aspiring composer who was Columbia University’s Mosenthal Fellow in Music Composition in 1930 and who later studied with Nadia Boulanger, was also a philosopher of music. One of his firm beliefs was that “beauty and meaning in music are functions of musical structure.”<sup>44</sup> For Brown, structure gave music its meaning and aesthetic value. For a musical work to be successful, this structure must be expressed clearly by giving energy and forward movement in phrasing. Brown was very critical of the contemporary classical music scene with its over-emphasis on virtuosity and fame. He thought that this system of making classical music into a business was corrupting the music itself. Furthermore, Brown disdained large-scale Romantic works because he believed that their “ornate orchestration” served to cover up the structural weakness of the compositions, thus violating the “very nature of music.”<sup>45</sup>

---

<sup>41</sup> Ibid., 25.

<sup>42</sup> Noah Greenberg would join the American Student Union and, later, the Socialist Workers Party.

<sup>43</sup> Levenstein, a pianist, became a music educator; Brook became a musicologist and teacher; Horowitz became an Artist and Repertory Director of Decca Classical Records and worked with Greenberg and New York Pro Musica (Gollin, 31-32).

<sup>44</sup> Ibid., 37.

<sup>45</sup> Ibid., 38.

James Gollin partially attributes Brown's steadfast adherence to his strong opinions to "the arrogance and iconoclasm of youth and to Harold's chronic dissatisfaction with life,"<sup>46</sup> but this frustration led Brown to search into the music of the distant past. For Brown, music of the Middle Ages and Renaissance was the only kind of music "in which structure is indeed all-important."<sup>47</sup> It did not discourage him that early music was not well known or not performed often. Brown, together with Greenberg, meticulously studied scores and manuscripts of works by early masters that they could obtain from the Fifty-eighth Street Music Library, and "they puzzled over Gregorian neumes and tried to imagine what the masses of Isaac, Ockeghem, Josquin, and Lasso would sound like if singers could be found to sing them."<sup>48</sup>

In the fall of 1938 they participated in a course on Gregorian chant by Mother Margaret Stevens, R.S.C.M., at the Pius X School of Liturgical Music of the Convent of the Sacred Heart. Around this time Greenberg and Brown began to organize informal musical gatherings and later a small chorus. They sang Gregorian chants, Elizabethan madrigals, and rounds, many of the selections taken from the newly published four-volume anthology by Lehman Engel, *Three Centuries of Choral Music: Renaissance to Baroque*.<sup>49</sup>

In 1940 Greenberg married Edith Schor, a comrade from the Workers Party and a regular member of the informal singing group that he led. The wartime economic and political situation made it impossible, however, for Greenberg to be fully immersed in his musical interests. To earn a living, Greenberg taught himself, and eventually many of his friends and comrades, how to operate a lathe and worked on various jobs. In 1943 Noah, followed later by Edith, moved to San Pedro, California, to work as a lathe operator for the Los Angeles Shipbuilding and Drydock

---

<sup>46</sup> Ibid.

<sup>47</sup> Ibid.

<sup>48</sup> Ibid., 39.

<sup>49</sup> Ibid., 46. The anthology was published in 1939. Jesse Simons recalls that Greenberg also "assembled, sang with, and conducted another amateur group around 1949-50" (Davenport, 40).



Corporation. In January 1944 Greenberg, no longer able to hold draft deferment, joined the Merchant Marines, with which he held various positions including messman, second cook/baker (with his newly obtained certificate from a cooking school), and oiler. From 1944 until the end of the war Greenberg shipped out three times. After the war, at the age of twenty-six, Greenberg felt that he was too old for college and was in financial need, since the benefits of the G.I. Bill did not apply to members of the Merchant Marine. However, he was determined to try his hand at music, specifically early music, which became his greatest passion, and he worked hard to save some money. In the next five years Greenberg continued to work on ships, completing at least twenty-four roundtrips across the Atlantic.<sup>50</sup>

During his time as a sailor Greenberg kept up his political activities at sea, and his musical activities on land. When he was in New York, the Saturday night get-togethers of eating, drinking, singing, and listening to music resumed. Jesse Simons recalls that a group of friends would gather for dinner and listen to Greenberg's record collection with his commentaries, and sing revolutionary songs (some of them from the International Workers of the World, an American anarchist organization) and "Spanish, Yiddish, German, Irish, and Italian songs, in the original languages."<sup>51</sup>

While on duty Greenberg participated in political activities, be it organizing strikes and informing fellow workers about labor principles, writing for some communist publications using the pseudonym "N. R. Gaden," or teaching and singing labor songs. Greenberg took advantage of the time abroad at port to visit some European cities, including Paris. During these visits he searched and collected phonograph records and music scores that interested him and Harold Brown. As many anecdotes and accounts of friends suggest, Greenberg probably did acquire

---

<sup>50</sup> Gollin, 79-91.

<sup>51</sup> Davenport, "Noah Greenberg," 41.

numerous musical materials abroad, but that was not the only source of early music for him, as is sometimes believed.<sup>52</sup>

In 1950 Noah and Edith sailed out for the first time as passengers on a trip to France and Italy. During this journey, while attending Pablo Casals's Bach Festival in Prades, France, Greenberg finally decided to become a professional musician. James Gollin describes this occasion as a "defining moment, a turning point," in Greenberg's life, and recounts:

For three solid weeks, he had had before him example after example of what inspiring musical leadership could produce. "Can you imagine musicians getting excited about a performance of the 3<sup>rd</sup> Brandenburg," Noah wrote, "which they had played dozens of times at rehearsals and 100's of times in the past?" That was what Pablo Casals had made happen.<sup>53</sup>

It was such joy of music-making that Greenberg wanted to create.

However, establishing a career in music was not an easy task for a poor ex-Merchant Marine without any conservatory training. Greenberg at first taught piano lessons and eventually worked as a music copyist for Elliott Carter, a job arranged by Harold Brown or another musical friend. Working for Carter, who was interested in Renaissance music and had an impressive collection of scores from his studies in Europe, brought an additional bonus. Carter recalls: "I knew Noah was deeply interested in the music, and he was also very poor. So I pulled out the whole pile and let Noah take his pick"<sup>54</sup> from his early music collection, which was "a treasure-trove, much of it virtually unknown even to scholars in this country."<sup>55</sup>

Greenberg's first position as a music director came from his friend Jesse Simons, who was by then an Assistant Political Director of the International Ladies' Garment Workers Union and

---

<sup>52</sup> Gollin, 90-91. For example, Haskell states that Greenberg's first exposure to early music was the recordings he found overseas (Haskell, 112), but this is not true.

<sup>53</sup> Gollin, 106. The festival must have been an extraordinary one, for Casals's biographer called it "a love feast among musicians" and the members of the festival orchestra publicly thanked Casals for his guidance and their pride in "being part of the beautiful collective work" (quoted in Gollin, 106).

<sup>54</sup> Quoted in Gollin, 109.

<sup>55</sup> Gollin, 109.

had contact with local chapter leaders. Through Simons, Greenberg became a choir director of Locals 22, 89, 91, and 135.<sup>56</sup> Together with the copying job and Edith's income, the Greenbergs could make a modest living.

However, the initial hardship and uncertainty of the financial situation, combined with personal conflicts, led to a separation in early 1951 as Noah left Edith after eleven years of marriage.<sup>57</sup> For Noah, this was also a beginning of a new life with music. He moved to an apartment in Greenwich Village, where he met — among others — Anatole Broyard, a reviewer and memoirist, and Wynstan Auden and Dylan Thomas, both internationally recognized poets. Greenberg resumed his informal singing sessions, and it was with some of the members of this group that Greenberg built the foundation for the New York Pro Musica Antiqua as it was formed late in 1952.

### **The United States and New York in the 1950s: An Economic and Cultural Background**

Many writers and intellectuals call the 1950s the dullest, most bland decade.<sup>58</sup> They claim that it was a happy and stable time, but because of a tendency to adhere to conformity, it was not a decade bursting with creativity. At the same time, during this decade the post-war economic boom and the anticipation of improved living conditions pushed technological developments as never before. On the one hand, as Joel Cohen suggests, one must “imagine America in the Eisenhower years. Imagine what that period represented in terms of blandness, conformity, and

---

<sup>56</sup> Ibid., 110-11. The Local 22 was the Jewish dressmakers; 89 the Italian dressmakers; 91 the children's wear makers; 135 the cloakmakers.

<sup>57</sup> The final legal process of divorce was dated May 12, 1952 (Gollin, 124).

<sup>58</sup> For example, John Patrick Diggins, *The Proud Decades: America in War and Peace, 1941-1960* (New York: W. W. Norton & Co., 1988); Joel Cohen and Herb Snitzer, *Reprise: The Extraordinary Revival of Early Music*; and William H. Chafe, *The Unfinished Journey: American Since World War II*, 2d ed. (New York: Oxford University Press, 1991).

the fear of appearing different or unusual.”<sup>59</sup> On the other hand, as the historian John Patrick Diggins comments, the attitude of complacency may have existed in the political and social areas, but “in all the arts and letters the postwar era exploded in excitement and controversy.”<sup>60</sup> Of course, it is difficult to make an accurate generalization to describe an entire decade, but Diggins offers a good conclusion:

Whatever the retrospective of writers and intellectuals, those who lived through the fifties looked upon them as a period of unbounded possibility. This was especially true of the beginning of the decade when the lure and novelty of material comforts seemed irresistible.<sup>61</sup>

The early 1950s, these years of “unbounded possibility,” was exactly the time when Noah Greenberg began his career with the New York Pro Musica.

The undeniable factor that contributed to this fascination with the “novelty of material comforts” was the unprecedented growth in the economy and the consequences it brought forth. Some statistics illuminate this observation: between 1945 and 1960 the gross national product increased by 250 percent;<sup>62</sup> the percentage of American families owning automobiles rose from 54 percent in 1948 to 73 percent in 1956; the percentage of American homes with television rose from 2.9 percent in 1948 to 81 percent in 1956; the ownership rate of refrigerators rose from 69.1 percent in 1946 to 96 percent in 1956; and for electric washers the percentage rose from 50.5 to 86.8 between 1946 and 1956.<sup>63</sup> The middle class expanded as the average real income of American workers increased,<sup>64</sup> and along with it came the rise in population, suburban migration, manufacturing and distribution of electric appliances, and more free time.

Diggins lists six possible reasons for this economic expansion and rise in living standards:

---

<sup>59</sup> Cohen, 32.

<sup>60</sup> Diggins, 220.

<sup>61</sup> *Ibid.*, 178.

<sup>62</sup> Chafe, 112.

<sup>63</sup> Diggins, 186.

<sup>64</sup> Chafe notes that “between 1947 and 1960 the average income for American workers increased by as much as it had in the previous half-century” (Chafe, 111).

(a) the lingering postwar back-up demand for consumer goods together with increased purchasing power as a result of savings; (b) the expansion of plant and machine tool capacity, and other technological advances left by the war and revived by the Cold War and Korean conflict; (c) the appearance of new and modernized industries ranging from electronics to plastics; (d) population growth and the expansion of large cities; (e) increases in the productivity, or output per man-hour, of the working force; and (f) the commitment to foreign aid, which made possible overseas credits and American exports.<sup>65</sup>

As seen from these developments, the economic growth and social stability in the postwar decade meant for an average American a life of material abundance and more leisure time. Consequently, the availability of leisure time increased the demand for entertainment. With the ever-growing distribution of television as well as the traditional radio and motion pictures, the mass media grabbed people's attention. Sporting events attracted more audiences, both live and through television.<sup>66</sup> In the music industry, the technological developments and growing availability of the long-playing record and playback equipment led the latest home-audio trends.

In terms of cultural developments, the fifties further carried on the ideas and traditions brought in by the European refugee intellectuals during and after the Second World War. Since the 1930s numerous American organizations such as the Emergency Committee on Aid of Displaced Foreign Scholars, Rockefeller and Carnegie Foundations, and the New School for Social Research in New York assisted European émigré scholars and artists with settling and continuing their work in the United States. Diggins reports that during the Third Reich more than 1,600 scholars, mostly Jewish, but also non-Jewish, were dismissed from their posts or forced into exile. Most of these scholars immigrated to the United States, where they were offered positions at universities and research centers.<sup>67</sup> In the arts, the European influence was remarkable, as seen in the roster of emigrant musicians and artists: Arturo Toscanini, Serge

---

<sup>65</sup> Diggins, 180.

<sup>66</sup> Ibid., 192.

<sup>67</sup> Ibid., 225.

Koussevitsky, Otto Klemperer, Bruno Walter, George Szell, Arnold Schoenberg, Béla Bartók, Igor Stravinsky, Paul Hindemith, George Balanchine, Walter Gropius, Charles Le Corbusier, Ludwig Mies van der Rohe, to name but a few.<sup>68</sup>

The relocation of major talents from Europe sparked and fueled the growth of cultural and intellectual activities in the United States, and more American individuals and organizations came to be recognized as leaders in their fields. New York, with its institutions of higher learning and research, cosmopolitan atmosphere, and concentration of gifted and ambitious individuals, took the lead as the cultural capital of the nation. Many writers, poets, composers and performing musicians lived or worked in New York. Furthermore, the New York Ballet under Balanchine was regarded as one of the best in the world, and with the “New York School” of abstract expressionism, New York replaced Paris as the leading center in the visual arts. Two of the most influential political philosophers of the time, Hannah Arendt and Leo Strauss, taught at The New School for Social Research, and New York intellectual circles were always alive and at the cutting edge of current trends. Diggins characterizes such assembly of minds as follows:

The inner circle of New York intellectuals consisted of those who had gone to City College of New York, engaged in fierce debates about Trotsky, wrote for *Partisan Review*, and who in the postwar years hung out in Greenwich Village bars and engaged in equally fierce debates about abstract expressionism.<sup>69</sup>

The vitality and intellectual stimulus that poured into the city added to its already thriving cultural tradition and contributed in bringing recognition to New York as an important and leading center of the Western world.

For Noah Greenberg, who was born and raised in New York, the city’s cultural and intellectual activities provided valuable resources in pursuit of his interests. Indeed, Diggins’s portrayal of the New York intellectual circle could be read as a description of Greenberg’s early

---

<sup>68</sup> Ibid., 221.

<sup>69</sup> Ibid., 265.

adult years. Greenberg was passionately involved with Trotskyian and labor movements, had friends and connections in Greenwich Village, and certainly was engaged in discussions on art and music. Furthermore, the rich cultural climate of New York enabled Greenberg to be exposed from early age to the top-level classical music performances. Finally, the resources available, be it at the New York Public Library or at museums and academic institutions, served as valuable places of scholastic and musical study and discovery for Greenberg.

To conclude, the economic boom and technological development of the 1950s provided opportunities for new ideas and businesses to grow. The average consumers, with increased financial resources, social stability, and leisure time, could more easily afford new products, services, and entertainment. For Greenberg, the new technological advances in the recording industry and the increased availability of free time and disposable income of the average Americans provided ideal conditions for his career as a professional musician to flourish. Culturally, with wartime emigration from Europe, the United States became a leader in many areas, including music and arts. New York was especially vitalized with new talents and diverse interests, and its cultural scene offered ample opportunities to try out new ideas. Greenberg eagerly took advantage of such opportunities, and the unique combination of his experiences prepared him to become a leader of America's first commercially successful early music ensemble.

### **Early Music Recordings and the Development of the Long-Playing Record**

Many historians, critics, and reporters have almost unanimously cited the advent of the recording medium of the long-playing record as the chief and most significant contributor in bringing early music closer to a wider range of public. Although the growing number of professionally trained musicians who specialized in early music and the emergence of charismatic

music directors such as Noah Greenberg and David Munrow influenced the course of the early music movement, their efforts alone could not have made such a shift in the mainstream musical taste.

Writing in 1957, Martin Mayer suggested that one of the factors that expanded the early music territory was “the growth of the phonograph record.”<sup>70</sup> Elaine Brody gives credit to the new technological developments in electronics, particularly the phonograph, in the growth of early music. The lowered cost of manufacturing LPs in the mid 1950s encouraged manufacturers and performers to take advantage of this opportunity to feature new repertoires. She says:

Instead of issuing the thirty-third recording of Beethoven’s *Eroica* which not only required huge forces but also had to compete with many versions already in existence, smaller companies like Vanguard, Nonesuch, and Turnabout turned to early music.<sup>71</sup>

Harry Haskell calls Greenberg’s generation the “children of the media age,” who were “attuned to the enormous potential that modern communications technology offered for disseminating music.” He continues: “Especially in the United States, with its culturally diverse and geographically far-flung audience, the mass media were a critical factor in the early music revival.”<sup>72</sup>

The idea of recording early music existed as early as 1891 with proposals to record Gregorian chants. However, such projects did not materialize in actual production until the 1900s. Some of the earliest examples of recorded early music are a set of piano rolls performed by Wanda Landowska in 1903, and some wax cylinder recordings of Arnold Dolmetch early in the decade, which, unfortunately, are lost. Also, the Gramophone Company recorded Gregorian

---

<sup>70</sup> Mayer, 38.

<sup>71</sup> Brody, 463.

<sup>72</sup> Haskell, 112.



chants in Rome in 1904. Unfortunately, the quality of many of these early and experimental recordings was poor, and the selection of the featured repertory was limited.<sup>73</sup>

The situation changed in the 1920s with both the expansion of early music activities and major advances in the recording technology. Bell Laboratories developed an electrical recording system that increased the possible frequency range of the recorded material from 250 to 2,500 cycles to 50 to 6,000 cycles, which enabled the recordings to have a wider and richer sound range. The system used condenser microphones that had up to one hundred times more sensitivity than previous models and could receive sounds in the distance more precisely. One of the trial recordings using this system was made in 1923 with the New York Philharmonic and the first commercial recording was released in 1925. The new technology made it possible to record a large symphony orchestra with much improved quality. This development standardized 33-1/3 rpm as the speed for professional recordings, while the already existing 78 rpm was used primarily for popular consumer discs.<sup>74</sup>

In the twenties and thirties the harpsichord was the most widely recorded early music instrument, because of its availability and popularity established by such star performers as Wanda Landowska and Violet Gordon Woodhouse. Along with vocal works, keyboard music on harpsichord was recorded and marketed by some major British and Continental companies. A roster of recorded performers and ensembles of this generation includes Anselm Hughe's Nashdom Abbey Singers, the Leipziger Thomanerchor, Sacher's Basle Chamber Choir, Davison's Harvard University Choir, Anna Linde, Régina Patorni-Cassadeus, Erwin Bodky,

---

<sup>73</sup> Ibid., 113-14.

<sup>74</sup> 33-1/3 rpm was chosen to synchronize with the motion pictures, which were recorded on 35 mm film with duration of eleven minutes. 78 rpm was standardized by Victor in 1901 and remained so (although there were other speeds developed and produced, for example 80 rpm by Edison) until the long-playing records at 33-1/3 rpm replaced it as the commercial standard in the 1950s. For a detailed account, see Steven E. Schoenherr, "Recording Technology History," 3 September 2001; available from <http://history.sandiego.edu/gen/recording/notes.html>; Internet; accessed 1 February 2002.

Lotte Lehmann, and Gerhard Hüsch, to name a few.<sup>75</sup> However, compared to vocal groups, instrumental consorts were not as widely recorded, perhaps because not many active professional instrumental ensembles existed. Arnold Dolmetsch and his family were probably the most recognized early instrumental ensemble at the time, but his performances and recordings were considered below professional standards in comparison to the musicians on modern instruments.<sup>76</sup>

Performances by smaller ensembles were better suited for recordings at this time. Early music ensembles were generally small groups, and the numerous chamber-choirs that emerged in England and Germany in the teens and twenties were a good match for the recording procedure of the time. In addition, smaller groups could project with better balance compared to the often muddy recordings by large choirs. For example, Haskell cites a recording released in 1923 by the English Singers in which vocal music of William Byrd was performed with one voice to a part, and notes that the chamber ensemble had “a presence that most choral recordings of the period lack.”<sup>77</sup>

Although limited at first, the technology of music recording developed rapidly. In the first complete recording of Bach’s Brandenburg Concertos in 1929, some high tessitura parts, for example the piccolo trumpet in the second concerto and even the flute in the fourth, had to be rearranged because the microphones could not successfully capture the high frequencies. However, by the mid-thirties, the newly developed technology enabled even the piccolo trumpet part in the second concerto to be heard in full sonority.<sup>78</sup>

---

<sup>75</sup> For a more complete list, see Haskell, 116.

<sup>76</sup> Haskell, 115.

<sup>77</sup> Haskell, 116.

<sup>78</sup> *Ibid.*, 117.

Through subscription projects in the 1930s,<sup>79</sup> record companies were able to expand their repertoire more freely and venture into lesser-known music. The resulting products included Landowska's recording of Bach's Goldberg Variations and sonatas by Couperin and Scarlatti; Albert Schweitzer's performances of Bach's organ music; Nadia Boulanger's renditions of Monteverdi's madrigals; Gregorian chants sung by the monks of Solesmes; and a selection of works by Lully, Rameau, Josquin des Prés, Palestrina, Schütz, and a number of Elizabethan composers.<sup>80</sup> In 1935 through its subscription system, Decca (England) completed a £20,000 project of an uncut recording of Purcell's *Dido and Aeneas* made on seven twelve-inch discs. In England, where early vocal music received growing public interest and support, the founding of the National Gramophonic Society further encouraged recordings of music not commonly heard.<sup>81</sup>

Another development that supported early music was the emergence of specialist record shops. Some of them even took on the projects themselves and issued recordings of various selections of unfamiliar music from the past and the present under their own labels.<sup>82</sup> In America the recording industry was coming out of the Depression-induced slump by the late thirties, and recordings of early music by such performers as Ars Rediviva, the Boyd Neel Orchestra, Ralph Kirkpatrick, and Nicola Montani's Palestrina Chorus were produced.<sup>83</sup> In the foreword to the first edition of *The Gramophone Shop Encyclopedia of Recorded Music* published in 1936, Lawrence Gilman observed that

the repertoire that is available today for students and gramophone enthusiasts will amaze those who have not kept pace with its recent extension. Not only have

---

<sup>79</sup> Haskell explains the idea of subscription in recordings: "by soliciting subscriptions from listeners interested in a specific composer or musical work, HMV (and later its competitors) could recoup in advance the cost of recordings that would not otherwise have been commercially attractive" (Haskell, 117).

<sup>80</sup> *Ibid.*, 117.

<sup>81</sup> *Ibid.*, 117.

<sup>82</sup> For example, the Boîte à Musique of Paris and the Gramophone Shop of New York (Haskell, 119).

<sup>83</sup> For a more complete list, see Haskell 120.

virtually all the standard works been recorded, but much [*sic*] of the rarest works of the past, known only by name to many musicians and music lovers, have now been transferred to the discs.<sup>84</sup>

In another instance an American music critic in 1940 remarked that “the phonograph within the last few years has been the chief means of bringing old music to the modern listener.”<sup>85</sup>

Going back to the early thirties, the emergence of historical anthologies provided extended possibilities for early music recordings. The first of its kind was Columbia’s (England) *History of Music by Ear and Eye*, which consisted of five eight-disc volumes each with an illustrated booklet that presented a survey of Western music from Gregorian chant to Varèse. Other projects that followed include Parlophone’s (Germany) *Two Thousand Years of Music* and the well-known *Anthologie Sonore* conceived by Curt Sachs. In 1932, L’Oiseau-Lyre, a new recording company with the specific purpose to publish and record early music, was founded by an Australian amateur musician and patron of the arts, Louise B. M. Dyer.<sup>86</sup>

These projects and developments steadily built up a foundation for the reception of early music in the public’s awareness. However, in the larger picture of the music industry, early music was still a peripheral interest. Even for Noah Greenberg, who regularly frequented the music listening center of the New York Public Library, and who had a keen interest in early music, recordings of early music were not easy to find in the late 1930s and ’40s, and he often had to rely on the scores and his imagination to familiarize himself with the music.

Nevertheless, in the next decade a dramatic development in the recording media would change the course of music performance and recording industry, including early music. In the 1950s and ’60s the early music movement was pushed forward by the development of the long-playing record, which proved to be more economical and had a longer playing time than 78 rpms.

---

<sup>84</sup> Quoted in Haskell, 117.

<sup>85</sup> David Hall, quoted in Haskell, 120.

<sup>86</sup> Haskell, 118-19. L’Oiseau-Lyre was absorbed by Decca after the Second World War.

With LPs, as they are now commonly called,<sup>87</sup> which became commercially available after the Second World War, the old music could reach an even wider public.

With the introduction of the long-playing record by the Columbia Records engineering team in 1948, a new age of mass audio communication began. Several phonograph record companies and researchers, among them RCA Victor and Columbia Records, had been engaged in a decades-long rivalry to develop and produce more economical, higher quality, and longer playing records.<sup>88</sup> By 1940 the commercial standard was the 12-inch acetate lacquer disc at 78 rpm that offered three to four minutes of playing time per side. To recover from the all-time low in record sales during the Great Depression, a new product that could offer longer playing time to accommodate at least an entire movement from a symphony on one side was urgently in demand. During World War II, such factors as the consumer goods shortage and the ban on commercial recording in the US, as well as the fact that most of the engineers at CBS were involved in military research projects, prevented any concrete achievements in the recording industry.<sup>89</sup> However, after the war, with the economic recovery and the fortification with wartime *émigré* engineers from Europe, the research and product development resumed and took a wide step forward.

The first long-playing discs had durations of eight to twelve minutes. However, to fit a musical work in its entirety on one disc, 90 percent of all existing classical repertory would require at least 17 minutes of playing time on each side, or 34 minutes total on one disc. In April 1947 Columbia developed 12-inch discs with a maximum playing time of 16½ minutes on both

---

<sup>87</sup> Dennis D. Rooney states that the term “Lp” was originally a trademark patented by Columbia, but because of its apt naming, it followed the same fate as “Cornflakes.” Dennis D. Rooney, “How the LP Was Born,” *International Classical Record Collector* 14 (autumn 1998): 37.

<sup>88</sup> See Dennis D. Rooney, “Paleo-LPs: The Unsuccessful Attempts,” *International Classical Record Collector* 14 (autumn 1998): 32-33.

<sup>89</sup> Rooney, “How the LP Was Born,” 31.

shellac and vinyl pressings. By the end of May, the playing time was increased to 20 minutes per side and vinyl pressings were favored. After further developments in playback equipment and in the marketing and promotion of new products, the long-playing record was introduced to the public in June 1948. Preserving this event is a famous photograph of two stacks of records that clearly showed the advantage of the LPs. On the left was a stack of 78 rpm discs that measured eight feet tall and contained a total of about 325 musical selections. On the right was a Columbia researcher, holding a stack just over 15 inches high that consisted of 101 new Columbia LPs containing music with the identical amount of playing time as the other stack.<sup>90</sup>

After its introduction to the market, it took several years for the LPs to gain mainstream acceptance. In 1949 RCA introduced a 45 rpm disc, which led to the so-called “Battle of Speeds,” and after a year of competition, a general agreement was reached that designated LPs for classical music and 45s for popular singles. The former “standard” speed of 78 rpm fell out of favor in the 1950s.<sup>91</sup>

However, by the mid-1950s, LPs had quite a significant effect on the recording industry.

Rooney describes the situation:

The LP had by then been wedded to the other most important postwar recording development, magnetic tape, whose low cost, portability and ease of editing not only revolutionized how records were made but led to an explosion of recorded repertoire simply unimaginable in 1945.<sup>92</sup>

The technology in producing and playing the long-playing records rapidly developed and the medium became readily available for the mass market. Assisted by the economic growth and social stability, the LPs offered new opportunities for the music industry, musicians, and the audience. For Greenberg, the recent development and advocacy of the LPs and the growth of

---

<sup>90</sup> Ibid., 31-36.

<sup>91</sup> Ibid., 37. According to Rooney, the 78 rpms were “essentially finished” by 1951. Elizabeth Roche states that “LPs had effectively banished 78s from the classical lists” by 1954 in England (Elizabeth Roche, “Early Music on Records in the Last 25 Years—1,” *Musical Times* 12 (1979): 34).

<sup>92</sup> Rooney, “How the LP Was Born,” 37.

record industry were crucial, because the New York Pro Musica was initially founded as a recording ensemble.<sup>93</sup> Without the long-playing record and the ensuing boom of the record industry, Greenberg's career in early music performance would have taken an entirely different form.

The stage was now set optimally for Noah Greenberg and his career in early music performance. A combination of many independent factors created an environment that fostered his work and enabled the early music movement to develop. In the context of the history of early music performance, the repertory was ready for a catalyst to give its movement a forward momentum. Although efforts had been made to foster interest in early music, such as the slow but steadily growing curiosity in the works and the emergence of professionally trained musicians with expertise in an early repertory, in reality, the general public of classical music-lovers was not aware of the music. Performances and recordings of early music were comparatively small in number, not as widely distributed or advertised, and not an attractive business commodity in the music industry. For early music to gain more recognition and interest that could further encourage its growth--in other words, for a true revival to take place--the music needed to be introduced to and heard by more listeners.

Indeed, making early music more accessible and enjoyable to a wider public was Greenberg's goal. His intense interest and love of the early repertory convinced his fellow musicians of the music's latent potential in musical communication, which they expressed in their performances. The economic growth and stability and social conditions of the time provided a greater number of the public with the time and means to listen to what Greenberg and the Pro Musica offered. The recent development in the long-playing record technology and its industry

---

<sup>93</sup> Gollin, 133.

provided an efficient means of communication that could reach a greater size and range of audience than ever before. It is not an overstatement to say that Greenberg was extremely fortunate, because all the conditions that made his career in early music successful were available and fitted perfectly like pieces in a puzzle. Finally, the increasing awareness and the growing number of listeners resulting from Greenberg's effort in turn created more support for the ensemble and early music, and this shift enabled the "vicious" circle of disinterest to turn into a productive one.



## CHAPTER 2

### THE NEW YORK PRO MUSICA

The year 1952 was the beginning of a new life for Noah Greenberg in personal and professional ways. Greenberg was leading a busy life trying to make ends meet, at the same time hoping that his musical career would take off.<sup>1</sup> Two positive events occurred during this year that moved his life forward: getting to know and getting engaged to Toni Feuerstein,<sup>2</sup> and being offered a proposal from a small New York record company to make a recording of Renaissance music. So began the twenty-one year long career of the New York Pro Musica, thirteen of which Greenberg led. During these twenty-one years the Pro Musica became an internationally recognized specialist and leader in early music performance. This chapter examines the work of the New York Pro Musica in two steps. First, a history of the founding of the ensemble will be presented in detail. A discussion of the Pro Musica's career will follow, with special consideration of the challenges and problems it faced as one of the first professional early music ensembles.

---

<sup>1</sup> James Gollin, *Pied Piper: The Many Lives of Noah Greenberg*, Lives in Music Series, no. 4 (Hillsdale, New York: Pendragon, 2001), 117. Gollin describes Greenberg's frenetic pace of life: "Copying music by day, leading I.L.G. choruses three, four or five nights a week, leading his own group on Tuesday evenings, teaching piano, trying to sell hi-fi equipment, running up to the Bronx to sell roofing—even for someone with Noah's vitality and endurance, it was too much."

<sup>2</sup> They were married in January 1953. Toni Greenberg supported the administration of the New York Pro Musica as a board member and later as the president after her husband's death.

## The Forming of the New York Pro Musica

The early 1950s saw a great boom in long-playing record production and distribution. Numerous small, independent recording companies and agencies were formed to record and sell practically any genre of music, as long as it promised to be interesting and appealing. Seamour Barab, a cellist and a friend of Howard Brown and Noah Greenberg, was one such agent producing LPs in post-war Europe. His method was to find, negotiate with, and record lesser-known and inexpensive orchestras and chamber groups in Europe for various small American record companies. Coincidentally, two clients of Barab, Jerry Newman and Bill Fox, who owned Esoteric Records (a newly founded small recording company in New York City) told Barab that they wanted to record Renaissance music. Barab immediately thought of Greenberg, who lived in New York and was looking for opportunities to be more involved in early music. Newman and Greenberg met sometime in December 1952 to discuss a recording contract, and this became the first step in the forming of the New York Pro Musica.<sup>3</sup>

Not surprisingly, it turned out that Greenberg had already begun his preparation. Around 1950 Greenberg had found a manuscript of *Il Festino*, a set of twenty madrigals, villanelli, and canzonettas, by the late sixteenth-century monk-composer Adriano Banchieri. He had kept this manuscript in his mind, hoping to perform it sometime. Now, this light-hearted Italian Renaissance vocal music seemed to be optimal as a program for a record. Although lacking formal music training and academic qualifications, Greenberg, with his trademark enthusiasm and confidence, secured a contract with Esoteric to record Banchieri's *Festino* to be performed with a vocal ensemble under his direction.<sup>4</sup>

---

<sup>3</sup> Ibid., 130.

<sup>4</sup> Ibid., 133

Taking this opportunity to the fullest, Greenberg set out to organize a choir with professionally trained voices. In offering this music for the first time in public, Greenberg wanted to settle for nothing less than a high quality, respectable, beautiful, musical, professional performance. The informal singing group that gathered every Tuesday evening at his apartment had brought together people interested in early music. Regular members came by word of mouth or through acquaintances, and included among others Nancy Macdonald, who was critic Dwight Macdonald's wife at the time; Peter Flanders, who owned an extensive library of English madrigal scores and shared it with the group; Ruth Daigon, a conservatory-trained singer; and Bernard Krainis, a recorder player and early music enthusiast like Greenberg.<sup>5</sup> However, having only one professional singer, Ruth Daigon, in his Tuesday night group, Greenberg had to probe his connections and search for the remaining qualified musicians for this special project.

One strong connection was Bernard Krainis, who came on Tuesday evenings to sing with Greenberg. Krainis, originally a jazz trombonist, began to play the recorder when he received a tenor recorder for his twenty-first birthday as a present from his father. He recalls the moment in 1945:

...until I had the thing in my hands—not only had I never seen or heard the instrument, but I had never even heard of it. It was an absolute first. I stayed up all night and figured out the notes, and since no one told me that it was an easy instrument, I started to practice.<sup>6</sup>

Krainis had studied anthropology and economics at Denver University. However, he turned down an offer to be recommended for a Rhodes Scholarship, and decided to pursue recorder performance and early music. Krainis enrolled at New York University to study early music with Gustave Reese. He also came in contact with Erich Katz and his Musicians' Workshop and joined

---

<sup>5</sup> Ibid., 113-18.

<sup>6</sup> Bernard Krainis, "An Interview with Bernard Krainis," interview by Sigrid Nagle and Marcia Blue, *American Recorder* 30, no.3 (August 1989): 97.

the American Recorder Society.<sup>7</sup> Krainis's weekly schedule was filled with playing and singing with various groups, studying, and teaching recorder. Like Greenberg, Krainis actively searched for music at libraries and hoped to find a group to perform it with.<sup>8</sup>

In January 1953 Greenberg officially signed a contract with Jerry Newman of Esoteric Records for his vocal group, which he called the Primavera Singers, to produce two recordings, the Banchieri *Festino* and a group of English madrigals.<sup>9</sup> Meanwhile Krainis himself was negotiating and organizing a project with Esoteric Records to record Handel's recorder sonatas and John Blow's *Ode on the Death of Mr. Henry Purcell*.

For his ensemble, Krainis had already recruited a young musician named Russell Oberlin. Krainis had met Oberlin, a lyric tenor, through a mutual friend, and invited him to join the ensemble for Blow's piece, to which Oberlin agreed. Oberlin, who had graduated from Juilliard at age twenty in 1948, was a sought-after musician in New York and a regular member at the Church of the Ascension music program. When Greenberg was searching for vocalists for his ensemble, Krainis recommended Oberlin. After much persuasion by Greenberg, Oberlin consented to join the Primavera Singers.<sup>10</sup>

A turning point in Oberlin's career as well as for the New York Pro Musica came about in the second rehearsal of the Primavera Singers. Initially, a soprano was singing the alto line. However, her voice did not project clearly enough, and Oberlin suggested that he could sing this part. Oberlin sang the line clearly without strain or turning to falsetto, and Greenberg immediately recognized a true countertenor voice. Through this incident Greenberg not only

---

<sup>7</sup> Ibid., 97.

<sup>8</sup> Gollin, 131.

<sup>9</sup> Ibid., 137. The first contract was signed for \$388.75 and royalties for two recordings with seven singers including Greenberg, and incidental keyboard music performed by Blanche Winogron.

<sup>10</sup> Oberlin recalls that he was simply too busy with other engagements at the time, and although singing in an ensemble with one voice to a part would have been a rewarding experience, he was initially reluctant to join. However, after meeting Greenberg and the members and hearing the musical selections, Oberlin could not resist (Gollin, 135).

“discovered” a countertenor, which is an essential part of early vocal ensemble music, but it also reconfirmed and strengthened his dream of creating a new kind of permanent performing group that specialized in early music.<sup>11</sup> With such rare talent as Oberlin under his wings, Greenberg felt that leading a professional early music ensemble was now an attainable goal.

Other singers Krainis introduced to Greenberg were bass Brayton Lewis, soprano Lois Roman, and sixteen-year-old soprano Sheila Jones, all Krainis’ acquaintances through the Musicians’ Workshop. In addition, Greenberg recruited Arthur Squires, a successful industrial chemist and exceptional tenor who sang with the Cantata Singers and Randolph Singers.<sup>12</sup> Ruth Daigon, at the time Ruth Popeski and a member of Greenberg’s Tuesday night group, was a lyric soprano, who studied at the Toronto Royal Conservatory and came to New York City in 1950 to continue her studies and pursue a career in music.<sup>13</sup> These six singers, including Oberlin, were the initial members of the Primavera Singers.<sup>14</sup>

Like Greenberg, Krainis needed to find musicians for his ensemble. In addition to Oberlin, Krainis had recruited LaNoue Davenport, a fellow recorder player and assistant director of the Musicians’ Workshop. Through Greenberg’s ensemble, Krainis was introduced to Arthur Squires. In addition, Krainis recruited harpsichordist Herman Chessid, a graduate of Yale School of Music and student of Hindemith and Ralph Kirkpatrick, and together with cellist George Koutzen, the two comprised the continuo section. Soprano Valarie Lamoree also joined and tenor Charles Bressler later replaced Squires. Krainis named his ensemble the St. Cecilia Players.<sup>15</sup>

The two groups, however, faced the same problem: Esoteric Records could not provide any assistance in promoting the new records. The company had very few business connections

---

<sup>11</sup> Ibid., 135-36.

<sup>12</sup> Ibid., 134.

<sup>13</sup> Ibid., 119.

<sup>14</sup> Ibid., 135.

<sup>15</sup> Ibid., 140-142.

and resources and its marketing activity was limited to its shop in Greenwich Village. It was up to the performers to take action to promote their product.

Because of the similarity in the nature of the projects and the overlapping of some members between the two groups, Greenberg and Krainis decided to work together and co-sponsor a live concert performance to promote their new albums. The two leaders combined their forces, the Primavera Singers and the St. Cecilia Players, to found the New York Pro Musica Antiqua and formed a corporation in March 1953 to manage the business details.<sup>16</sup> The purpose of the corporation was:

to encourage the general public's understanding of early music through concerts and recordings, to promote research of music not generally known to the general public and to musicians, to acquire appropriate manuscripts, scores, and musical instruments, to maintain facilities, and to employ singers and instrumentalists to carry out the organization's purpose.<sup>17</sup>

The first concert was scheduled at the New School for Social Research in late April 1953.

Greenberg borrowed the money needed to make a deposit from a friend, and all the members worked to publicize the concert. Excluding the fact that no one thought of preparing change for the box office, and despite the very lengthy program, the concert was a success, capturing the attention of the capacity audience.<sup>18</sup>

Once again, Greenberg was able to be at the right place at the right time. The first concert not only brought instant public recognition and interest to the New York Pro Musica Antiqua and the music it presented, but also planted the seed of a relationship that would grow into a successful musical and business partnership. One member of the audience was William Kolodney, program director of the Young Men's and Young Women's Hebrew Association of

---

<sup>16</sup> Ibid., 145. The name of the ensemble was later modified as New York Pro Musica, to prevent confusion with the already existing Pro Musica Antiqua of Brussels, led by Safford Cape.

<sup>17</sup> Sarah Jane Gaskill, "The Artist as Manager: Noah Greenberg and the New York Pro Musica" (M.A. thesis, The American University, 1984), 11.

<sup>18</sup> Gollin, 146-47.

New York on Ninety-second Street, the largest and most active Jewish community center in the United States at the time. It was through Kolodney and the concerts at the Ninety-second Street “Y” that the New York Pro Musica Antiqua would gain its fame and success as a professional performing and recording ensemble of early music. Kolodney was impressed and overwhelmed by the New School concert and helped to initiate a subscription series of the New York Pro Musica Antiqua at the “Y,” which promised the ensemble a secure performance venue, audience, recognition, and prestige.<sup>19</sup>

### **The Career of the New York Pro Musica**

The New York Pro Musica Antiqua grew to become the most prominent early music ensemble and institution in the United States. By the time of Greenberg’s death in 1966, the group was recognized as a leader in early music performance and strove to maintain this status until it disbanded in 1974. Activities under the auspices of the New York Pro Musica Antiqua, and later the New York Pro Musica, encompassed not only performances in recordings and concerts, but also extended tours within and outside of the United States; the writing and publishing of performance editions and various articles; appearances on television and radio programs; educational programs with lessons, workshops, and seminars; and large-scale projects such as the presentations of the liturgical dramas *Daniel* and *Herod*.

As a performing unit, the New York Pro Musica began with two ensembles: the Primavera Singers with six vocalists, and the instrumental St. Cecilia Players that originally consisted of two tenors, two recorders, and basso continuo. By the early 1960s Pro Musica’s vocal groups expanded and were organized according to their specialization. The three permanent groups were the six-voice Concert Ensemble, which replaced the Primavera Singers; the sixteen-

---

<sup>19</sup> Ibid., 148-51.

voice Motet Choir in a style of a Renaissance chapel choir with only male singers including four boy sopranos; and the five-voice Abbey Singers, which served as a chamber vocal ensemble. An offspring of the St. Cecilia Players, the Instrumental Ensemble, also called the Wind Ensemble, with most of its players doubling on various instruments according to the needs of the music, eventually became the Renaissance Band with fourteen regular members.

As one of the first ensembles to specialize in the performance of early music, Pro Musica faced many challenges and difficulties, in both musical and administrative aspects. In terms of musical approach and interpretation, the group first had to obtain necessary but rare instruments and locate and recruit appropriate performers. Also, a great deal of research and creative planning was necessary in the process of repertory and program building. Furthermore, in addition to the usual challenges confronting professional ensembles, Greenberg and the Pro Musica had to overcome many hurdles as a specialist in early music.

One distinct attraction of the Pro Musica performances was the then novel sonority of early instruments. In a Pro Musica program, the audience could expect lively selections featuring many of these unusual instruments, such as recorder,<sup>20</sup> viola da gamba, krummhorn, cornetto, sacbutt, and an assortment of percussion, with each musician playing two or even three instruments. This added variety and contrast in sound, as well as a stunning display of showmanship as virtuoso musicians effortlessly switched instruments back and forth.

The instrumental ensemble of the Pro Musica originated with Bernard Krainis's St. Cecilia Players, which performed chamber works of Handel and Blow in 1953. Krainis admits that in those days, so little was known about the performance practice of early instrumental music

---

<sup>20</sup> Recorders were still not well known in the 1950s as noted by Shelley Gruskin, who joined Pro Musica in 1960. He tells in an interview that as a flute student at Eastman School of Music in the mid '50s, he organized a recorder ensemble and recalls that "people had never heard such a thing" (Shelley Gruskin, "I Feel Like a Millionaire!" interview by Tina Chancey, *Early Music America* 9, no. 2 (summer 2003): 33.



that technical as well as musical interpretations were done by experimenting or by trial and error. He recalls such an experimental approach in mastering a new piece: “We would have learned everything we needed to know by actually playing the repertory.”<sup>21</sup> The lack of tradition, however, was not always a disadvantage, as will be discussed later.

Another problem was acquiring instruments appropriate for the repertory and determining the ones with satisfactory qualities. The small number of professional early instrument makers and the limited number of models produced, and the cost of such rare instruments were a source of frustration to the musicians. First of all, it was difficult to find the instruments, or to find a maker willing to make the instruments. In addition, the cost and the uncertainty of the usability of the end product were high. For example, when Greenberg ordered a late-medieval-style portative organ in 1953 from the Rieger Organ Company after long negotiations, it was to become the first such organ to be reconstructed in four centuries. Lacking an existing model to work from, the reconstruction was difficult, and the maker extended its deadline several times. The end result brought disappointment and frustration: Greenberg had already booked a concert featuring the organ at the Metropolitan Museum of Art, but the instrument was not finished in time for the concert.<sup>22</sup>

Second, when a model of an instrument that could be used for performances did exist, it was often not the right model. D. C. Culbertson reports in *American Recorder* that “All the recorders played in the early Pro Musica were Baroque models, since no makers made Renaissance models at the time, and all were adaptations rather than copies of actual instruments.”<sup>23</sup> Also, the shawms available then were made by Moeck, which, intended for

---

<sup>21</sup> Bernard Krainis, “Gone but Not Forgotten,” *American Recorder* 38 (1997): 21.

<sup>22</sup> Gollin, 166-67.

<sup>23</sup> D. C. Culbertson, “Men, Women, and Early Winds: The Recorders and Double Reeds of the New York Pro Musica,” *American Recorder* 37 (November 1996): 8.

amateurs, employed an easier fingering system, sacrificing the intonation instead. In addition, good reeds were not readily available for shawms and krummhorns.<sup>24</sup> Furthermore, the lack of availability of instruments restricted possible repertory that could be performed, and Krainis recalls this as a source of great frustration.<sup>25</sup>

Finally, sometimes problems were caused by the players of the instruments and not the instruments themselves. In the early years, finding a gambist, for example, was not easy. Nina Courant, an amateur gambist and wife of a mathematics professor at New York University, was recruited for the Handel disc. At the time, she was the only gambist available, but this elderly woman was not a professional musician. Gollin reports a rather amusing episode, where she would verbally express her responses to the music during the recording sessions, and the editing of the tape involved heavy splicing to remove them. Not only that, she could not master some of the fast passages, and the mistakes were edited and even justified with explanations in the liner notes.<sup>26</sup>

This was an early and extreme example, but in later years, when the Wind Band hired extra players, other kinds of problems arose. Martha Bixler, a recorder player with the Pro Musica, recalls that professional oboists and bassoonists were hired as supplemental shawm and krummhorn players. However, in many instances, they “insisted on strict adherence to union rules about breaks during rehearsals and rates of pay, but rarely practiced or even changed their reeds.”<sup>27</sup> In spite of such difficulties, the Pro Musica instrumentalists were able to produce recordings and performances that were positively received by their listeners.

---

<sup>24</sup> Culbertson, 9.

<sup>25</sup> Krainis, “Gone but Not Forgotten,” 21.

<sup>26</sup> Gollin, 156.

<sup>27</sup> Culbertson, 9.

Pro Musica, like any other ensemble, experienced changes in personnel. Some members were replaced to improve the balance and quality of the ensemble, and others left the group to pursue solo or other musical careers. In either case, Greenberg and the Pro Musica were able to find qualified replacements and the overall identity of the Pro Musica did not suffer. Denis Stevens credits this consistency to Greenberg:

Excellent as they [NYPM] were, individually and as a group, it was Noah Greenberg's enthusiasm and drive that brought them year after year to a higher peak of perfection, and although inevitably he suffered changes of personnel he always managed to replace star performers with promising young people who blended smoothly into the ensemble and maintained the quality of their musical offerings.<sup>28</sup>

One factor that helped to sustain the Pro Musica's high level of performance was Greenberg's resolution to maintain a high standard in professionalism. He wanted and expected full commitments from the artists and in turn firmly believed that they deserved appropriate payment. Greenberg's goal and dream was to make the Pro Musica a part of the classical music concert world and be able to fully support its musicians as professional early music performers. Although the latter goal could not be fully achieved, Greenberg's unbending commitment in realizing high professional standard continued to reinforce the Pro Musica's reputation.

Another challenge specific to the Pro Musica as a pioneer early music ensemble was how to select and present the repertory that was unfamiliar to the audience. Unlike traditional classical ensembles, which could attract an audience by presenting familiar and standard works, most if not all of the music the Pro Musica introduced was new to the listeners. It was again Greenberg's talent in recognizing interesting features in musical works that led the Pro Musica to success.

Gollin confirms this point:

One of Noah's strengths as a promoter and program planner was his understanding of the peculiar power of early music to make the past come alive. With this went a

---

<sup>28</sup> Dennis Stevens, "Tribute to Noah Greenberg," quoted in Gaskill, 118.

shrewd sense of how to turn milestones of cultural history—even those as obscure as the anniversary of a little-known madrigalist [Morley, in this case]—into performing opportunity for Pro Musica.<sup>29</sup>

Greenberg was able to turn a disadvantage into an advantage and use this point to hook the listeners.

To sustain this curiosity, the Pro Musica had to extend its repertory and constantly offer something new and interesting to the audience. A wider repertory, however, requires varied groupings of vocalists and instrumentalists. To avoid constant shifting and changing of personnel, a solution Greenberg employed was to form several small ensembles within the Pro Musica that worked together as need arose. The small size of the each group allowed it to remain flexible, yet as combined forces, the groups could perform a wider range of repertory. Greenberg explains its merit:

Indeed, [the small ensembles] complement [the Pro Musica] and provide additional opportunity for the kind of research into the sounds and performance practices of the time which Pro Musica considers to be an important part of its work, and which has produced the repertory and virtuosity of the professional ensemble itself.<sup>30</sup>

These ensembles within the New York Pro Musica were the Concert Ensemble (previously the Primavera Singers), the Wind Band or later the Renaissance Band, the Motet Choir, and the Abbey Singers.

The administrative and financial difficulties of operating a professional early music ensemble remained a challenge for the Pro Musica, even though its facilities and organizational system improved and grew as the artistic activities expanded. In terms of physical office space, the Pro Musica's administrative center was initially located in Greenberg's own apartment, which

---

<sup>29</sup> Gollin, 162.

<sup>30</sup> Quoted in Gaskill, 47.

served as its headquarters, rehearsal space, library, and organization and educational center.<sup>31</sup> In later years, the Pro Musica was able to afford larger office, library, and rehearsal space. This served to better support the multi-faceted activities of the group.<sup>32</sup>

However, in terms of financial and administrative challenges, Greenberg and the Pro Musica faced a thorny path. In addition to the high cost of establishing the capital, which included the music, instruments, books, and office and studio equipment, the group had to somehow find the necessary funding to meet the organizational and publicity costs, rental fees for the concert venues, and to pay its members' salaries, in other words to sustain its status as a professional ensemble.

In addition, as the country's first professional early music ensemble, the New York Pro Musica had labor and expenses usually not required by other kinds of performing ensembles. Such costs included purchasing specialized instruments; conducting research to select and interpret the repertory; preparing performance editions of the music; writing scholarly program notes; translating texts; and finally, rehearsing for each new program, which, due to the unfamiliarity of the music, required up to a dozen rehearsals.<sup>33</sup> Purchasing instruments was difficult, both because of the cost and the limited selection of good instruments and makers to choose from. Culbertson's comment that "most of the instruments the Pro Musica used during their early days were paid for with group members' own money, despite the fact that their salaries were rather low,"<sup>34</sup> attests to the time and dedication the players devoted to building up the collection of early instruments for which the Pro Musica came to be known. In addition, costs to

---

<sup>31</sup> Gollin, 160.

<sup>32</sup> *Ibid.*, 224-25.

<sup>33</sup> Gaskill, 23.

<sup>34</sup> Culbertson, 9.

conduct extended tours, hire extra players for special programs, and establish a research library all contributed to the financial challenges the Pro Musica faced.

The administrative difficulty stemmed from two causes. First, the system and network of arts administration and government support of the arts as we know it today had not yet developed in the early 1950s. Gaskill explains the situation:

“Arts administration” as a profession and the body of arts management literature available to managers of arts organizations today did not exist then. Fund raising was limited to wealthy arts patrons, other individual contributors, and foundations. Regular Federal government funding, other than international tours supported by the State Department, began only in 1965 with the creation of National Endowment of the Arts. State government support began in New York in 1960 with the foundation of the New York State Council of the Arts; in the early years it was a small organization “run out of a tiny office.” Corporate sources of funding had yet to be tapped.<sup>35</sup>

Furthermore, no one on the Pro Musica’s board of directors had a professional business background, and it was reported that the administration was carried on in an experimental way without an established model.<sup>36</sup> The result was a constant lack of financial stability and security.

Second, the concentration of administrative responsibility on Greenberg alone caused problems as well. Greenberg’s eagerness to take full control may have come from the fact that he saw the Pro Musica as his group that he founded and nurtured. In addition to being the musical director, Greenberg voluntarily acted as its “booking agent, publicist, and fund raising executive.”<sup>37</sup> Furthermore, Greenberg felt his duty to actively participate in managerial matters. Richard French, former Pro Musica board director, remembered that Greenberg was always present at board meetings. He recalls, “There really couldn’t have been a meeting without Noah. It was his organization, for better or for worse.”<sup>38</sup> Perhaps in the first years of the Pro Musica’s

---

<sup>35</sup> Gaskill, 4.

<sup>36</sup> Ibid., 3.

<sup>37</sup> Gollin, 160.

<sup>38</sup> Gaskill, 4.

career the personal approach of Greenberg seemed reasonable and effective to him and to the organization. However, as the Pro Musica grew in its size and scope, it became apparent that the group could not be organized as a one-man-show, not to mention the tremendous strain and pressure on Greenberg.

Nevertheless, their long list of achievements attests to the fact that Greenberg and the Pro Musica did indeed cope with these and other challenges in pursuing their dream of being a professional early music ensemble. The following summary of Pro Musica's activities is based on Sarah Jane Gaskill's master's thesis in arts administration, "The Artist as Manager: Noah Greenberg and the New York Pro Musica." The overview also includes relevant financial and administrative issues.

In the first fiscal season, 1953-54, the New York Pro Musica presented eight public live concerts including its opening concert at the New School for Social Research. Owing to the arrangement made possible by William Kolodney, the Pro Musica gave four concerts at the Kaufmann Auditorium at the Ninety-second Street "Y." Three additional concerts took place at the Metropolitan Museum of Art. Greenberg and the Pro Musica's association with the Metropolitan Museum of Art, which began in the fall of 1953, became an important artistic and business partnership for both parties. The connection was established in a three-fold way. First, Greenberg contacted Emanuel Winternitz, a musicologist and curator of the Musical Instrument Collection of the Metropolitan Museum of Art, who was responsible for booking concerts in the museum's galleries. Then Greenberg wrote to Beatrice Farwell, who was a friend of Arthur Squires, daughter of composer Arthur Farwell, and employee of the Education Department of the museum. Farwell, an amateur singer and devotee of early music herself, enthusiastically incorporated the Pro Musica into the museum's medieval and Renaissance projects. The third

relationship was instigated by Margaret B. Freeman, the Associate Curator of The Cloisters of the Metropolitan Museum of Art, who was looking for medieval music to be presented there. As will be seen later, The Cloisters would become an important venue for staging the *Play of Daniel*.<sup>39</sup>

During this first year, the New York Pro Musica recorded six albums for Esoteric Records, five of which were released in 1953. As mentioned earlier, the first Pro Musica concert at the New School was intended to publicize the first two record issues. Owing much to the success of the concert,<sup>40</sup> the Primavera Singer's *Festino*, released in early May, had sold over 300 copies by the end of June.<sup>41</sup> The number may seem small in today's standards, but for a record produced by a small local record company of a newly formed and little known early music ensemble in the early 1950s, this was significant proof of public recognition and interest. Moreover, this achievement in record sales could be seen as a good indication that the music appealed to the general public, and not only to the specialists.

However, from the very beginning of the Pro Musica's career, funding was a problem. For the Pro Musica debut concert in 1953, Martin Mayer reports that Greenberg and Krainis had to borrow some money and literally "empty their pockets of a hundred dollars to rent the auditorium at New York's New School for Social Research for a matinee concert."<sup>42</sup> In the early years, the income from the Pro Musica activities alone could not support a living for any of its members. Greenberg, for example, supplemented his director fee for the concerts with Guggenheim grants, writing, and teaching at Mannes School of Music in New York. Other members also taught or performed outside the Pro Musica.

---

<sup>39</sup> Gollin, 166-67.

<sup>40</sup> A review of the concert in the *New York Herald Tribune* stated that "both the vocal and instrumental ensembles of Pro Musica group are eminently able to and equipped to bring vigorous life to the music of another day" (J. S. Harrison, review of New York Pro Musica Antiqua, *New York Herald Tribune*, 27 April 1953, 13:2).

<sup>41</sup> Gollin, 155.

<sup>42</sup> Martin Mayer, "Musical Echoes of the Renaissance," *The Reporter* 17 (September 5, 1957): 39.



For a new and unusual ensemble such as the New York Pro Musica, funds from donations and grants were what actually supported its activity. Fortunately, Greenberg’s skill in fund raising and public relations—and his personal connections and enthusiasm for the Pro Musica—saved the group’s financial situation. James Gollin names some of the influential social figures in 1950s New York whom Greenberg befriended or made contact with: Judge Julius and Betty Isaacs of Greenwich Village; James Ingram Merrill, a young artist, social and cultural arbiter, poet, and son of Charles E. Merrill of Merrill Lynch; Lincoln Kirstein, a renowned leader in and patron of the arts and founder of the New York City Ballet<sup>43</sup>; and Leo Lerman, a “party giver extraordinaire,” and “collector of famous people.”<sup>44</sup> James Merrill, for example, supported the arts generously and it was noted that he gave Greenberg \$5,000 on at least two occasions before 1955. From Lincoln Kirstein, the Pro Musica not only received financial support, but also organizational and production assistance in various musical drama projects. Furthermore, attending events hosted by socialites such as Leo Lerman proved to be an important means to rub elbows with other influential figures and “cultural taste makers” to give the Pro Musica free publicity.<sup>45</sup>

However, even with donations the New York Pro Musica could not provide a stable and secure income for its members. Fund raising was difficult at times, and relying on Greenberg alone to secure donations was not practical. The amount of income was unpredictable and the dependency on Greenberg placed much additional responsibility on his shoulders. Below is a table of received donations in the first years that illustrates how donated income fluctuated.<sup>46</sup>

Season	Amount of donation received
1953-54	\$1,762

---

<sup>43</sup> Gollin, 174.

<sup>44</sup> Ibid., 158.

<sup>45</sup> Ibid., 157-59.

<sup>46</sup> Gaskill, 26.

1954-55	\$4,205
1955-56	\$12,410
1956-57	\$10,129

The resulting amount may have depended on the kind of projects taken on by the Pro Musica, how much effort Greenberg put into fund raising, and simply luck. However, the Pro Musica always managed to stay afloat financially.

Already in its second year, 1954-55, the Pro Musica presented seventeen concerts, in some prestigious venues including Lenox Town Hall near Tanglewood, Massachusetts, the Folger Shakespeare Library in Washington, D.C., and the Peabody Conservatory. In 1955 Greenberg collaborated with the poet Wynstan H. Auden in a program of Elizabethan poetry and music, and the performance, with Auden reciting the poems, pulled in the Pro Musica's first capacity audience concert at the Kaufmann auditorium. As an extension of this project, Greenberg published an anthology of Elizabethan vocal music, *An Elizabethan Songbook*,<sup>47</sup> which was later reprinted in paperback format.

In 1955-56, twenty concerts were presented, including one for the annual meeting of the American Musicological Society held at Princeton University, and one at Vassar College (Poughkeepsie, New York), and one at the Detroit Museum of Art. In 1955 the Pro Musica appeared on television during CBS's *Omnibus* and in 1956 on *Camera 3*. During this fiscal year, the Pro Musica signed a recording contract with Columbia Records. Starting with the *Evening of Elizabethan Verse and Its Music* with Auden, the group recorded four albums. In addition, the Pro Musica hired its first concert tour manager and fulfilled ten touring engagements. Also this year, the Pro Musica initiated its sheet music publication project, and established the New York Pro Musica Editions.

---

<sup>47</sup> W. H. Auden and Noah Greenberg, *An Elizabethan Songbook* (New York: Doubleday and Co., 1955).

The New York Pro Musica went on its first extended tour in 1956-57. All eighteen performances during the tour in the Mid-West were well received, and the group was re-engaged at every venue for future performances. All in all, the Pro Musica presented a total of thirty-nine concerts, including one at the American Shakespeare Festival that season. Other important developments this year were the establishment and expansion of its library and instrumental collection, and the initiation of its Education Program. Through the Education Program, the Pro Musica offered weekly study groups for students and amateurs in three areas: a choral program led by Greenberg, a viol study group by Martha Blackman, and a recorder study group by Krainis.

Artistically, the New York Pro Musica had gained forward momentum that would lead it through new projects and expand its areas of activities. However, the financial situation of the individual musicians had not yet stabilized. At the beginning of its fifth fiscal year, Martin Mayer reported that none of the members could make a living solely from the Pro Musica salaries: "Next season's schedule represents about half the number of appearances which would be necessary to give Pro Musica's members a decent living from early music."<sup>48</sup> All the members agreed on the importance of the concert tours for the group's artistic success. However, each member was only paid \$50 honorarium per concert and travel expenses, but was left to pay for the meals and accommodations on his own.<sup>49</sup> In 1957, for the first time Greenberg received an annual salary of \$1,000 excluding the director fees for the concert performances.<sup>50</sup> Otherwise he supplemented his income with teaching and writing. His wife, Toni, who assisted in administrative matters of the Pro Musica, received no salary for her work and would not be paid for the first time until 1964.<sup>51</sup>

---

<sup>48</sup> Mayer, 40.

<sup>49</sup> Culbertson, 9.

<sup>50</sup> *Ibid.*, 9.

<sup>51</sup> Gaskill, 84. Toni Greenberg's first salary in 1964 was \$1,500 for the year. In comparison, the first full-time secretary, who was hired in 1963-64 season, received annual salary of \$5,200.

The most important project for the Pro Musica in the 1957-58 season, and perhaps for its entire career, was the *Play of Daniel*. It was premiered in January 1958 at the Romanesque Hall of The Cloisters, followed by ten additional performances that year. In addition, the Pro Musica performed in fifteen touring engagements and gave seven concerts in New York. An exclusive recording contract was signed with Decca Records, with an agreement to record two albums and an optional third one per year. In December 1957, The Rockefeller Foundation awarded the Pro Musica a grant of \$46,000 to be paid over a five-year period, which supported and revitalized the group's projects. With the funding, the Pro Musica established a reference library, purchased several instruments, rented a spacious office and rehearsal studio, and set up organizational headquarters. Workshops and study groups continued, with the addition of a wind study group. Also this year the Motet Choir was formed to specialize in Renaissance sacred polyphonic vocal music.

*The Play of Daniel* remained the highlight of the Pro Musica's activity in 1958-59. Seven performances of the play were presented, and a television and radio performance was broadcast by the Canadian Broadcasting Company. In addition, the Pro Musica fulfilled forty-four touring engagements this season. Greenberg initiated a lecture series entitled Pro Musica Forum and the Pro Musica presented three lectures,<sup>52</sup> as well as three seminars. The Pro Musica appointed Columbia Artists Management, the world's largest concert management agency then, to organize the business matters for the concert tours. By this season, the Pro Musica's touring ensemble was standardized and called the Concert Ensemble, consisting of two sopranos, a countertenor, a tenor, a baritone, a bass, and four instrumentalists. According to the needs of the program, the Concert Ensemble was combined with other groups and additional instrumentalists. Also this

---

<sup>52</sup> The three lecturers were given by Father Weakland, on the problems of transcribing *The Play of Daniel* into modern notation; Albert Fuller, on the harpsichord and its revival during the past fifty years; and Joel Newman, on the music of Renaissance Spain. Gaskill, 43.

year, Greenberg hired Joel Newman, a musicologist and associate of the Pro Musica since the Salamone Rossi program in 1958, as the official librarian for the Pro Musica book and manuscript collection.

The 1959-60 season saw a first significant shift in personnel. Three important members decided to leave the Pro Musica: Russell Oberlin to pursue a solo career; Bethany Beardslee to concentrate her talent on contemporary music; and Bernard Krainis also to pursue a solo career. They were replaced by Robert White, Carolyn Backus, and LaNoue Davenport, respectively, and Davenport continued the recorder classes that Krainis initiated. On the administrative side, Richard French followed Arthur Squires as the Board President. In spite of the changes, the Pro Musica presented sixty-one performances including eight *Daniel* presentations, three concerts by the Motet Choir and the Wind Ensemble, and three more at the “Y.” In the area of music publication, Greenberg completed and published the performance edition of *The Play of Daniel*.

An observation of the financial situation of this season illustrates a typical yearly struggle of the organization to balance its budget. Gaskill reports that although the net income from concert performances totaled \$51,073, the expenses, including artists fees, transportation, *per diem*, and the cost of a band boy amounted to \$57,693. The Pro Musica attempted to cover the loss with other projects and fundraising. However, even with \$13,069 in donations, \$5,000 from a special benefit performance of *Daniel*, and \$8,000 from the Rockefeller Foundation, the group ended with a \$2,103 deficit. Furthermore, to balance the budget from the previous seasons and to carry out its future plans, the Pro Musica would need a steady donation income of \$20,000 in the following years.

A major event in 1960-61 was the invitation from the Department of State to perform *The Play of Daniel* and several concerts on a European tour supported by the President’s Program for Intercultural Exchange, administered by the American National Theatre and Academy. The Pro

Musica presented fifty-six performances in two months, including nine Concert Ensemble performances, a taping for the British Broadcasting Corporation, and partaking on radio programs in England, France, and Italy. Back at home, the Pro Musica offered fifty-eight performances, including fifteen *Daniel* presentations and several concerts by the Motet Choir and the Wind Ensemble. Also, the Pro Musica appeared on Leonard Bernstein's *Young People's Concert* on CBS. During this year, Davenport was appointed director of educational activities and the Abbey Singers was formed. By 1961 the Pro Musica library held 2,450 items.

A much-needed financial break-through came in the form of two grants in 1961-62. The Rockefeller Foundation awarded the New York Pro Musica a second grant in the amount of \$15,000 to be paid over a four-year period. Furthermore, the Ford Foundation offered a choral conductor fellowship to Noah Greenberg in the amount of \$3,000 and the Pro Musica received additional \$7,000 to expand the repertoire and support the rehearsals of the Motet Choir. With the financial support, the Pro Musica continued its performance projects with fifty-five concerts on tour, ten in New York, and twelve *Daniel* performances. The five-voice Abbey Singers presented nineteen concerts, and the Wind Ensemble, now expanded to fourteen players and renamed as the Renaissance Band, made two recordings of their own. An agreement was reached that an artist must stay with the Pro Musica at least three years to receive royalties from recordings.

In April 1963 the Ford Foundation awarded the New York Pro Musica a grant in the amount of \$465,000 to be paid over a ten-and-a-half-year period. The funding helped with the administrative costs and in expanding the ensembles and raising the members' salaries. In the 1962-63 season, the Concert Ensemble toured for twelve weeks, and also gave a performance at the opening of the Philharmonic Hall, also known as the Avery Fisher Hall, at Lincoln Center, New York. The Pro Musica appeared on NBC's *Today Show* on Christmas Day in 1962. These developments reflect the public recognition Greenberg and the New York Pro Musica had earned

in the first ten years of their career. In addition, the Abbey Singers signed a contract independent from the New York Pro Musica with Decca. In terms of personnel changes, Charles Bressler, one of the Pro Musica founding members, as well as Robert White, Barbara Mueser (viola da gamba), and Joel Newman left the group. They were replaced by Ray DeVoll, John Ferrante, Judith Davidoff, and Charles Canfield Brown, respectively.

In the summer of 1963 the New York Pro Musica went on its second trans-Atlantic tour, performing in Holland, Spain, Israel, and Yugoslavia. Back at home it participated in three concert tours including one to Canada, and gave three concerts in New York with three new programs for the season. In December the Pro Musica premiered *The Play of Herod*, its second medieval liturgical drama production, at the Fuentiduena Apse of the Cloisters. The Renaissance Band presented nine concerts, and the Motet Choir gave six concerts. With the financial assistance from the grants, the Pro Musica was able to pay off some of the loans, hire a full-time secretary, and—for the first time since their founding— was able to offer thirty-five of its members social security and unemployment benefit coverage. LaNoue Davenport, assisted by Martha Bixler, expanded the Education Program through the Collegium Musicum and provided instruction on all instruments to encourage more younger and serious students to learn early music, and Shelley Gruskin led the recorder classes. The heavy workload and stress, unfortunately, began to take toll on Greenberg's health, and in the winter of 1963-64 he fell ill; the group continued performing without him for some time until he recovered.

By the end of its first decade of existence, the New York Pro Musica had clearly become an institution of early music. In addition to the usual performance and recording projects, Greenberg and the Pro Musica members continually strove to create new artistic and educational programs. Meanwhile, with the receipt of major grants came the expectation and pressure to further expand the activities of the Pro Musica. As each branch of the Pro Musica developed, the

organization as a whole that was a “collage of private, almost disparate, interests” became “an assemblage of musical institutions each of which, while retaining its identity and individuality, responds to, and is responsible to, the broad demands and purposes of the whole.”<sup>53</sup> The pressure that this growth brought on to the group was tremendous, and in the mid 1960s the Pro Musica came to a point where some kind of general management was necessary.

In 1965 Greenberg responded to the Pro Musica’s state of growth as follows:

The process of institutionalizing a private dream is necessarily painful. It cannot be done at all without important budgetary changes and major adjustments of individual attitudes, activities and responsibilities. It cannot be judged successful if, for any reason, the process smothers the sparkle of creative energies that has heretofore been generated by conflict and improvisation.<sup>54</sup>

Of course, the Pro Musica’s accomplishments, evident in the scope and depth of its multi-faceted activities that gave the group a positive reception and recognition, signified its success as a professional ensemble. Furthermore, for an early music ensemble, it was extremely encouraging to see the enthusiastic public demand and support in all of its areas of activities. However, the bureaucratic complexity of a large institution had a danger of limiting the creation of new ideas to be experimented and setting routine procedures that are difficult to be amended. If the Pro Musica continued to grow at this rate, the process of institutionalization could indeed smother the “sparkle of creative energies” as Greenberg feared. In addition, it was already becoming difficult for Greenberg to oversee every activity of the Pro Musica as he could do in the past, which proved to be a disappointing condition for him. Nevertheless, the fact remained that the New York Pro Musica was changing, and the change was inevitable.

A highlight in the 1964-65 season was the Pro Musica’s first tour to the Soviet Union, funded by the U.S. State Department. The Concert Ensemble and the Renaissance Band gave

---

<sup>53</sup> Ibid., 88.

<sup>54</sup> Ibid., 92.



twenty-six concerts in ten Russian cities and toured for a week in Yugoslavia. At home the Pro Musica presented twelve performances each of *Daniel* and *Herod*, and Greenberg made plans for five or six shows for National Educational Television (Public Broadcasting Service). Also this year, Everest Records of California re-released the Pro Musica's previous recordings with Esoteric without permission, which led the Pro Musica to file a lawsuit. Although a frustrating incident for the Pro Musica, the fact that a re-release edition was in demand could be interpreted as a good indication of the group's popularity. Greenberg's next goal was to found a summer residency at a school or in a community to establish a more permanent base for the Pro Musica's educational activities. However, this goal would not be achieved.

In 1965-66, the last year of Greenberg's activity with the New York Pro Musica, the Concert Ensemble took on a South American tour under the support of U.S. State Department. Among the year's highlights were the three concerts presented at the Berliner Festwoche in Berlin and a broadcast of the event. Furthermore, Greenberg received the Preis der Deutschen Schallplattenkritik (Prize of the German record critics) by Deutsche Grammophon Recording Corporation. This honorable event reflects the fact that Greenberg and the Pro Musica and their recordings were also known and appreciated in Europe. By the end of 1965 the New York Pro Musica and Noah Greenberg was said to have "attained a status of a major international musical attraction."<sup>55</sup>

On January 8, 1966, after a sudden heart attack, Noah Greenberg passed away at the age of forty-six at the height of his successful career. This unexpected and tragic death was a great loss not only to the New York Pro Musica, but also to the early music community and classical

---

<sup>55</sup> Ibid., 90.

music scene in general. As William McNeil Lowry said, Greenberg “comes as close as anyone his age to being irreplaceable in the arts.”<sup>56</sup>

LaNoue Davenport was appointed interim music director, while Arthur Burrows led the *a cappella* pieces for the Concert Ensemble. A search committee for the new director was formed consisting of Leonard Bernstein, Elliott Carter, Margaret Freeman, Arthur Mendel, Gustave Reese, and Meyer Shapiro. Some of the candidates were: Thomas Binkley, Pierre Boulez, Julian Bream, Alan Curtis, Thurston Dart, LaNoue Davenport, Collin Davis, John Eliot Gardner, Raymond Leppard, Daniel Pinkham, David Willcocks, Roy Jesson, and John Reeves White. John Reeves White was appointed for a three-year term starting September 1966. As seen from the roster of board members and candidates, the New York Pro Musica had become an important and essential force in the early music and arts world.

Under White, the New York Pro Musica offered nearly one hundred performances in the 1966-67 season. Both *Daniel* and *Herod* toured nationally for the first time for five weeks, and the Pro Musica gave numerous seminars at colleges and universities. Even after Greenberg’s death, the Pro Musica was able to complete a prosperous season.

However, in the next fiscal year it was reported that the Pro Musica activities had “reached a ‘virtual saturation point’—not for the audiences but the performers.”<sup>57</sup> This was of course a good sign for the group’s career, but a need to limit the number of performance engagements was imminent. John Reeves White accepted a three-year extension of his directorship until 1972 and led the Pro Musica in 1967-68 in 110 performances.

The following season, 1969-70, however, was as busy as ever, with at least a hundred concerts, a South American tour with twenty-four concerts, three major concerts at Alice Tully

---

<sup>56</sup> Quoted in Gaskill, 91.

<sup>57</sup> *Ibid.*, 95,

Hall, and productions of an Elizabethan masque, *An Entertainment for Elizabeth*, and a medieval Easter play, *The Play of the Risen Christ*, later known as *The Resurrection Play of Tours*. This was also a difficult season for the Pro Musica, with severe financial troubles as well as a “crisis of musical leadership and morale.”<sup>58</sup> It was actually astonishing how much the Pro Musica was able to perform and also produce new programs in this time of transition. However, in May 1970, unable to satisfactorily manage his role as the Music Director, White resigned the position. Furthermore, the season ended with both Davenport, Assistant Director, and Richard French, President, resigning their posts as well. Noah Greenberg’s widow, Toni, took the position of Acting President.

In 1970-71 Paul Maynard, harpsichordist and one of the early members, took on the Acting Music Director position and continued for two seasons. The Renaissance Band, which had been inactive since 1965, was revived, and the drama projects thrived, as the three medieval plays were featured at Stanford University and the Greek Theater in Los Angeles.

During this season, financial difficulties began to take a turn for the worse. For example, the cost of renting Alice Tully Hall for the three performances was so high, that in spite of the well-attended performances, the Pro Musica could not break even. The situation was made worse by the high cost of publicizing these concerts, and by the Pro Musica’s decision to keep the ticket price in an attractive range, especially for young audiences. The result was an artistic success and a financial failure. Furthermore, although the Pro Musica received \$50,000 in donations excluding the Ford grant, the total budget this year had risen to over \$500,000, due to added cost in administrative and artistic matters. Also, because of financial problems in higher education

---

<sup>58</sup> Ibid., 96.

institutions, the Pro Musica had to decrease the number of seminars it could offer at colleges and universities, which had provided a substantial source of income in the previous years.<sup>59</sup>

Nevertheless, a search committee was formed to appoint a new music director; George Houle, the director of Stanford's early music program accepted the nomination, and led the Pro Musica in the 1972-73 season. The Concert Ensemble of five voices and six instrumentalists, including Houle, performed in seventy-five concerts in addition to Pro Musica's third South American tour. An early Baroque opera, *La Dafne* by Marco da Gagliano, was its main project of the season and the fourth drama to be funded by the Ford Foundation grant. It was premiered at the Spoleto Festival in Italy, and with this production, the Ford grant expired.

When his contract ended in 1974, George Houle decided that he did not want to continue as the Music Director. The Board came to a decision not to conduct another search. Considering the difficult musical, financial, and personnel situation, they reached an agreement to disband the New York Pro Musica at the end of this fiscal year.

On May 16, 1974, the New York Pro Musica performed its last concert at the Pierpont Morgan Library for an international Petrarch convention. The next day, it began the process of disbursing its assets. New York University acquired the Pro Musica's instrument collection for \$39,000, which became the Noah Greenberg Collection of Musical Instruments. Edwin Ripin would offer instruction on the instruments, and the University's Collegium Musicum directed by Kay Jaffe of the Waverly Consort would use the instruments. The New York Pro Musica's harpsichord was purchased for Paul Maynard's early music program at Queens College. The Pro Musica's library holdings were sold to the State University of New York at Purchase for \$45,000.<sup>60</sup> The costumes for the four plays, *Daniel*, *Herod*, *Resurrection*, and *Dafne*, were given

---

<sup>59</sup> Ibid., 99-100.

<sup>60</sup> Ibid., 101.

to the Costume Collection of the Theatre Development Fund, and the stage sets to the Cathedral Church of St. John the Divine.<sup>61</sup> Eighty boxes of written materials were donated to the New York Public Library. A grant was given to Music for Awhile, an ensemble in which LaNoue Davenport and Sheila Shonbrun participated. With a \$10,000 gift from the Pro Musica's board of directors and a matching anonymous donation, the Noah Greenberg Award of the American Musicological Society was established in 1977 for those who contributed to the advancement of early music performance, and a grant of up to \$1,000 per year has been awarded annually since 1978.<sup>62</sup>

In conclusion, the New York Pro Musica's achievement can be seen not only in its commercial success, but also in its role as a force that fostered the growth of early music revival. Its wide range of repertory and commitment in presenting refined performances elevated the Pro Musica to one of the leaders in early music performance. However, it was the inclusion and support of diverse activities pertaining to early music that gave the Pro Musica a role of the all-around promoter of early music. The Pro Musica's emphasis on education and research into early music enriched its activities and helped to encourage a deeper interest and awareness of early music. This further stimulated both the Pro Musica's projects and progress in early music movement in general. What Martin Mayer called a vicious circle of the state of early music before the 1950s became a positive circle with the work of Greenberg and the Pro Musica. With Greenberg's vision and the dedicated collaboration of its members, the New York Pro Musica overcame many obstacles and challenges and proved that early music deserves to be an essential part of our musical experience.

---

<sup>61</sup> Gollin, 389.

<sup>62</sup> Gaskill, 103.

## CHAPTER 3

### THE INFLUENCE OF NOAH GREENBERG

If one had to choose a single most decisive factor that distinguished the New York Pro Musica from any other performing ensembles, it would be the leadership of Noah Greenberg. Denis Stevens, a British musicologist and specialist in early music, aptly sums up the influence of Greenberg: “His personality made the Pro Musica into the foremost group of its kind anywhere in the world.” Stevens continues, “Always I had the impression of the guiding force of Noah Greenberg, a force so powerful that it dominated even those works which he did not actually conduct.”<sup>1</sup> The first section of this chapter examines the character and leadership qualities of Noah Greenberg to better understand this remarkable force behind the New York Pro Musica. The second section concerns the New York Pro Musica after Greenberg’s death in 1966. Record reviews and other articles are consulted to define the further achievements of the Pro Musica and to determine the influence of Noah Greenberg on the ensemble.

#### **Noah Greenberg’s Character and How It Shaped the New York Pro Musica**

Greenberg’s energy and enthusiasm for early music were extraordinary, as can be seen from the almost unanimous praise of Greenberg in review articles and obituaries. On a personal note, Seymour Barab, a friend of Greenberg, remembers the power of his enthusiasm: “[He] got out of us [friends] what he wanted exactly the same way he got money out of contributors,

---

<sup>1</sup> Denis Stevens, untitled tribute to Noah Greenberg, New York Pro Musica Archives, Music Division, New York Public Library, 26 January 1966. Quoted in Gaskill, 119.

sheerly on the basis of enthusiasm.”<sup>2</sup> Already in his youth, Greenberg was known for his tactful salesmanship and convincing ways. Gollin tells an amusing anecdote in which young Greenberg worked as a salesman for a roofing company. He was an excellent salesman, had secured additional positions in the company for his friends, and when he left, the company went bankrupt.<sup>3</sup>

In the field of early music performance, Greenberg was a true pioneer. Early music performance did exist before Greenberg, but what he did with the Pro Musica changed the way the music was presented and how much it was heard. As David Hamilton writes in the *New Yorker*, early music “became revolutionary through Greenberg’s energy and imagination; what scholars found on library shelves, Pro Musica’s tours and records disseminated farther and wider than it had ever traveled before.”<sup>4</sup> Assisted by the recording industry, which played “the role of an essential catalyst”<sup>5</sup> to Greenberg and the Pro Musica’s career, the Pro Musica’s music could be heard by an ever wider range of audience.<sup>6</sup>

Greenberg is often referred to as a scholar and a musicologist, an “authority on medieval, Renaissance, and Baroque music,”<sup>7</sup> as stated in an obituary in the *International Musician*. However, according to Barry S. Brook, Greenberg strongly objected to being called an authority.<sup>8</sup> With or without a scholarly title, Greenberg nevertheless built a bridge between the academic side of musicology and its application in the performance of early music. Furthermore, this was an important and valuable bridge, as recognized in the praise of Greenberg by Brook. Brook states

---

<sup>2</sup> James Gollin, *Pied Piper: The Many Lives of Noah Greenberg*, Lives in Music Series, no. 4 (Hillsdale, New York: Pendragon, 2001), 163-64.

<sup>3</sup> *Ibid.*, 116.

<sup>4</sup> David Hamilton, “Musical Events: *Ave Atque Vale*,” *New Yorker* (25 March 1974):114.

<sup>5</sup> “Noah Greenberg,” *High Fidelity* 16 (April 1966): 136.

<sup>6</sup> Greenberg also comments on the importance of the recording industry in Pro Musica’s career. Noah Greenberg, “Early Music Performance Today,” in *Aspects of Medieval and Renaissance Music: A Birthday Offering to Gustave Reese*, ed. Jan LaRue (New York: W. W. Norton, 1966; reprint, New York: Pendragon Press, 1978), 315.

<sup>7</sup> Obituary of Noah Greenberg, *International Musician* 64 (April 1966): 21.

<sup>8</sup> Barry S. Brook, “Noah Greenberg: 1920-1966,” *Journal of the American Musicological Society* 20, no. 3 (fall 1967): 511.

that “no man ever realized the ideals of musicology more magnificently”<sup>9</sup> than Greenberg, who narrowed the gap between scholastic and practical sides of early music. Jeremy Noble also credits Greenberg in this effort: “In a culture in which music-historians tend to become increasingly remote from the public he played an invaluable role.”<sup>10</sup> Greenberg did not have any formal training in musicology or music, but realized the importance of historical research in performing early repertoires. He eagerly made contacts with leading musicologists of the time, asked for their advice, and was always open to constructive suggestions and criticisms. Lawrence Sears writes in *Musart* that “American musicology may never know another with precisely the depth and scope of his talents,”<sup>11</sup> a well-deserved praise for Greenberg. With his intelligent, sharp, inquiring mind and passion for early music, Greenberg invigorated the field of applied musicology in early music.

Not only did Greenberg lessen the gap between musicology and performance, he also built a wider bridge between early music and the public. Education played a key role in his approach, an effort widely recognized and appreciated. The *Music Educators Journal* praises the Pro Musica and Greenberg as the “most important performing and recording organization for medieval, Renaissance, and Baroque music anywhere in the world,” which served “also as a library and center for the study, publication, and teaching of old music.”<sup>12</sup> Denis Stevens acknowledges the series of Pro Musica publications, which provided useful performing editions for numerous collegia musica and amateur groups, and the Pro Musica’s frequent appearances on television and radio in the United States and Canada as bringing forward and strengthening the awareness of early music.<sup>13</sup> Indeed, Greenberg’s concept of the New York Pro Musica included a

---

<sup>9</sup> *Ibid.*, 511.

<sup>10</sup> Jeremy Noble, “Obituary: Noah Greenberg,” *Musical Times* 107 (March 1966): 241.

<sup>11</sup> Lawrence Sears, “Noah Greenberg, 1919-1966: His Legacy,” *Musart* 18, no. 4 (1966): 67.

<sup>12</sup> “Noah Greenberg: 1919-1966,” *Music Educators Journal* 52 (April-May 1966): 26.

<sup>13</sup> Stevens, 119.



research library, publications of practical editions, workshops and seminars, and the training of young musicians. These not only enriched the activities of the Pro Musica, but also helped shape and strengthen the early music performance in general.

Another quality that made the communication of the Pro Musica to the public more effective was its high standard of professionalism. It was understood that a Pro Musica performance would be precise in every detail, spirited, and entertaining, and Greenberg did not disappoint the public. The joy of the musicians and Greenberg showed in their performances, and Greenberg always designed the programs to be interesting to the ears and the mind, combining vocal and instrumental works and providing ample variety. Cohen credits the attractiveness of the Pro Musica to Greenberg's repertorial choices: "Scholarship helped make up the programs, but so did the proven virtues of good old American show-biz." He continues:

He [Greenberg] intuited what kinds of pieces would "work" in American concert halls, before non-specialist audiences. So skillful was he in marketing the distant past that Pro Musica was able to move away from the special-interest recital and the Sunday afternoon museum lecture and into the mainstream of concert life.<sup>14</sup>

Greenberg was able to offer the unfamiliar repertory of early music in programs that fascinated audiences.

The music critics of his time also recognized and gave credit and praise to Greenberg's leadership qualities. Some expressions that appeared in record reviews that describe Greenberg are "man of conviction and artistry";<sup>15</sup> "able director";<sup>16</sup> "one of music's unique and important figures";<sup>17</sup> and praise his "fantastic energy and capability for organization."<sup>18</sup> In one review of the *Ludwig Senfl* album, the author specifically expresses his personal gratitude to Greenberg for

---

<sup>14</sup> Joel Cohen and Herb Snitzer, *Reprise: The Extraordinary Revival of Early Music* (Boston: Little, Brown & Co., 1985), 32.

<sup>15</sup> Review of *Music of Salamone Rossi, HiFi Music at Home* (January and February 1958): 47.

<sup>16</sup> Review of *Medieval English Carols and Italian Dances*, *New Records* 30 (December 1962): 2.

<sup>17</sup> Review of *Early Baroque Music of Italy*, *American Record Guide* 32 (May 1966): 795.

<sup>18</sup> Review of *Renaissance Bands*, *Gramophone* 43 (May 1966): 560.

“devoting an entire disc to an interesting sampling of an important Renaissance composer.”<sup>19</sup>

Even a critic who thought that Greenberg’s excessive “enterprise and scholarship” were the cause of inappropriate overscoring on the *Renaissance Festival Music* album admits that he “hates to be hard on Noah Greenberg.”<sup>20</sup> Musically, Greenberg is praised as having “discovered the secret of breathing life into the bare outline of a simple one or two line melody,”<sup>21</sup> which helped to make the music attractive to the listeners. Finally, a reviewer praises Greenberg’s contribution as the cause of a “tremendous awakening of public interest in ‘early’ music” because “few if any other men have done as much to make medieval and Renaissance music intelligible and really popular,”<sup>22</sup> which is a very good summary of what Greenberg did.

By the end of his short career, Greenberg’s work with early music, according to *High Fidelity* magazine, had earned him “a reputation as the individual most responsible for the steadily growing revival of interest in medieval and Renaissance music.”<sup>23</sup> In the 1960s the names Noah Greenberg and the New York Pro Musica were synonymous with early music in the United States. As Cohen states, the driving force behind the Pro Musica’s success was indeed Noah Greenberg’s passion and determination to make early music come to life.<sup>24</sup> Greenberg was not only a talented musician, but also a man of great vision and strength, who could carry out his goals.

### **The New York Pro Musica After Noah Greenberg**

By the time of Greenberg’s death in January 1966 the New York Pro Musica had become a major musical institution. The group experienced great success in terms of the extent and depth

---

<sup>19</sup> Review of *Ludwig Senfl*, *HiFi Stereo Review* (May 1964): 64.

<sup>20</sup> Review of *Renaissance Festival Music*, *American Record Guide* 29 (June 1963): 777.

<sup>21</sup> Review of *Medieval English Carols and Italian Dances*, *High Fidelity* 13 (January 1963): 81.

<sup>22</sup> Review of *Early Baroque Music of Italy*, *American Record Guide* 32 (May 1966): 795.

<sup>23</sup> “Noah Greenberg,” *High Fidelity* 16 (April 1966): 164.

<sup>24</sup> Cohen, 32.

of musical projects and the variety of educational and artistic services, and in making itself known as the pioneer in early music performance. However, the New York Pro Musica of 1953-1965 was fundamentally a realization of Greenberg's personal dream. Without Greenberg, the New York Pro Musica had no choice but to begin a new chapter with new challenges.

Amidst the shock and mourning of Greenberg's sudden death, the New York Pro Musica confronted the fact that it had lost its leader, who had held the ever-expanding organization together with a clear vision. Finding a successor who was willing and able, and who would be completely in charge, was no easy task for the board and the search committee. Richard French told *High Fidelity* magazine in April 1966: "Either we will find exactly the right man to succeed Noah, or the organization will be dissolved. The board of directors would never permit the Pro Musica to simply ride along mechanically."<sup>25</sup> Some, like Joel Cohen, have criticized the board members for being too cautious and conservative.<sup>26</sup> However, the choice of a new music director was a very difficult decision to make, especially because so much had depended on Greenberg, and the successor would have to be able to carry on his legacy. John Reeves White, Paul Maynard, and George Houle led the Pro Musica for eight years after Greenberg, but none of them stayed for an extended period of time.

In fact, Toni Greenberg told Gaskill that the main reason for disbanding the Pro Musica in 1974 was the lack of a leader after Houle decided to leave when his contract expired. The board did not want to form another search committee because of its cost and effort. She explains:

I remember the *Times* called and said, "Is it money?" and I said, "Well, there are money problems but that is not *the* problem." There was really no one to become Music Director. There was really no one willing to take charge. I firmly believe there always has to be one person who really cares, and who's willing to accept the ultimate responsibility. And here, everybody was busy with his or her own life and willing to do some thing, but not accept that ultimate responsibility. The Music

---

<sup>25</sup> "Noah Greenberg," *High Fidelity/ Musical America* 16 (April 1966), 164.

<sup>26</sup> Cohen, 34.

Director thought of himself as an employee of the board. So, who's in charge? I didn't want to be, and I couldn't—it really was not my thing. And there was no one else.<sup>27</sup>

The decision to disband was reached on December 26, 1973, and the New York Pro Musica presented its last concert on May 16, 1974.

The difficulties that the Pro Musica faced after Greenberg's death could be attributed to two issues. First, the personality and influence of Greenberg were so dominant that without him, it was simply impossible to continue the activities of the Pro Musica exactly as he had. In addition, it was not realistic to expect the new director to take on the same responsibilities that Greenberg had. Therefore, it was necessary to make some adjustments to restructure the organization and redirect its approach. At the same time, to outdo Greenberg and improve the Pro Musica from what he left would be an enormous challenge. Second, as the general public's musical taste and trends changed over the years, the Pro Musica had to adapt to the changes and develop new methods to continue to attract the interest of its listeners. In other words, the Pro Musica had to offer something new and different from what Greenberg had done. However, it was difficult to achieve a fine balance between continuing in the Greenberg tradition and the established Pro Musica style, which had so far guaranteed commercial success, and developing a new style with which to lead the early music movement.

As stated repeatedly in various ways, the Pro Musica was indeed a product of Noah Greenberg. Not only was the Pro Musica a result of Greenberg's idea and dream, but it was also shaped by his charisma, leadership, energy, and personality, from the way the group was organized to the repertory it performed and the manner of interpretation. He took on the ultimate responsibility in programming, performance style, fundraising activities, management, organizing

---

<sup>27</sup> Sarah Jane Gaskill, "The Artist as Manager: Noah Greenberg and the New York Pro Musica" (M.A. thesis, The American University, 1984), 101.

performance opportunities and educational programs, writing articles and creating performance editions, publicity, and directing the music. For one person to carry on all this responsibility was a great feat, and for the group to continue in exactly the same way as Greenberg would have done would have simply been impossible. Even *The Play of Daniel*, which became a standard production and a hallmark of the New York Pro Musica, would not be the same without Greenberg's guidance and presence.<sup>28</sup> Richard French's question sums up the problem: "Could an organization which had been so much the expression of the personality of a single individual survive him?"<sup>29</sup>

Change, however, is not always undesirable. In fact, it is inevitable and necessary when making a sustained effort to continue the successful performing career of a group such as the New York Pro Musica. Even if Greenberg had not died, to keep the vitality of the Pro Musica alive and fresh, he would constantly have had to find new ideas and approaches. In a way, the successors to Greenberg, who worked in the late 1960s and the first half of the 1970s with the Pro Musica, had tougher jobs than Greenberg himself. By this time, early music was not a new sensation to many of the listeners, and the public's knowledge and expectations had grown. In addition, numerous new early music groups had emerged, offering more choice in repertory, interpretation, and performance style. New findings and studies were made in the field of historical musicology and applied musicology, and the topic of performance practice became a more important issue, eventually leading to the so-called authenticity debates of the 1980s.

Adapting to changes in public taste and trends, as well as keeping up with the latest scholarly findings meant that the Pro Musica could not stay as Greenberg had envisioned it in the early 1950s. White, Maynard, and Houle continued the Greenberg tradition, but could not

---

<sup>28</sup> George P. Elliott, "The Achievement of Noah Greenberg," *Commentary* (July 1966): 68

<sup>29</sup> Quoted in Gaskill, 93.

produce something new that continually grabbed the public's attention as much as Greenberg did.

James Gollin concludes:

All three men were dedicated musicians, but the climate in which they had to operate was changing. Other groups were vigorously contesting Pro Musica's virtual monopoly over the early music repertory. The sound of early instruments was no longer novel. Pro Musica itself gradually lost many of its seasoned members, and replacements of equal talent were not easy to find.<sup>30</sup>

Toni Greenberg had similar concerns when she decided to agree to disband the organization. She recalls her state of mind in 1973 in an interview with Gaskill in 1984. She realized that:

If Pro Musica had gone on, in the same way, that it had in the few preceding years, that eventually there would have been a downslide. That [it] was no longer a groundbreaking, vital organization. That the performances would in time become almost mechanical. That [it] would coast along . . . and then it would ultimately exit sadly.<sup>31</sup>

However, in spite of the obvious challenge of taking over Greenberg's footsteps, the directors who followed did lead the New York Pro Musica in eight more successful and eventful years of music making. In terms of recording projects, the Pro Musica produced new recordings with LaNoue Davenport and John Reeves White, but after the expiration of the Decca contract in 1969 only one new album was made in 1973 with George Houle. The reviews for the Decca releases contain praise for the high standard that the Pro Musica continued to maintain after Greenberg's departure, but criticisms surfaced as well.

Under Davenport the Pro Musica recorded *Florentine Music*, which was said to "maintain [the] fine standards"<sup>32</sup> of the Pro Musica and the group was said to continue to "flourish."<sup>33</sup> The same reviewer, however, found problems in the choice of repertory and musical logistics of the performance. He criticized the selections of the first side of the record as "questionably Florentine" and noted that it was a pity that the "repeats and piedi [were] omitted without

---

<sup>30</sup> Gollin, 389.

<sup>31</sup> Quoted in Gaskill, 102.

<sup>32</sup> Review of *Florentine Music*, *Pan Pipes of Sigma Alpha Iota* (May 1967): 30.

<sup>33</sup> Review of *Florentine Music*, *Gramophone* 44 (May 1967): 597.

explanation.” However, he found the record excellent overall, with “singing, playing, editing and direction all deserv[ing] high praise.”<sup>34</sup> Another critic also praised the recording as a “delightful, masterful performance” with a “nicely varied selection.”<sup>35</sup>

With John Reeves White, the New York Pro Musica made four more recordings. White is said to have maintained a “high standard”<sup>36</sup> and had “nobly carr[ied] on the fine standards of Noah Greenberg.”<sup>37</sup> He is described as a “scholarly performer,” who, like Greenberg, made the music “breathe with life.”<sup>38</sup> He is also credited with tackling difficult and unusual repertory, such as works of Machaut, and solving interpretive problems “with ease”<sup>39</sup> and conviction.<sup>40</sup> As before with Greenberg, the recordings produced with White are praised as having “excellent”<sup>41</sup> quality with “clear and vivid”<sup>42</sup> sound. The instrumental ensemble continued to be a strong attraction, receiving words of acclaim such as “collection of wonderful sounds”;<sup>43</sup> “variety of instrumental tone...fresh beauty”;<sup>44</sup> “kaleidoscopic tonal color effect” with “expert playing”;<sup>45</sup> “sparkling instrumental accompaniment” with “splendid recorder”;<sup>46</sup> and “dazzling variety of instrumental color.”<sup>47</sup> Some of the comments for the Pro Musica under White in general are: It “performs with confidence and distinguished artistry” and its “performance deserves careful study”;<sup>48</sup> “fine

---

<sup>34</sup> Ibid.

<sup>35</sup> Review of *Florentine Music*, *American Recorder* 8 (Spring 1967): 64.

<sup>36</sup> Review of *The Romance of Medieval France*, *High Fidelity* 18 (January 1968): 92.

<sup>37</sup> Review of *The Romance of Medieval France*, *Pan Pipes of Sigma Alpha Iota* 60 (March 1968): 37.

<sup>38</sup> Review of *The Romance of Medieval France*, *High Fidelity* 18 (January 1968): 92.

<sup>39</sup> Ibid.

<sup>40</sup> Review of *The Romance of Medieval France*, *Pan Pipes of Sigma Alpha Iota* 60 (March 1968): 37.

<sup>41</sup> Review of *The Kynge's Musicke*, *Stereo Review* 22 (February 1969): 114.

<sup>42</sup> Review of *Petrucchi*, *American Record Guide* 35 (May 1969): 756.

<sup>43</sup> Review of *The Kynge's Musicke*, *New Records* 36 (February 1969): 5.

<sup>44</sup> Review of *The Kynge's Musicke*, *High Fidelity* 19 (March 1969): 110.

<sup>45</sup> Review of *The Kynge's Musicke*, *American Recorder* 10 (Winter 1969): 9.

<sup>46</sup> Review of *Petrucchi*, *American Recorder* 10 (Spring 1969): 51.

<sup>47</sup> Review of *Petrucchi*, *High Fidelity* 19 (June 1969): 106.

<sup>48</sup> Review of *The Romance of Medieval France*, *American Record Guide* 34 (April 1968): 666.

album, spirited, expertly performed”;<sup>49</sup> “energetic and colorful”; and “imaginative, attractive, and very worthwhile album.”<sup>50</sup>

At the same time, however, some critics noticed a decline in the Pro Musica’s performances. One considered the *Petrucchi* album to be “somewhat below par,” with a “harsh and piercing” soprano voice;<sup>51</sup> and another remarked that the “heavy concert schedule is beginning to take its toll on the soloists,” which causes them to “sound a shade tired and unsteady in sustained pieces”<sup>52</sup> on the *Music of the Spanish Theater in the Golden Age* disc.

However, more critics seemed to appreciate the Pro Musica’s skillful and imaginative performances and “characteristically flavorful renditions”<sup>53</sup> under the leadership of White. One critic, writing on *Music of the Spanish Theater in the Golden Age*, praised White for bringing the Pro Musica to a higher musical standard than Greenberg. He noted that the Pro Musica, in spite of a mass production of recordings, was improving. He found the performances in the earlier recordings “irritatingly uniform” with the same brassy “voices and tone in any repertory” and “instruments zooming along in mechanical fashion” that he considered unmusical.<sup>54</sup> However, under White’s direction, the Pro Musica had achieved a “great deal more subtlety” and “more variety in sounds and treatment of the music according to its need.”<sup>55</sup> Also, the “expanded array of instruments and increased color” added to the value of the performances that were “totally precise.” These improvements under White resulted in a “new mellowness and expressivity” with more human quality.<sup>56</sup>

---

<sup>49</sup> Review of *Petrucchi*, *American Recorder* 10 (Spring 1969): 51.

<sup>50</sup> Review of *Petrucchi*, *American Record Guide* 35 (May 1969): 756.

<sup>51</sup> Review of *Petrucchi*, *High Fidelity* 19 (June 1969): 106.

<sup>52</sup> Review of *Music of the Spanish Theater in the Golden Age*, *High Fidelity* 19 (December 1969): 126.

<sup>53</sup> Review of *Music of the Spanish Theater in the Golden Age*, *Stereo Review* 23 (December 1969): 128.

<sup>54</sup> Review of *Music of the Spanish Theater in the Golden Age*, *Audio* 54 (April 70): 65.

<sup>55</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>56</sup> *Ibid.*



One of the main criticisms the recording projects of the New York Pro Musica received after Greenberg's death concerned the liner notes. Some critics rated the notes written by White as good,<sup>57</sup> but some considered them "interesting, but not satisfactory for musicologists";<sup>58</sup> "too general and cursory";<sup>59</sup> or even though "amusing, interesting, [and] at times fascinating," they were "social rather than musical or scholarly."<sup>60</sup> In both cases the omission of sources of editions and dates was criticized.<sup>61</sup> Even the notes written by Jeremy Noble, which were praised as "admirable," were faulted for the lack of fully identified sources.<sup>62</sup> These criticisms may reflect the fact that the awareness and knowledge of early repertory had increased among the reviewers and listeners. The liner notes were expected to be on a scholarly level and with full citation of the sources for further reference. It was not enough for the notes to be interesting with tidbits of facts that caught the attention of record consumers. However, as with the earlier albums produced under Greenberg's direction, the presentations of the new recordings were praised as attractive, having a "handsome jacket" with "good layout,"<sup>63</sup> and a "handsome package."<sup>64</sup>

White's musical interpretation also received some criticisms. Under White the Pro Musica carried on the Greenberg tradition of a lively and enthusiastic style. However, many of the critics found this approach exaggerated and unmusical, and criticized White for continuing a style that was considered outdated. For example, in a rendition of a medieval motet, a reviewer noted that the performance was "lively and vivacious [and] of occasionally somewhat unconventional

---

<sup>57</sup> Review of *The Romance of Medieval France*, *High Fidelity* 18 (January 1968): 37.

<sup>58</sup> Review of *The Romance of Medieval France*, *Pan Pipes of Sigma Alpha Iota* 60 (March 1968): 37.

<sup>59</sup> Review of *The Romance of Medieval France*, *American Record Guide* 34 (April 1968): 666.

<sup>60</sup> Review of *The Kynges Musicke*, *New Records* 36 (February 1969): 5.

<sup>61</sup> Review of *The Romance of Medieval France*, *High Fidelity* 18 (January 1968): 37. Review of *The Kynges Musicke*, *High Fidelity* 19 (March 1969): 110. Review of *The Kynges Musicke*, *American Recorder* 10 (Winter 1969): 9.

<sup>62</sup> Review of *Petrucchi*, *American Record Guide* 35 (May 1969): 756.

<sup>63</sup> Review of *Petrucchi*, *High Fidelity* 19 (June 1969): 106.

<sup>64</sup> Review of *Music of the Spanish Theater in the Golden Age*, *High Fidelity* 19 (December 1969): 126.

fashion” that misrepresented the musical genre.<sup>65</sup> The “variety and flexibility” was a flair of Noah Greenberg that had been considered attractive ten years ago, but when it was strictly adhered to, the style could be heard as a “bit too affected and done to catch attention rather than [to follow the] inherent logic in music.”<sup>66</sup> Another critic wrote of *The Kynge’s Musicke* that the lively performance was taken sometimes too fast and it seemed like “twentieth-century showmanship rather than sixteenth-century court entertainment.”<sup>67</sup> Other comments along this line include: the performance “suffers from Pro Musica’s old tendency to play absurdly fast . . . but at least three-fourths of the pieces are charmingly done”;<sup>68</sup> “too much instruments doubling and elaborations” with “overly heavy and rich” style that is “not probable in Petrucci’s time.”<sup>69</sup> One critic found the tempo taken on the *Petrucci* album as snapping “annoyingly”;<sup>70</sup> and another critic for the same album also thought that the tempi for some of the pieces were “rather pushed for effect,” and the performance “can do well without such streamlined razzle-dazzle.”<sup>71</sup> In contrast, one reviewer praised the same album, noting that the music was “presented stylishly and convincingly” with enthusiasm. He thought that the performance was “at times a little too ‘o wow!’ but mostly with positive results.”<sup>72</sup>

As seen from these comments, taking over and intensifying Greenberg’s interpretive approach did not always please the critics. The old style may have worked formerly because of Greenberg’s personality, or because of the accepted musical tastes of the time. However, the preference was clearly shifting from vivacious, energetic, attention-catching performances toward a more sensitive, subdued style with more attention given to the musical structure and meanings.

---

<sup>65</sup> Review of *The Romance of Medieval France*, *American Record Guide* 34 (April 1968): 666.

<sup>66</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>67</sup> Review of *The Kynge’s Musicke Stereo Review* 22 (February 1969): 114.

<sup>68</sup> Review of *The Kynge’s Musicke*, *High Fidelity* 19 (March 1969): 110.

<sup>69</sup> Review of *Petrucci*, *American Record Guide* 35 (May 1969): 756.

<sup>70</sup> Review of *Petrucci*, *High Fidelity* 19 (June 1969): 106.

<sup>71</sup> Review of *Petrucci*, *Stereo Review* 23 (August 1969): 98.

<sup>72</sup> Review of *Music of the Spanish Theater in the Golden Age*, *New Records* 37 (October 1969): 11.

Opinions concerning White's programming were wide-ranging. Some commended the rich variety of selections ("nicely varied selection,"<sup>73</sup> "varied and interesting repertory,"<sup>74</sup> and "extremely entertaining, captivating [music with] varied collection"<sup>75</sup>). However, others criticized, for example, the program of *The Romance of Medieval France* as having a "somewhat awkward organization" with an "unstable combination,"<sup>76</sup> and *Petrucchi* as "too specialized" in its repertory, which is "limited in its appeal compared to other general Renaissance collection[s]."<sup>77</sup> Still, the same critic of *The Romance of Medieval France* added that even with the flaw in programming, it is "really an important album."<sup>78</sup>

After *The Music of the Spanish Theater in the Golden Age*, the Pro Musica released *Medieval Roots*, which consisted of re-releases of selections from eight previous recordings. Although the selections were "immensely interesting"<sup>79</sup> to one critic, both of the two critics who commented on this album pointed out the poor presentation of the album. One wrote that there were no liner notes or text, only "exactly 59 words on the jacket."<sup>80</sup> The other criticized the album as a "total loss to any potential Pro Musica enthusiast" because the "presentation is so poor for this type of album in order to get anything out of the music other than background pap."<sup>81</sup> These opinions are a clear sign that the audience and the critics had come to expect extensive notes and attractive album presentations from the Pro Musica. However, unfortunately, the last Decca release of the New York Pro Musica could not fulfill this expectation.

---

<sup>73</sup> Review of *Petrucchi*, *American Record Guide* 35 (May 1969): 756.

<sup>74</sup> Review of *Petrucchi*, *Stereo Review* 23 (August 1969): 98.

<sup>75</sup> Review of *Music of the Spanish Theater in the Golden Age*, *Stereo Review* 23 (December 1969): 128.

<sup>76</sup> Review of *The Romance of Medieval France*, *American Record Guide* 34 (April 1968): 666.

<sup>77</sup> Review of *Petrucchi*, *New Records* 37 (May 1969): 6.

<sup>78</sup> Review of *The Romance of Medieval France*, *American Record Guide* 34 (April 1968): 666.

<sup>79</sup> Review of *Medieval Roots*, *New Records* 39 (October 1971): 12.

<sup>80</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>81</sup> Review of *Medieval Roots*, *Stereo Review* 26 (March 1972): 98.

*Marco da Gagliano: La Dafne*, the last recording of the New York Pro Musica under the direction of George Houle, was released in 1973. The only review located states that it is a “good but dry recording” with a sound that is too “studio-ish.” Overall the writer criticized the album, calling it a “disappointing last Pro Musica recording.” He explained that although it is a “rare and precious work,” the instruments did not have “quite the right sound,” and there was “not enough easy, free, expressive, ornamental vocalism” expected in this repertory. He lamented that “Pro Musica never seems to have fully recovered from the shock of Noah Greenberg’s death” and this “final memento of a great musical organization . . . lacks something of the fire and genius.”<sup>82</sup>

Fortunately, however, the harsh criticism of the last review seems to be a special case directed toward this particular recording and not the New York Pro Musica in general. The majority of the critics and reviews approved and praised the work of the Pro Musica and its directors who succeeded Greenberg. Even when the criticisms were voiced, the appreciation and recognition of the contributions that this group had made were not forgotten. However, the New York Pro Musica was indeed Noah Greenberg’s creation, and his work and influence on its career cannot be overstated.

---

<sup>82</sup> Review of *Marco da Gagliano: La Dafne*, *Stereo Review* 35 (July 1975): 96.

## CHAPTER 4

### RECORDING PROJECTS OF THE NEW YORK PRO MUSICA

Two closely related factors that led to the commercial success of the New York Pro Musica were the post-war development and advocacy of long-playing records, and the flourishing of the record industry. When Greenberg embarked on his musical career with the New York Pro Musica in 1953, the stage could not have been better set for him. Rooley sums up the advantage of LPs as follows:

The combination of longer playing time, lower cost, easier handling and storage, quieter surfaces, a catalogue of high-quality recordings and an inexpensive machine on which to play them unleashed a flood of pent-up consumer demand... Everyone made money with the LP – companies, distributors, dealers, artists, audio engineers, graphic designers (who made the LP jacket both an art form and a sales tool), publishers and performing rights societies.<sup>1</sup>

Seymour Barab, a friend of Greenberg, a cellist, and a producer of LP records featuring lesser-known musicians, also notes that “at the time, if you could get musical material cheap and cut a few hundred records and sell them in your store, you could make money.”<sup>2</sup>

Indeed, it is not an overstatement to say that it was possible for Noah Greenberg to pursue a career in early music because of the record industry. Of course, recordings alone did not bring forth the commercial and musical success of the New York Pro Musica, but the importance of the recording projects were central to the ensemble’s identity and mission. In this chapter, the achievement of Noah Greenberg and the New York Pro Musica will be assessed by analyzing the

---

<sup>1</sup> Dennis D. Rooney, “How the LP Was Born,” *International Classical Record Collector* 14 (Autumn 1998): 37.

<sup>2</sup> Quoted in James Gollin, *Pied Piper: The Many Lives of Noah Greenberg*, Lives in Music Series, no. 4 (Hillsdale, New York: Pendragon, 2001), 131.

Pro Musica's recording projects and the published reviews of them. First, the role of recordings and the recording industry in the development of the Pro Musica's career and early music performance in general will be discussed. This section will conclude with some thoughts on the significance of recordings as opposed to the traditional live performances. Second, the methodological approach of this study will be explained, followed by a presentation of the research project, which reveals the significance of the work of Noah Greenberg and the New York Pro Musica examined through the perspective of the recording medium.

### **Significance of the Recordings**

By early 1950s the technology for producing long-playing records had improved and the practical and commercial potential of this medium promised many new opportunities. New recording companies emerged, new musical ensembles and groups were formed, and new kinds of repertory were sought. Early music was one of the ideal genres for two reasons. First, it was efficient and relatively inexpensive: only small-scale forces were needed to perform most of its repertory, and since many of the musicians were new to performing this genre, the cost of hiring them was reasonable. Second, it had great intellectual and entertainment potential: the music was not well-known and listened to, but precisely for this reason, it offered something novel and interesting that could attract a new set of audiences. Moreover, for the performers, long-playing records were an optimal form of advertisement because they could reach more people over a wider area without traveling and performing.

The New York Pro Musica was among such new ensembles that were formed with the specific goal of making recordings. Noah Greenberg's first recording, *Il Festino*, as discussed earlier, was made for Esoteric Records in 1953. Subsequently, the New York Pro Musica issued thirty-four original long-playing record albums, three of which contained some re-release

material, with five additional records and three CDs with only re-release materials under its name. A complete discography of the Pro Musica's recordings is presented in Appendix I. Initially, live concerts were organized to promote the Pro Musica's recordings. Over the course of its career, the Pro Musica came to be known for its live performances, concert tours, and other endeavors, but the recording projects remained one of its core activities, especially under the direction of Noah Greenberg.

Greenberg, reflecting back on the early years of the Pro Musica, gave credit to the record industry for the group's success, perhaps speaking from his experience:

Amusingly enough, it was not the givers of conventional concerts who opened up their programs to the repertory of early music, but the record companies—and for the most part, not the large record companies (who could have easily afforded to do it) but the small ones, who could not afford to hire the virtuoso ensembles and artists needed to sell recordings of the standard repertory. Given the LP record and a restricted operating budget, the small companies were drawn to the modest (and modestly priced) ensembles of the practitioners of earlier music.<sup>3</sup>

Many such small, independent record companies that featured early music were established just before and after the war, especially in the United States. Some labels that featured lesser-known repertory, including early music, were Musicraft, Technicord, Vox, Westminster, Concert Hall Society, Esoteric, Lyrichord, Renaissance, Timely, Discophiles Français, Kantorei, Durium, and the Neglected Masterpiece Recording Society.<sup>4</sup>

However, the recording of early music was not limited to such small companies. Historical anthologies continued to provide outlets for early music recordings. In the early fifties, HMV (England) introduced its *History of Music in Sound*. Other similar projects included Lumen label's *Seven Centuries of Sacred Music*, American Columbia's series of four discs, Victor's two

---

<sup>3</sup> Noah Greenberg, "Early Music Performance Today," in *Aspects of Medieval and Renaissance Music: A Birthday Offering to Gustave Reese*, ed. Jan LaRue (New York: W. W. Norton, 1966; reprint, New York: Pendragon, 1978), 315.

<sup>4</sup> Harry Haskell, *The Early Music Revival: A History* (London: Thames & Hudson, 1988), 127.

volumes of Renaissance and Baroque music performed by the American Society of Ancient Instruments, the Czech *Musicae Bohemicae Anthologia*, and the Italian *Musiche Italiane Antiche*.<sup>5</sup> One of the high points of this trend was the development of a record series solely devoted to early music: the *Archiv Produktion* by Deutsche Grammophon. The aim of the project was to present a comprehensive survey of Western Music from Gregorian chant to Mozart in a musically interesting, “authentic” manner, which meant that specialist performers and period instruments were employed whenever possible. These recordings were organized as groups of twelve “research projects,” and were accompanied by thorough historical documentation.<sup>6</sup> The success of the Deutsche Grammophon *Archiv* series encouraged other firms to follow suit with projects such as Telefunken’s *Das Alte Werk*, L’Oiseau-Lyre’s *Florilegium*, and EMI’s *Reflexe* series. The rising interest in recording early music by larger record companies brought more publicity to the performers and a wider circulation of the music. The New York Pro Musica’s later records, for example, were released by Columbia and then by Decca, which offered greater marketing possibilities than could Esoteric Records.

The post-war development and support of the arts by the electronic mass media industries, including not only LPs but also radio and television, brought on what Haskell calls a “phenomenon” of the emergence of “early music ensemble[s] organized specifically for the purposes of broadcasting or recording.”<sup>7</sup> As mentioned previously, the New York Pro Musica is an example of such an ensemble. Other groups include the Cappella Coloniensis of the Westdeutscher Rundfunk (West-German Radio, 1954), Franzjosef Maier’s Collegium Aureum (active in the 1960s) for the Hamonia Mundi label, and Christopher Hogwood’s Academy of Ancient Music (founded in 1973) for the Decca L’Oiseau-Lyre label.

---

<sup>5</sup> Ibid., 119.

<sup>6</sup> Ibid., 127.

<sup>7</sup> Ibid., 123.



Some statistical studies revealed the recording industry's heightened interest in early music in the 1950s and '60s. A report by James Coover and Richard Colvig in 1973 stated that in the preceding decade, the number of pre-Baroque compositions represented in American record catalogues had almost doubled, and the number of composers almost tripled.<sup>8</sup> In another study, Elizabeth Roche conducted a survey of early music on records from 1952 to 1977 by examining the classical issues reviewed in the *Gramophone* (UK). Although the overall percentage that early music shared in classical record output was rather low (on average below 5 percent of the total output), the number of early music issues had clearly increased, with its peak in the mid-sixties. She concluded that, considering the number of records released and the works featured, the most significant rise of interest in early music occurred between 1954 and 1967,<sup>9</sup> the period that directly coincides with the height of the New York Pro Musica's activities.

It is not an exaggeration to say that the LP record industry drastically changed the state of early music in the post-war decades. Haskell concludes that "early music [was] in the air – literally as well as figuratively," and that it "[became] a high marketable commodity."<sup>10</sup> This partnership between early music and record companies, according to Greenberg, was "an extraordinarily happy one":

Not only is the general public now familiar with sonorities and repertory both of which were largely unknown two decades ago, but what began as a curious interest in new music and timbres has now broadened and deepened into a cultivated awareness of musical styles. Today there is a new tolerance in public listening and understanding, a tolerance that may even be extending itself into a demand for the curious novelties of contemporary sounds. Certainly the tyrannical monopoly of the standard repertory has been seriously weakened.<sup>11</sup>

---

<sup>8</sup> Reported in Haskell, 128.

<sup>9</sup> Elizabeth Roche, "Early Music on Records in the Last 25 Years-1," *Musical Times* 120 (1979): 34.

<sup>10</sup> Haskell, 130.

<sup>11</sup> Greenberg, 315-16.

With this powerful tool of communication, Noah Greenberg could confidently embark on his journey through an uncharted territory: the performance of early music in the United States with a professional ensemble.

As recordings became an accepted and even expected means of listening to music, the nature of the audience and their listening habits changed. Of course, many were familiar with the gramophones and shorter discs of the past half-century. However, the increased financial security and leisure time, affordability of electrical appliances, and the enthusiastic output by large and small record companies during the post-Second World War era all assisted in standardizing the recording medium, making it a significant part of the mass musical culture.

Listening to records in the privacy of the home is indeed an altogether different experience from attending a concert and hearing the music performed live. Live concerts offer the visual element of the hall, the performers, and the audience, as well as the excitement of hearing and experiencing the music in a unique and particular situation that occurs only at the moment. One experiences such events with all the senses—the sight, the acoustics, the air, the seats, and even smell—and the sensations of this experience, both communal and deeply personal, cannot be replicated with recordings. However, recordings can reach more people. Even in places where musicians do not tour and perform, their music can be heard as long as the record companies supply the market with their products. Also, repeated hearings can deepen one's understanding and appreciation of unfamiliar music, and the new-found familiarity with a style or genre can broaden one's musical activities, be it in performance, study, or listening. As mentioned earlier, Noah Greenberg credited recordings as helping to cultivate in the general public an “awareness of

musical styles” that added new tolerance in listening.<sup>12</sup> Furthermore, recordings can familiarize a listener with the particular performance style and approach of an ensemble or soloist, which one can then expect to hear in the next release or in concert halls. This can be a useful guide and reference for listeners and provide marketing potential for performers.

Repeated hearing, however, is not necessarily an advantage for either the listeners or performers. Tess Knighton, writing 1992 about the significance of recordings in early music, notes that one disadvantage of recordings is that they “can close doors as well as open them”:

A recording quickly and stealthily—almost without our realizing it—becomes a document, one all the more potent and influential for being perceived by the senses as well as by the intellect. In this way evidence for performance that on paper may give pause for thoughts makes far greater impact when realized in sound. A recording makes the music accessible, but it is all too easy to accept that sound world as being a just and accurate reflection of how Machaut might have heard his Mass, either in his mind’s ear or in actual performance.<sup>13</sup>

The familiarity gained through repeated hearings can limit one’s understanding of the broader musical sense, if the goal of the listener is, after hearing one recording, to reach some kind of conclusion on interpretation, style, or historical fact. Listening to a number of recordings of the same work or genre can be useful in drawing comparisons, thus broadening one’s understanding of the music. However, such possibility was an unattainable luxury for the listeners of early music in the 1950s and ’60s, when a wide selection of recordings of early repertory simply did not exist.<sup>14</sup>

Furthermore, the selection of music available on record could be taken as a misleading guide in determining what constitutes an appropriate interpretation of a work of early music.

---

<sup>12</sup> Ibid., 315.

<sup>13</sup> Tess Knighton, “Going Down on Record,” in *Companion to Medieval and Renaissance Music*, ed. Tess Knighton and David Fallows (London, J. M. Dent & Sons, 1992), 30.

<sup>14</sup> Writing in 1975, Howard Mayer Brown reported that “it really is not possible to understand from the available recordings why the generation of Franco-Flemish musicians working in between 1480 and 1520 are said to be such great composers. Hardly any of their music can readily be heard by interested non-specialists.” Howard Mayer Brown, “Performing Early Music on Record—2: Continental Sacred Music of the 16<sup>th</sup> Century,” *Early Music* 3 (1975): 375.

Daniel Leech-Willinson warns: “bad performances, particularly on record, can do great damage.”<sup>15</sup> We in our age, and even more so for the musicians fifty years ago, have only a limited understanding and awareness of how a work of the Middle Ages and the Renaissance functions musically. However, so much of a successful performance (according to today’s standards) depends on such considerations as tuning, pronunciation, appropriate voices and instruments, and the overall style, which are all interpretational matters. In addition, works of music are selected by performers because of their potential interest, availability and competence of the musicians, financial considerations, possible audience reception, accessibility to a performable edition of the music, and finally, the approval from the record company. When all these factors are considered, it is easy to see that what is represented in recordings (and especially in early recordings) does not and cannot represent the entire broad genre of early music, and the interpretive decisions of these performances should not be taken as conclusive.

An example concerning the performance of *The Play of Herod* aptly demonstrates this point. During the preparation of the production of *The Play of Herod* in 1963, disagreement about instrumental usage arose between Greenberg and William L. Smoldon, who was collaborating in the writing of the modern edition of the play. Smoldon, an English musicologist who was also in contact with Greenberg concerning *The Play of Daniel* in 1958, strongly opposed Greenberg’s approach to instrumentation. Smoldon explained in the liner notes to the record:

Regarding musical accompaniments, the evidence for the employment of instruments during the acting of these Church dramas is almost wholly negative. Whatever use of them is made in modern staging must depend upon the principles of good taste, and the fact that in medieval times the dramas were performed

---

<sup>15</sup> Daniel Leech-Wilkinson, “The Good, the Bad, and the Boring,” in *Companion to Medieval and Renaissance Music*, ed. Tess Knighton and David Fallows (London, J. M. Dent & Sons, 1992), 7.

during the Hour services of the Church, when a restricted use of organ and of chime-bells only was permitted.<sup>16</sup>

Greenberg, however, following Edmund A. Bowles's thesis of the symbolic use of instruments in liturgical plays,<sup>17</sup> favored the use of instruments and freely added some instrumental numbers. Furthermore, Greenberg considered the original play as "written to appeal to a popular audience"<sup>18</sup> with "a series of highly contrasting scenes, each developing its own mood."<sup>19</sup> These considerations and Greenberg's sense of showmanship led him to take the approach of using more colorful instrumentation. He included five additional instrumental parts not mentioned in the manuscript: percussion instruments, a bell carillon, a sopranino recorder, a tenor vielle, and a small bagpipe.<sup>20</sup> The result was another successful Pro Musica production, but Smoldon later expressed his regret as a scholar: "It can certainly be claimed that these 'Pro Musica' additions were good 'box office.' But for the sake of scholarship I must make a protest." He feared that the general public who were introduced to the medieval liturgical plays through the Pro Musica recordings would get a misleading impression of the genre and would be disappointed if they heard a more somber, "if more authentic" production.<sup>21</sup>

In terms of selection of repertory and interpretation of the music, the Pro Musica's recordings significantly shaped the early music culture of the post-war United States. The works the Pro Musica chose to record, and how the group performed them, became an important source

---

<sup>16</sup> William L. Smoldon, "The Play of Herod," liner note to the album *The Play of Herod*, New York Pro Musica, Decca DXSA 7 187, 15.

<sup>17</sup> Mark Davenport, "The New York Pro Musica's *Play of Herod*: Research Issues Then and Now," *Early Music America* 1 (Winter 1995): 30.

<sup>18</sup> Noah Greenberg, "Introduction to the Performing Edition," *The Play of Herod: A Twelfth-Century Musical Drama*, ed. Noah Greenberg and William L. Smoldon (New York: Oxford University Press, 1965), vii.

<sup>19</sup> Davenport, 32. Greenberg, *Herod*, vii.

<sup>20</sup> Greenberg, *Herod*, vii.

<sup>21</sup> William L. Smoldon, *The Music of the Medieval Church Dramas*, ed. Cynthia Bourgeault (London: Oxford University Press, 1980): 254-55, quoted in Davenport, *Herod*, 32. Interestingly, the fact that Greenberg decided to include Smoldon's article, which expressed an opposing view, in the record liner notes suggests on the one hand the openness and fairness of Greenberg's approach. On the other hand, this may also suggest the fact that Greenberg wanted the Pro Musica albums to be both aurally and intellectually stimulating and to provide a forum for scholarly debate.

of early music that the audience listened to, studied, analyzed, and enjoyed. Often early music works selected for study in classrooms were chosen because of the availability of the recordings. Furthermore, for many of the listeners, the way the music was performed and presented became their understanding of the musical work itself, adding more significance to the recordings and more than a touch of responsibility to the recording musicians.

In the early years of the New York Pro Musica, the musical programs were planned specifically for making recordings, and live concerts were designed to feature and promote these recordings. In later years, the concert tours and live performances became the driving force that led the group's career forward. However, the musical selections and interpretation of the programs for the concerts and recordings paralleled each other, and both versions could be identified as the Pro Musica's productions. Even when the concerts became the selling-point of the Pro Musica, recordings still reached a greater number of people in a wider area than did live performances.

### **Recording Projects and Their Reviews: What They Reveal About the New York Pro Musica**

As discussed earlier, recording was a core project of the Pro Musica that represents the group's activity in several respects. First, the selected repertory reflects the interest and breadth of knowledge of the director and his collaborators. Second, the selections on the recordings organized by the director show his talent in designing programs that made sense musically and thematically, and had entertainment quality as well. The liner notes, often written by musicologists, provide historical and academic background information to deepen the understanding of the music, which also reflects the group's commitment to educating the public. The presentation of the albums, with illustrations, photographs, and attractive layouts helped the

Pro Musica to gain a reputation as a professional ensemble with high artistic standards. Finally, the musical performances heard on the recordings are a culmination of the ensemble's talent and musical interpretation. Moreover, the medium of recording offers a fair starting point for all the listeners, including the reviewers. Unlike live performances, recordings produce the same performance regardless of place, time, and situation, thus providing a single point of reference for all listeners. The unchanging quality of the recordings even let us hear the performances now as they were presented over forty years ago.

Recording projects and the published reviews of them provide a means to assess the impact and reception of the New York Pro Musica. The wide range of periodicals, from *Consumer Bulletin* to *Journal of American Musicological Society*, in which recording reviews of the New York Pro Musica appeared, may be taken as a sign of the Pro Musica's broad appeal. At the same time, a closer look at the language, readership, and the goal of each periodical must be taken into account to achieve a more accurate assessment of the reviews. For example, the reader must discern whether the article is written as an academic report or more to express the writer's subjective opinion. Does the writer use clichés, such as "authentic," "genuine," or "faithful," to describe the performance? Do the reviews reflect public opinion or the personal musical taste and preference of the writer or the periodical? Finally, could the reviews that appeared in major journals, newspapers, and magazines act as arbiters of taste by praising, criticizing, recommending or rejecting certain qualities of performances?

Even if the opinions published in the articles do not directly mirror those of the general audience, reviews will likely influence the readers. After reading a review, a reader may decide to buy, not to buy, or to consider buying the recording. The reader of a review may further recommend or not recommend the recording or the ensemble, and when he listens to the recording, he may hear the performance with biased or critical ears, depending on what was

stated in the review. Reviews can thus give the readers a preconception of a recording and, with this added expectation, the listeners may hear the performance differently than if he had not read the review.

The reviews are interesting primary source material that reflect the reception of the New York Pro Musica and their work. Analysis of an extended number of reviews for the same album and a study of the larger picture of the entire Pro Musica record output reveal several key issues that lend insight into the career of the New York Pro Musica. These include the notion of authenticity, musical interpretation, audience building, program design, and marketing tools. A total of 190 review articles for 38 records were collected from over 35 periodicals, including journals, newspapers, and magazines. The reviews were located by using the *Music Index*, *New York Times Index*, *WorldCat*, *International Repertory of Music Literature (RILM)*, *International Index to Music Periodicals (IIMP)*, *National Union Catalog*, Kurtz Myers' *Index to Record Reviews*, and various university library catalogs. Other sources consulted were James Coover and Richard Colvig's *Medieval and Renaissance Music on Long-Playing Records*<sup>22</sup> and Trevor Croucher's *Early Music Discography: From Plainsong to the Sons of Bach*, volumes 1 and 2.<sup>23</sup> Appendix 1 lists the collected reviews grouped according to recording titles and chronologically within each title.<sup>24</sup>

In the following section, the four key issues – the notion of authenticity, musical interpretation, audience building, and programming and marketing tools – in the New York Pro Musica's activity under Noah Greenberg will first be examined from the perspective of the performers through writings by and about the Pro Musica members, then from the perspective of

---

<sup>22</sup> James Coover and Richard Colvig, *Medieval and Renaissance Music on Long-Playing Records*, Detroit Studies in Music Bibliography, no. 6 (Detroit: Information Service, Inc., 1964).

<sup>23</sup> Trevor Croucher, *Early Music Discography: From Plainsong to the Sons of Bach*, vol. 1, *Record Index* (Phoenix, Ariz.: Oryx Press, 1981). *Early Music Discography: From Plainsong to the Sons of Bach*, vol. 2, *Composer, Plainsong, Anonymous Work, and Performer Indexes* (Phoenix, Ariz.: Oryx Press, 1981).

<sup>24</sup> See Appendix I.



the recipients of the performances through record reviews. Finally, the Pro Musica style, or what was actually communicated to the audience and became the image or hallmark of the New York Pro Musica, will be assessed from the reactions and comments in the reviews.

### **Authenticity**

One concept that reappears often in recording reviews of the New York Pro Musica is authenticity. One must approach this term with caution because of the high frequency of its use and the vagueness of its meaning. The term “authenticity” in early music performance caught fire and burst into flame in a series of controversial debates and discussions in the 1980s.<sup>25</sup> However, in the 1950s and ’60s the term was used rather freely in performance reviews and writings about early music performance. Critics seemed to welcome the term and used it often in their writings. Calling a performance “authentic” gave an impression of correctness, weight, and earnestness, and made the reviewer’s ideas sound more convincing. In some reviews the term is used with discretion, but in many reviews the term appears rather casually, almost like a catch phrase to round up ideas or was used for a lack of better criticism. Although the basis for its application was unclear, through the repeated use of the term, this idea of how “authentic” a performance of early music was, became an important criterion for the critics and the public.

From the earliest reviews of the New York Pro Musica, the term authenticity and its related ideas were used. For example, a review of *Festino* called the performance “faithful” and said that it would have been lauded in the sixteenth century. The incorporation of virginal interludes in the program was said to add “to the impression of authenticity.”<sup>26</sup> For the *Ode on the Death of Mr. Henry Purcell* the Pro Musica was praised as breathing “the glowing, silvery

---

<sup>25</sup> For a discussion on the topic of authenticity see Nicholas Kenyon, ed., *Authenticity and Early Music* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1988).

<sup>26</sup> Review of *Festino*, *New Records* (October 1953): 13.

musical atmosphere of seventeenth-century England,”<sup>27</sup> and the use of Oberlin’s countertenor voice was said to “lend an air of authenticity”<sup>28</sup> and gave a “convincing authenticity.”<sup>29</sup> A reviewer of the *Thomas Morley* album interpreted the immediateness of the old music that the Pro Musica brought to life as authentic: “Listening to these madrigals, one can almost feel . . . the Elizabethan’s terror of youth’s departure and to participate in that exquisite insanity of passion.”<sup>30</sup> Other expressions used included “authentically performed”;<sup>31</sup> “brilliant performance of strikingly authentic reconstruction”;<sup>32</sup> “with air of authenticity”;<sup>33</sup> “authentic sounding performance”;<sup>34</sup> “performance with spirit and authenticity; genuinely antique”;<sup>35</sup> and “interpretation as faithful as possible.”<sup>36</sup>

The instruments and instrumental selections were especially recognized as giving a quality of authenticity to the performances. Because of the idiosyncratic and unfamiliar sonority of the early instruments, the instrumental works could easily be identified as something very different from mainstream classical music. Thus, in some cases, the use of early instruments itself was considered to contribute to the authenticity, as stated in a review of *The Play of Daniel*, which claimed that the early instruments gave an “authentic medieval flavor.”<sup>37</sup> In other cases it was the choice of instruments that contributed to a sense of authenticity. For example, such comments were made as: “viols give a touching element of authenticity,”<sup>38</sup> “with authentic variety of

---

<sup>27</sup> Review of *Ode on the Death of Mr. Henry Purcell*, *Saturday Review* (26 December 1953): 61.

<sup>28</sup> Review of *Ode on the Death of Mr. Henry Purcell*, *New Records* (February 1954): 11.

<sup>29</sup> Review of *Ode on the Death of Mr. Henry Purcell*, *The Musical Quarterly* 40 (April 1954): 279.

<sup>30</sup> Review of *Thomas Morley*, *New Records* (December 1953): 8.

<sup>31</sup> Review of *Vocal Music of Claudio Monteverdi*, *New Records* 25 (April 1957): 13.

<sup>32</sup> Review of *The Play of Daniel*, *The Musical Quarterly* 45 (April 1959): 269.

<sup>33</sup> Review of *Josquin des Prés*, *New Records* 29 (May 1961): 8.

<sup>34</sup> Review of *Medieval English Carols and Italian Dances*, *The New York Times*, 21 May 1961, x12.

<sup>35</sup> Review of *Medieval English Carols and Italian Dances*, *Musical America* 82 (December 1962): 55.

<sup>36</sup> Review of *Renaissance Bands*, *High Fidelity* 15 (December 1965): 114.

<sup>37</sup> Review of *The Play of Daniel*, *The Musical Quarterly* 45 (April 1959): 269.

<sup>38</sup> Review of *Sacred Music of Thomas Tallis*, *New Records* 27 (July 1959): 13.

instrumental colors,”<sup>39</sup> “on authentic instruments,”<sup>40</sup> “Pro Musica seeks for utmost authenticity in choice of instruments,”<sup>41</sup> “historically correct use of instruments,”<sup>42</sup> and “authentic with old instruments at right places.”<sup>43</sup> The “authentic” sound of old instruments was considered an asset, as seen in this recommendation: “[a] vital acquisition for anyone who is interested in the authentic timbre of wind instrument of 16<sup>th</sup> century.”<sup>44</sup>

The musical interpretation and performance style of the Pro Musica were also deemed authentic. The instrumental numbers in *Elizabethan and Jacobean Ayres, Madrigals and Dances* were “performed with authentic style and dedicated devotion,” which was “communicative and captivating.”<sup>45</sup> A reviewer stated in 1961 that by then “authority and authenticity” can be expected from any Greenberg and Pro Musica performance.<sup>46</sup> Another critic was thankful that the Pro Musica recordings “finally permit old music to be heard in something like its own natural settings.”<sup>47</sup> On a similar note, another review stated that the *Renaissance Festival Music* “allows us to hear them as they might have been performed at some royal banquet.”<sup>48</sup>

However, the idea of authenticity was not always considered an advantage or a necessity in performances.<sup>49</sup> Sometimes Greenberg’s choice of instrumentation was not authentic, or historically probable, but nevertheless the performances were interesting and attractive to the

---

<sup>39</sup> Review of *Elizabethan and Jacobean Ayres, Madrigals and Dances*, *American Record Guide* 26 (April 1960): 661.

<sup>40</sup> Review of *Renaissance Festival Music*, *The New York Times*, 19 May 1963, x15.

<sup>41</sup> Review of *Spanish Music of the Renaissance*, *Pan Pipes of Sigma Alpha Iota* 53 (March 1961): 22.

<sup>42</sup> Review of *Ludwig Senfl*, *HiFi Stereo Review* (May 1964): 72.

<sup>43</sup> Review of *Early Baroque Music of Italy*, *Audio* 50 (May 1966): 43.

<sup>44</sup> Review of *Renaissance Bands*, *Gramophone* 43 (May 1966): 560.

<sup>45</sup> Review of *Elizabethan and Jacobean Ayres, Madrigals and Dances*, *New Records* 27 (December 1959): 13.

<sup>46</sup> Review of *Heinrich Isaac*, *The New York Times*, 1 October 1961, x14.

<sup>47</sup> Review of *Medieval English Carols and Italian Dances*, *High Fidelity* 13 (January 1963): 81.

<sup>48</sup> Review of *Renaissance Festival Music*, *High Fidelity* 13 (April 1963): 93.

<sup>49</sup> For an overview of a history of authenticity and the early music movement see Howard Mayer Brown, “Pedantry or Liberation? A Sketch of the Historical Performance Movement,” in *Authenticity and Early Music*, ed. Nicholas Kenyon (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1988), 27-56.

audience.<sup>50</sup> For some, it was the musical aesthetic and the quality of the performance that was important regardless of authenticity. For example, one critic suggested that scoring for solo voices would have been historically correct in a selection on *Florentine Music*, but that the “public prefers the gay parade of different colors,”<sup>51</sup> and this was exactly what Greenberg provided. In other cases authenticity was not a priority: a critic commented that even for those who do not know the “true traditions,” Greenberg’s performances “have the virtue of seeming appropriate and there is always a breath of life.”<sup>52</sup> Thus, the notion of authenticity or historical appropriateness was not always an important criterion for a recording to receive a favorable review.

Finally, a writer stated that for the Pro Musica there is “no feeling whatever of historical resuscitation being done as a duty,”<sup>53</sup> a comment probably also reflected the attitude of the performers, an attitude which influenced their interpretive decision-making process. Indeed, for the Pro Musica performers, the concept of authenticity was not always a primary concern. In fact, precisely because there were no set rules and standards for performing early music, they could take more liberties in the decision making process. Bernard Krainis observed from a performer’s perspective: “[the fact that the Pro Musica was not concerned about authenticity] accounts for the fact that the Pro Musica’s performances were so joyous and spirited and musical and full-blooded. Every note meant something personally.”<sup>54</sup> He continues: “We were not interested in performance practice. We did this music because it was beautiful and it moved us, and we wanted to move the audience. We weren’t concerned about doing it the way somebody else did it a

---

<sup>50</sup> Review of *Instrumental Music from the Courts of Queen Elizabeth and King James*, *High Fidelity* 12 (June 1962): 68. Also review of *Spanish Medieval Music*, *High Fidelity* 12 (November 1962): 117.

<sup>51</sup> Review of *Florentine Music*, *Gramophone* 44 (May 1967): 597-8.

<sup>52</sup> Review of *Music of Shakespeare’s Time*, *Saturday Review* 47 (25 July 1964): 43.

<sup>53</sup> Review of *Elizabethan and Jacobean Ayres, Madrigals and Dances*, *The New York Times*, 13 September 1959, x22.

<sup>54</sup> Bernard Krainis, “An Interview with Bernard Krainis,” interview by Sigrid Nagle and Marcia Blue, *American Recorder* 30, no.3 (August 1989): 99.

thousand years ago.”<sup>55</sup> Taking historical information into account, but also having this kind of attitude, Greenberg and the Pro Musica members explored unknown repertory and presented their findings as fresh discoveries.

The difficulty with the term “authenticity” was the vagueness of its meaning. In the 1950s there was no clearly defined consensus as to which qualities make a performance authentic, and what was meant if a performance was described as “authentic.” Qualities can be called historically authentic if they represent the “original” performance in whole, taking its time period, location, and the performers in consideration. However, we cannot be completely certain how the music sounded in the past. One can attempt to give a historically informed performance, or try as best as possible to employ the findings in the latest historical research, but the casualness with which the term was used in the reviews suggests that many of the critics did not consider such issues when they labeled a performance as authentic. Furthermore, judging from the reviews, it seems as though it was not yet a custom to make a careful distinction between the terms “historically informed” and “authentic” in the era of the Pro Musica’s activity. One could even interpret that statements such as “authentic” or “genuine” were meant to express the fact that the musicians gave an earnest and whole-hearted performance with care, competence, and commitment.<sup>56</sup>

In contrast, the Pro Musica musicians seemed to be less concerned with authenticity than the critics. Historical research was indeed essential, but the Pro Musica’s aim was bringing early music to life to the modern ears.<sup>57</sup> In fact, the musicians seemed to benefit from the lack of

---

<sup>55</sup> Ibid., 99.

<sup>56</sup> Howard Mayer Brown’s statement in 1988 seemed to reflect Pro Musica musicians’ philosophy on “authentic” performance. Brown stated that “the whole purpose of playing early music authentically is for the sake of the music and not for the sake of the performance” (Brown, 55). For more discussions on this issue, see Nicholas Kenyon, ed., *Authenticity and Early Music* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1988).

<sup>57</sup> In fact, Will Crutchfield wrote in 1988 on what he considers important in early music performances. He stated that “history is its own reward, and accurate research into past performing styles is a wonderful pursuit. But *for*

precise meaning of the term “authenticity” in their vocabulary. For them, the absence of rigid concern to be “authentic” gave them a sense of freedom in interpreting and experimenting with new ideas. For example, Shelley Gruskin, a recorder player with Pro Musica from 1960 to 1973, commented in a recent interview that “we all knew we were stretching some of the (performance) practices, but we wanted to make the music accessible and fun for the audience.”<sup>58</sup>

When reading recording reviews from the fifties and sixties, “authenticity” and related terms must be taken with a grain of salt. The context of the time period and the average cultural knowledge of the time when the reviews were written must be considered when analyzing the articles. In addition, clarifying such questions as who the intended readership of the articles was, and whether or not the writer’s opinion reflected the public opinion, can help one to better understand the reviews.

### **Performance Practice and Musical Interpretation**

The greatest challenge for Greenberg and the Pro Musica in the area of performance was the lack of a performance practice tradition in early music. At the time, there were very few existing models that could be used as practical guides, and the performer was left to make his or her decisions regarding performance practice. Greenberg writes, “Lacking help, the imaginative performer will have no choice but to experiment and seek his own answers.”<sup>59</sup> This did not mean, however, that Greenberg simply arranged and interpreted the music to his liking. As resources permitted, Greenberg sought scholarly input from published treatises and writings, and suggestions and ideas from musicologists and other scholars such as art historians, medievalists,

---

*performers* its values lies only in the extent to which it can participate in the quest for aliveness” (Will Crutchfield, “Fashion, Conviction, and Performance Style In an Age of Revivals,” in *Authenticity and Early Music*, ed. Nicholas Kenyon (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1988), 26.

<sup>58</sup> Shelley Gruskin, “I Feel Like a Millionaire!” interview by Tina Chancey, *Early Music America* 9, no. 2 (summer 2003): 34.

<sup>59</sup> Greenberg, “Early Music Performance Today,” 317.

and theater historians. Meanwhile, Greenberg called attention to the need for more scholars to prepare performing editions and to give practical assistance and guidance through the application of their musicological research. To be able to make the best possible decisions, Greenberg personally consulted many scholars of varied disciplines, with Gustave Reese as the chief musicological advisor. Joel Newman, also a musicological advisor to Greenberg in the 1950s, recalls that “although he was essentially self-instructed in early music and regarded himself primarily as a performer, Noah exploited all the resources of modern musicology,” and he kept his mind open to interdisciplinary ideas.<sup>60</sup>

One of the most difficult and audibly obvious decisions concerned the use of instruments. From the beginning, as Greenberg’s Primavera Singers and Krainis’s St. Cecilia Players joined forces to form the New York Pro Musica, instruments played an important role. Use of instruments and instrumental pieces gave musical variety to a program, as heard in their first album, *Festino*, where vocal selections are presented with keyboard interludes. The instruments provided additional color and liveliness to the performances. In addition, the players learned and mastered several instruments so they could switch back and forth in a program, and their display of virtuosity on these unusual instruments became a distinct attraction for the audience.

Christopher Page, writing in the 1980s, attributed this former popular tendency to use instruments widely as resulting from interpreting instrumental iconography in medieval art and descriptions in contemporary literature. The sources were interpreted as an encouragement to “imagine a flexible, multi-instrumental practice along Renaissance lines,” and this “prospect was as exciting to the imagination as the wealth of iconography was enticing to the eye.”<sup>61</sup> The

---

<sup>60</sup> Joel Newman, “Noah Greenberg: April 9, 1919 –January 9, 1966,” *Current Musicology* (Spring 1966): 35.

<sup>61</sup> Christopher Page, “The English *A Cappella* Heresy,” in *Companion to Medieval and Renaissance Music*, ed. Tess Knighton and David Fallows, 23-29 (London: J. M. Dent & Sons, 1992), 24.

tendency to use instruments was further reinforced by the vibrant, colorful image of the late Middle Ages described in Johan Huizinga's *The Waning of the Middle Ages*, a definitive work on the late-medieval culture. Also, during the Pro Musica's career, it was generally agreed by many musicologists and performers that the musical construction of medieval polyphony was better suited for instruments, a view that would not be refuted until the 1970s and later.<sup>62</sup> Furthermore, modern performers tended to view medieval music from what Page called a "Renaissance optic," derived from sixteenth-century music printers who encouraged their customers to perform the music with voices as well as any kind of combination of musical instruments.<sup>63</sup> These reasons provided welcoming arguments for the generous use of instruments, which was also Greenberg's stylistic preference.

In addition, the Pro Musica's approach to interpreting new pieces encouraged an imaginative use of instruments. Often an interpretive decision was made by a trial-and-error process. Sometimes the instrumentalists, many of whom, like Krainis, were fluent in improvisation or had a jazz background, would offer new ideas for arranging and scoring the music. Page later describes the result as "a generously instrumented sound and an approach to programming which favoured relatively short pieces with abrupt changes of scoring."<sup>64</sup>

For Greenberg, decisions regarding instrumentation were not always easy to make. This is well illustrated in Greenberg's account of two different experimental approaches to instrumentation that led to an inappropriate choice of instruments and scoring:

On the one hand, the performer's enthusiasm for experimenting with sonorities may lead him too far astray. As a case in point, let me mention a performance of a Fairfax motet from the Eton choir manuscript that the New York Pro Musica gave a few years back. The work was executed by ten musicians—five singers, and five instrumentalists doubling the vocal lines in unison. A scholar who was acquainted

---

<sup>62</sup> Ibid., 25.

<sup>63</sup> Ibid., 23.

<sup>64</sup> Ibid., 25.



with the Eton choir manuscript made a helpful criticism of our performance based on his firm belief, after careful study of available evidence, that instruments had not originally been used in these works. I then restudied the piece in the light of this scholar's comments and became convinced that the motet should have been performed by a small choir and a group of five solo voices.

On the other hand, the performer may find himself far too conservative. Years ago, I studied a *Salve Regina* of Francisco Guerrero and was persuaded at the time that the texture of this polyphonic antiphon implied a *cappella* rendition. It therefore came as quite a shock to me recently to read Guerrero's rules for performance as they have been found in Seville Cathedral archives. One of the instructions states that "at Salves, one of the three verses that are played shall be on shawms, one on cornets, and the other on recorders; because always hearing the same instrument annoys the listener." Obviously, therefore, it was Guerrero's practice in Seville to perform the *Salve Regina* with instruments as well as voices.<sup>65</sup>

Deciding on the use of instruments, therefore, involved balancing scholarly evidence, musical logic, and the personal preference of Greenberg and the Pro Musica.

Greenberg's solutions for interpreting early music, and the style of the New York Pro Musica, reflected Greenberg's personality: energetic, enthusiastic, lively, and attractive. One decision Greenberg made early on was not to let his music sound like a "precious miniature" with a delicate, small sound. This thought came after he read a review of a concert by the Pro Musica at the New York Public Library that praised its performance but noted its "delicate" sound typical of early music. Greenberg felt that previous early music performances usually took a too polite and subdued approach in an "effort to apply the lessons of scholarship,"<sup>66</sup> but he was convinced that he could bring the music to life, to its full potential. After reading this review, he expanded the instrumental force and always tried to extract full sonority from his singers.

Indeed, Greenberg's first priority in making interpretive decisions was to bring the music to life. For him, this meant creating music that would be listened to and that was interesting and engaging. He was "fond of big, splashy instrumentation that involved a multiplicity of voices and

---

<sup>65</sup> Greenberg, "Early Music Performance Today," 317.

<sup>66</sup> Gollin, 6.

instruments,”<sup>67</sup> and the result was a colorful and kaleidoscopic musical style.<sup>68</sup> The tempi tended to be rather brisk, with musical contrasts as one of the central ideas. However, while Greenberg encouraged imaginative interpretations, he disapproved of what he considered far-fetched renditions, such as Thomas Binkley’s Arab-influenced arrangements, René Clemencic’s over-orchestrated performance of *Daniel*, jazzy renditions of medieval dances, and “flashy contemporary manifestations of Gregorian chant.”<sup>69</sup>

Joel Newman, in his obituary for Greenberg, aptly sums up the artists’s interpretive approach:

Noah Greenberg attacked problems with his intellect as well as with his musical intuition, but he never pretended that his solutions were entirely conclusive. His recreations of early music were convincing musically and presented with an assurance that was so memorable a part of his personal impact.<sup>70</sup>

A result of this was a confident presentation of early music that was attractive to the senses of the modern public.

For the critics reporting on the Pro Musica’s performances in terms of musical interpretation, three topics were most often discussed: the selection and quality of voices, those of instruments, and the overall musical approach of the Pro Musica.

Greenberg formed his vocal group, the Primavera Singers, with the goal of performing early vocal music on a professional level. The original members were all classically trained singers. From the earliest reviews, the singers were praised for their mature voices and musicianship. Some reviewers even reveal their surprise in finding such high quality performance

---

<sup>67</sup> D.C. Culbertson, “Men, Women, and Early Music Winds: The Recorders and Double Reeds of the New York Pro Musica,” *American Recorder* 37 (November 1996): 8.

<sup>68</sup> Knighton, 31.

<sup>69</sup> Gollin, 391.

<sup>70</sup> Newman, 35.

in early music, as stated in the *Library Journal* article for *Festino*, in which the reviewer acknowledges the singing as “more than usually proficient.”<sup>71</sup> The high quality of the vocal ensemble seems to have already set the Pro Musica apart from some other early music groups.

One decisive advantage and attraction of the Pro Musica was the inclusion of a countertenor in the ensemble. Although it was initially feared by a critic that the “male alto timbre may not appeal to everyone,”<sup>72</sup> Russell Oberlin’s countertenor voice was generally favorably received.<sup>73</sup> On the *Henry Purcell Songs* album of 1955, Oberlin was featured as a vocal soloist. Some descriptions of Oberlin’s voice included “unusual vocal sound,” “light texture,” “agile,” “with ease and accuracy,”<sup>74</sup> “clean, bright, vital,” and “sensitive, fresh.”<sup>75</sup> As one of the first American countertenors of his generation, Oberlin was often compared to Alfred Deller, the leading British countertenor. In one review, Oberlin was praised as having more life than Deller,<sup>76</sup> but in another, he was described as less “exquisite” and having less emotional expression and “interpretive touches.”<sup>77</sup> However, the same British reviewer noted that Oberlin’s performance was musical, “more frank and natural than English countertenors,” and that his “American touch in pronunciation could be deemed positive.”<sup>78</sup> In a review of *An Evening of Elizabethan Verses and Its Music*, Oberlin’s voice was criticized as “hard and brassy,”<sup>79</sup> and in another article, it was characterized as an “unmistakably masculine voice” compared to the

---

<sup>71</sup> Review of *Festino*, *Library Journal* 78, no. 2 (1 October 1953): 1675.

<sup>72</sup> Review of *Ode on the Death of Mr. Henry Purcell*, *Saturday Review* (26 December 1953): 61.

<sup>73</sup> Review of *Ode on the Death of Mr. Henry Purcell*, *New Records* (February 1954): 11. Oberlin’s voice is praised as “amazing.” Review of *English Medieval Christmas Carols*, *New Records* (April 1979): 10. In this review of the re-release of 1953 original, Oberlin is said to “sing with remarkable capability.”

<sup>74</sup> Review of *Henry Purcell: Songs*, *The New York Times*, 13 February 1955, x9.

<sup>75</sup> Review of *Henry Purcell: Songs*, *Library Journal* 80, no. 2 (15 June 1955): 1484.

<sup>76</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>77</sup> Review of *Henry Purcell Songs*, *Gramophone* 38 (June 1960): 39.

<sup>78</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>79</sup> Review of *Elizabethan Verses and Its Music*, *Audio* 40 (14 January 1956): 42.

feminine quality of Deller.<sup>80</sup> However, the general consensus seemed to have been high regard of Oberlin's voice and performance.

Praise of Oberlin continued in the reviews of later albums. Oberlin and Bressler were singled out for their refined vocalism in *The Play of Daniel*. In the *Saturday Review* their singing is described as "excellent" and "impeccable."<sup>81</sup> In addition, more recognition was given specifically to Oberlin in *Hi-Fi Music at Home*, *The Musical Quarterly*, and *The Gramophone*.<sup>82</sup> In reviews of *Sacred Music of Thomas Tallis* and *Elizabethan and Jacobean Ayres, Madrigals and Dances* Oberlin was again a main attraction and praised as "flawless."<sup>83</sup>

Robert White replaced Oberlin in the 1959-60 season. White was considered to be a "splendid addition"<sup>84</sup> to the Pro Musica and an "excellent countertenor."<sup>85</sup> It was a great fortune for the Pro Musica to have been able to find a good replacement for their star, Russell Oberlin. White, and later John Ferrante, who replaced White in the 1962-63 season, carried on the highly regarded countertenor tradition of Oberlin. Indeed, the countertenor voice became a hallmark and an indispensable asset of the Pro Musica.

Other singers were also earned accolades. For example, soprano Valerie Lamoree was described as "uniformly excellent"<sup>86</sup> on the John Blow album, and all six singers of the Concert Ensemble were praised as "prime soloists"<sup>87</sup> in 1959. However, none received as much recognition as the countertenors Oberlin and White.

---

<sup>80</sup> Review of *Elizabethan Verses and Its Music*, *The New York Times*, 11 March 1956, x8.

<sup>81</sup> Review of *The Play of Daniel*, *Saturday Review* (29 November 1958): 72.

<sup>82</sup> Review of *The Play of Daniel*, *Hi-Fi Music at Home* (January 1959): 34; *The Musical Quarterly* 45 (April 1959): 269; *Gramophone* 38 (September 1960): 188.

<sup>83</sup> Review of *An Evening of Elizabethan and Jacobean Ayres, Madrigals and Dances*, *New Records* 27 (December 1959): 13. Also review of *Sacred Music of Thomas Tallis*, *New Records* 27 (July 1959): 13; *Saturday Review* (29 August 1959): 41.

<sup>84</sup> Review of *Spanish Music of the Renaissance*, *Audio* 45 (February 1961): 60.

<sup>85</sup> Review of *Spanish Medieval Music*, *Gramophone* 40 (April 1963): 476.

<sup>86</sup> Review of *Ode on the Death of Mr. Henry Purcell*, *New Records* (February 1954): 11.

<sup>87</sup> Review of *Elizabethan and Jacobean Ayres, Madrigals, and Dances*, *New Record* 27 (December 1959): 13.

Although the individual voices were described as “indeed beautiful,”<sup>88</sup> “attractive [and] delightful”<sup>89</sup> in the reviews from the early years, problems in blending and balance were also often pointed out. One recurring criticism beginning with the first album concerned the blending of the voices. Several articles from 1953 to 1955 criticized differences in tonal quality of the voices. For example, in a review of *Festino*, the sopranos were said to have “white” voices without vibrato in a style of the seventeenth-century vocalism, but the basses had “colored,” rich voices with heavy vibrato, and that these tone qualities did not match well.<sup>90</sup> Also, it was noted in several reviews that male voices generally “outshine” female voices.<sup>91</sup> In the first several years of the Pro Musica’s activities, Greenberg was able to gather excellent singers for his group, but had not yet achieved a unified balance and style in the ensemble. One critic noted in 1955 that the “singers have not yet digested the style”<sup>92</sup> and that more rehearsals were needed to learn the musical style and establish unity in interpretation.

However, the Pro Musica singers did receive many positive comments for the precision and beauty of their singing. For the *Vocal Music of Claudio Monteverdi* album, the selections were said to have been “sung beautifully”<sup>93</sup> and the “cleanness of the singing” was called “notable.”<sup>94</sup> Furthermore, in a review of *Elizabethan and Jacobean Ayres, Madrigals and Dances*, the vocal ensemble was praised as having an “exceptional ability.”<sup>95</sup>

---

<sup>88</sup> Review of *Thomas Morley: Elizabethan Madrigals, Canzonets and Ballets*, *High Fidelity* 4a (June 1954): 46.

<sup>89</sup> Review of *Ode on the Death of Mr. Henry Purcell*, *Guide to Long-Playing Records* (1955): 195.

<sup>90</sup> Review of *Festino*, *High Fidelity* 3 (September and October 1953): 65. Also review of *Thomas Morley: Elizabethan Madrigals, Canzonets and Ballets*, *High Fidelity* 4a (June 1954): 46.

<sup>91</sup> Review of *Festino*, *Saturday Review* (28 November 1953): 66. Review of *Festino*, *The Musical Quarterly* (April 1954): 275.

<sup>92</sup> Review of *English Medieval Christmas Carols*, *Guide to Long-Playing Records* (1955): 346.

<sup>93</sup> Review of *Vocal Music of Claudio Monteverdi*, *New Republic* (23 December 1957): 22.

<sup>94</sup> Review of *Vocal Music of Claudio Monteverdi*, *Saturday Review* 50 (29 July 1967): 44.

<sup>95</sup> Review of *Elizabethan and Jacobean Ayres, Madrigals and Dances* *New Records* 27 (December 1959):

In terms of the diction of the text, the Pro Musica was effective in most cases, especially in the English language. An early review stated that the diction was “exceptionally clear . . . despite complex interweaving of voices.”<sup>96</sup> Several years later the Pro Musica was still praised for the “clear enunciation” that made the “text easy to follow”<sup>97</sup> and for its “always excellent”<sup>98</sup> and “splendid”<sup>99</sup> diction. However, at the same time, the Pro Musica’s foreign language diction--Italian in the case of *Festino*--as occasionally criticized in terms of pronunciation and style. Interestingly, however, surprisingly few criticisms were written about the Pro Musica’s foreign language pronunciation. Nevertheless, the distinctively Americanized pronunciation, especially heard in the diction of “r,” is still clearly audible in later recordings. Perhaps we have become more sensitive to this point today than in the ’50s and ’60s, and have learned to expect a more appropriate pronunciation of the foreign languages.<sup>100</sup> However, in the Pro Musica’s time, perhaps this was not expected.

In the early years of the Pro Musica, the vocal ensemble received mostly favorable reviews of its technical ability. However, one quality that was often pointed out was the so-called American style of singing as opposed to the British style. For example, in a review for *An Evening of Elizabethan Verses and Its Music*, the Pro Musica was said to have an “American style” of singing, characterized by a rich tone with plenty of vibrato that was not well-blended. According to the critic, this was opposite to the British style of madrigal singing, which was well blended and had no vibrato.<sup>101</sup> Another reviewer similarly commented that the Pro Musica, unlike

---

<sup>96</sup> Review of *Thomas Morley*, *High Fidelity* 4a (June 1954): 46-7.

<sup>97</sup> Review of *Sacred Music of Thomas Tallis*, *Hi-Fi Review* 3 (August 1959): 52.

<sup>98</sup> Review of *Elizabethan and Jacobean Ayres, Madrigals and Dances*, *New Records* 27 (December 1959): 13.

<sup>99</sup> Review of *Vocal Music of Claudio Monteverdi*, *American Record Guide* 23 (March 1957): 95.

<sup>100</sup> It is difficult to state which style of pronunciation is appropriate or accurate in vocal works of the early music repertory, since the pronunciation of any particular language may vary depending on location, situation, and time period.

<sup>101</sup> Review of *An Evening of Elizabethan Verses and Its Music*, *Audio* 40 (January 1956): 42.

any British group, sang with a round, nasal tone with plenty of vibrato.<sup>102</sup> However, this quality did not take away from the enjoyment of the record for this reviewer. Both critics, writing for American journals, recognized the stylistic differences of the two countries, but did not claim one style as being inferior or superior.

Around 1960 the Pro Musica's full, round vocal sonority began to receive severe criticism. The quality once described as delightful and lively began to be viewed as "intense to a point of semi-hysteria," and the critic even cynically encouraged the singers to "take a few tranquilizers before recording."<sup>103</sup> Another critic commented that the singing "suffer[s] from modern operatic loud voice quality,"<sup>104</sup> which was inappropriate for the performance of early music. In the *Ludwig Senfl* recording the hardness of the vocal quality was said to constrict the musical expression at times,<sup>105</sup> and the overall effect was made worse by the way Greenberg scored the vocal parts. Two reviewers suggested the use of a larger ensemble for certain selections, since the small group gave a "too immediate sound"<sup>106</sup> with too much emphasis on individual voices.<sup>107</sup> This shift in reviewers' opinions may reflect a change in musical taste, which now welcomed more subtle and refined musicality. Or perhaps the audience, having been introduced to early music by previous Pro Musica recordings, were ready to hear new interpretive approaches. Of course, there had been some critics who generally favored such reserved or introspective styles, but recognizably more criticisms against the aggressive Pro Musica style started to appear in the early 1960s.

---

<sup>102</sup> Review of *An Evening of Elizabethan Verses and Its Music*, *Harper's Magazine* 212 (April 1956): 104.

<sup>103</sup> Review of *Medieval English Carols and Italian Dances*, *Audio* 47 (May 1963): 45.

<sup>104</sup> Review of *Spanish Music of the Renaissance*, *New Records* 28 (February 1961): 13-14.

<sup>105</sup> Review of *Ludwig Senfl: Composer to the Court and Chapel of Emperor Maximilian I*, *Hi-Fi Stereo Review* (May 1964): 64.

<sup>106</sup> Review of *Ludwig Senfl: Composer to the Court and Chapel of Emperor Maximilian I*, *Gramophone* 41 (May 1964): 513-14.

<sup>107</sup> Review of *Ludwig Senfl: Composer to the Court and Chapel of Emperor Maximilian I*, *American Record Guide* 30 (April 1964): 666-67.

In the reviews for *Early Baroque Music of Italy*, Greenberg's last recording, the singing received renewed praise. Perhaps the addition of new vocalists revitalized the group ("new singers are better"<sup>108</sup>), or perhaps Greenberg did change his approach. In either case, the ensemble is credited with "excellent singing" that even arrested the "earlier falling off quality"<sup>109</sup> with the "best ever" singers with lovely voices "blending attractively."<sup>110</sup>

In spite of occasional harsh criticisms of the vocal quality and the ensemble, the Pro Musica singers were generally regarded as exhibiting excellent musicianship and their performances seemed to give positive impressions. Within the context of the American style of early music vocal ensembles, the Pro Musica was indeed a leader. Regardless of this context, the individual singers and the ensemble received more praise than criticisms overall in the published reviews.

Although the Pro Musica started out with more emphasis on the vocal ensemble, the instrumental part later developed into an indispensable attraction and asset of the group. Comments on instruments and instrumentation began to appear in reviews beginning with *The Play of Daniel* in 1958. Before this time, the Pro Musica programs mostly featured vocal selections, sometimes with a keyboard interlude. Some instrumental pieces were included and instruments accompanied vocal works occasionally, but the only comments specific to the instrumental ensemble before 1958 appeared in reviews of *The Music of Salamone Rossi* in 1957.<sup>111</sup> The real emphasis on the instrumental ensemble began in the late 1950s.

---

<sup>108</sup> Review of *Early Baroque Music of Italy*, *Audio 50* (May 1966): 43.

<sup>109</sup> Review of *Early Baroque Music of Italy*, *American Record Guide 32* (May 1966): 795.

<sup>110</sup> Review of *Early Baroque Music of Italy*, *Consumer Bulletin* (June 1966): 15.

<sup>111</sup> A writer criticizes the balance of instruments as "marred slightly by an obtrusive recorder." Review of *The Music of Salamone Rossi*, *American Record Guide 24* (November 1957): 83. Another reviewer comments that instruments support the singers "in proper places." Review of *The Music of Salamone Rossi*, *Hi-Fi Music at Home* (January and February 1958): 47.



As discussed previously, decisions concerning instrumentation were difficult to make, and the problematic nature of the issue was also reflected in varying opinions expressed in the record reviews. For example, because there were no indications of instrumental use in the original manuscript, Greenberg arranged and scored the instrumental parts in *The Play of Daniel*. The reactions were mostly very favorable, with such comments as “all instruments [are] used with imagination and skill born of careful scholarly investigation”<sup>112</sup>; and “colorful and imaginative instrumental support.”<sup>113</sup> However, at the same time these two reviewers disagreed on the use of chimes in the *Te Deum*. The first writer was very critical, calling it the only flaw in the entire program and describing it as a “senseless tattoo of chimes that is kept up unpleasantly all through the lovely singing of *Te Deum*,” “pointless,” and even a “disfiguration.”<sup>114</sup> The second one, however, thought that the chimes added to the colorfulness of the music with a “peal of tuned bells running like a silver stream of sound.”<sup>115</sup> Similar comments appeared for *The Play of Herod* in 1964. The same critic who criticized the use of chimes in *Daniel* wrote again that the instrumentation was “a bit overdone” with heavy doubling and a “hammering, disproportionate tattoo of chimes.”<sup>116</sup> In contrast, another reviewer stated: “[the] percussion and chimes make the ancient story seem vivid and immediate.”<sup>117</sup> As seen in these cases, often the opinions on use of instruments were based on what the critics considered historically and musically appropriate and in large part on personal preferences.

Although the Pro Musica instrumentalists presented novel sounds and music to most listeners, the critics generally enthusiastically praised and recommended the performances even to those unfamiliar with early music. Some critics did warn that the sounds of early instruments

---

<sup>112</sup> Review of *The Play of Daniel*, *American Record Guide* 25 (December 1958): 264.

<sup>113</sup> Review of *The Play of Daniel*, *Gramophone* 37 (October 1959): 186-7.

<sup>114</sup> Review of *The Play of Daniel*, *American Record Guide* 25 (December 1958): 264.

<sup>115</sup> Review of *The Play of Daniel*, *Gramophone* 37 (October 1959): 186-7.

<sup>116</sup> Review of *The Play of Herod*, *American Record Guide* 31 (September 1964): 18.

<sup>117</sup> Review of *The Play of Herod*, *Atlantic Monthly* 214 (December 1964): 142.

might take some time to get used to,<sup>118</sup> but most reviewers were impressed by the technical ability, musicality, and the ensemble work of the players. For example, Bernard Krainis was praised as the “finest recorder player” to date for his performance on the *Spanish Music of the Renaissance* album.<sup>119</sup> In a review of *Music of the Early German Baroque*, the wind ensemble was described as exhibiting “warmth of sentiment and genius at musical invention.”<sup>120</sup> Furthermore, the performance of *Instrumental Music from the Courts of Queen Elizabeth and King James* was lauded as being exceptionally in tune,<sup>121</sup> apparently a quality rarely heard in early instrumental ensembles.

For the most part, the instrumentation employed by Pro Musica was considered in “good taste and imagination,”<sup>122</sup> adding contrast, “vigor and color”<sup>123</sup> to the performance. In one review, the selection of instruments is described as giving a “generous wash of Renaissance instrumental colors,”<sup>124</sup> and in another as a “Gothic tapestry of instrumental colors and forms,”<sup>125</sup> and both approved the evocative quality of the colorful use of instruments. On numerous occasions the historical accuracy of Greenberg’s orchestration was questioned, but was nevertheless accepted due to its aesthetic merit. For example, in a review of *Instrumental Music from the Courts of Queen Elizabeth and King James*, the instrumentation was described as exhibiting a “degree of sophistication . . . that may or may not have existed in Elizabethan times, but [is] undeniably

---

<sup>118</sup> Review of *Instrumental Music from the Courts of Queen Elizabeth and King James*, *The New York Times*, 1 April 1962, x12.

<sup>119</sup> Review of *Spanish Music of the Renaissance*, *The New York Times*, 14 August 1960, x14.

<sup>120</sup> Review of *Music of the Early German Baroque*, *The New York Times*, 21 May 1961, x12.

<sup>121</sup> Review of *Instrumental Music from the Courts of Queen Elizabeth and King James*, *Gramophone* 40 (June 1962): 11. Also *High Fidelity* 12 (June 1962): 68.

<sup>122</sup> Review of *The Play of Herod*, *High Fidelity* 14 (September 1964): 66.

<sup>123</sup> Review of *Spanish Music of the Renaissance*, *The New York Times*, 14 August 1960, x14.

<sup>124</sup> Review of *Instrumental Music from the Courts of Queen Elizabeth and King James*, *High Fidelity* 12 (June 1962): 68.

<sup>125</sup> Review of *Medieval English Carols and Italian Dances*, *High Fidelity* 13 (January 1963): 81-2.

charming to modern ears,”<sup>126</sup> while a critic for *Spanish Medieval Music* wrote that the “sophisticated instrumentation” was probably not historically authentic, but it “holds the attention from start to finish.”<sup>127</sup>

However, the rich orchestration typical of the Pro Musica also received criticism. A critic reviewing *Instrumental Music from the Courts of Queen Elizabeth and King James* stated that the Pro Musica’s experimental instrumentation offered a “fascinating assortment of rare tone colors and unusual sonorities,” but the “subtle polyphony of the inner lines [are] occasionally obscured by poor instrumentation [with an] overemphasis on upper voices.”<sup>128</sup> He further commented that a viol consort would have been more appropriate in this case “to show individuality and intricate balance of the polyphonic lines.”<sup>129</sup> A similar argument was made in a review for *Renaissance Festival Music*. The writer criticized the instrumentation as overscored, not discrete and idiomatic. The Pro Musica achieved the musical contrasts “by constantly switching timbres of instruments,” while the composer’s intention was to express contrasts within the “directional structure of the music.”<sup>130</sup> In another review of the same album, the writer admitted that “some connoisseur may call this [orchestration] overdone.”<sup>131</sup> However, he also defended Greenberg by saying that such instrumentation practice did actually exist in the sixteenth century, and said that because of the excellent “diversity, blending, and tuning” of the Pro Musica instrumentalists, the end result was for the better.<sup>132</sup>

---

<sup>126</sup> Review of *Instrumental Music from the Courts of Queen Elizabeth and King James*, *High Fidelity* 12 (June 1962): 68.

<sup>127</sup> Review of *Spanish Medieval Music*, *High Fidelity* 12 (November 1962): 117.

<sup>128</sup> Review of *Instrumental Music from the Courts of Queen Elizabeth and King James*, *The Musical Quarterly* 48 (1962): 546-8

<sup>129</sup> Ibid.

<sup>130</sup> Review of *Renaissance Festival Music*, *American Record Guide* 29 (June 1963): 778.

<sup>131</sup> Review of *Renaissance Festival Music*, *Gramophone* 41 (June 1963): 12.

<sup>132</sup> Ibid.

By the early 1960s the instrumental ensemble of the New York Pro Musica had matured technically and musically and the general sonority of early instruments began to be known and accepted by the public. The *New York Times* reported in 1963 that the instruments “buzz and wheeze charmingly,”<sup>133</sup> and a few years later *High Fidelity* described them as a “lovely noise.”<sup>134</sup> Other descriptions of the instruments seen on popular magazines include: “warm and musical”<sup>135</sup>; “exotic but perfectly blended”<sup>136</sup>; “impressive instrumentation”<sup>137</sup>; and played with a “mastery of technique”<sup>138</sup>; and gave a “marvelous impression.”<sup>139</sup>

Indeed, the instrumental section of the Pro Musica had become more popular and versatile than the vocal ensemble. In a review from 1963 the critic commented that the instruments were the best part of the Pro Musica,<sup>140</sup> and another wrote that the instrumentalists were better than the singers.<sup>141</sup> Regarding the *Spanish Medieval Music* album of 1962, a critic asked why nine of the twelve selections were performed instrumentally when they were all vocal repertory. He then answered his question saying that Greenberg’s instrumental scoring was nevertheless logical and the “close adherence to repetition schemes” allowed the poetic form of the music to remain clear even without the text, and most of all, the performance was excellent.<sup>142</sup>

However, the debate concerning the instrumentation continued, and the opinions in the reviews reflected the divergent viewpoints. For example, one review of *Renaissance Bands* in

---

<sup>133</sup> Review of *Renaissance Festival Music*, *The New York Times*, 19 May 1963, x15.

<sup>134</sup> Review of *Renaissance Bands*, *High Fidelity* 15 (December 1965): 114.

<sup>135</sup> Review of *Renaissance Festival Music*, *Audio* 47 (June 1963): 38.

<sup>136</sup> Review of *Renaissance Festival Music*, *HiFi Stereo Review* (May 1964): 64.

<sup>137</sup> Review of *Medieval English Carols and Italian Dances*, *HiFi Stereo Review* (February 1963): 92.

<sup>138</sup> Review of *Play of Herod*, *High Fidelity* 14 (September 1964): 66.

<sup>139</sup> Review of *Ludwig Senfl*, *HiFi Stereo Review* (May 1964): 64.

<sup>140</sup> Review of *It Was a Lover and His Lass: Music of Shakespeare’s Time*, *American Record Guide* 30 (July 1964): 1026-7.

<sup>141</sup> Review of *It Was a Lover and His Lass: Music of Shakespeare’s Time*, *Gramophone* 42 (August 1964): 95.

<sup>142</sup> Review of *Spanish Medieval Music*, *The Musical Quarterly* 49 (1963): 259-63.

1965 praised the “inventive” scoring employed by Greenberg,<sup>143</sup> while another criticized the scoring as “too lavish, [with] too much wind [instruments]” and therefore not authentic.<sup>144</sup> In contrast, the technical mastery of the Pro Musica instrumentalists was, as in the earlier years, almost always praised and the performers’ musicality was recognized more positively. A writer lauded the Pro Musica instrumental collection as “amazing” and made a good point about the progress of instrumental performance:

The recorder-krummhorn group of players seems to get in a good deal more humanity and good musical phrasing than the rest—perhaps because recorder playing is now relatively an ancient “revived” tradition and it’s beginning to mellow and ripen into something musical, as well as authentically musicological.<sup>145</sup>

After a decade of experimenting on unfamiliar instruments, the ensemble was recognized as having greatly developed its technique and achieved a mature musical style.

The truth of the matter concerning instrumentation, however, was that musicological research had not reached a definitive conclusion. Therefore, the problems with the use of instruments and orchestration did not have a correct solution. In such situations, a performer had to make a decision depending on the state of research at the time and experiment with original ideas. Although Greenberg consulted the best available resources he had, his solutions in orchestration did not always receive unanimous approval. However, the group performed the works with high technical and musical standards. This commitment, combined with the earnest effort of Greenberg, earned the Pro Musica instrumentalists the praise: “instruments as always: expert and colourful.”<sup>146</sup>

---

<sup>143</sup> Review of *Renaissance Bands*, *HiFi Stereo Review* (January 1966): 89.

<sup>144</sup> Review of *Renaissance Bands*, *American Record Guide* 32 (January 1966): 421.

<sup>145</sup> Review of *Renaissance Bands*, *Audio* 49 (December 1965): 44.

<sup>146</sup> Review of *Early Baroque Music of Italy*, *American Record Guide* 32 (May 1966): 795.

If one were to choose an expression to describe the performance style of the New York Pro Musica, perhaps “lively” would be appropriate. Greenberg’s goal was to bring early music to life in the modern settings, and his interpretations did convey this quality. Some felt this liveliness to be expressing joy with a heightened energy and spirit. Others, however, interpreted it as making the performance too aggressive, rushed, and mechanical. Either way, except for one early review from 1953<sup>147</sup> and one other review in 1966,<sup>148</sup> all seemed to agree that the Pro Musica’s performances had plenty of energy.

For those who favored the Pro Musica’s interpretation, the brisk tempo and energetic approach contributed vitality and spirit to the performance. A critic for *English Medieval Christmas Carols* commented that Greenberg favored a “detached” rather than “expressive” treatment of the music but was never “callous.”<sup>149</sup> In fact, Greenberg’s approach brought out a “new freshness and gentle poignancy,” with a “happy inspiration.”<sup>150</sup> Another recalled in 1966 that the early Pro Musica style had “vitality too often lacking in those days of wholesale recording.”<sup>151</sup> In some cases the fast tempo employed by Greenberg was commended as “crisp and vigorous,”<sup>152</sup> and giving “verve and gusto” and “a good deal of vigor appropriate for the time,” capturing “the spirit of music.”<sup>153</sup> The latter writer also welcomed the fact that the performance had “not been refined to the point of esoteric preciousity,”<sup>154</sup> but was rich in spirit. In a review of *Heinrich Isaac*, the “rhythmic verve” was praised as giving a “remarkable effect of

---

<sup>147</sup> Review of *Festino*, *American Record Guide* 19 (June 1953): 234. The writer wished for “less concert-hall solemnity and a little more merriment in the proceedings.” He believed that the “individuality of the composition” was lost because of the now “accepted, essentially genteel style of singing madrigals.”

<sup>148</sup> Review of *Early Baroque Music of Italy*, *New Records* 34 (September 1966): 11. The reviewer calls the performance “lacking in vitality” and “unexciting.”

<sup>149</sup> Review for *English Medieval Christmas Carols*, *Guide to Long-Playing Records* (1955): 346.

<sup>150</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>151</sup> Review of *Noah Greenberg Conducting the New York Pro Musica*, *Saturday Review* (25 June 1966): 48.

<sup>152</sup> Review of *Elizabethan and Jacobean Ayres, Madrigals, and Dances*, *American Record Guide* 26 (April 1960): 661-2.

<sup>153</sup> Review of *Elizabethan and Jacobean Ayres, Madrigals, and Dances*, *HiFi Stereo Review* (December 1959): 108.

<sup>154</sup> *Ibid.*

celebration,”<sup>155</sup> and a reviewer of *Early Baroque Music of Italy* approved Greenberg’s lively tempo as providing a “contrast with [the] lugubrious weightiness of most European performers of this type of music.”<sup>156</sup>

The variety of colors and textures, in addition to the lively tempo, was credited as bringing out life in performances.<sup>157</sup> In a review of *Spanish Medieval Music*, the writer praised the rich variety presented in the performance: “all verses [are] done with various combination of voices” and “varying ensemble of instruments” that give a vivid “range of color.”<sup>158</sup> He criticized the “fast tempi,” but admitted that it gave “vigor and gaiety” and the end result was “irresistible.”<sup>159</sup> Along the same line, a reviewer commented that *Music of Shakespeare’s Time* was performed “much too fast and arranged too freely,” but the variation and colorfulness contributed a “remarkable degree of contrast” and resulted in an “alive, mostly outstanding performance.”<sup>160</sup> These comments seem to suggest that for many of the the critics, the overall aesthetic of the performance was more important than the need to strictly adhere to the issue of authenticity.

However, the same quality of fast tempo and vigorous interpretation also became a target of criticism. This performance style was deemed too aggressive, lacking expressiveness, and unmusical. The intense vocal sonority of the *Thomas Morley* album was called “blindingly loud,” robbing the “music of all delicacy and grace,” and the recording was regrettably “too loud for intimate home setting.”<sup>161</sup> Some expressions describing the Pro Musica’s interpretation of the

---

<sup>155</sup> Review of *Heinrich Isaac*, *High Fidelity* 11 (November 1961): 94.

<sup>156</sup> Review of *Early Baroque Music of Italy*, *Audio* 50 (May 1966): 43.

<sup>157</sup> Review of *Josquin des Prés*, *High Fidelity* 11A (June 1961): 52. Review of *Heinrich Isaac*, *High Fidelity* 11 (November 1961): 94.

<sup>158</sup> Review of *Spanish Medieval Music*, *American Record Guide* 29 (June 1963): 776-8.

<sup>159</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>160</sup> Review of *Music of Shakespeare’s Time*, *Gramophone* 42 (August 1964): 95.

<sup>161</sup> Review of *Thomas Morley*, *High Fidelity* 4A (June 1954): 46-7.

tempi included: “much too rushed,” “exaggerated tempi a flaw”;<sup>162</sup> “rushed, rugged, pushed, strenuous”;<sup>163</sup> “some tempos too fast for comfort”;<sup>164</sup> “extremely rapid”;<sup>165</sup> “unrelenting”;<sup>166</sup> and “too fast and grotesque.”<sup>167</sup> The choice of fast tempo was said to give a “tendency to drive the music than let it take its own shape,” which was “a little disturbing in sustained pieces.”<sup>168</sup> In *Instrumental Music from the Courts of Queen Elizabeth and King James* the brisk tempo was blamed for the cantus firmi being covered and lost.<sup>169</sup>

The intense and aggressive style was also criticized. A reviewer noted that the “continuing hard-hitting declamation of the singers,” in addition to the fast tempo, does not “let the tender emotions to come through.”<sup>170</sup> Another critic described the Pro Musica as having a “hardness of style” and “roughshod musical subtlety.”<sup>171</sup> Indeed, some critics considered the Pro Musica as lacking deep musicality. One wrote that the technique was “impeccable,” but the “musical penetration a bit on casual side,” a failing he attributed to the fact that the Pro Musica covered too many musical styles and periods in its programs and had “not enough time in preparation.”<sup>172</sup> Another noted that the tempo was indeed exciting, but at times it made the performance “too high pressured.”<sup>173</sup> Finally, a reviewer summarized what he considered the typical Pro Musica style: “professional, precise, efficient, forceful, high tension, warm as the proverbial iceberg,” with

---

<sup>162</sup> Review of *Music of Claudio Monteverdi*, *American Record Guide* 34 (October 1967): 136.

<sup>163</sup> Review of *Sacred Music of Thomas Tallis*, *American Record Guide* 25 (August 1959): 60.

<sup>164</sup> Review of *Heinrich Isaac*, *The New York Times*, 1 October 1961, x14.

<sup>165</sup> Review of *Instrumental Music from the Courts of Queen Elizabeth and King James*, *The Musical Quarterly* 48 (1962): 546.

<sup>166</sup> Review of *Spanish Medieval Music*, *HiFi Stereo Review* 9 (December 1962): 108.

<sup>167</sup> Review of *Early Baroque Music of Italy*, *Gramophone* 44 (August 1966): 122.

<sup>168</sup> Review of *Thomas Morley*, *Guide to Long-Playing Records* (1955): 157.

<sup>169</sup> Review of *Instrumental Music from the Courts of Queen Elizabeth and King James*, *The Musical Quarterly* 48 (1962): 546-48.

<sup>170</sup> Review of *Spanish Medieval Music*, *Gramophone* 40 (April 1963): 476-77.

<sup>171</sup> Review of *Renaissance Festival Music*, *Audio* 47 (June 1963): 38-39.

<sup>172</sup> Review of *Spanish Music of the Renaissance*, *New Records* 27 (December 1959): 13.

<sup>173</sup> Review of *Ludwig Senfl*, *HiFi Stereo Review* (May 1964): 64.



“everything fast and bumpy.”<sup>174</sup> One critic even gave a proof of the “rushed” style of the Pro Musica. He compared the recordings of a same mass by Thomas Tallis performed by the Pro Musica and Deller Consort. The result was that the Pro Musica performed it in fifteen minutes, while Deller Consort took twenty-two.<sup>175</sup>

To conclude, most critics seem to have agreed that Greenberg led the Pro Musica with a sense of showmanship and great energy. However, there was a general disagreement whether this spiritedness improved or hindered the quality of the performances. For some the choice of fast tempo, use of colorful instrumentation, and incorporation of contrasting elements made the performance more lively and interesting and brought out the spirit of the music. For others, however, these qualities were too excessive and robbed the performances of musicality and historical appropriateness. One critic writing on the *Renaissance Festival Music* in 1963 admitted that thanks to the Pro Musica, “we have outgrown the idea of old music as somehow ‘quaint’ and fragile,”<sup>176</sup> but found the now-familiar energetic Pro Musica style as “riding through the polished musical phrases with the subtlety of a subway express.”<sup>177</sup> As more audiences were introduced to and became more familiar with early music, perhaps the “wake-up call” of the Pro Musica did not sound so pleasant anymore.

Overall, however, the main goals that Greenberg strove for--bringing life and energy to early music, making early music attractive to the modern ears, and leading a full professional ensemble--were successfully achieved and acknowledged by the critics. Greenberg wanted the Pro Musica to be recognized as a competent group of musicians dedicated to performing early music with the highest possible technical and interpretive standards. His approach in research,

---

<sup>174</sup> Review of *Renaissance Bands*, *Audio* 49 (December 1965): 44.

<sup>175</sup> Review of *Sacred Music of Thomas Tallis*, *American Record Guide* 25 (August 1959): 858.

<sup>176</sup> Review of *Renaissance Festival Music*, *Audio* 47 (June 1963): 38.

<sup>177</sup> *Ibid.*

organization, and musical interpretation was aggressive, outward, and to the point, and these qualities were successfully communicated to the listeners. Regardless of whether the reviews praised or criticized the Pro Musica style, one thing was certain: with the New York Pro Musica, early music was heard loud and clear.

### **Audience Building**

In many ways, Greenberg and the Pro Musica owe the success of their career to the fact that they had an effective method of gaining and building an audience. Greenberg not only tried to win new audiences, but also planned to achieve a deeper interest and commitment from the existing audience to build a thriving early music community.

In the 1980s Christopher Page named Noah Greenberg as one of the “miraculous individuals” who dominated the performance of medieval music in the 1960s.<sup>178</sup> As seen earlier, one thing Greenberg did not lack was unlimited enthusiasm in the performance of early music. It was this energy that shaped and led the Pro Musica and was communicated to its audience. For a new kind of music to catch sustained public attention, it has to be attractive and convincing. This Greenberg achieved with his professionalism and brilliant, extroverted style of performance.

Greenberg combined his performance style with the idea of novelty in the sonority of old music and the historical curiosity, and engaged the interests of inquisitive young people, the curious general public, and the intelligentsia, not to mention early music devotees, amateurs, students, and other professionals. As Elaine Brody reported, there were many young listeners in the audience,<sup>179</sup> which contributed youthful energy and positive outlook for the future of early

---

<sup>178</sup> Page, 23. Page names Thomas Binkley, Michael Morrow, and David Munrow as other leaders of early music performance between 1960 and 1975.

<sup>179</sup> Elaine Brody, “The Performance of Early Music in the United States Today,” in *Musica Antiqua*, 5, ed. Anna Czekanowska (Bydgoszcz, Poland: 1978), 460.

music performance. Richard French, then the president of the Pro Musica, stated that Greenberg had and demonstrated an “ability to communicate his enthusiasm for the art and music of the Middle Ages and the Renaissance to the public and to other professionals—to a tremendous range of people.”<sup>180</sup>

Greenberg made efforts to make early music inviting to a wide range of audiences. Student discounts were available for live performances, and the Pro Musica visited and presented seminars and workshops at many universities and colleges during their tours. Concert programs were selected and modified according to the audience and its venue. For example, Greenberg would design different programs for concerts in a small town where the group played for the first time, as compared to performances in a large city for an audience already familiar with early music. Gaskill reports that the Pro Musica felt an obligation both to the academic and sophisticated audiences and to the communities where early music does not occupy the common concert repertory.<sup>181</sup> In addition, Greenberg took advantage of other media that helped gain audiences for the Pro Musica. Television and radio programs, like records, could reach more people at once than single concert performance, and publications in the form of articles, books, and musical scores helped inform and make known the work of the Pro Musica. For example, among others, Greenberg edited and published the two liturgical dramas, *Daniel* and *Herod*, and the Pro Musica initiated two series, one vocal and other instrumental, of performing editions. See Appendix II for a complete list of publications.

Furthermore, Greenberg kept up social connections with prominent figures in the arts and music in New York. Performances for prestigious events helped further the Pro Musica’s recognition in the fields of fine and popular arts. For example, the Pro Musica performed for the

---

<sup>180</sup> Richard French, quoted in “Mephisto’s Musings,” *High Fidelity* 16 (April 1966): 164.

<sup>181</sup> Gaskill, 78.

Folger Shakespeare Library in Washington, D.C. and for the memorial service of Dylan Thomas, where, among others, Tennessee Williams, Dawn Powell, e. e. cummings, John Berryman, and Muriel Rukyser were present.<sup>182</sup> In addition, the recurring appearances at well-known New York venues such as the Ninety-second Street “Y,” the Metropolitan Museum of Art, Town Hall, and Lincoln Center helped the Pro Musica to maintain its status as a leading early music ensemble in its home city.

Equally important for Greenberg was the education of the interested public. Historical as well as musical concepts were explained in writings, lectures, study groups, and above all, in program notes and on record jackets. In addition, the publication of performance editions and writings on musical interpretation and performance practice served as an important resource for musicologists and early music students and enriched the activities of amateur musicians, who formed various recorder, gamba, and vocal groups. Before the Pro Musica’s activities, hardly any practical and non-academic guides for students and lay musicians existed in the area of early music performance practice. Greenberg saw the necessity of providing educational opportunities and useful guidance for the amateurs and enthusiasts to establish an active community of early music supporters. Also, training serious and young musicians through lessons and workshops, as well as in seminars at universities and conservatories, provided for the future of early music performance. Furthermore, the sharing of ideas in performance practice and findings in researches invigorated the activities in the professional and academic sphere, which deepened and broadened our understanding of early music and history.

Greenberg tried to build the audience through two approaches: by creating fascinating and interesting recordings and performances that people would want to listen to, and by educating the

---

<sup>182</sup> Gollin, 168.

public about early music to sustain their interest. These activities helped gain a wider range of audiences and eventually strengthened their commitment to the Pro Musica and early music.

Critical opinion about the likely audience for the Pro Musica recordings varied. Of the entire record reviews collected, only two thought the music would be of limited interest. One said that *Music of Salamone Rossi* was “not a recommended disc for lovers of *Carmen* and *Aida*, but for those [listeners whose] interests are esoteric,”<sup>183</sup> and the other that *Sacred Music of Thomas Tallis* was appropriate only “for scholars and devotees of sacred music.”<sup>184</sup> Two reviewers made partly cynical comments about *An Elizabethan Songbag for Young People*, perhaps because the album was said to be “for young people,” but they thought the music too difficult for children. They wrote that it was a “lovely record for children of superior intelligence,”<sup>185</sup> and “for children interested in part singing.”<sup>186</sup>

Some articles emphasized the fact that the music may not be accessible at first, but can be appreciated. A reviewer of *Josquin des Prés*, writing for *New Records* some years later, notes that the disc may not be initially for everyone, but repeated hearing and study may help listeners to appreciate the music. He concluded that the music “must be lived with and studied before it will reveal its many beauties” and that it was “for those who wish to grow musically.”<sup>187</sup> A critic of the *Heinrich Isaac* album (also writing for *New Records* later that year and perhaps the same critic as the one for the Josquin disc) commented that it “requires some good will and intelligent listening on the part of the auditor.”<sup>188</sup> Furthermore, *Consumer Bulletin* magazine reported that

---

<sup>183</sup> Review of *Salamone Rossi, Hebreo of Mantua*, *New Records* 25 (December 1957): 13.

<sup>184</sup> Review of *Sacred Music of Thomas Tallis*, *New Records* 27 (July 1959): 13.

<sup>185</sup> Review of *An Elizabethan Songbag for Young People*, *New Records* (December 1953): 16.

<sup>186</sup> Review of *An Elizabethan Songbag for Young People*, *High Fidelity* 4A (March 1954): 71.

<sup>187</sup> Review of *Josquin des Prés*, *New Records* 29 (May 1961): 8.

<sup>188</sup> Review of *Heinrich Isaac*, *New Records* 29 (October 1961): 12.

the New York Pro Musica was a “group that impressed sophisticated audiences.”<sup>189</sup> These comments suggest that the musical selections featured by the Pro Musica were considered difficult to understand and require some background knowledge and interest, but for those with such background, the recordings are very valuable.

Some critics recommend the recordings precisely because they could be of value to those with special interest in early music. A reviewer wrote that the *Florentine Music* album was a “must for first-term music history courses” and that “university record libraries should acquire it.”<sup>190</sup> Another critic wrote about *Renaissance Festival Music* that “no devotee of early wind music should miss this record.”<sup>191</sup> Finally, a reviewer called the *Heinrich Isaac* album “a must for all lovers of pre-Baroque music.”<sup>192</sup> These and previous comments can be interpreted as a sign of acknowledgment that the Pro Musica offered recordings with high and dependable musical and academic values suitable for students and scholars of early music and the educated public.

However, most critics seem to have thought that even though the music was unfamiliar and at times too scholarly, it had an appeal to a wider range of audiences. Many of them did consider the topic of early music as something unusual and highbrow, but were convinced that the Pro Musica recordings could be enjoyed by anyone who was interested. Examples of such commentaries include the following: “should win over some new recruits to the cult of musical archaeology”;<sup>193</sup> “‘esoteric’ [from the name of the record company] live[s] up to its name . . . probably a disc for connoisseurs, but deserves wider hearing”;<sup>194</sup> and “for anyone interested in

---

<sup>189</sup> Review of *Spanish Medieval Music*, *Consumer Bulletin* (December 1962): 36.

<sup>190</sup> Review of *Florentine Music*, *Pan Pipes of Sigma Alpha Iota* (May 1967): 30.

<sup>191</sup> Review of *Renaissance Festival Music*, *Gramophone* 41 (June 1963): 12.

<sup>192</sup> Review of *Heinrich Isaac*, *HiFi Stereo Review* (December 1961): 72.

<sup>193</sup> Review of *Festino*, *Saturday Review* (28 November 1953): 66.

<sup>194</sup> Review of *Ode on the Death of Mr. Henry Purcell*, *New Records* (February 1954): 11.

old music a must and others urged to investigate.”<sup>195</sup> A critic described *The Play of Daniel* disc as “add[ing] to the corpus of scholarly sonic documentation of medieval music . . . [but] it might be well, though, for the average music lover to sample this.”<sup>196</sup> Further comments included: “delight for even the non-professional appreciator”;<sup>197</sup> “some of the sounds take a little getting used to . . . but the buzzes and wheezes are all great fun”;<sup>198</sup> and would “appeal to new audiences.”<sup>199</sup>

From these comments, which appeared in periodicals ranging from *Consumer Bulletin* to *The Musical Quarterly*, it seems most critics considered the Pro Musica recordings accessible and enjoyable for the general public and recommended them. At the same time, the Pro Musica’s albums provided enough points of interest for the early music specialists. Thus the Pro Musica could secure audiences from the two opposite ends of a pole and also those in between.

### **Programming and Marketing**

In conjunction with the effort to build an audience, Greenberg and the New York Pro Musica employed an effective approach in marketing their music. For a professional performing ensemble to be successful, the way the music and the group are presented to the public plays a crucial role. As an ensemble specializing in early music, the Pro Musica had a disadvantage compared to groups performing familiar eighteenth- and nineteenth-century works. The Pro Musica had to win public interest by performing works that were heard for the first time by the majority of the audience. The unfamiliarity of the music can contribute an impression of freshness and excitement, but it can also be an obstacle if the public does not care to learn something new. Greenberg and the Pro Musica overcame this potential barrier by planning

---

<sup>195</sup> Review of *Thomas Morley, New Records* (December 1953): 8.

<sup>196</sup> Review of *The Play of Daniel, HiFi and Music Review* 1 (November 1958): 63.

<sup>197</sup> Review of *Spanish Music of the Renaissance, Pan Pipes of Sigma Alpha Iota* 53 (March 1961): 22.

<sup>198</sup> Review of *Instrumental Music from the Courts of Queen Elizabeth and King James, The New York Times*, 1 October 1961, x14.

<sup>199</sup> Review of *Spanish Medieval Music, The Musical Quarterly* 49 (1963): 259.

interesting and attention-catching programs, presenting the records in an attractive fashion, and offering exciting, lively, and thoroughly entertaining performances.

Noah Greenberg himself expressed his view of the importance of thematic program construction. He pointed out that in the previous years, performers preferred the “sampling” or anthology formats, which featured a few examples from several genres, composers, or time periods to introduce early music to those unfamiliar with it. This tendency, Greenberg thought, was giving way to more cohesive, thematically connected programs. This showed a more serious involvement with the scholarly aspects of historical and musical investigation on the part of the performers, and a ready acceptance and wider tolerance and understanding of diverse musical styles on the part of the audience. Greenberg stated that this increasing awareness of musical styles had “an important effect on the listening habits of the concert public as well as on the nature of the demands it is beginning to make on those who draw up programs.”<sup>200</sup>

Several years later, Elizabeth Roche confirmed this point. She reported that before the 1950s, interest in early music had been generally limited to music of a certain period such as the Elizabethan era, and to “easily assimilated anthologies and collections of dance music.” In other words, the early music works available on records had “scarcely touched the more serious repertory.”<sup>201</sup> However, beginning in about 1954, a new movement toward a more “adventurous exploration of repertory, and concentration on most important music” was seen statistically, reaching its peak in 1967.<sup>202</sup> This coincided with the height of Noah Greenberg’s career, along with activities of other prominent early music groups such as David Munrow’s Early Music Consort of London, Michael Morrow’s *Musica Reservata*, and Thomas Binkley’s *Studio der frühen Musik*.

---

<sup>200</sup> Greenberg, “Early Music Performance Today,” 315

<sup>201</sup> Roche, “Early Music on Records in the Last 25 Years--2,” *Musical Times* 120 (1979): 217.

<sup>202</sup> *Ibid.*, 217.



In his program designs, both for recordings and concerts, Greenberg strove for thematic coherence and moved away from the random anthology format.<sup>203</sup> A program, for example, could be taken from a larger collection or extended work, such as Banchieri's *Festino*, or longer Renaissance masses. It could also be based on some historical event or figure, such as the music of Shakespeare's time, music for the court of Lorenzo the Magnificent, or music of the court and chapel of Emperor Maximilian I. In other cases, a single composer could be featured, for example, Claudio Monteverdi, Ludwig Senfl, Thomas Tallis, or Josquin des Prés. Philip Pickett commends this combination of "education and excitement." He states, "Anything which focuses the attention of the general public onto an aspect of history already familiar to them while promoting an awareness of the social, historical and cultural background to the music of different periods seems to draw at least some of the crowds."<sup>204</sup> Such extra-musical information can anchor the interests of the audience, and broaden their awareness of the music with historical and cultural points of view.

Another approach to programming that proved successful was the combining of music with other performance elements. In a project for the Ninety-second Street "Y," Greenberg and the Pro Musica collaborated with the poet W. H. Auden for "*An Evening of Elizabethan Verses and Its Music*." Auden recited a selection of Elizabethan verses, and the Primavera Singers presented the musical settings. This program was an instant success, attracting New York's

---

<sup>203</sup> This is a comparative evaluation relative to the practice of Greenberg's time. Tess Knighton, however, writing retrospectively in 1992 notes, however, that these early pioneers "almost always adopted an anthology format: a selection of pieces from a wide repertory that might be broadly divided into medieval or Renaissance" (Knighton, 31). If she is including Greenberg among the "early pioneers," then what Greenberg considered to be an innovative move away from the anthology format was considered by Knighton, looking back twenty years later, to be still an anthology format. If it were the case, it demonstrates how the criteria for good programming and the public taste have changed over the decades.

<sup>204</sup> Philip Pickett, "Hard-Sell, Scholarship and Silly Titles," in *Companion to Medieval and Renaissance Music*, ed. Tess Knighton and David Fallows (London: J. M. Dent & Sons, 1992), 50.

intellectual community. It brought in the Pro Musica's first full-capacity audience and the record, released in 1955, was still the best-selling album of the Pro Musica two years later.<sup>205</sup>

The highlights of the Pro Musica's programs, however, were the medieval musical dramas and other theatrical presentations. The New York Pro Musica presented two medieval musical dramas under the direction of Noah Greenberg: *The Play of Daniel* and *The Play of Herod*. After Greenberg's death, the Pro Musica produced an Elizabethan masque, *An Entertainment for Elizabeth*, a medieval Easter play, *The Play of the Risen Christ* (later known as *The Resurrection Play of Tours*), and finally, *La Dafne* by Marco da Gagliano, which was also recorded. These projects required extensive preparation and interdisciplinary cooperation.

In *Daniel*, for example, Greenberg prepared a performance edition from the original twelfth-century manuscript with the advice and assistance of William L. Smoldon, a British musicologist, and Rev. Rembert Weakland, O.S.B., and decided on the instrumentation and the personnel.<sup>206</sup> Then Greenberg collaborated with the producer Lincoln Kirstein of the American Ballet (who also supported the project financially), director Nikos Psacharopoulos of the Yale Drama School, the costume and stage designer Robert Fletcher of the Ballet Theatre, the artistic advisor Meyer Schapiro of Columbia University, and the poet W. H. Auden, who wrote the English verses to be recited. In addition, extra singers were hired, new instruments were acquired, program notes and related publications were written, and much planning, experimenting, and rehearsing was necessary.<sup>207</sup> The large scale of the projects and combining of many different areas of expertise involved in these theatrical productions were a great challenge artistically and financially for Greenberg and the Pro Musica. However, the end results, especially for *Daniel* and

---

<sup>205</sup> Martin Mayer, "Musical Echoes of the Renaissance," *Reporter* 17 (September 5, 1957): 39.

<sup>206</sup> Noah Greenberg, ed., *The Play of Daniel* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1959).

<sup>207</sup> Gollin, 228-251.

*Herod*, were enthusiastically received by the critics. These projects became great assets to the Pro Musica's career in the long run.

Greenberg also paid much attention to the visual presentation of the programs. The group performed in formal concert attire, as would any professional classical chamber ensemble. Both the concerts and the records were accompanied by extensive, informative program notes explaining the historical, musical, and cultural background of the music. Because the period, musical styles, and instruments were generally unfamiliar, program notes played a significant role in creating the intellectual and emotional “anchor” for the audiences. The lengthy and thorough notes were written by musicologists and attractively illustrated, and were offered in concerts or as booklets bound to the Decca album covers. With their high professional quality in the writing, illustrations, design, and printing, these program notes became another hallmark of the Pro Musica's productions. Although generally appreciated, personal responses to the notes varied: The *New Yorker* magazine reported that the notes can sometimes be a distraction and the “too heady” contents can take away one's enjoyment of the moment, but admitted that they do appeal to the cultural intelligentsia of New York.<sup>208</sup> Sarah Gaskill wrote that the program notes for the Kaufmann Auditorium concerts, with the typography “donated by Franz Hess, the president of Huxley House, the most distinguished typographers then in New York,” who later designed many of the covers for the Decca recordings and also the Pro Musica logo, had become distinctive attractions.<sup>209</sup>

As the music director of the ensemble, it was up to Greenberg to decide on the programs for the recordings. Greenberg seemed to have mastered the task quite well, offering various

---

<sup>208</sup> Hayes B. Jacobs, “The Zinkist and the Shawmist,” *New Yorker* 36 (7 May 1960): 38.

<sup>209</sup> Gaskill, 14.

programs with contrasting elements, new ideas, and interesting repertoire selections. However, critics objected to the repetition of works already recorded by other groups, the inclusion of inappropriate selections in a thematic program, and the use of some new programming approaches Greenberg employed. Nevertheless, most critics seem to agree that Greenberg's programming was effective.

The leading qualities of Greenberg's programs were variety and contrast. Not only with instrumentation and musical interpretation, but also with the selection of the repertory did Greenberg offer an interesting variety in a program. For example, the use of virginal interludes in a set of otherwise all *a cappella* madrigals was lauded as giving a pleasant variety in earlier programs.<sup>210</sup> A reviewer writing about the Everest Anthology of the Pro Musica noted that the "variety in alternating vocal and instrumental music" was a "strong selling point" of the Pro Musica.<sup>211</sup> Others wrote that Greenberg had a "keen ear for contrast and variety in program making";<sup>212</sup> and his programs had an "ample variety of mood and texture";<sup>213</sup> and "varied content."<sup>214</sup>

What made Greenberg's recordings more attractive was the incorporation of this element of variety in a well-planned program. In fact, the praise for Greenberg's talent in planning a good program was almost unanimous. His programs were described as "mostly excellently selected";<sup>215</sup> an "appropriate cross-section of music of this period";<sup>216</sup> "enjoyable";<sup>217</sup> "delightful

---

<sup>210</sup> Review of *Festino, Guide to Long-Playing Records* (1955): 28. Also review of *Thomas Morley, Guide to Long-Playing Records* (1955): 157.

<sup>211</sup> Review of *Noah Greenberg Conducting the New York Pro Musica, Saturday Review* (25 June 1966): 48-49.

<sup>212</sup> Review of *Elizabethan and Jacobean Ayres, Madrigals and Dances, High Fidelity* 9B (November 1959): 100.

<sup>213</sup> Review of *Early Baroque Music of Italy, High Fidelity* 16 (June 1966): 92.

<sup>214</sup> Review of *Early Baroque Music of Italy, HiFi Stereo Review* (June 1966): 80.

<sup>215</sup> Review of *Elizabethan and Jacobean Ayres, Madrigals and Dances, New Records* 27 (July 1959): 13.

<sup>216</sup> Review of *Elizabethan and Jacobean Ayres, Madrigals and Dances, High Fidelity* 9B (August 1959): 60.

<sup>217</sup> Review of *Elizabethan and Jacobean Ayres, Madrigals and Dances, HiFi Stereo Review* (December 1959): 108.

[and] richly colored”;<sup>218</sup> “pleasantly arranged”;<sup>219</sup> a “comprehensive survey of genres and styles [and a] well-chosen selection”;<sup>220</sup> a “fascinating survey”;<sup>221</sup> and a “skillfully contrived [and] artful combination.”<sup>222</sup> The choice of works was also lauded as making the programs into “very rare”<sup>223</sup> or “important collection[s]”;<sup>224</sup> probing into the “little-known corner of music history”;<sup>225</sup> and featuring “neglected repertory.”<sup>226</sup> Furthermore, Greenberg was commended as having “unerring taste,”<sup>227</sup> “showmanship,” and “highly critical taste” in selecting and designing programs that were rich in “contrast and variety in subject, spirit, and texture.”<sup>228</sup>

However, one criticism that stood out concerned the selection of repertory already recorded by other performers. During the Pro Musica’s infancy, the repertory of early music was just beginning to be explored and featured on recordings. Therefore, some critics thought it unfortunate to re-record works that had already been recorded by other groups. For example, some of the selections of virginal pieces by Frescobaldi on *Festino* had already been recorded by others, and a reviewer wrote that with “so little of Frescobaldi’s music recorded, duplication is wasteful.”<sup>229</sup> Some selections on *Sacred Music of Thomas Tallis* had already been recorded by Alfred Deller, and one critic noted that Deller had “done it better,” therefore it was unnecessary

---

<sup>218</sup> Review of *Spanish Music of the Renaissance*, *Pan Pipes of Sigma Alpha Iota* 53 (March 1961): 22.

<sup>219</sup> Review of *Instrumental Music from the Courts of Queen Elizabeth and King James*, *Gramophone* 40 (June 1962): 11.

<sup>220</sup> Review of *Instrumental Music from the Courts of Queen Elizabeth and King James*, *The Musical Quarterly* 48 (1962): 546.

<sup>221</sup> Review of *Spanish Medieval Music*, *High Fidelity* 12 (November 1962): 117.

<sup>222</sup> Review of *Early Baroque Music of Italy*, *American Record Guide* 32 (May 1966): 795.

<sup>223</sup> Review of *Spanish Medieval Music*, *American Record Guide* 29 (June 1963): 259.

<sup>224</sup> Review of *Spanish Medieval Music*, *HiFi Stereo Review* 9 (December 1962): 108.

<sup>225</sup> Review of *Spanish Medieval Music*, *High Fidelity* 12 (November 1962): 117.

<sup>226</sup> Review of *Spanish Medieval Music*, *The Musical Quarterly* 49 (1963): 259.

<sup>227</sup> Review of *Elizabethan and Jacobean Ayres, Madrigals and Dances*, *The New York Times*, 13 September 1959, x22.

<sup>228</sup> Review of *Spanish Music of the Renaissance*, *High Fidelity* 10B (October 1960): 98.

<sup>229</sup> Review of *Festino*, *American Record Guide* 19 (June 1953): 234.

to repeat.<sup>230</sup> Included with *Elizabethan and Jacobean Ayres, Madrigals and Dances* were also some selections that duplicated Deller's recordings.<sup>231</sup>

In contrast, one aspect of Greenberg's programming that received praise was his incorporation of new approaches. These included featuring theme-oriented programs, as already discussed, and incorporating non-musical elements. Because the early music repertory was unfamiliar to most of the public, it could be said that many of the programs automatically acted as ear-openers to the new music and sonority. However, some programs did receive special recognition for their choice of works. For example, a reviewer commented on *The Music of Salamone Rossi: Hebreo of Mantua* as having a choice of theme that offers "something new" by an "unusually interesting composer."<sup>232</sup> Another critic for the same album thought that Greenberg's choice of music made it an "unusual record."<sup>233</sup>

In its combining of other interests with music, *An Evening of Elizabethan Verses and Its Music* received acclaim as well as criticism. On the one hand, some regarded the idea of combining poetry recitation by W. H. Auden with performances of the songs a "very clever"<sup>234</sup> and "good"<sup>235</sup> idea, and thought it an "effective combination that should have been tried long ago," because the "spoken poetry adds greatly to the sense of madrigals."<sup>236</sup> One reviewer even noted that "words and music have seldom been blended more fascinatingly."<sup>237</sup> On the other hand, a critic noticed that the "transition of song to verses [are] irritating and mood breaking,"<sup>238</sup>

---

<sup>230</sup> Review of *Sacred Music of Thomas Tallis*, *American Record Guide* 25 (August 1959): 858.

<sup>231</sup> Review of *Elizabethan and Jacobean Ayres, Madrigals and Dances*, *American Record Guide* 26 (April 1960): 661.

<sup>232</sup> Review of *Music of Salamone Rossi, Hebreo of Mantua*, *High Fidelity* 7B (November 1957): 74.

<sup>233</sup> Review of *Music of Salamone Rossi, Hebreo of Mantua*, *Consumer Bulletin* (February 1958): 37.

<sup>234</sup> Review of *An Evening of Elizabethan Verses and Its Music*, *New Records* 23 (December 1955): 16.

<sup>235</sup> Review of *An Evening of Elizabethan Verses and Its Music*, *Audio* 40 (January 1956): 42.

<sup>236</sup> Review of *An Evening of Elizabethan Verses and Its Music*, *Harper's Magazine* 212 (April 1956): 104.

<sup>237</sup> Review of *An Evening of Elizabethan Verses and Its Music*, *Atlantic Monthly* 221 (May 1968): 107.

<sup>238</sup> Review of *An Evening of Elizabethan Verses and Its Music*, *The New York Times*, 11 March 1956, x8.

and another commented that the “poetry reading [is] fun the first time around, but falls flat without the music.”<sup>239</sup>

Another approach Greenberg took was including short demonstrations and spoken descriptions of early instruments on the *Renaissance Bands* album. Thus a listener could hear the individual sonority of different early instruments. This idea also received both praise and criticism. Those in favor noted that it was “interestingly educational”;<sup>240</sup> “marvelously effective”;<sup>241</sup> and “a pleasure.”<sup>242</sup> Those opposing commented that it was “wasteful of good space” and only “good for novices to familiarize” themselves with the early instruments.<sup>243</sup> In this case, perceptions of the audience’s previous experience and knowledge in early music and instruments proved to be an important factor in the critical reception of the album.

The medieval musical dramas *The Play of Daniel* and *The Play of Herod* were a culmination of Greenberg’s interdisciplinary endeavors in programming. On the imagination and work involved in *The Play of Daniel*, for example, one critic called it an “astounding exercise of creative scholarship,” that “convert[ed] a most unpromising-looking ‘script’ into a work of art” which was “a rare pleasure indeed.”<sup>244</sup> The preparation of the production was recognized as requiring a high level of commitment and collaboration, as seen in such comments as: “a veritable bonanza, one cannot praise too highly the care and erudition that have gone into this recording”;<sup>245</sup> “obviously the work of dedicated men”;<sup>246</sup> and “every element of play made the object of intense research.”<sup>247</sup> The interpretation of the historical information was recognized as

---

<sup>239</sup> Review of *An Evening of Elizabethan Verses and Its Music*, *High Fidelity* 18 (June 1968): 91.

<sup>240</sup> Review of *Renaissance Bands*, *Audio* 49 (December 1965): 44.

<sup>241</sup> Review of *Renaissance Bands*, *HiFi Stereo Review* (January 1966): 89.

<sup>242</sup> Review of *Renaissance Bands*, *The New York Times*, 27 March 1966, x22.

<sup>243</sup> Review of *Renaissance Bands*, *American Record Guide* 32 (January 1966): 421.

<sup>244</sup> Review of *The Play of Daniel*, *High Fidelity* 8B (October 1958): 66.

<sup>245</sup> Review of *The Play of Daniel*, *New Records* 26 (October 1958): 11.

<sup>246</sup> Review of *The Play of Daniel*, *Consumer Bulletin* (November 1958): 39.

<sup>247</sup> Review of *The Play of Daniel*, *The Musical Quarterly* 45 (April 1959): 269-72.

“a musical archaeology . . . an imaginative step forward” with “hypothetical reconstruction done freely within strict scholarly bounds”;<sup>248</sup> and “problems solved by the best of modern scholarship.”<sup>249</sup> The Pro Musica was said to have done “full justice” in creating this “unforgettable” production,<sup>250</sup> making it “historically correct, yet fresh-sounding as today.”<sup>251</sup>

In producing recordings that would be well received by the public, presentation played an important role. The New York Pro Musica was especially renowned in this matter, with its high-quality recordings, helpful notes, and attractive album presentations.

Most critics seem to agree that from the early albums with Esoteric Records, to those with Columbia and Decca, the Pro Musica produced recordings with good sound quality and balance. Some points of criticism were, for example, the “over-resonant sharpness” in tone quality in *Thomas Morley*;<sup>252</sup> the too great emphasis on Oberlin’s voice that “exaggerates almost to absurdity the intensity of Oberlin”<sup>253</sup> on the *Henry Purcell* album; and the close recording that was “a bit oppressive” in *Renaissance Bands*,<sup>254</sup> but other reviews generally praised the recording quality. Some descriptions of the recorded sound include: “well nigh perfect by current [i.e., 1953] standards”;<sup>255</sup> “excellent,” with a “nice amount of space around singers”;<sup>256</sup> with “welcome spaciousness”;<sup>257</sup> “clean, well defined”;<sup>258</sup> “excellent and fine balance”;<sup>259</sup> “exceptionally

---

<sup>248</sup> Review of *The Play of Daniel*, *Harper’s Magazine* (December 1958): 106.

<sup>249</sup> Review of *The Play of Daniel*, *Library Journal* 84, no. 1 (1 January 1959): 67.

<sup>250</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>251</sup> Review of *The Play of Daniel*, *Pan Pipes of Sigma Alpha Iota* 51 (March 1959): 24.

<sup>252</sup> Review of *Thomas Morley*, *Guide to Long-Playing Recordings* (1955): 157.

<sup>253</sup> Review of *Henry Purcell Songs*, *Nation* (12 March 1955): 228.

<sup>254</sup> Review of *Renaissance Bands*, *Gramophone* 43 (May 1966): 560.

<sup>255</sup> Review of *Festino*, *American Record Guide* 19 (June 1953): 234.

<sup>256</sup> Review of *Thomas Morley*, *High Fidelity* 4A (June 1954): 46.

<sup>257</sup> Review of *Thomas Morley*, *The Musical Quarterly* 40 (September 1954): 634.

<sup>258</sup> Review of *Children’s Songs of Shakespeare’s Time*, *HiFi Music at Home* (January and February 1958).

<sup>259</sup> Review of *Vocal Music of Claudio Monteverdi*, *American Record Guide* 23 (March 1957): 95.



fine”;<sup>260</sup> a “beautiful... and clear natural sound,” and with “good blend and balance”;<sup>261</sup> “brilliant”;<sup>262</sup> “excellent”;<sup>263</sup> and “superb.”<sup>264</sup> The recording standard was called “a model of its kind”<sup>265</sup> and the engineering was called “marvelous.”<sup>266</sup> The Pro Musica was able to take advantage of the latest developments in recording technology and the critics recognized its excellent quality.

Because the repertory that the New York Pro Musica presented was relatively new to the audience, it was necessary and helpful to introduce the material in writing. Greenberg tried to include the text with its translation and explanatory notes with each album whenever possible. On some discs, however, this was not done for budgetary reasons, and the listeners, who came to expect thorough introductory materials on the Pro Musica albums, were disappointed. The Decca issues in the late fifties and early sixties contained attractively designed and illustrated compendious notes in a booklet form that were enthusiastically received by the critics. In fact, the visual presentation of the records, in terms of the illustration, cover, packaging, and written comments, became as strong a selling point of the Pro Musica records.

In *Festino*, which was one of the first albums released, only a partial translation of the text was printed on the back cover, and one reviewer wished for “fuller descriptive notes and text.”<sup>267</sup> However, most of the following albums were praised for their good background information.

---

<sup>260</sup> Review of *The Play of Daniel*, *Consumer Bulletin* (November 1958): 39.

<sup>261</sup> Review of *The Play of Daniel*, *Consumer Reports* 24 (March 1959): 146.

<sup>262</sup> Review of *Instrumental Music from the Courts of Queen Elizabeth and King James*, *Musical America* (April 1962): 36.

<sup>263</sup> Review of *Spanish Medieval Music*, *The Musical Quarterly* 49 (1963): 259. Review of *Medieval English Carols and Italian Dances*, *HiFi Stereo Review* (February 1963): 92.

<sup>264</sup> Review of *Spanish Medieval Music*, *Consumer Bulletin* (December 1962): 36. Review of *Early Baroque Music of Italy*, *American Recorder* 10 (Winter 1969): 9.

<sup>265</sup> Review of *The Play of Daniel*, *Consumer Reports* 24 (March 1959): 146.

<sup>266</sup> Review of *Early Baroque Music of Italy*, *Consumer Bulletin* (June 1966): 15.

<sup>267</sup> Review of *Festino*, *Saturday Review* (28 November 1953): 66.

Except for the occasional correction of facts,<sup>268</sup> the reviewers regarded the notes, most of them written by musicologists, as “intelligent”;<sup>269</sup> “from most authoritative sources”;<sup>270</sup> “good”;<sup>271</sup> and as offering an “interesting discussion.”<sup>272</sup> Many of the contributors were especially praised for their writings. For example, Max Serbin was acknowledged for his notes for *Ode on the Death of Mr. Henry Purcell*;<sup>273</sup> W. H. Auden’s notes were rated as a “brilliant scholarship”;<sup>274</sup> and Joel Newman’s writings were praised as “excellent.”<sup>275</sup> The original issue of *The Play of Daniel* contained eleven pages of notes<sup>276</sup> with extended essays by Paul Henry Lang, Father Rembert Weakland and Margaret Freeman,<sup>277</sup> the entire text with its translation, and Auden’s verse narration.<sup>278</sup> Other writers who received praise include LaNoue Davenport,<sup>279</sup> Denis Stevens,<sup>280</sup> and C. C. Brown.<sup>281</sup>

There was also criticism regarding the content of the notes, mostly concerning the lack of citation of sources mentioned in the notes. Such comments included: “wish for more discussion of music”;<sup>282</sup> “lack of acknowledgement and no mention of assembling the work”;<sup>283</sup> more

---

<sup>268</sup> For example review of *Ode on the Death of Mr. Henry Purcell*, *The Musical Quarterly* 40 (April 1954): 279-80; and review of *Music of Salamone Rossi, Hebreo of Mantua*, *American Record Guide* 24 (November 1957): 83.

<sup>269</sup> Review of *Ode on the Death of Mr. Henry Purcell*, *New Records* (February 1954): 11.

<sup>270</sup> Review of *Ode on the Death of Mr. Henry Purcell*, *The Musical Quarterly* 40 (April 1954): 279.

<sup>271</sup> Review of *English Medieval Christmas Carols*, *New Records* (December 1953): 8.

<sup>272</sup> Review of *An Evening of Elizabethan Verses and Its Music*, *Harper’s Magazine* 212 (April 1956): 104.

<sup>273</sup> Review of *Ode on the Death of Mr. Henry Purcell*, *The Musical Quarterly* 40 (April 1954): 279-80.

<sup>274</sup> Review of *An Evening of Elizabethan Verses and Its Music*, *American Record Guide* 22 (March 1956): 104-05.

<sup>275</sup> Review of *The Music of Salamone Rossi, Hebreo of Mantua*, *American Record Guide* 24 (November 1957): 83. Review of *Sacred Music of Thomas Tallis*, *Saturday Review* (29 August 1959): 41.

<sup>276</sup> Review of *The Play of Daniel*, *HiFi and Music Review* 1 (November 1958): 63.

<sup>277</sup> Review of *The Play of Daniel*, *High Fidelity* 8B (October 1958): 66.

<sup>278</sup> Review of *The Play of Daniel*, *The New York Times*, 24 August 1958, x10.

<sup>279</sup> Review of *Instrumental Music from the Courts of Queen Elizabeth and King James*, *Gramophone* 40 (June 1962): 11.

<sup>280</sup> Review of *Spanish Medieval Music*, *American Record Guide* 29 (June 1963): 776.

<sup>281</sup> Review of *Ludwig Senfl: Composer to the Court and Chapel of Emperor Maximilian I*, *American Record Guide* 30 (April 1964): 666. Review of *Renaissance Bands*, *High Fidelity* 15 (December 1965): 114. Review of *Early Baroque Music of Italy*, *High Fidelity* 16 (June 1966): 92.

<sup>282</sup> Review of *Instrumental Music from the Courts of Queen Elizabeth and King James*, *The Musical Quarterly* 48 (1962): 546.

<sup>283</sup> Review of *Spanish Medieval Music*, *The Musical Quarterly* 49 (1963): 259.

information on sources and instruments are needed;<sup>284</sup> “fuller documentation of instrumentation of each movement would be helpful”;<sup>285</sup> “sources of works not identified in notes”;<sup>286</sup> and no sources and dates in notes.<sup>287</sup> The criticism concerning the lack of musical sources recurred often, but it is unclear why Greenberg failed to correct this shortcoming.

In the early years of the Pro Musica, the written materials were simply printed on the backside of the record covers. However, beginning with *The Play of Daniel*, several albums were presented in an attractive, “deluxe” manner with booklets containing illustrations and photographs. This made the albums more visually attractive and caught the attention of the record buyers and collectors. Indeed, the original *Play of Daniel* album is described as “unusually handsome”;<sup>288</sup> “beautifully packaged, magnificently recorded, expertly annotated”;<sup>289</sup> with “elaborate format.”<sup>290</sup> The packaging was said to be “virtually all one could ask”;<sup>291</sup> and “a most helpful leaflet” of the “album produced with care” added “to the value of the disc to be cherished.”<sup>292</sup> Even though the “recording cannot convey the beauty and color of the elaborate costumes and pageantry”<sup>293</sup> as one critic commented, the album received as much recognition and praise as the live performances because of its presentation.

The thorough preparation of the record was well worth the effort. The public appreciated the added information and the attractive presentation and packaging, and came to expect it as part of the high standard of professionalism that the Pro Musica offered. In fact, *Sacred Music of Thomas Tallis*, which was released after *The Play of Daniel*, was criticized because its packaging

---

<sup>284</sup> Review of *It Was a Lover and His Lass: Music of Shakespeare’s Time*, *Gramophone* 42 (August 1964): 95.

<sup>285</sup> Review of *Renaissance Bands*, *High Fidelity* 15 (December 1965): 114.

<sup>286</sup> Review of *Early Baroque Music of Italy*, *American Record Guide* 32 (January 1966): 421.

<sup>287</sup> Review of *Early Baroque Music of Italy*, *Gramophone* 44 (August 1966): 122.

<sup>288</sup> Review of *The Play of Daniel*, *The New York Times*, 24 August 1958, x10.

<sup>289</sup> Review of *The Play of Daniel*, *New Records* 26 (October 1958): 11.

<sup>290</sup> Review of *The Play of Daniel*, *AGO Quarterly* (October 1958): 154.

<sup>291</sup> Review of *The Play of Daniel*, *American Record Guide* 25 (December 1958): 264.

<sup>292</sup> Review of *The Play of Daniel*, *Harper’s Magazine* (December 1958): 106.

<sup>293</sup> Review of *The Play of Daniel*, *HiFi & Music Review* 1 (November 1958): 63.

was not as nice as the *Daniel* record.<sup>294</sup> However, many of the later albums were praised for their handsome and elaborate presentations,<sup>295</sup> and this quality became an added Pro Musica hallmark.

To be successful as a professional performing ensemble, a group must present what it wants to offer, particularly if what it is offering is new and unfamiliar, in an effective way so that it can be communicated to the audience. Greenberg's methods of communication were indeed effective, and this set the New York Pro Musica as one of the leading early music ensembles of its time. The first and the most obvious of Greenberg's approaches was the performance of early music of the highest possible professional quality, although the Pro Musica was not alone in this respect. Second was the ample supporting material and activities in early music in the form of program notes, music publishing, workshops, and education. However, what ultimately distinguished the Pro Musica from its rival groups was the clear image or impression of the group consisting of competent, enthusiastic, interesting, pioneering musicians led by a charismatic leader, Noah Greenberg. Music was important, but even more so was the way it was brought out. In this aspect, Greenberg can take the full credit. It was his idea and imagination that brought the musicians together and his energy and enthusiasm that overcame difficulties and challenges and led them to produce exciting performances.

In the performance of relatively unknown early music with professional singers and virtuoso instrumentalists that "swept away the cobwebs encrusting the performance of 'old music,'" <sup>296</sup> Greenberg's primary goal was to let the music come alive and speak loud and clear to

---

<sup>294</sup> Review of *Sacred Music of Thomas Tallis*, *American Record Guide* 25 (August 1959): 858.

<sup>295</sup> Review of *Elizabethan and Jacobean Ayres, Madrigals and Dances*, *American Record Guide* 26 (April 1960): 661. Review of *Spanish Music of the Renaissance*, *New Records* 28 (February 1961): 13. Review of *Spanish Medieval Music*, *American Record Guide* 29 (June 1963): 776. Review of *It Was a Lady and His Lass: Music of Shakespeare's Time*, *American Record Guide* 30 (July 1964): 72. Review of *The Play of Herod*, *American Record Guide* 31 (September 1964): 18. Review of *Early Baroque Music of Italy*, *Audio* 50 (May 1966): 43.

<sup>296</sup> David Hamilton, "Musical Events: Ave Atque Vale," *New Yorker* (25 March 1974), 116.

the people. Most critics and reviewers characterized the Pro Musica performances with such words as exciting, energetic, brilliant, virtuosic, with great showmanship, electrical, colorful, with zest and vitality, lively, new, and engaging. Comments such as the one that says that the Pro Musica's performances are "not museum pieces, but ever fresh, live and lovely"<sup>297</sup> reappeared many times. This general style did become what Knighton calls the "clearly recognizable sound print"<sup>298</sup> that is essential for a group to achieve and sustain its recognition.

For an ensemble specializing in early music, this recognition was indeed remarkable. *The Play of Daniel* album, for example, became a commercial success not only in the field of early music, but also in the general classical music as well. The recording was called "certainly one of the finest phonographic productions in recent years," and "one of the most amazing sets ever to come to this writer's attention."<sup>299</sup> Similarly, a critic for the *Consumer Bulletin* even wrote that it was "the most exciting and significant record of the quarterly crop,"<sup>300</sup> and another writing for *The Musical Quarterly* regarded it as "a history-making record."<sup>301</sup> These praises are significant, because they point to the fact that a recording of early music by the Pro Musica could compete with the mainstream classical releases. In the larger context of classical music recordings, the Pro Musica's *Daniel* was called the best of the season. Finally, a reviewer lauded the album as "a new landmark in the already remarkable achievement of this superb group," and recommended it as a "stimulating, novel and most valuable addition to the recorded medieval literature and worth owning."<sup>302</sup>

Through Greenberg's consistent effort in offering the public polished, professional quality recordings of interestingly conceived and planned programs of early music in an engaging,

---

<sup>297</sup> Review of *Spanish Music of the Renaissance, Pan Pipes of Sigma Alpha Iota* 53 (March 1961): 22.

<sup>298</sup> Knighton, 32.

<sup>299</sup> Review of *The Play of Daniel, New Records* 26 (October 1958): 11-12.

<sup>300</sup> Review of *The Play of Daniel, Consumer Bulletin* (November 1958): 39.

<sup>301</sup> Review of *The Play of Daniel, The Musical Quarterly* 45 (April 1959): 269.

<sup>302</sup> Review of *The Play of Daniel, American Record Guide* 25 (December 1958): 264-65.

attractive, novel fashion, the New York Pro Musica became a recognized “commodity” in the field of classical and early music performance. Greenberg reinforced this with ties to education, and by making academic contributions, taking risks, and upholding his and the Pro Musica’s spirit and appetite for new projects. The public could depend on Greenberg to bring them something new, interesting, and exciting on many levels, from the purely entertaining to the academic, and always with a good show. This two-way process between the Pro Musica’s productions and the trust and expectations of the public made the New York Pro Musica a successful early music ensemble.

## CHAPTER 5

### THE NEW YORK PRO MUSICA IN THE CONTEXT OF THE EARLY MUSIC REVIVAL

Noah Greenberg is often called a pioneer in early music performance. The *Oxford Advanced Learner's Dictionary* defines pioneer as “a person who is the first to study and develop a new area of knowledge, culture, etc.” or “a person who is among the first to go into an area or country to settle or work there.” In both senses of its meaning, Greenberg and the New York Pro Musica can be said to have earned this title. In the first sense, Greenberg did indeed study and develop a new area of knowledge in early music performance and introduced to the public this newly “discovered” repertory. In the second sense, Greenberg was among the first to get involved in the relatively unexplored area of early music performance. Along with other pioneers of his time, Greenberg cleared the field and plowed the soil for the future development of the early music movement.

Indeed, Greenberg and the Pro Musica made important achievements in the field of early music performance. However, the Pro Musica was not alone in this effort. Other leaders and ensembles across the Atlantic were also exploring the subject. For example, new performing and educational opportunities were becoming available, such as BBC's Third Programme, initiated in 1946, which offered an “adventurous showcase for performers and scholars such as Alfred Deller, Denis Stevens, [and] Thurston Dart.”<sup>1</sup> In addition to the Schola Cantorum Basiliensis in Basle (Basel), Switzerland, the Vienna Music Academy became known for studies in early music. Students at the Vienna Music Academy who studied early music with the musicologist Josef

---

<sup>1</sup> Harry Haskell, “Early Music,” in *The New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians*, 2<sup>nd</sup> ed.

Mertis included Nikolaus Harnoncourt, Gustave Leonhardt, René Clemencic, and Eduard Melkus, all of whom became leaders in the field.<sup>2</sup>

The two decades of the Pro Musica's existence correspond to the beginning phase of the post-World War II early music movement, characterized by the emergence of numerous influential and commercially successful early music performers. A survey of Greenberg's contemporaries specializing in medieval to early Baroque repertory gives a broader perspective on the state of early music performance during his career. Keeping this in mind, specific achievements of the Pro Musica that left significant marks on the course of early music revival will be discussed.

### **Contemporaries of the New York Pro Musica**

In the early 1950s the two most notable figures in early music were Safford Cape (1906-1973) and Alfred Deller (1912-1979). After his musical study in Belgium, Cape, an American conductor, musicologist, and composer, founded the Pro Musica Antiqua Ensemble of Brussels in 1933 and directed the group until his retirement in 1967. As one of the first professional early music specialist ensembles, Cape and his group performed in live concerts and made about fifty recordings, first on 78 rpm and later on LPs, of music of the thirteenth to sixteenth century.<sup>3</sup> Among the most noteworthy of the group's recording projects were its contributions to *L'Anthologie Sonore* and the *History of European Music in Sound* series.<sup>4</sup>

The English countertenor Alfred Deller is said to have initiated the revival of the countertenor tradition in early music performance. A self-trained singer and member of the

---

<sup>2</sup> Haskell, "Early Music."

<sup>3</sup> Pierre-F. Roberge, "Safford Cape," *Early Music FAQ*; available from <http://www.medieval.org/emfaq/performers/cape.html>; Internet; accessed 01 October 2002.

<sup>4</sup> Howard Schott, "Safford Cape," in *The New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians*, 2<sup>nd</sup> ed.



Canterbury Cathedral choir, Deller was discovered by the composer Michael Tippett. Since his radio broadcast performance of songs by Purcell in 1946, Deller became one of the most well-known and respected early music specialists in England. Deller founded the Deller Consort in 1948 and performed early English vocal works by such composers as Purcell and Dowland. Later he expanded his repertory to include works by other English composers as well as Bach, Handel, Monteverdi, and Machaut. A prolific performer, he toured internationally from 1955 until 1979 with his group and made over 135 recordings. In 1963 Deller founded the Stout Music Festival to promote early music and collaborated with other notable musicians such as Gustave Leonhardt and Frans Brüggen. In 1960 Benjamin Britten wrote the first important counter tenor role in a modern opera, *A Midsummer Night's Dream*, in which Deller premiered as Oberon.<sup>5</sup>

Harry Haskell, in his article on early music in the second edition of *The New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians*, names Nikolaus Harnoncourt, Noah Greenberg, Frans Brüggen, and David Munrow as the most influential early music leaders in the 1960s and '70s. In addition, Thomas Binkley and Michael Morrow are given credit for their experimental styles and unique approaches to the interpretation of medieval and Renaissance music.

The cellist, viol player, and conductor Nikolaus Harnoncourt (b. 1929) studied at the Vienna Academy of Music and founded the Concertus Musicus of Vienna in 1953. The group, led by his wife Alice, gave its public concert début in 1957 after four years of preparation and released its first recording in 1962. The ensemble was one of the first to specialize in performing early repertory with instruments appropriate to the period. Harnoncourt's areas of interest span the entire Baroque era and include Bach cantatas (from 1971 to 1990, Harnoncourt, collaborating

---

<sup>5</sup> Pierre-F. Roberge, "Alfred Deller," available from <http://www.medieval.org/emfaq/performers/deller.html>; Internet; accessed 18 September 2002. Aryeh Oron, "Alfred Deller," *Bach Cantatas Website*; available from <http://www.bach-cantatas.com/Bio/Deller-Alfred.htm>; Internet; accessed 18 September 2002.

with Gustave Leonhardt, recorded all of Bach's sacred cantatas) and Monteverdi operas. He also writes scholarly books and articles on early music performance practice and interpretation.<sup>6</sup>

Frans Brüggen (b. 1934) is considered to be the world's most famous recorder player. He studied recorder with Kees Otten and further studied flute at the Amsterdam Muzieklyceum. In 1955, at age twenty-one, Brüggen was appointed professor of recorder at the Royal Conservatoire in The Hague. After leading an extremely successful career as a recorder and flute virtuoso and teacher, Brüggen began to concentrate on conducting. He is today a specialist in the interpretation and performance of the orchestral music of the eighteenth century.<sup>7</sup>

Of the three main leaders named, David Munrow (1942-76) was probably closest to Greenberg in the area of specialization and musical style. Like Greenberg, Munrow formed his group, the Early Music Consort of London, in 1967 to perform medieval, Renaissance, and Baroque music. In his short but vivacious career with the ensemble, Munrow made fifty-two original recordings, led and performed in live performances and concert tours, organized a radio series called *Pied Piper* (1971-76), wrote the book *Instruments of the Middle Ages and Renaissance*,<sup>8</sup> and wrote and arranged scores for four feature films.<sup>9</sup> Munrow also composed and arranged the scores for the BBC television series *The Six Wives of Henry VIII* and *Elizabeth R*, which were televised internationally. Furthermore, the soundtrack for *The Six Wives of Henry VIII* became a best-selling album, which helped to make Munrow and his style and repertory known to a wide audience. Indeed, his refined and exciting performances, attention-catching

---

<sup>6</sup> Nicholas Anderson, "Nikolaus Harnoncourt" in *The New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians*, 2<sup>nd</sup> ed.

<sup>7</sup> Aryeh Oron, "Frans Brüggen," *Bach Cantatas Website*; available from <http://www.bach-cantatas.com/Bio/Bruggen-Frans.htm>; Internet; accessed 18 September 2002.

<sup>8</sup> David Munrow, *Instruments of the Middle Ages and Renaissance* (London: Oxford University Press, 1976).

<sup>9</sup> The four films are Ken Russell's *The Devils*; the EMI-MGM *Henry VIII*; Joël Santoni's *La Course en tête*; and John Boorman's *Zardoz*.

programs, and the high standard of instrumental virtuosity attracted many new listeners and popularized early music.<sup>10</sup>

The repertoires of Michael Morrow (1929-84) and Thomas Binkley (1932-95), two leaders with unusual approaches, also correspond to Greenberg's. Michael Morrow, originally a writer and broadcaster, co-founded the Musica Reservata with harpsichordist John Beckett in the mid 1950s. The British group gave its first public concert in 1960 and made at least fifteen original recordings.<sup>11</sup> Inspired by Eastern European folksingers, Morrow preferred a nasal or harsh tone quality. His direct and aggressive style was unusual at a time when early music was generally performed with a gentle, romantic sound and interpretation. Morrow presented various works from the thirteenth to sixteenth century, but his main area of interest and research was the French and Italian dance music of the sixteenth century.<sup>12</sup>

The American Thomas Binkley led his ensemble, Studio der Frühen Musik (Early Music Quartet), in Munich, Germany. From 1960 to 1979 the Early Music Quartet performed and made about fifty original recordings. Binkley was also active as a scholar and teacher. He wrote many articles and reviews in professional journals and essays on performance practice. Binkley taught at the Schola Cantorum Basiliensis from 1973 to 1977, then at Stanford University, and finally founded and directed the Early Music Institute at the University of Indiana at Bloomington in 1979.<sup>13</sup> The Early Music Quartet featured such composers as Machaut, Landini, Du Fay, Dowland, and Cicconia, but its special emphasis was earlier monophonic repertoires. The group always performed from memory and its interpretation was said to have "fluidity, freedom of

---

<sup>10</sup> Pierre-F. Roberge, "David Munrow" *Early Music FAQ*; available from available from <http://www.medieval.org/emfaq/performers/munrow.html>; Internet; accessed 10 December 2002. David Scott, "David Munrow," in *The New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians*, 2<sup>nd</sup> ed.

<sup>11</sup> Pierre-F. Roberge, "Musica Reservata," *Early Music FAQ*; available from <http://www.medieval.org/emfaq/performers/reservata.html>; Internet; accessed 18 September 2002.

<sup>12</sup> David Fallows, "Michael Morrow," in *The New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians*, 2<sup>nd</sup> ed.

<sup>13</sup> Pierre-F. Roberge, "Thomas Binkley," *Early Music FAQ*; available in <http://www.medieval.org/emfaq/performers/binkley.html>; Internet; accessed 18 September 2002.

expression, and direct communication.”<sup>14</sup> The distinctive vocal style of Estonian soprano Andrea von Ramm and Binkley’s interest in Andalusian folk music enhanced the expressive and improvisatory approach of the ensemble.<sup>15</sup>

From the late 1960s through the ’80s, the rise of interest in early vocal music helped start the careers of numerous vocal ensembles such as the Monteverdi Choir, Ensemble Clément Janequin, the Prague Madrigalists, Concerto Vocale, the Hilliard Ensemble, and Gothic Voices. In the 1970s and ’80s further star performers and leaders emerged, including Christopher Hogwood (former member of Munrow’s Early Music Consort of London), Reinhard Goebel, William Christie, Jordi Savall, and the Kuijken brothers.<sup>16</sup> Later in the decade, even full orchestras of period instruments, for example the Academy of Ancient Music (Christopher Hogwood) and the Orchestra of the Eighteenth Century (Frans Brüggen), were founded in addition to the ever-growing number of smaller specialist ensembles. By the 1990s, professional training in early music began to be offered in many conservatories and music academies, and issues in performance practice and authenticity became widely debated topics. As Haskell notes, “As the early music field becomes increasingly professional in its approach to training, organization, marketing, and fundraising, it has lost many of the trappings of a counterculture and become more and more integral to mainstream musical life.”<sup>17</sup>

However, in the beginning stage of Greenberg’s career with the New York Pro Musica, early music was still a relatively rare commodity in the United States. Almost every finding and idea Greenberg offered to the interested listeners meant something new and exciting, a kind of music so different from the usual classical concert repertory. One of the important aspects of the

---

<sup>14</sup> David Fallows, “Studio der frühen Musik,” in *The New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians*, 2<sup>nd</sup> ed.

<sup>15</sup> Ibid.

<sup>16</sup> Haskell, “Early Music.”

<sup>17</sup> Ibid.

achievement of the New York Pro Musica, as with other leading ensembles of its time, was bringing forth such new “discoveries” to the public. In fact, the Pro Musica made numerous recordings that featured certain works or composers of early music for the first time in modern history. In other cases the Pro Musica’s renditions offered new interpretations of music already recorded by a few others, thus enriching the choice of performances for the listeners. Such contributions were crucial not only for the Pro Musica’s career, but also for the broader picture of the early music revival.

### **The Contributions of the New York Pro Musica**

The New York Pro Musica can boast a list of “the first” or “one of the first” endeavors in recording particular works or featuring a series of works by a composer. A substantial list of such historical recordings can be compiled from information in published record reviews alone. It includes the first complete madrigal comedy;<sup>18</sup> the most extensive recording of Morley ever;<sup>19</sup> the first complete version of *The Play of Daniel*;<sup>20</sup> the first complete recorded version of a mass by Thomas Tallis;<sup>21</sup> one of the first discs devoted entirely to Josquin;<sup>22</sup> first recordings of two masses by Heinrich Isaac and Jacob Obrecht;<sup>23</sup> and the first substantial representation of Senfl on record and the first one entirely devoted to him.<sup>24</sup>

The Pro Musica also offered new interpretations of works already recorded by other performers. In many articles comparing the Pro Musica with other performers, the reviewers were

---

<sup>18</sup> Review of *Festino*, *New Records* (October 1953): 13.

<sup>19</sup> Review of *Thomas Morley*, *Guide to Long-Playing Records* (1955): 157.

<sup>20</sup> Review of *The Play of Daniel*, *Gramophone* 37 (October 1959): 186.

<sup>21</sup> Review of *Sacred Music of Thomas Tallis*, *High Fidelity* 9B (August 1959): 60.

<sup>22</sup> Review of *Josquin des Prés*, *The New York Times*, 21 May 1961, x12.

<sup>23</sup> Review of *Heinrich Isaac*, *HiFi Stereo Review* (December 1961): 72. Also *New Records* 29 (October 1961): 12.

<sup>24</sup> Review of *Ludwig Senfl: Composer to the Court and Chapel of Emperor Maximilian I*, *American Record Guide* 30 (April 1964): 666.

impressed with the Pro Musica performances. The liveliness and enthusiasm typical of Greenberg's musical approach often came across as a positive quality. For example, a reviewer of *Thomas Morley* commented that the Pro Musica gave a performance that was more musical in concept and detail and more polished than any other performances he had heard.<sup>25</sup> One critic found some selections in the Monteverdi disc "unmatched by other rival takes";<sup>26</sup> another called it "among the finest singing of Monteverdi to be had on records," being "stylistically acute, passionate, [and] admirably full of affect."<sup>27</sup> Compared to other recordings of Elizabethan instrumental works, a reviewer noted that the Pro Musica had a "much more vivid and accurate sound-picture of the royal band and consort," and had "realize[d] the spectrum of sounds" extending beyond the usual Elizabethan consort of viols and madrigals.<sup>28</sup>

However, in some cases of comparison between the Pro Musica and other performers, individual critics had mixed opinions or several reviews of the same recording expressed opposing views. For example, a critic commented that the Pro Musica gave a more outgoing and spirited rendition of Monteverdi than Safford Cape or Nadia Boulanger, but he also thought that it lacked a sense of quiet and deep expression like that of Hindemith's collegium musicum group.<sup>29</sup> Several reviewers compared the Pro Musica's renditions of English works to those of the Deller Consort. In one view, a Pro Musica recording of Thomas Tallis selections was said to be "skillful and eloquent enough to range it alongside the excellent one by the Deller Consort."<sup>30</sup> However, another critic thought of it as "something of a comedown. . . disappointment. . . [and it doesn't]

---

<sup>25</sup> Review of *Thomas Morley*, *The Musical Quarterly* 40 (September 1954): 634-35.

<sup>26</sup> Review of *Vocal Music of Claudio Monteverdi*, *American Record Guide* 34 (October 1967): 136.

<sup>27</sup> Review of *Vocal Music of Claudio Monteverdi*, *HiFi Stereo Review* 19 (December 1967): 106.

<sup>28</sup> Review of *Instrumental Music from the Courts of Queen Elizabeth and King James*, *Gramophone* 40 (June 1962): 11.

<sup>29</sup> Review of *Vocal Music of Claudio Monteverdi*, *Library Journal* 82I (15 June 1957): 1663.

<sup>30</sup> Review of *Sacred Music of Thomas Tallis*, *High Fidelity* 9B (August 1959): 60.

measure up to Deller.”<sup>31</sup> In contrast, in the *Elizabethan and Jacobean Ayres, Madrigals and Dances*, the Pro Musica was said to “enter into the fun with verve and gusto,” which is a “far better advantage” for certain pieces, than the “trifle more restrained” style of Deller.<sup>32</sup> Some comparisons were also made to the Pro Musica Antiqua of Brussels. A critic commented that compared to Cape’s Pro Musica Antiqua, the New York Pro Musica was “more sensational” in style, but he found the Brussel group’s quiet style to be more “intimate, ingratiating and immensely musical.”<sup>33</sup>

The comparisons of the Pro Musica with other leading performers of the field reflect the respect and status the Pro Musica gained. The abundance of positive reviews is a good indication of the classical music circle’s acceptance and appreciation of the Pro Musica’s recordings. Even the criticisms and contrasting opinions can be taken as a healthy sign. Through its recordings, the Pro Musica created a lively forum of discussion. Furthermore, the increasing public recognition and improvements in the ensemble itself can also be seen in the comments made about the Pro Musica over the course of its career. These opinions could be interpreted as mirroring the continuous public interest in and support of the ensemble.

In the earliest reviews the New York Pro Musica was often confused with Cape’s Pro Musica Antiqua.<sup>34</sup> However, it did not take long for the Pro Musica to be recognized and remembered on its own merit. In a review of the Everest anthology, which consists of the Pro Musica’s first seven albums, the critic commented that “not only did the music prove as delightful as it was novel, but the performances had a vitality too often lacking in those days of

---

<sup>31</sup> Review of *Sacred Music of Thomas Tallis*, *American Record Guide* 25 (August 1959): 858.

<sup>32</sup> Review of *Elizabethan and Jacobean Ayres, Madrigals and Dances*, *American Record Guide* 26 (April 1960): 661-12.

<sup>33</sup> Review of *Medieval English Carols and Italian Dances*, *Audio* 47 (June 1963): 38-39.

<sup>34</sup> Review of *Festino*, *Nation* (13 June 1953): 511, and *New Records* (October 1953): 13.

wholesale recording.”<sup>35</sup> A reviewer in 1960 wrote how Renaissance music became an exciting and interesting part of music performance, thanks to the Pro Musica’s “vivid pleasure of. . . music making [with] youthful, lively, literate, infectious joy,” a “broad range of human sentiments,” and “virtually flawless singing.”<sup>36</sup> Already in the first years of its career, the Pro Musica, with its spirited performance style, was distinguished from other recording groups and recognized as bringing early music closer to the public.

From a slightly different perspective, one critic noted that such early music leaders as Cape and Deller did contribute much, but their efforts were generally isolated and the albums were considered too “expensive for something unfamiliar.”<sup>37</sup> However, by the mid-1960s, at the height of the Pro Musica’s career, LPs had become more affordable with more competition in the lower price range, which made it possible for the Pro Musica to be heard by a wider audience.<sup>38</sup>

Many comments were made on the improvement seen in the first decade of the Pro Musica’s existence both as a performance ensemble and as an early music organization. In the aforementioned review of the Everest anthology, the critic noticed a “steady rise toward perfection in performance”<sup>39</sup> in the seven Esoteric discs. In 1957 a critic commented that the “group works together better as time goes on.”<sup>40</sup> Another writer noted in 1961 that the Pro Musica had “developed into a remarkably efficient unit of production for the reconstruction of ‘old’ music” with “office, library, and instrument collection.”<sup>41</sup> In a review from the same year, the Pro Musica musicians were praised as having thoroughly mastered the old instruments by this

---

<sup>35</sup> Review of *Noah Greenberg Conducting the New York Pro Musica*, *Saturday Review* (25 June 1966): 48-49.

<sup>36</sup> Review of *Spanish Music of the Renaissance*, *The New York Times*, 14 August 1960, x14.

<sup>37</sup> Review of *Renaissance Bands*, *The New York Times*, 27 March 1966, 22x.

<sup>38</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>39</sup> Review of *Noah Greenberg Conducting the New York Pro Musica*, *Saturday Review* (25 June 1966): 48-49.

<sup>40</sup> Review of *Vocal Music of Claudio Monteverdi*, *Library Journal* 82, no.1 (15 June 1957): 1663.

<sup>41</sup> Review of *Spanish Music of the Renaissance*, *Audio* 45 (February 1961): 60.



time, and were capable of making them sound “charming to modern ears.”<sup>42</sup> Moreover, in a review of their next album, *Medieval English Carols and Italian Dances*, a critic recognized and explicitly commented on the group’s maturity of style.<sup>43</sup>

By the early 1960s Noah Greenberg was widely regarded as an important figure in early music performance and the revival of the early repertory. In 1963 a critic stated that “Mr. Greenberg’s ensemble has taken an important part in this country” for the revival of early instruments.<sup>44</sup> One writer even called out to “thank this group for an immensely healthy contribution to early music.”<sup>45</sup> In a review of *The Play of Herod* in 1964, a critic asked in amazement, “who would have thought a decade ago, that recordings of medieval liturgical drama could be an exciting commercial success, as he [Greenberg] has made them?”<sup>46</sup> In 1965 a reviewer noted that Greenberg was still a “pioneer and leader in the resurrection of old instruments,”<sup>47</sup> and a critic for *The New York Times* confirmed that a Renaissance trend was in the making, which he believed was sparked by Greenberg and the Pro Musica. He excitedly stated that the one important reason for this trend was the existence of Noah Greenberg, who “made previous dusty pieces glow with warmth, gaiety and passion [and] meaningful personal expression.”<sup>48</sup>

Reviews from the 1960s continued to reveal the growing musical maturity in the Pro Musica style. Regarding the *Renaissance Festival Music*, a critic wrote in 1963 that the instruments were “handled with greater skill than before,” and the ensemble had become “more

---

<sup>42</sup> Review of *Instrumental Music from the Courts of Queen Elizabeth and King James*, *High Fidelity* 12 (June 1962): 68.

<sup>43</sup> Review of *Medieval English Carols and Italian Dances*, *High Fidelity* 13 (January 1962): 81.

<sup>44</sup> Review of *Renaissance Festival Music*, *High Fidelity* 13 (April 1963): 93.

<sup>45</sup> Review of *Renaissance Festival Music*, *Audio* 47 (June 1963): 12.

<sup>46</sup> Review of *The Play of Herod*, *American Record Guide* 31 (September 1964): 18-19.

<sup>47</sup> Review of *Renaissance Bands*, *Audio* (December 1965): 114-15.

<sup>48</sup> Review of *Renaissance Bands*, *The New York Times*, 27 March 1966, 22x.

diversified.”<sup>49</sup> In the *Play of Herod* the “mastery of instrumental technique” was noticed and the musical style was said to have become “more solemn and quiet compared to *Daniel*,” with more assurance and musical values than six years before.<sup>50</sup> In 1966 a critic reflected back on the development and improvement of the Pro Musica. He commented that “like many an American industrial product, the Pro Musica’s semi-mass produced old music has steadily improved in quality from a very bug-ridden and unmusical early output,”<sup>51</sup> to the last two albums before Greenberg’s death, which he considered the finest of Pro Musica recordings. He continued, “Noah Greenberg, a steely powerhouse sort of director, was beginning to glow with something more than a briskly mechanical energy. He was becoming a trace poetic or performed better.” Furthermore, the new personnel improved the performance quality and the Pro Musica records were now “well worth first line price.”<sup>52</sup> Whether this particular comment was occasioned by Greenberg’s death or not, the critics generally seemed to agree that the New York Pro Musica under the direction of Noah Greenberg did improve its quality and musicality over the years.

Noah Greenberg and the New York Pro Musica left an important mark on the revival of early music. The Pro Musica was recognized as one of the most significant early music ensembles of its time along with other leading performers and ensembles. Each of the leaders of early music ensembles offered his unique approach and interpretation of the repertory, thus enriching the broader field of the early music revival. The existence of numerous groups with varied emphasis and strength provided diverse perspectives and interpretive possibilities. The fact that the Pro Musica was considered as one such leader indicates the group’s influential status in the field. Furthermore, its improvement in performance quality proved to be beneficial not only

---

<sup>49</sup> Review of *Renaissance Festival Music*, *Gramophone* 41 (June 1963): 12.

<sup>50</sup> Review of *The Play of Herod*, *High Fidelity* 14 (September 1964): 66.

<sup>51</sup> Review of *Early Baroque Music of Italy*, *Audio* 50 (May 1966): 43.

<sup>52</sup> *Ibid.*

for the Pro Musica itself, but also for the general area of the early music movement. The expanded repertory and more attractive and musically sophisticated recordings were no doubt welcomed by both the interested public and scholars alike, and helped awaken awareness in many of those not familiar with early music.

To conclude, the pioneering effort of the New York Pro Musica contributed many historically important achievements to the early music revival, especially in the United States. Along with other leaders of its time, the Pro Musica's contributions helped enliven the area of early music performance and provided more possibilities for all concerned to learn and grow musically.

Indeed, the flourishing of the early music performance in the United States owes much to the work of Noah Greenberg and the New York Pro Musica. By performing the works of early music in an interesting and stylish manner that could be enjoyed by a wide range of listeners, Greenberg made early music a recognized genre of classical music. The increase in public awareness and interest in early music opened new possibilities for other musicians and those who followed the Pro Musica. In addition, the educational programs and seminars served to recruit and train young musicians who further carried on the tradition and enlivened the field of early music performance.

As Mark Davenport states, "New York Pro Musica made dozens of ground-breaking recordings that helped early music take a firm foothold in the U.S. and launched the careers of many early music performers and scholars."<sup>53</sup> The Pro Musica members who continued their careers in early music include Russell Oberlin, as a countertenor soloist; Paul Maynard, as a professor at Queens College; Bernard Krainis, as a recorder soloist and teacher; LaNoue

---

<sup>53</sup> Mark Davenport, "Noah Greenberg: The Man Behind the Music," *Early Music America* 3 (Fall 1997): 47.

Davenport, as a member of Music for Awhile; and Jan de Gaetani, as a champion of contemporary vocal music. Some early music ensembles that were directly influenced by the teachings of Greenberg and the Pro Musica, or those with former members of the Pro Musica, include the Waverly Consort, the Boston Camerata, the London Early Music Group, the Ensemble for Early Music, Music for Awhile, the New York Consort of Viols, the New York Renaissance Band, the New World Consort, Pomerium Musices, the Philidor Trio, Calliope: A Renaissance Band, Cappelle Nova, Concert Royal, the Elizabethan Enterprise, Schola Antiqua, the Tudor Consort, the New York Cornett and Sacbutt Ensemble, and Western Wind.<sup>54</sup>

Influence, however, does not mean that these individuals and groups merely copied or carried on the Greenberg style and tradition. With new findings in research and the changes in musical taste and expectations of the public, it was inevitable that musical style, approach, and interpretation would change in later generations. However, the groundwork that Greenberg laid provided a starting point to work from and a firm point of reference for those that followed. Cohen expanded on this idea, writing in 1985 that “ironically, our progression in taste has come about in part because of the Pro Musica’s early efforts, and not just in spite of them.”<sup>55</sup> He continued: “Their *Play of Daniel*, which catapulted the ensemble into international fame, now seems impossibly un-Medieval as we rehear the record and look at the old production photos,” but the important point was that “those efforts of a generation ago opened doors, whetted appetites, and gave many of us the urge to learn, to explore, and to achieve something in our own right.”<sup>56</sup>

---

<sup>54</sup> Elaine Brody, “The Performance of Early Music in the United States Today,” in *Musica Antiqua*, 5, ed. Anna Czekanowska (Bydgoszcz, Poland: 1978), 461. Joel Cohen and Herb Snitzer, *Reprise: The Extraordinary Revival of Early Music* (Boston: Little, Brown & Co., 1985), 35.

<sup>55</sup> Cohen, 31.

<sup>56</sup> *Ibid.*

In the field of early music performance in general, the contributions of Greenberg and the New York Pro Musica are significant, to say the least. A writer for the *New Yorker* magazine noted in 1974 that “musical institutions, like musicians, have finite lives, but they also may have progeny, as has Pro Musica, to incalculable effect.” He concluded that “hardly a single similar organization now active in presenting early music has not been in some way inspired by Pro Musica’s example and philosophy, or benefited from the audience that it brought into existence.”<sup>57</sup> James Gollin wrote that by the 1960s early music groups were common in the United States and especially in New York, but it must be remembered that the New York Pro Musica was the first to introduce the timbres of some early instruments such as krummhorns, shawms, regals, and bell carillons, and that Russell Oberlin with the Pro Musica initiated the American countertenor tradition.<sup>58</sup> The legacy of Greenberg and the Pro Musica’s work is still evident in the choice of repertory that is studied and listened to in music history courses and in the use of Greenberg’s performance editions. For example, Cohen wrote that “college choruses still perform “Riu riu chiu” (a Spanish Renaissance carol) at Christmastime, complete with the tambourine parts that Noah wrote in for people who didn’t know how to improvise.”<sup>59</sup>

More specifically, Cohen noted that following Greenberg’s death, the “American music business co-opted and recycled Pro Musica’s formulas for success” and “the old ways of doing things held on, not only within that ensemble, but also in the American performance world outside.”<sup>60</sup> For example, according to Cohen, in a good early music performance, “there had to be six singers, there had to be four instruments, there had to be an ornamented recorder piece, there had to be one solo for each singer in the second half, there had to be brilliant orchestration with

---

<sup>57</sup> David Hamilton, “Musical Events: *Ave Atque Vale*,” *New Yorker* (25 March 1974): 117.

<sup>58</sup> James Gollin, *Pied Piper: The Many Lives of Noah Greenberg*, Lives in Music Series, no. 4 (Hillsdale, New York: Pendragon, 2001), 391.

<sup>59</sup> Cohen, 35.

<sup>60</sup> Cohen, 34.

frequent shifts of instrumental color.”<sup>61</sup> Even in the mid-1980s, Cohen reported, an American ensemble that planned to produce *The Play of Daniel* lost its bookings because “the group insisted on designing new costumes and sets, while many sponsors demanded that the ‘original’ Pro Musica costumes, still preserved in mothballs by a special foundation set up for the purpose, be reutilized.”<sup>62</sup> This was an extreme case of the Pro Musica’s influence, but it demonstrates how sometimes it is also difficult to replace an old, successful tradition. Indeed, Christopher Page’s description of the work of the early music pioneers such as Greenberg and David Munrow a “miracle” that creates “faith in performance practice”<sup>63</sup> is appropriate here. The individual styles and musical interpretations of these leaders gave such strong impressions that the public really learned to believe in their styles as the best or only possible way to perform early music.

To conclude, without Greenberg and his vision, the New York Pro Musica as we know it would not have existed. What Greenberg left was not only a new repertory and a performance tradition of early music, but also an encouraging role model for the younger generation of musicians and scholars. Greenberg seems to have taken great interest and invested much time in helping and encouraging young musicians and those who were interested in early music. In a letter he wrote to a high school student in 1964 Greenberg stated:

I do not know whether you are preparing yourself for a musical career, but if you are, I urge you to study the great works of the medieval and Renaissance times. I assure you that my explorations are only a beginning in a much unexplored field.<sup>64</sup>

When he was a beginning lutenist, Joel Cohen had an opportunity to meet Greenberg. Cohen recalled that he was impressed and touched by how freely Greenberg shared his ideas “on music,

---

<sup>61</sup> Ibid.

<sup>62</sup> Ibid., 34-35.

<sup>63</sup> Christopher Page, “The English A Cappella Heresy,” in *Companion to Medieval and Renaissance Music*, ed. Tess Knighton and David Fallows (London: J. M. Dent & Sons, 1992), 23.

<sup>64</sup> Noah Greenberg to Michael Zimmerman, 21 July 1964, quoted in Gollin, 390.

career, and meaning of life” with someone he barely knew.<sup>65</sup> For Cohen, “the exhilaration, the joyous gratitude felt by young musicians of [his] generation” for Greenberg was enormous, because the concerts and the recordings of the Pro Musica led them “to discover new and infinitely promising musical horizons.”<sup>66</sup>

Cohen summarized what he considers as the most valuable gift that Noah Greenberg left behind. He wrote:

What is precious about the Greenberg heritage is not the specific decisions he made about this or that piece, not the tinsel costumes for this or that production, not the style options reflecting a specifically American time and place. What we need to remember is Noah’s open, generous, innovative spirit and his unflagging commitment to making early music enjoyable and accessible.<sup>67</sup>

Greenberg’s achievements in the research and performance of early music were indeed important and valuable, but perhaps as Cohen stated, what will always remain is the memory of Greenberg’s spirit and enthusiasm that made his dreams come true.

---

<sup>65</sup> Cohen, 36.

<sup>66</sup> *Ibid.*, 30.

<sup>67</sup> *Ibid.*, 35.

## CONCLUSION

The New York Pro Musica, created out of Greenberg's dream and initiative in 1953, grew rapidly and swept over the field of early music in the United States. Assisted by the production and distribution of long-playing records and the extended concert tours, the Pro Musica's fame and its music reached far beyond New York by the end of the 1950s. Its performances appealed not only to those interested in early music, but also to a wider public. The "new" sound of "old" music attracted many listeners, to a point where it was recognized that a popular trend in early music performance was being established.<sup>1</sup>

The Pro Musica did become famous in the twenty-one years of its existence. By 1973, the last year of its activity, the Pro Musica had become one of the main topics of cultural gossip. For example, the *New Yorker* magazine printed an article about the group along with articles on the Metropolitan Opera, George Balanchine, and the New York City Ballet in the same section. According to a *Billboard* report in 1966, Pro Musica was among the top sellers of Decca's classical line. The writer of this article credited Greenberg and the Pro Musica with being the leading force in early music performance in New York and nationwide: "The YMHA concerts established the Pro Musica as a significant factor in the city's musical life and contributed to the growing popularity of early music in the U. S. during the 1950s."<sup>2</sup> In 1974 the *New Yorker* magazine lamented the disbanding of Pro Musica as a "sad thought to those who remember the

---

<sup>1</sup> Allen Hughes, "A Trend In the Making?" *The New York Times*, 27 March 1966, 22x.

<sup>2</sup> "Noah Greenberg Dies, 46," *Billboard* 78 (22 January 1966): 38.



bracing vitality with which its early concerts swept away the cobwebs encrusting the performance of ‘old music.’”<sup>3</sup>

Overall, the style and standard of the New York Pro Musica and the music it brought forth impressed and attracted the public and added the term “early music” to concert goers’ vocabulary. A combination of many factors distinguished the Pro Musica as a leading early music ensemble: the high standard of professionalism; the fortification of its performance projects with research and education projects, which included the development of a research library and an extended instrument collection, and publishing of performance editions; the securing and building of audiences through various media and programs; and Greenberg’s boundless and fearless energy. David Hamilton credited Greenberg for overcoming “scholarly probity” and standing for “virtuosity, musicianship, and style in the degree we took for granted in the so-called ‘standard repertory.’”<sup>4</sup> In addition, Hamilton noted that the two singers in a recent all-Webern concert at Carnegie Hall were Pro Musica performers, which was “a timely reminder that the qualifications Greenberg demanded of his musicians were universally applicable.”<sup>5</sup> In short, the Pro Musica became a vital part of the classical music scene and could stand shoulder to shoulder with other classical ensembles and performers on the basis of the level of performance quality and popularity.

Indeed, examining the activities of Noah Greenberg and the New York Pro Musica within the larger picture of the early music activities in the United States from before 1950 and within the cultural milieu of the time, their achievements stand out as truly exceptional. However, they could not have accomplished this feat alone. Many elements, such as opportunities, personalities, and technological development, assisted in bringing success to their effort. In a sense, Greenberg

---

<sup>3</sup> David Hamilton, “Musical Events: *Ave Atque Vale*,” *New Yorker* (25 March 1974), 116.

<sup>4</sup> *Ibid.*, 114.

<sup>5</sup> *Ibid.*

was extremely fortunate to have lived in a time when the new technology of the long-playing record had just developed and began to offer many new possibilities for musicians of almost any background. In addition, this was also a time when the repertory of early music was not yet fully explored, and Greenberg was able to take on a role of a pioneer and exercise greater freedom in the choice of repertory and interpretation. What Greenberg accomplished in the 1950s and '60s would not have been possible ten years earlier or later.

From a commercial point of view and considering the influence the Pro Musica brought forth in the field of early music performance, the ensemble's career was no doubt successful. Moreover, the group was also able to achieve its other goal: to communicate to its audience that early music is interesting, musical, and enjoyable, and that it is worth listening to. This study, in which the aims of Greenberg and the Pro Musica, the problems they faced, and the public reactions to their work as seen in record reviews are examined and compared, reveals that the Pro Musica effectively presented itself and early music as a living tradition, and further established the foundation from which the field of early music performance would grow.

## BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Anderson, Donna K. "John White: New Pro Musica Director." *American Choral Review* 9, no. 2 (1967): 25-7.
- Blachly, Alexander. "Report from New York: Early Music Concerts, 1969-1970." *Current Musicology* 12 (1971): 50-55.
- Brody, Elaine. "The Performance of Early Music in the United States Today." In *Musica Antiqua*, 5, ed. Anna Czekanowska, 458-66. Bydgoszcz, Poland: n.p., 1978.
- Brooks, Barry S. "Obituaries: Noah Greenberg." *Journal of the American Musicological Society* 20, no. 3 (Fall 1967): 511.
- Brown, Howard Mayer. "Pedantry or Liberation? A Sketch of the Historical Performance Movement." In *Authenticity and Early Music*, ed. Nicholas Kenyon, 27-56. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1988.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Performing Early Music on Record—2: Continental Sacred Music of the Sixteenth Century." *Early Music* 3 (1975): 373-77.
- Cohen, Joel, and Herb Snitzer. *Reprise: The Extraordinary Revival of Early Music*. Boston: Little, Brown & Co., 1985.
- Collins, Fletcher, Jr. "The Play of Daniel in Modern Performance." In *The Play of Daniel: Critical Essays*, ed. Dunbar H. Ogden, 63-75. Kalamazoo: Western Michigan University Medieval Institute, 1996.
- Coover, James, and Richard Colvig. *Medieval and Renaissance Music on Long-Playing Records*. Detroit Studies in Music Bibliography, no. 6. Detroit: Information Service, Inc., 1964.
- Croucher, Trevor. *Early Music Discography: From Plainsong to the Sons of Bach*. Vol. 1, *Record Index*. Phoenix, Ariz.: Oryx Press, 1981.
- \_\_\_\_\_. *Early Music Discography: From Plainsong to the Sons of Bach*. Vol. 2, *Composer, Plainsong, Anonymous Work, and Performer Indexes*. Phoenix, Ariz.: Oryx Press, 1981.
- Crutchfield, Will. "Fashion, Conviction, and Performance Style in an Age of Revivals." In *Authenticity and Early Music*, ed. Nicholas Kenyon, 27-56. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1988.

- Culbertson, D. C. "Men, Women, and Early Music Winds: The Recorders and Double Reeds of the New York Pro Musica." *American Recorder* 37 (November 1996): 7-9.
- Davenport, Mark. "American Recorder Pioneer LaNoue Davenport Dies at Age 77." *Recorder Magazine* (Summer 2000): 47-49.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "The New York Pro Musica's Play of Herod: Research Issues Then and Now." *Early Music America* 1, no. 2 (Winter 1995): 26-34.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Noah Greenberg: The Man Behind the Music." *Early Music America* 3, no. 3 (Fall 1997): 39-44, 47.
- Dulak, Michelle. "The Quiet Metamorphosis of 'Early Music.'" *Repercussions* 2 (Fall 1993): 31-61.
- Elliott, George. "The Achievement of Noah Greenberg." *Commentary* (July 1966): 67-71.
- Gaskill, Sarah Jane. "The Artist as Manager: Noah Greenberg and the New York Pro Musica." M. A. thesis, The American University, 1984.
- Gollin, James. *Pied Piper: The Many Lives of Noah Greenberg*. Lives in Music Series, no. 4. Hillsdale, New York: Pendragon, 2001.
- Greenberg, Noah. "Early Music Performance Today." In *Aspects of Medieval and Renaissance Music: A Birthday Offering to Gustave Reese*, ed. Jan LaRue, 314-18. New York: W. W. Norton, 1966. Reprint, New York: Pendragon Press, 1978.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Introduction to the Performing Edition." In *The Play of Herod: A Twelfth-Century Musical Drama*, eds. Noah Greenberg and William L. Smoldon, vii-xi. New York: Oxford University Press, 1965.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "The Performance of Festive Renaissance Music." *American Music Teacher* 12, no. 4 (March-April 1963): 19.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "A Soft Sound in the U.S.S.R." *High Fidelity* 15 (May 1965): 41-43.
- Gruskin, Shelley. "I Feel Like a Millionaire!" Interview by Tina Chancey. *Early Music America* 9, no. 2 (summer 2003): 33-35, 48.
- Hamilton, David. "Musical Events: *Ave Atque Vale*." *New Yorker* (25 March 1974): 112-17.
- Harris, Dale. "Pro Musica Antiqua." *Opera Canada* 15, no. 3 (fall 1974): 33.
- Haskell, Harry. *The Early Music Revival: A History*. London: Thames & Hudson, 1988.

- Henry, Derrick. *The Listener's Guide to Medieval and Renaissance Music*. New York: Facts on File, Inc., 1983.
- Hess, John L. "Olde Time Musicke." *The New York Times*. 12 May 1957, VI 71:2.
- "High C." *New Yorker* (3 December 1973): 43-44.
- Hirsch, E. D. Jr., Joseph F. Kett, and James Trefil. *The Dictionary of Cultural Literacy*. 2<sup>nd</sup> ed. Boston: Houghton Mifflin Company, 1993.
- Hughes, Allen "Pro Musica Will Disband After 20 Melodious Years." *The New York Times*. 10 January 1974, 45:1.
- Jacobs, Hayes B. "The Zinkist and the Shawmist." *New Yorker* 36 (7 May 1960): 38-39.
- Kenyon, Nicholas, ed. *Authenticity and Early Music*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1988.
- Knighton, Tess. "Going Down on Record." In *Companion to Medieval and Renaissance Music*, ed. Tess Knighton and David Fallows, 30-36. London: J. M. Dent & Sons, 1992.
- Krainis, Bernard. "Gone but Not Forgotten." *American Recorder* 38, no. 1 (1997): 21.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "An Interview with Bernard Krainis." Interview by Sigrid Nagle and Marcia Blue. *American Recorder* 30, no. 3 (August 1989): 97-101.
- "LaNoue Davenport: A Son's Recollections... and Those of Others." *American Recorder* (January 2000): 12-15, 32.
- Mayer, Martin. "Musical Echoes of the Renaissance." *Reporter* 17 (5 September 1957): 38-40.
- Miller, Carl S. "Dialogue: Letter to the Editor and Response." *College Music Symposium* 37 (1997): 129-32.
- "New York Pro Musica Antiqua." *Central Opera Service Bulletin* 16 (Spring 1974): 90.
- Newlin, Dika. "In Memoriam Noah Greenberg." *Pan Pipes of Sigma Alpha Iota* 59 (November 1966): 30, 32.
- Newman, Joel. "In Remembrance, Noah Greenberg, 1919-1966." *American Recorder* 7 no. 3 (Summer 1966): 3.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Noah Greenberg, April 9, 1919 - January 9, 1966." *Current Musicology* (Spring 1966): 35-36.
- "Noah Greenberg." *Choral Journal* 6, no. 4 (March-April 1966): 7.

- “Noah Greenberg.” *High Fidelity* 16 (April 1966): 136, 164.
- “Noah Greenberg.” *International Musician* 64 (April 1966): 21.
- “Noah Greenberg: 1919-1966.” *Music Educators Journal* 52 (April-May 1966): 26.
- “Noah Greenberg Dies, 46.” *Billboard* 78 (22 January 1966): 38.
- “Noah Greenberg Is Dead at 46; Founded New York Pro Musica.” *New York Times*. 10 January 1966, 25:2.
- Noble, Jeremy. “Obituary: Noah Greenberg.” *Musical Times* 107 (March 1966): 241.
- “Notes for Notes.” *Notes: The Journal of the Music Library Association of America* 23 (1966): 34-35.
- “Notes for Notes.” *Notes: The Journal of the Music Library Association of America* 39 no. 4 (1983): 838.
- “Obituaries: Noah Greenberg.” *Opera News* 30 (19 February 1966): 32.
- “Obituaries: LaNoue Davenport.” *American Record Guide* 63, no. 1 (January-February 2000): 25.
- Page, Christopher. “The English *A Cappella* Heresy.” In *Companion to Medieval and Renaissance Music*, ed. Tess Knighton and David Fallows, 23-29. London: J. M. Dent & Sons, 1992.
- Palisca, Claude V. “Report in the Musicological Year 1974 in the United States.” *Acta Musicologica* 47, no. 2 (1975): 283-89.
- Philip, Robert. *Early Recording and Musical Style: Changing Tastes in Instrumental Performance, 1900-1950*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1992.
- Picker, Martin. Review of *New York Pro Musica Series*. *American Choral Review* 7, no. 3 (March 1965): 13-14.
- Pickett, Philip. “Hard-Sell, Scholarship and Silly Titles.” In *Companion to Medieval and Renaissance Music*, ed. Tess Knighton and David Fallows, 48-54. London: J. M. Dent & Sons, 1992.
- “Pro Musica Antiqua Presents English and Italian Works.” Review of live performance. *The New York Times*. 27 April 1953, 19 no. 3.
- “Pro Musica Appoints New Music Director.” *Diapason* 63 (June 1972): 1.
- “Pro Musica Receives Grant.” *Instrumentalist* 17 (June 1963): 15.

- Roche, Elizabeth. "Early Music on Records in the Last 25 Years-1." *Musical Times* 120 (1979): 34-36.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Early Music on Records in the Last 25 Years-2." *Musical Times* 120 (1979): 215-17.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Early Music and the BBC: 1: World War II to 1957." *Musical Times* 120 (1979): 821-32.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Early Music and the BBC: 2: 1957 to Date." *Musical Times* 120 (1979): 912-14.
- Rooney, Dennis D. "How the LP Was Born." *International Classical Record Collector* 14 (autumn 1998): 30-38.
- Sabin, Robert. "New York Pro Musica Expands With Grant." *Musical America* 78 (July 1958): 28-29.
- Sears, Lawrence. "Noah Greenberg, 1919-1966: His Legacy." *Musart* 18, no. 4 (1966): 10-11, 66-67.
- Sherman, Bernard D. *Inside Early Music: Conversations With Performers*. New York: Oxford University Press, 1997.
- Smoldon, William L. "The Play of Herod." Liner notes for *The Play of Herod*. Decca DXSA 7 187, 1964.
- Sommer, Susan T. "Vale Atque Ave: The Late Pro Musica and the State of Early Music in America Today." *Musical Newsletter* 5, no. 3 (summer 1975): 15-17.
- Stevens, Denis. *Early Music*. Yehudi Menuhin Music Guides. London: Kahn & Averill, 1980.
- Thomson, John Mansfield. *Recorder Profiles*. London: Schott, 1972.
- Wollitz, Ken and Marcia Blue. "An Interview with LaNoue Davenport." *American Recorder* 30, no. 1 (February 1989): 4-7.

## Appendix I: Discography and Record Reviews

This discography of the New York Pro Musica is compiled from two sources: James Gollin's discography in *Pied Piper*; and Pierre F. Roberge's discography on the Internet page <http://www.medieval.org/emfaq/performers/nypm.html>. The exact recording and release dates for some of the albums could not be determined.

The New York Pro Musica released thirty-five original recordings, two recordings with both new and re-released works, and eight recordings of all re-released material, including one seven-disc anthology and three in compact disc format. A total of twenty-eight recordings were directed by Noah Greenberg. The recordings are listed below in chronological order.

**Reviews for each recording are listed under each recording title and arranged chronologically according to the date of publication. A total of 190 published reviews for thirty-eight of the New York Pro Musica recordings were collected.**

### Albums Recorded and Released Under the Direction of Noah Greenberg

1. ***George Frederick Handel: Music for Ancient Instruments and Soprano Voice***  
Esoteric ES 515 [LP, mono]  
Recorded & released 1953  
**Review:**  
*New Records* (October 1953): 13.
2. ***Adriano Banchieri: Festino: A Renaissance Madrigal Entertainment to be Sung on the Evening of Fat Thursday Before Supper***  
Esoteric ES 516 [LP, mono]  
Released May 1953  
**Reviews:**  
*Nation* (13 June 1953): 511.  
*American Record Guide* 19 (June 1953): 234.  
*The New York Times*, 12 July 1953, x6.  
*High Fidelity* 3 (September and October 1953): 65.  
*Library Journal* 78 II (1 October 53): 1675.  
*New Records* (October 1953): 13.  
*Saturday Review* (28 November 1953): 66.  
*The Musical Quarterly* (April 1954): 275-6.  
*Guide to Long-Playing Records* (1955) 28.
3. ***John Blow: Ode on the Death of Mr. Henry Purcell / Henry Purcell: Instrumental & Vocal Selections***  
Esoteric ES 519 [LP, mono]  
Released May 1953  
**Reviews:**  
*Saturday Review* (26 December 1953): 61.



*The New York Times* 3 January 1954, x9  
*High Fidelity* 3 (January and February 1954): 53.  
*New Records* (February 1954): 11.  
*The Musical Quarterly* 40 (April 1954): 279-80.  
*Library Journal* 80 (15 January 1955): 147.  
*Guide to Long-Playing Records* (1955): 46.

4. ***Thomas Morley: Elizabethan Madrigal, Canzonets and Ballets***

Esoteric ES 520 [LP, mono]

Released September 1953

**Reviews:**

*New Records* (December 1953): 8.  
*The New York Times*, 3 January 1954, x9.  
*High Fidelity* 4A (June 1954): 46-47.  
*The Musical Quarterly* 40 (September 1954): 634-35.  
*Nation* (12 March 1955): 228.  
*Guide to Long-Playing Records* (1955): 157.

5. ***English Medieval Christmas Carols***

Esoteric ES 521 [LP, mono]

Released October 1953

**Reviews:**

*New Records* (December 1953): 8.  
*Guide to Long-Playing Records* (1955): 346-47.  
*New Records* (April 1979): 10.

6. ***An Elizabethan Songbag for Young People***

Esoteric ESJ-6 [LP, mono, 25cm]

Released 1953

**Reviews:**

*New Records* (December 1953): 16.  
*High Fidelity* 4A (March 1954): 71.  
*Guide to Long-Playing Records* (1955): 346-47.

7. ***Henry Purcell: Songs***

Esoteric ES 535 [LP, mono]

Recorded 1954; Released January 1955

**Reviews:**

*The New York Times*, 13 February 1955, x9.  
*Nation* (12 March 1955): 228.  
*Library Journal* 80 II (15 June 1955): 1484.  
*Guide to Long-Playing Records* (1955): 195.  
*Gramophone* 38 (June 1960): 39. Release in the Great Britain

8. ***Anthology of Renaissance Music***  
 Period PL 597 [LP, mono]  
 Recorded November 1953; Released 1954  
**Review:**  
*Guide to Long-Playing Records* (1955): 346-47.
9. ***An Evening of Elizabethan Verses and Its Music***  
 Columbia ML 5051 [LP, mono]  
 Recorded 1954; Released 1955  
**Reviews:**  
*New Records* 23 (Dec 1955): 16.  
*Audio* 40 (January 1956): 42.  
*Nation* (14 January 1956): 40-41.  
*The New York Times*, 11 March 1956, x8.  
*American Record Guide* 22 (March 1956): 104-5.  
*Harper's Magazine* 212 (April 1956): 104.  
*Library Journal* 81 (1 May 1956): 1145.  
*New Listener's Companion and Record Guide* (1956): 342-43.
10. ***Vocal Music of Claudio Monteverdi***  
 Columbia ML 5159 [LP, mono]  
 Recorded 1954  
**Reviews:**  
*American Record Guide* 23 (March 1957): 95.  
*High Fidelity* 7A (April 1957): 68.  
*New Records* 25 (April 1957): 13.  
*Library Journal* 82 I (15 June 1957): 1663.  
*New Republic* (23 December 1957): 22.
11. ***The Music of Salamone Rossi, Hebreo of Mantua***  
 Columbia ML 5204 [LP, mono]  
 Recorded 1954; Released 1957  
**Reviews:**  
*High Fidelity* 7B (November 1957): 74.  
*American Record Guide* 24 (November 1957): 83.  
*HiFi Music at Home* (January and February 1958): 47.  
*New Records* 25 (December 1957): 13.  
*Consumer Bulletin* (February 1958): 37.  
*Library Journal* 83 I (1 March 1958): 746.
12. ***Music of the Medieval Court and Countryside***  
 Decca "Gold Label" DL 9400 [LP, mono]  
 Recorded August 1957; Released October 1957  
**Review:**  
*American Record Guide* (December 1957).

**13. *The Play of Daniel***

Decca "Gold Label" DL 9402 / DL 7 9402 [LP, mono/stereo]

Recorded January, February 1958; Released August 1958

**Reviews:**

*The New York Times* 24 August 1958, x10.

*High Fidelity* 8B (October 1958): 66.

*New Records* 26 (October 1958): 11-12.

*AGO Quarterly* (October 1958): 154.

*Consumer Bulletin* (November 1958): 39.

*HiFi & Music Review* 1 (November 1958): 63.

*Saturday Review* (29 November 1958): 72.

*Harper's Magazine* (December 1958): 106.

*American Record Guide* 25 (December 1958): 264-65.

*Library Journal* 84 I (1 January 1959): 67.

*Hi-fi Music at Home* (January 1959): 34.

*Consumer Reports* 24 (March 1959): 146.

*Pan Pipes of Sigma Alpha Iota* 51 (March 1959): 24.

*The Musical Quarterly* 45 (April 1959): 269-72.

*Gramophone* 37 (October 1959): 186-87.

*Gramophone* 38 (September 1960): 188.

*American Recorder* 10 (Spring 1969): 52. The author has written a review of the performance edition of the play in 1960, but realized that he has not written a review of the recording for this journal.

**14. *Sacred Music of Thomas Tallis***

Decca "Gold Label" DL 9404 / DL 7 9404 [LP, mono/stereo]

Recorded 1958; Released February 1959

**Reviews:**

*New Records* 27 (July 1959): 13.

*Consumer Bulletin* (August 1959): 34.

*Saturday Review* (29 August 1959): 41.

*High Fidelity* 9B (August 1959): 60.

*American Record Guide* 25 (August 1959): 858.

*HiFi Review* 3 (August 1959): 52.

**15. *Elizabethan and Jacobean Ayres, Madrigals and Dances***

Decca "Gold Label" DL 9406 / DL 7 9406 [LP, mono/stereo]

Recorded 1959; Released August 1959

**Reviews:**

*American Record Guide* 26 (April 1960): 661-62.

*The New York Times*, 13 September 1959, x22.

*High Fidelity* 9B (November 1959): 100.

*Consumer Bulletin* (December 1959): 32.

*HiFi Review* (December 1959): 108.

*New Records* 27 (December 1959): 13.

*HiFi Stereo Review* (November 1960): 90.

- 16. *Spanish Music of the Renaissance***  
 Decca "Gold Label" DL 9409 / DL 7 9409 [LP, mono/stereo]  
 Recorded 1960; Released April 1960  
**Reviews:**  
*The New York Times*, 14 August 1960, x14  
*High Fidelity* 10B (October 1960): 98.  
*HiFi Stereo Review* (November 1960): 90.  
*New Records* 28 (February 1961): 13-14.  
*Audio* 45 (February 1961): 60.  
*Pan Pipes of Sigma Alpha Iota* 53 (March 1961): 22.  
*Library Journal* 86 II (15 April 1961): 1579.
- 17. *Josquin Des Prés: Missa Pange Lingua, Motets and Instrumental Pieces***  
 Decca "Gold Label" DL 9410 / DL 7 9410 [LP, mono/stereo]  
 Recorded January, February 1960; Released January 1961  
**Reviews:**  
*New Records* 29 (May 1961): 8.  
*The New York Times*, 21 May 1961, x12.  
*High Fidelity* 11A (June 1961): 52.  
*HiFi Stereo Review* (December 1961): 66-67.
- 18. *Music of the Early German Baroque: Heinrich Schütz & Melchior Franck***  
 Decca "Gold Label" DL 9412 / DL 7 9412 [LP, mono/stereo]  
 Recorded November 1960; Released May 1961  
**Review:**  
*The New York Times*, 21 May 1961, x12.
- 19. *Heinrich Isaac: Music for the Court of Lorenzo the Magnificent / Jacob Obrecht: Missa Fortuna Desperata***  
 Decca "Gold Label" DL 9413 / DL 7 9413 [LP, mono/stereo]  
 Recorded February 1961; Released August 1961  
**Reviews:**  
*New Records* 29 (October 1961): 12.  
*The New York Times*, 1 October 1961, x14.  
*High Fidelity* 11 (November 1961): 94.  
*HiFi Stereo Review* (December 1961): 72.
- 20. *Instrumental Music from the Courts of Queen Elizabeth and King James***  
 Decca "Gold Label" DL 9415 / DL 7 9415 [LP, mono/stereo]  
 Recorded March 1961; Released February 1962  
**Reviews:**  
*The New York Times*, 1 April 1962, x12.  
*Musical America* (April 1962): 36.  
*Gramophone* 40 (June 1962): 11.  
*High Fidelity* 12 (June 1962): 68.  
*HiFi Stereo Review* 8 (June 1962): 76.  
*The Musical Quarterly* 48 (1962): 546-48.

**21. William Byrd: Keyboard Music (Keyboard works performed by Paul Maynard)**

Decca "Gold Label" DL 10040 / DL 7 10040 [LP, mono / stereo]

Recorded 1961; Released November 1961

**Review:**

*The New York Times*, 19 May 1963, x15.

**22. Spanish Medieval Music**

Decca "Gold Label" DL 9416 / DL 7 9416 [LP, mono/stereo]

Recorded January 1962; Released August 1962

**Reviews:**

*High Fidelity* 12 (November 1962): 117.

*Consumer Bulletin* (December 1962): 36.

*HiFi Stereo Review* 9 (December 1962): 108-9.

*Gramophone* 40 (April 1963): 476-77.

*American Record Guide* 29 (June 1963): 776-78.

*The Musical Quarterly* 49 (1963): 259-63.

**23. Medieval English Carols and Italian Dances**

Decca "Gold Label" DL 9418 / DL 7 9418 [LP, mono/stereo]

Recorded April 1962; Released October 1962

**Reviews:**

*Musical America* 82 (December 1962): 55.

*New Records* 30 (December 1962): 2.

*High Fidelity* 13 (January 1963): 81-82.

*HiFi Stereo Review* (February 1963): 92.

*Audio* 47 (May 1963): 45.

*American Recorder* 10 (Spring 1969): 51-52.

**24. Renaissance Festival Music: Flemish Dances and Venetian Music**

Decca "Gold Label" DL 9419 / DL 7 9419 [LP, mono/stereo]

Recorded May 1962; Released January 1963

**Reviews:**

*New Records* 30 (February 1963): 6.

*High Fidelity* 13 (April 1963): 93.

*The New York Times*, 19 May 1963, x15.

*Audio* 47 (June 1963): 38-39.

*American Record Guide* 29 (June 1963): 777-78.

*Gramophone* 41 (June 1963): 12.

*HiFi Stereo Review* (May 1964): 72.

**25. Ludwig Senfl: Composer to the Court and Chapel of Emperor Maximilian I**

Decca "Gold Label" DL 9420 / DL 7 9420 [LP, mono/stereo]

Recorded May 1963; Released January 1964

**Reviews:**

*New Records* 32 (March 1964): 10.

*American Record Guide* 30 (April 1964): 666-67.

*Gramophone* 41 (May 1964): 513-14.  
*HiFi Stereo Review* (May 1964): 64.

- 26. *It Was a Lover and His Lass: Music of Shakespeare's Time***  
Decca "Gold Label" DL 9421 / DL 7 9421 [LP, mono/stereo]  
Recorded September 1963; Released April 1964

**Reviews:**

*American Record Guide* 30 (July 1964): 1026-27.  
*High Fidelity* 14 (July 1964): 72.  
*Saturday Review* 47 (25 July 1964): 43.  
*Gramophone* 42 (August 1964): 95.  
*Consumer Bulletin* (September 1964): 13.  
*Library Journal* 90 II (1 May 1965): 2122.

- 27. *The Play of Herod***

Decca DXA 187 / DXSA 7 187 [LP, mono/stereo]  
Recorded January 1964; Released September 1964

**Reviews:**

*The New York Times*, 9 August 1964, x12  
*High Fidelity* 14 (September 1964): 66.  
*American Record Guide* 31 (September 1964): 18-19, 58.  
*New Records* 32 (October 1964): 8.  
*Atlantic Monthly* 214 (December 1964): 142-43.

- 28. *Renaissance Bands***

Decca "Gold Label" DL 9424 / DL 7 9424 [LP, mono/stereo]  
Recorded April 1965; Released October 1965

**Reviews:**

*Audio* 49 (December 1965): 44.  
*High Fidelity* 15 (December 1965): 114-15.  
*HiFi Stereo Review* (January 1966): 89.  
*American Record Guide* 32 (January 1966): 421.  
*Consumer Bulletin* (February 1966): 28.  
*The New York Times*, 27 March 1966, 22x.  
*Gramophone* 43 (May 1966): 560-61.

- 29. *Early Baroque Music of Italy***

Decca "Gold Label" DL 9425 / DL 7 9425 [LP, mono / stereo]  
Recorded May 1965; Released January 1966

**Reviews:**

*The New York Times*, 27 March 1966, 22x.  
*Audio* 50 (May 1966): 43.  
*American Record Guide* 32 (May 1966): 795.  
*Consumer Bulletin* (June 1966): 15.  
*High Fidelity* 16 (June 1966): 92.  
*HiFi Stereo Review* (June 1966): 80.  
*Gramophone* 44 (August 1966): 122-23.

*New Records* 34 (Sept 1966): 11.  
*Pan Pipes of Sigma Alpha Iota* 59 (November 1966): 30, 32.  
*American Recorder* 10 (Winter 1969): 9.

### **Albums Recorded and Released After Noah Greenberg's Death**

#### **30. *Florentine Music***

Decca "Gold Label" DL 9428 / DL 7 9428 [LP, mono/stereo]  
Recorded before May 1967; Released before May 1967

##### **Reviews:**

*American Recorder* 8 (Spring 1967): 64.  
*Gramophone* 44 (May 1967): 597-98.  
*Pan Pipes of Sigma Alpha Iota* (May 1967): 30.

#### **31. *Ah Sweet Lady: The Romance of Medieval France***

Decca "Gold Label" DL 7 9431 [LP, stereo]  
Recorded March 1967; Released October 1967

##### **Reviews:**

*High Fidelity* 18 (January 1968): 92-93.  
*Pan Pipes of Sigma Alpha Iota* 60 (March 1968): 37.  
*American Record Guide* 34 (Apr 1968): 666-68.  
*The Thirteenth High Fidelity Annual Records in Review* (1969): 497-98.

#### **32. *The Kynges Musicke***

Decca "Gold Label" DL 7 9434 [LP, stereo]  
Recorded January, April, May 1968; Released September 1968

##### **Reviews:**

*New Records* 36 (February 1969): 5-6.  
*Stereo Review* 22 (February 1969): 114.  
*High Fidelity* 19 (March 1969): 110-11.  
*American Recorder* 10 (Winter 1969): 9, 27.

#### **33. *Petrucchi: First Printer of Music***

Decca "Gold Label" DL 7 9435 [LP, stereo]  
Recorded April, May 1968; Released February 1969

##### **Reviews:**

*American Recorder* 10 (Spring 1969): 51-52.  
*American Record Guide* 35 (May 1969): 756-58.  
*New Records* 37 (May 1969): 6.  
*High Fidelity* 19 (June 1969): 106.  
*Stereo Review* 23 (August 1969): 98.

#### **34. *Music of the Spanish Theater in the Golden Age***

Decca "Gold Label" DL 7 9436 [LP, stereo]  
Recorded January 1969; Released August 1969

##### **Reviews:**

*New Records* 37 (October 1969): 11-12.  
*High Fidelity* 19 (December 1969): 126-27.  
*Stereo Review* 23 (December 1969): 128.  
*Audio* 54 (April 1970): 65.

**35. *Marco da Gagliano: La Dafne***

Musical Heritage Society MHS 1953/4 [LP, mono / stereo]  
Recorded 1973; Released 1974[?]

**Review:**

*Stereo Review* 35 (July 1975): 96.

**Albums Containing Both Original and Re-released Material**

**36. *Music for a Medieval Day - Music of the Cloister, Cathedral, Court, Marketplace, and Countryside***

Horizon DL 34 541 [LP]

Recorded 1957-1968; Released June 1968

Some original recordings under John Reeves White and re-release of selections from *Music of the Medieval Court and Countryside* (No. 12); *The Play of Daniel* (No. 13); *Spanish Medieval Music* (No. 22); *Medieval English Carols and Italian Dances* (No. 23); *Ah Sweet Lady: The Romance of Medieval France* (No. 31).

**Reviews**

None found.

**37. *Anne of a Thousand Days and Music of the Tudor Court***

Decca DI7 9174 [LP, stereo]

Released March 1970

Side A: soundtrack from the film *Anne of a Thousand Days*; Side B: re-release of selections from *Instrumental Music from the Courts of Queen Elizabeth and King James* (No. 20); *The Kynge's Musicke* (No. 32).

**Reviews:**

None found.

**Re-releases**

**38. *Children's Songs of Shakespeare's Time***

Counterpoint / Esoteric CPT 540 [LP, mono]

Released 1957

Re-release of selections from *John Blow: Ode on the Death of Mr. Henry Purcell / Henry Purcell: Instrumental & Vocal Selections* (No. 3); *Thomas Morley: Elizabethan Madrigal, Canzonets and Ballets* (No. 4); *An Elizabethan Songbag for Young People* (No. 6).

**Review:**

*HiFi Music at Home* (January and February 1958).



- 39. *A Baroque Concert***  
 Counterpoint / Esoteric CPT 1502 [LP, mono]  
 Released ca. 1957  
 Various performers including the New York Pro Musica.  
 Re-release of selections from *George Frederick Handel: Music for Ancient Instruments and Soprano Voice* (No. 1); *John Blow: Ode on the Death of Mr. Henry Purcell / Henry Purcell: Instrumental & Vocal Selections* (No. 3).  
**Reviews:**  
 None found.
- 40. *Noah Greenberg Conducting the New York Pro Musica: An Anthology of Their Greatest Works***  
 Everest 6145 / SDBR 3145 [LPx7, mono / select. stereo]  
 Released after 1966  
 Re-release of Esoteric recordings from 1952 to 1954 (Nos. 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7)  
**Reviews:**  
*Saturday Review* (25 June 1966): 48-49.  
*Pan Pipes of Sigma Alpha Iota* 59 (November 1966): 30, 32.
- 41. *An Evening of Elizabethan Verses and Its Music***  
 Odyssey "Legendary Performances" 32 16 0171 [LP, mono]  
 Recorded 1954; Released 1968 or prior  
 Re-release of No. 9  
**Reviews:**  
*Atlantic Monthly* 221 (May 1968): 107.  
*American Record Guide* 34 (May 1968): 891.  
*High Fidelity* 18 (June 1968): 91.
- 42. *Vocal Music of Claudio Monteverdi***  
 Odyssey "Legendary Performances" 32 16 0087 [LP, mono]  
 Recorded 1954; Released 1967 or prior  
 Re-release of No. 10.  
**Reviews:**  
*Saturday Review* 50 (29 July 1967): 44.  
*American Record Guide* 34 (October 1967): 136.  
*HiFi Stereo Review* 19 (December 1967): 106.
- 43. *Medieval Roots***  
 Decca "Gold Label" DL 7 9438 [LP, stereo]  
 Released 1971 or prior  
 Re-release of selections from *Music of the Medieval Court and Countryside* (No. 12); *Heinrich Isaac: Music for the Court of Lorenzo the Magnificent / Jacob Obrecht: Missa Fortuna Desperata* (No. 19); *Spanish Medieval Music* (No. 22); *Medieval English Carols and Italian Dances* (No. 23); *Ah Sweet Lady: The Romance of Medieval France* (No. 31); *Petrucchi: First Printer of Music* (No. 33).  
**Reviews:**  
*New Records* 39 (October 1971): 12.

*Stereo Review* 26 (March 1972): 98.

**44. *English Medieval Christmas Carols***

Rykodisc TCD1056 [CD]

Re-release of No. 5

**Reviews:**

None found.

**45. *The Play of Daniel - The Play of Herod***

MCAD2 10102 [CDx2]

Re-release of No. 13 and No. 27

**Reviews:**

None found.

**46. *Praetorius - Susato: Renaissance Dances***

Millennium Classics UMD 80 565 [CD]

Released 1999

Re-release of selections from *Renaissance Festival Music: Flemish Dances and Venetian Music* (No. 24); *Renaissance Bands* (No. 28)

**Reviews:**

None found.

**Others**

**47. *The Renaissance Band***

National Educational Television WOM-21 [video]

Recorded 1965

**48. *Conversation between William Malloch and Noah Greenberg***

Audio tape: KPFK Studio [cassette]

Recorded ca. 1964

## Appendix II: Publications of New York Pro Musica

The list of publications is taken from library catalogues and Sarah Jane Gaskill's M.A. thesis, "The Artist as Manager: Noah Greenberg and the New York Pro Musica." She compiled the list in 1984 from the following sources:

Washington, D.C. Library of Congress. Copyright Office card catalogue.  
New York Public Library. Music Division. New York Pro Musica Archives.  
Promotional brochure, ca. 1973.

### I. New York Pro Musica Editions: Choral Series

- NYPM 1 Wilbye, John: "Weep, o mine eyes" (SST or TTB)  
edited by Noah Greenberg  
© 13 October 1955 by Associated Music Publishers
- NYPM 2 Wilbye, John: "Come shepherd swains" (SSA or TTB)  
edited by Noah Greenberg  
© 13 October 1955 by Associated Music Publishers
- NYPM 3 Lupo, Thomas: "O Lord give ear" (SATB)  
edited by Noah Greenberg  
© 13 October 1955 by Associated Music Publishers
- NYPM 4 Jones, Robert: "Lament my soul" (SSATB)  
edited by Noah Greenberg  
© 7 December 1956 by Associated Music Publishers
- NYPM 5 Byrd, William: "Lord in thy rage. Domine, ne in furore (Psalm 6)" (S/A TB)  
edited by Noah Greenberg  
© 17 December 1956 by Associated Music Publishers
- NYPM 6 Pilkington, Francis: "Hidden, O Lord" (SATB)  
edited by Noah Greenberg  
© 10 December 1956 by Associated Music Publishers
- NYPM 7 Byrd, William: "Ave verum corpus" (SATB) Latin / English  
edited by Noah Greenberg  
© 12 August 1958 by Associated Music Publishers
- NYPM 8, 9, 10 Three Spanish Christmas Carols of the Sixteenth Century

1. "E la don don, Verges Maria"
  2. "Dadme albricias, himos d'Eva"
  3. "Riu, riu, chiu"
- edited by Noah Greenberg  
 © 12 May 1959 by Associated Music Publishers
- NYPM 11 Weelkes, Thomas: "When David heard" (SSAATB)  
 edited by Walter Collins  
 © 18 January 1960 by Associated Music Publishers
- NYPM 12 Weelkes, Thomas: "O Jonathan" (SSAATB)  
 edited by Walter Collins  
 © 18 January 1960 by Associated Music Publishers
- NYPM 13 Tallis, Thomas: "Sermone blando angelus" (SAATB)  
 edited by Denis Stevens  
 © 7 September 1961 by Associated Music Publishers
- NYPM 14 Tallis, Thomas: "Salvator mundi Domine" (SATBarT)  
 edited by Denis Stevens  
 © 22 September 1961 by Associated Music Publishers
- NYPM 15 Tallis, Thomas: "Jam Christus astra ascenderat" (SATTB)  
 edited by Denis Stevens  
 © 22 September 1961 by Associated Music Publishers
- NYPM 16 Tallis, Thomas: "Quod chorus vatum" (SAATB)  
 edited by Denis Stevens  
 © 26 December 1961 by Associated Music Publishers
- NYPM 17 Tallis, Thomas: "Deus tuorum militum" (SAATB)  
 edited by Denis Stevens  
 © 26 December 1961 by Associated Music Publishers
- NYPM 18 Franck, Melchior: "Ich sucht des nachts" (SSATB)  
 edited by K. Stone  
 © 29 June 1962 by Associated Music Publishers
- NYPM 19 Franck, Melchior: "Meine Schwester, liebe Braut" (SSATTB)  
 edited by K. Stone  
 © 29 June 1962 by Associated Music Publishers
- NYPM 20 Franck, Melchior: "Ich sucht des Nachts" (SSATTB)  
 edited by K. Stone  
 © 29 June 1962 by Associated Music Publishers
- NYPM 21 Isaac, Heinrich: "Quis dabit capiti meo quam" (STBarB)

- edited by Noah Greenberg  
© 1963 by Associated Music Publishers
- NYPM 21a Isaac, Heinrich: “Quis dabit capiti meo aquam” (SATB)  
edited by Noah Greenberg  
© 1963 by Associated Music Publishers
- NYPM 22 Anon.: “Mass in honor of the Blessed Virgin” 13<sup>th</sup> Century (ATB / SSA)  
edited by Denis Stevens  
© 24 November 1964 by Associated Music Publishers
- NYPM 23 Nicolson, Richard: “O pray for the peace of Jerusalem” (SAATB)  
edited by Cyril F. Simkins  
© 24 November 1964 by Associated Music Publishers
- NYPM 24 Nicolson, Richard: “Cantate Domino canticum novum” (SSATB)  
edited by Cyril F. Simkins  
© 1965 by Associated Music Publishers
- NYPM 25 New York Pro Musica Choral Song Book: A Collection; 117 pages  
edited by Noah Greenberg and others  
© 1 August 1966 by Associated Music Publishers
- NYPM 26 Sheppard, John: “Te Deum Laudamus” (SATTBarB)  
edited by Bruno Turner  
© 1969 by Associated Music Publishers
- NYPM 27 Josquin: “Ave Maria” (SATB)  
edited by Noah Greenberg  
© 9 October 1969 by Associated Music Publishers
- NYPM 28 Josquin: “Ave Maria” another setting and text (SATB)  
edited by Noah Greenberg  
© 31 December 1969 by Associated Music Publishers
- NYPM 29 Senfl, Ludwig: “Ave Maria, gratia plena” (SSATBarB)  
edited by Noah Greenberg  
© 1969 by Associated Music Publishers
- NYPM 30 Tallis, Thomas: “Blessed be the Lord” (TTBB)  
edited by Walter Collins  
© 1969 by Associated Music Publishers
- NYPM 31 Willaert, Adrian: “Chanson on ‘Dessus le marché d’Arras’” (SATB)  
edited by James Erb  
© 1969 by Associated Music Publishers
- NYPM 32 Lasso, Orlando di: “Chanson on ‘Dessus le marché d’Arras’” (SSATTB)

edited by James Erb  
© 1969 by Associated Music Publishers

NYPM 33 Lasso, Orlando di: “Magnificat primi toni on ‘Dessus le marché’” (SSATTB)  
edited by James Erb  
© 1969 by Associated Music Publishers

NYPM 34 Ockeghem, Johannes: “Salve Regina” (SATB)  
© 1973 by Associated Music Publishers

NYPM (?) Josquin: “Ave maris stella” (SATB)  
edited by John R. White  
© unknown

## II. New York Pro Musica Editions: Instrumental Series

NYPM/IS 1 Dalla Casa, Girolamo: “Alix avoit,” diminutions for a solo instrument on a chanson by Thomas Crecquillon  
edited by Imogene Horsley and LaNoue Davenport  
© 1968 by Associated Music Publishers

NYPM/IS 2 Spadi, Giovanni Battista: “Anchor che col partire,” diminutions for a solo instrument on a madrigal by Cipriano de Rore  
edited by Imogene Horsley and LaNoue Davenport  
© 1970 by Associated Music Publishers

NYPM/IS 3 Galilei, Vincenzo: Two lute duets from *Fronimo Dialogo*  
edited by Joseph Iadone  
© 1967 by Associated Music Publishers

NYPM/IS 4 Praetorius, Michael: “Terpischore,” a suite of dances (à 4-6)  
edited by LaNoue Davenport  
© 1969 by Associated Music Publishers

NYPM/IS 6 Simpson, T.: Two Paired Dances (à 5)  
edited by William E. Hettrick  
© 1970 by Associated Music Publishers

NYPM/IS 7 Bach, Carl Philipp Emanuel: Sonata in C minor for alto recorder and harpsichord obbligato with cello continuo  
edited by Daniel Waitzman  
© 1974 by Associated Music Publishers

NYPM/IS (?) Marais, Marin: Suite no. 1 in D minor for viola da gamba and basso continuo  
edited by George Hunter  
© 1974 by Associated Music Publishers

The exact publishing information could not be found on the following editions:

15 monophonic dances of the fourteenth century

edited by J. E. Kreider

Ferrabosco, Alfonso II: Three Almans and Three Pavans

edited by J. E. Kreider

Instrumental Music of Codex Bamberg

edited by J. E. Kreider

### III. New York Pro Musica: Songs for Voice and Keyboard Accompaniment

Purcell, Henry: "Ah, how sweet it is to love"

"I love and I must"

"O how happy's he"

"Ye gentle spirits"

edited by Paul Maynard and Russel Oberlin

© 6 May 1958

### IV. Other Publications

1. *An Elizabethan Song Book*

text edited by W. H. Auden and Chester Kallman

music edited by Noah Greenberg

© W. H. Auden and Noah Greenberg 20 October 1955

published by Doubleday & Company, New York, 1955

© renewed by the estate of Wystan Auden 6 January 1983

published by W. W. Norton & Company in 1970 as

*An Anthology of Elizabethan Lute Songs, Madrigals and Rounds*

2. *The Play of Daniel: A Biblical Narrative with Music*

transcribed by Rembert Weakland

© New York Pro Musica Antiqua, Inc. 4 April 1958

3. *The Play of Daniel: A Thirteenth-Century Musical Drama*

transcribed by Rembert Weakland

music edited by Noah Greenberg

narration by W. H. Auden

© Oxford University Press, 12 November 1959

4. *An English Song Book*

edited by Noah Greenberg

© Noah Greenberg 3 November 1961

published by Doubleday & Company, 1961

published by W. W. Norton & Company in 1968 with an introduction by Joel Newman as

*An Anthology of English Medieval and Renaissance Vocal Music: Part Songs for One to Six Voices*

5. *The Play of Herod and the Slaying of the Innocents*  
transcribed and translated by William L. Smoldon  
music edited by Noah Greenberg  
© Noah Greenberg and William L. Smoldon 4 December 1964
7. *The Play of Herod*  
edited by Noah Greenberg and William L. Smoldon  
© Noah Greenberg and William L. Smoldon 4 December 1964
8. *The Play Herod, a Twelfth-Century Musical Drama*  
transcribed and translated by William L. Smoldon  
© Oxford University Press, 16 September 1965
9. “L’ autre jour par un matinet”  
edited by Noah Greenberg  
© Juilliard School of Music 22 November 1965
10. “Et qui la dira”  
edited by Noah Greenberg  
© Juilliard School of Music 22 November 1965
11. “Si mon malheur”  
edited by Noah Greenberg  
© Juilliard School of Music 22 November 1965
12. *New York Pro Musica Songbook*  
edited by Noah Greenberg  
© 1 August 1966
13. “Mary’s Lament”  
translated by Charles Canfield Brown  
© Juilliard School of Music 30 November 1966
14. Three Christmas Songs  
translated by Charles Canfield Brown  
© Juilliard School of Music 2 October 1967
15. *An Anthology of Early Renaissance Music*  
edited by Noah Greenberg and Paul Maynard  
© W. W. Norton & Company, December 1975  
published by W. W. Norton & Company, Inc.