CLERIC-TROUVÈRES AND THE *JEUX-PARTIS* OF MEDIEVAL ARRAS

Jennifer Saltzstein*

Abstract: In the founding documents of their confraternity, the trouvères and *jongleurs* of the northern French city of Arras claimed extraordinary prestige for their humble occupation, insisting on their literacy in Latin and the vernacular. The songs created in Arras reflect the learned, clerical identity of the city's musicians, particularly the debate song genre called the *jeu-parti*. Scrutiny of the participants in extant *jeux-partis*, examination of the material presentation of the genre in the *chansonnier d'Arras*, and analysis of the song contest "Maistre Symon" illustrate the dominance of cleric-trouvères in the genre and the emphasis placed on clerical identity. The authorial persona of the cleric-trouvère has been viewed as important to the emergence of vernacular literature; this article explores the presence of this persona in thirteenth-century song.

Keywords: trouvère, *jeu-parti*, *chansonnier d'Arras*, Ovid, Simon d'Authie (fl. 1220s), Guillaume le Viniers (d. 1245), Adam de la Halle (d. 1285/88 or after 1306), Jehan Bretel (d. 1272), vernacular authority, citation.

In the thirteenth century, the northern French city of Arras was a locus of economic self-determination and social mobility. The city's minstrels were perhaps the first musicians in history to form their own confraternity; through this act of incorporation, the trouvères and *jongleurs* of Arras claimed unprecedented cultural prestige, elevating the formerly low position of the entertainer by ensuring a proper burial for even the humblest of their members.[1] Given their status as performers, it is notable that the confraternity was self-consciously authenticated through written texts. Recent work by Carol Symes has highlighted the learned character of the organization, evident in their official seal, which featured a motto inscribed in both the vernacular and in Latin. Further, in their Latin foundation miracle, later translated and copied into *picard*, the Blessed Virgin herself chose two *jongleurs* to save all the city's inhabitants from a bout of Saint Elmo's Fire. The apostolic and legal language used in the narrative convey a sense of Latinate authority on the organization: over the course of the thirteenth-century, the document that preserves the miracle was amended by more than eleven scribes who were members of the confraternity.[2] Through these artifacts, the trouvères and *jongleurs* claimed legitimacy for their enterprise and posited their vernacular musical organization as an institutional authority within Arras. In their first attempts to establish themselves as members of a profession, the trouvères emphasized their clerical status, particularly their knowledge of Latin and their scribal abilities in both Latin and the vernacular. The confraternity was thus an organization of performers who composed and sang in the vernacular but were preoccupied with writing and the cultural status of Latin.

This confluence of learning and the vernacular is evident in one of the most popular

---

[1] On the official condemnation of *jongleurs*, see John W. Baldwin, "The Image of the Jongleur in Northern France around 1200," *Speculum* 72 (1997) 635–663; and Christopher Page, *The Owl and the Nightingale: Musical Life and Ideas in France, 1100–1300* (Berkeley 1986) 8–41.

[2] See Carol Symes, *A Common Stage: Theater and Public Life in Medieval Arras* (Ithaca and London 2007) 85–88.

song genres cultivated by the trouvères of Arras: the *jeu-parti*.[3] The *jeu-parti* was a genre of sung debate in which two or more singers argued for and against a given question, such as "which is better, a great joy lost, or a great hope never realized?"[4] The competitors would each take a different position, and would respond in alternation, the second trouvère imitating the rhyme scheme, poetic structure, and melody of the first.[5] A respected judge determined the winner of the contest.[6] The genre is always presented as having joint authorship, although due to its formal procedure, the melody and rhyme scheme of the strophic song, when original, were the creation of the first trouvère. The roots of the *jeu-parti* arguably extend back to the Latin debate poetry fostered in the Carolingian era, but the more recent frame of reference for the trouvères was likely the troubadour *tenso*.[7] Whereas it is unknown whether or not the extant *jeux-partis* represent a record of actual song contests performed in the middle ages, scholars have pointed to the realism of these songs as evidence that they were, indeed, improvised and performed in the manner suggested by their form. In contrast to the troubadour *tenso* and earlier debate poetry, which often featured dialogues between personified abstractions, seasons, philosophical concepts, or flowers, in most of the *jeux-partis*, both participants are named and can be connected to known historical figures.[8] This argues against the suggestion that the extant songs may represent poetic fictions written by a single author.[9]

Several accounts have highlighted formal resonances between the *jeu-parti* and the scholastic dialogues fostered at the urban universities.[10] What has not yet been shown,

however, is that the genre was dominated by trouvères who were also clerics. Moreover, we will see that in one the largest surviving collections of extant *jeux-partis* from Arras, the *chansonnier d'Arras*, the genre is represented as a vernacular version of scholastic *disputatio*. The lyrics of the song that opens this collection emphasize clerical identity through the translation of learned Latin sources into a new vernacular context. The staging of the *jeu-parti* in this manuscript highlights the training and skills of the majority of its participants in Arras, many of whom seem to have been equally at home in the vernacular world of courtly love song and the scholarly environment associated with the universities and cathedral schools. Given its latent formal similarity to disputation, the *jeu-parti* has a natural association with clerical culture. We will see that when the genre is cultivated in the educated milieu of Arras, this association is amplified and made explicit through its manuscript presentation. As an authorial construct, the cleric-trouvère figure played an important role in the legitimization of vernacular literature in the thirteenth century.[11] Examining the cleric-trouvère persona in the context *jeux-partis* of Arras invites reflection on emerging notions of vernacular authority and their relationship to song.

CLERICAL IDENTITY AND THE *JEU-PARTI*

The tradition of troubadour song is usually described as having been initiated by a nobleman: Guillaume IX, duke of Aquitaine. Although later generations of troubadours and trouvères would include members of a broader cross-section of medieval society, many thirteenth-century *chansonniers* honor the tradition's aristocratic heritage by emphasizing distinctions in status between aristocratic and non-noble trouvères. As Sylvia Huot has shown, *chansonniers* often begin with songs of Thibaut, king of Navarre, giving the noble trouvère pride of place.[12] In author portraits, manuscript illuminators depict aristocratic trouvères as knights on horseback; in contrast, they represent non-nobles as professionals such as singers, musicians, or writers.[13] Those depicted as performers are represented as *jongleurs*, itinerant musicians of low rank who played instruments and performed the songs of well-known troubadours and trouvères.[14] The illuminators also differentiate clerics, men who possessed some degree of training in Latin, through academic clothing and scribal implements.[15] According to Huot, these careful distinctions demonstrate the importance of status within the

---

[3] The dominance of poets from Arras in the surviving *jeux-partis* has been noted by a number of scholars. See Alfred Jeanroy, *Origines de la poésie lyrique en France au moyen âge: Études de littérature française et comparée* (Paris 1889) 47; Michèle Gally, "Disputer d'amour: les arrageois et le jeu-parti," *Romania* 107 (1986) 55–76; and Emma Cayley, *Debate and Dialogue: Alain Chartier in his Cultural Context* (Oxford 2006) 34.

[4] As judge, Pierre de Corbie asked this question of Guillaume le Vinier and Adam de Givenci (CXXVII). Numbering for the *jeux-partis* referenced in this article refers to *Recueil général des jeux-partis français*, ed. Arthur Langfors, Alfred Jeanroy, and L. Brandin (Paris 1926). For recent editions of medieval debate poetry that include *jeux-partis*, see *La Joute poétique: de la tenson médiévale aux débats chantés traditionnels*, ed. Pierre Bec (Paris 2000); and *Medieval Debate Poetry: Vernacular Works*, ed. Michel-André Bossy (New York 1987).

[5] *Songs of the Women Trouvères*, ed. Eglal Doss-Quinby, Joan Tasker Grimbert, Wendy Pfeffer, and Elizabeth Aubrey (New Haven 2001) 73–74.

[6] For a review of literature on the *jeu-parti*, see Philippe Vernay, "Jehan, d'amour je vous demant: queques considérations sur le jeu-parti français," *Il genere tenzone nelle literature romanze delle origini*, ed. Matteo Pedroni and Antonio Stäuble (Ravenna 1999) 189–201. Recent studies include Georges Lavis, "Le Jeu-parti français: jeu de réfutation, d'opposition et de concession," *Medioevo romanzo* 16 (1991) 21–128; and Michèle Gally, *Parler d'amour au puy d'Arras: Lyrique en jeu* (Orléans 2004).

[7] On the troubadour *tenso* and its relationship to the *partimen* or *jeu-parti*, see Bossy, *Medieval Debate Poetry* (n. 4 above) xiii–xvi; Michèle Gally, "Entre sens et non sens: approches comparatives de la *tenso* d'oc et du *jeu-parti* arrageois," *Il genere* tenzone (n. 6 above) 223–235; and Dominique Billy, "Pour une réhabilitation de la terminologie des troubadours: *Tenson, partimen* et expressions synonymes," ibid. 237–313. For recent editions of the *tenso* and *partimen*, see *The Troubadour* Tensos *and* Partimens, ed. Ruth Harvey and Linda Patterson (Woodbridge 2010); and Bec, *La Joute poétique* (n. 4 above).

[8] See ibid. 12, 22–23; and François Zuffrey, "Tensons réelles et tensons fictives au sien de la littérature provençal," *Il genere* tenzone (n. 6 above) 315–328. Some songs also refer specifically to contemporary historical events. See Baldwin, "Image of the Jongleur" (n. 1 above) 657–658.

[9] In a few songs, this probably was the case. For example, Bec notes that it is unlikely that the few pornographic *jeux-partis* between unnamed men and women debaters were actually improvised in a public setting; he argues that a male author likely write both parts. See Bec, *Joute poétique* (n. 4 above) 30.

[10] See Jeanroy, *Origines* (n. 3 above) 46; Bec, *Joute poétique* (n. 4 above) 20; and Gally, "La Chant et la

dispute," *Argumentation* 1 (1987) 379–395. On the connections between disputation and the Occitan *partimen*, see Sebastian Neumeister, *Das Spiel mit der höfischen Liebe: das altprovenzalische Partimen* (Munich 1969).

[11] See Sylvia Huot, *From Song to Book: The Poetics of Writing in Old French Lyric and Lyrical Narrative Poetry* (Ithaca 1987); Alastair Minnis, *Magister Amoris: The "Roman de la Rose" and Vernacular Hermeneutics* (Oxford 2001); and Jacqueline Cerquiglini-Toulet, *La Couleur de la mélancolie: la fréquentation des livres au XIVe siècle, 1300–1415* (Paris, 1993).

[12] Huot, *From Song to Book* (n. 11 above) 54–56.

[13] The non-noble status of other *trouvères* is also betrayed by their names, which frequently indicate their profession, as in the case of Guillaume d'Amiens, who is identified as Guillaume "li paigneur" ("the painter") in the Vatican *chansonnier* (Vat. Reg. 1490).

[14] Page, *Owl and the Nightingale* (n. 1 above) 54–55.

[15] Huot, *From Song to Book* (n. 11 above) 59–60. The term *clericulus* could refer broadly to any member of the clergy, even a person who had taken minor orders, and any person who had attended medieval schools, even if he led a secular life. See Jacques Verger, *Men of Learning in Europe at the End of the Middle Ages*, trans. Lisa Neal and Steven Rendall (Notre Dame 2000) 187 n. 3.

chansonniers but also serve to endow each trouvère with a specific identity.[16]

In practice, the identities of trouvère, cleric, and *jongleur* were more fluid than the *chansonniers* suggest. The confraternity established in Arras was called the *Carité de Jongleurs et de Bourgeois*, yet its necrology lists many trouvères among its membership, indicating that in Arras, there may not have been a clear distinction between the terms trouvère and *jongleur*.[17] Further, Christopher Page notes that late thirteenth-century canon law specified that clerics who became *jongleurs* would lose their privileges if they stayed with the trade for more than a year, implying that *jongleurie* was a popular occupation for unemployed clerics.[18] The same seems to have been true in Arras; based on the enrollment capacity of the local cathedral school and abbey, Roger Berger calculated that roughly one man out of every four living in the city was educated in the liberal arts.[19] Whereas most of these students would never take holy orders after finishing their studies, this number was also far more than were needed at the abbey scriptorium, cathedral choir, and bishop's chancery. Many of those who remained would exploit their clerical and musical skills as merchants or as minstrels. The necrology of the jongleurs' confraternity records the deaths of many trouvères who were also members of the cathedral chapter and a total of forty-eight monks, indicating that a large number of cleric-trouvères were active in the city.[20]

In light of the range of identities operating within the trouvère song tradition, the *jeu-parti* is notable for its inclusiveness. The judges and participants include every stratum of society, from kings and noble trouvères to *jongleurs*, wealthy merchants and bankers, and even women.[21] Closer scrutiny of the participants, however, shows that cleric-trouvères dominated the extant contests. Two of the most prolific debate partners were Jehan de Grieviler, an unordained married cleric of Arras who participated in thirty-four *jeux-partis*, and Lambert Ferri, a clerk of the Benedictine monastery of Saint Leonard in Pas-de-Calais, who participated in twenty-seven. The *bourgeois* Jehan Bretel was the most seasoned competitor; he participated in fifty-six of the surviving *jeux-partis*. Although Jehan was not a cleric himself, it is clear from the corpus that survives that he preferred to compete with clerics, perhaps enjoying the challenge of an educated opponent. He competed twenty-one times with Jehan de Grieviler and twelve times with Lambert Ferri. Moreover, all but three of the *jeux-partis* by Adam de la Halle, perhaps the most famous cleric-trouvère from Arras, were waged against Jehan. When competing against Adam, Jehan adopts a rhetoric of humility. In one contest, Jehan requests that Adam debate him as a layman since he is ignorant of grammar whereas Adam is "bien letrés" ("well lettered").[22] He later complains that

[16] Ibid. 57.

[17] Even in the era of the troubadours, the distinction between the aristocratic, amateur troubadour and the paid *joglar* was not always clear-cut. See Ruth Harvey, "Courtly culture in medieval Occitania," *The Troubadours: An Introduction*, ed. Simon Gaunt and Sarah Kay (Cambridge 1999) 8–27.

[18] Page, *The Owl and the Nightingale* (n. 1 above) 74.

[19] See Roger Berger, *Littérature et société arrageoise au XIIIe siècle: les chansons et dits artésiens* (Arras 1981) 58–60 and 110.

[20] *La Nécrologie de la confrérie des jongleurs et des bourgeois d'Arras (1194–1361)*, ed. Roger Berger (Arras 1963). See discussion in Symes, *A Common Stage* (n. 2 above) 41.

[21] Ardis Butterfield, *Poetry and Music in Medieval France: From Jean Renart to Guillaume de Machaut* (Cambridge 2002) 136; and Symes, *A Common Stage* (n. 2 above) 226.

[22] "Adan, a moi respondés / con lais hom a cest affaire / car ne sai point de gramaire / et vous estes bien

Adam speaks only "en clergeois" ("in clerical parlance"),[23] and on another occasion, he insists that Adam teach him about the God of Love, since he has no mastery of the subject.[24]

Not only were clerical-trouvères active participants in the *jeu-parti*, a number of characteristics of genre highlight their identity, particularly its similarity to the most performative of contemporary academic traditions, the disputation.[25] The clearest connection between the *jeux-partis* and *disputatio* is the form itself; the opening question of a *jeu-parti* is likely a parody of the academic *sententia*. Further, in their arguments, cleric-trouvères use vernacular analogues to typical forms of evidence employed in academic disputations. Proverbs, for example, function as a vernacular version of the *auctoritates*, quotations of scripture and classical authorities used as evidence in disputations and academic commentaries. Trouvères also use rhetorical figures such as analogies and metaphors to illustrate their arguments, and even provide allegorical interpretations of the authorities they quote. The *jeux-partis* differ importantly from the sentences in their tendency to focus on the personality of the debater and the drama of the contest rather than the logical resolution of a problem; indeed, many of the contests end in a standstill.[26] Yet the songs arguably retain the trappings of the clerical debate style associated with the medieval universities.

It is important to note that Arras had no university. It is likely that the majority of the cleric-trouvères in question were educated at the cathedral school of Notre-Dame d'Arras or the Abbey of Saint-Vaast rather than, for example, the University of Paris.[27] Yet scholars have noted examples of the diffusion of scholastic practices from the universities into the monastic and cathedral schools, and indeed, into the broader culture.[28] Not all monasteries were hostile to scholastic methods and some attempted to adapt them to monastic learning.[29] The direct involvement of Philippe le Chancellor in the composition of polyphonic music guaranteed the influence of scholastic culture in polyphonic musical genres such as *conductus* and the motet.[30] Examining the *jeu-*

letrés," CXIII. By calling Adam "bien letrés," Jehan might have been invoking the Latin designation *litteratus*, which indicated knowledge of Latin. See Verger, *Men of Learning* (n. 15 above) 11.

[23] CXVII, "Adan, amis, je vous dis."

[24] "J'ai bein mestier de vo ensengnement / car je n'en sai mie / le maintien ne le maistrie / sel voeil savoir de vous, aprendés m'ent!"

[25] On the theatrical nature of the academic disputation, see Jody Enders, "The Theater of Scholastic Erudition," *Comparative Drama* 27 (1992) 341–363; and Alex James Novikoff, "Dialogue and Disputation in Medieval Thought and Society, 1050–1350." (Ph.D. diss., University of Pennsylvania 2007) 176–181.

[26] See Cayley, *Debate and Dialogue* (n. 3 above); and Galy, "La Chant et la dispute" (n. 10 above) 379–395.

[27] See Symes, *A Common Stage* (n. 2 above) 41 and 156. There is less evidence regarding the curricula of the cathedral schools than that which exists for the universities. Cathedral and monastic schools seem to have focused on education in Latin grammar and the singing of the liturgy; more advanced students may have studied some logic and the classics, and even elements of the liberal arts. See Verger, *Men of Learning* (n. 15 above) 43–45; and Susan Boynton, "Boy Singers in Monasteries and Cathedrals," *Young Choristers, 650–1700*, ed. Susan Boynton and Eric Rice (Woodbridge 2008) 37–48.

[28] Although disputation is most often associated with the university, Alex Novikoff has recently argued for its origins in the literary dialogues used in 12th-c. monastic learning. See Alex Novikoff, "Anselm, Dialogue, and the Rise of Scholastic Disputation." *Speculum* 86 (2011) 387–418.

[29] See Stephen Ferruolo, *The Origins of the University: The Schools of Paris and Their Critics, 1100–1215* (Stanford 1985) 69–71.

[30] Anne-Zoé Rillon argues that Philippe's music functioned as a form of preaching to the clergy. See her "Convaincre et émouvoir: les conduits monodiques de Philippe le Chancelier, un médium pour la prédica-

parti provides an opportunity to explore the cultural diffusion of scholastic ideas in the context of vernacular song.

THE CHANSONNIER D'ARRAS AND THE CLERICAL JEU-PARTI

Arrageois manuscripts often highlight the identity of cleric-trouvères. The *arrageois Chansonnier de Noailles*, for example, announces the clerical status of Richard de Fournivale by giving him the title *maistre* in the rubric for each of the five songs in his section. The rubricator of this manuscript also identifies Simon d'Autie and Guillaume le Viniers, both of whom were clerics, using the title *maistre*.[31] This title held very specific significance in the thirteenth-century universities; it designated mastery of a particular subject matter and the ability to teach it, a privilege that required a *licentia docendi*, which only the church could grant. It was originally conferred by bishops, abbots, and archdeacons, but later became the unique purview of the chancellor.[32] It seems unlikely that all of the cleric-trouvères designated *maistre* in the surviving songbooks possessed *licentiae docendi*. Yet the tendency for scribal rubrics in the manuscripts to address clerical-trouvères through this title connects them to the institutional structures of the universities.

Fourteen different manuscripts transmit *jeux-partis*, but the majority of the repertory is preserved in two *chansonniers*: the Vatican *Chansonnier* (Bibl. Vat. Reg. 1490) and the *chansonnier d'Arras* (Arras, bibl. munic. 657).[33] The *jeu-parti* collection in *chansonnier d'Arras* is of particular interest because of the way it stages the genre, highlighting, from the outset, the clerical identity of the participants and the resemblance between the *jeu-parti* and *disputatio*. The *chansonnier d'Arras* contains the second-largest surviving collection of *jeu-partis*[34] and is composed of two distinct songbooks: a collection of love songs and a separate collection of *jeux-partis* and other assorted songs that were bound together.[35] The latter collection includes thirty-nine songs, twenty-three of which are *jeux-partis*. The opening page of a medieval collec-

tion often serves to define its contents. The opening page of this songbook emphasizes the *jeu-parti* as the generic focus of the collection and presents an image of the genre as specifically clerical. This is perhaps not surprising given that the manuscript's scribe and collator may have himself been a cleric-trouvère. The scribe identifies himself as "Jehans d'Amiens li petis" in his signature on the colophon in the *chansonnier d'Arras*; he may also have been the author of a song on folio 62v of the Vatican *chansonnier*, which is attributed to "Jehan li petit clerc."[36]

The opening miniature depicts two clerics standing opposite one another, robed and tonsured, holding out long index fingers as though each is addressing his speech to the other.[37] The presence of this miniature lies in contrast to the Vatican *chansonnier*, the largest source of *jeux-partis*, which does not supply a comparable illumination; the surviving miniatures in that manuscript are author portraits that delineate the social class of the poets without suggesting performance.[38] Two other *chansonniers* that transmit *jeux-partis*, manuscripts *I* (Oxford, Bodleian Library Douce 308) and *W* (Paris, BnF MS fr. 25566), provide miniatures that suggest debate. The latter, found in the *jeu-parti* section of the complete works of Adam de la Halle, depicts two figures standing opposite one another in a debating pose.[39] In the former, a cleric seated at a bench addresses a standing layman; the debate that follows this image addresses the story of a lady who must chose between two men, one rich and one poor.[40] Eglal Doss-Quinby argues that rather than depicting the debaters, the image represents the lady's two suitors as described in the song.[41] Within the context of other manuscripts that transmit the *jeux-partis*, the illumination in the *chansonnier d'Arras* resembles that found in *W*, but not those found in the other *chansonniers*.

Debating scenes featuring similar clothing and gestures are common in medieval philosophical and reference manuscripts.[42] In the *chansonnier d'Arras*, however, what follows the image is not a Latin text, but rather, a *jeu-parti* between Giles le Viniers

---

tion?" *La Place de la musique dans la culture médiévale: colloque organisé à la Fondation Singer-Polignac le mercredi 25 octobre 2006*, ed. Olivier Cullin (Turnhout 2007) 99–113. Thomas B. Payne argues that two of Philip's motets can be interpreted as an artistic representation of scholastic disputation. See *Philip the Chancellor: Motets and Prosulas*, ed. Thomas B. Payne (Middleton 2011) xvi–xxv, esp. xix. Alex Novikoff also explores the motet genre as a musical representation of disputation in "Toward a Cultural History of Scholastic Disputation," forthcoming. I am grateful to Alex Novikoff for sharing his article with me prior to publication.

[31] Indeed, the rubricator often chooses to abbreviate Guillaume's name rather than his title when space is limited, as he does before the song "En mi mai" (fol. 29), attributed to *Maistre Willes*.

[32] John W. Baldwin, *Masters, Princes, and Merchants: The Social Views of Peter the Chanter and his Circle* (Princeton 1970) 74.

[33] The ordering of songs in these manuscripts indicates a close relationship between the two. See John E. Stevens, "The Manuscript Presentation and Notation of Adam de la Halle's Courtly Chansons," *Source Materials and the Interpretation of Music: A Memorial Volume to Thurston Dart*, ed. Ian Bent (London 1981) 33–35.

[34] See Mary O'Neill, *Courtly Love Songs of Medieval France: Transmission and Style in the Trouvère Repertoire* (Oxford 2006) 17–18.

[35] O'Neill argues, following Jeanroy, that the *jeu-parti* collection was incorrectly bound in the middle of the love song collection. See ibid. 18–19. In his facsimile of the *chansonnier*, Jeanroy argued that the song collections were not originally included in the large anthology within which they were bound. See *Le Chansonnier d'Arras: Reproduction et phototypie*, ed. Alfred Jeanroy (Paris 1925) 5–8. This hypothesis was contested in *Li Bestiaires d'amours di Maistre Richart de Fornival e Li Response du Bestiaire*, ed. Cesare Segre (Milan 1957) xlvii–li.

[36] See Huot, *From Song to Book* (n. 11 above) 60.

[37] See Jeanroy, *Le Chansonnier d'Arras* (n. 35 above) fol.136.

[38] The portraits either depict equestrian knights or performers playing musical instruments. See Huot, *From Song to Book* (n. 11 above) 52; and Alison Stones, "Some Northern French Chansonniers and Their Cultural Context," *Ars musica septentrionalis: de l'interprétation du patrimoine musical à l'historiographie*, ed. Barbara Haggh, Frédéric Billiet, Claire Chamiyé, and Sandrine Dumont (Paris 2011) 176–177.

[39] Fol. 23v. Several of the illuminations in this manuscript suggest a staged performance of the work that follows them. The *Jeu de pelerin* opens with a miniature featuring a pilgrim holding a staff addressing an audience (fol. 37v); the *Jeu de Robin et Marion* opens with a miniature depicting Marion singing, standing across from the knight, pictured on horseback holding his falcon (fol. 39).

[40] There is some disagreement about this image. Mary Atchison argues that the seated figure is female. See *The Chansonnier of Oxford Bodleian MS Douce 308: Essays and Complete Edition of Texts*, ed. Mary Atchison (Aldershot 2005) 92. Eglal Doss-Quinby, following Alison Stones, argues that both figures are male. See Doss-Quinby, "The Visual Representation of Lyric Type in Trouvère Manuscript *I* (Oxford, Bodleian Library, MS Douce 308)," *"Chançon legiere a chanter": Essays in Honor of Samuel N. Rosenberg*, ed. Karen Fresco and Wendy Pfeffer (Birmingham 2007) 1–25; and Alison Stones, *A Survey of Manuscripts Illuminated in France: Gothic Manuscripts c. 1260–1320* (London forthcoming), cited on ibid. 20.

[41] See Doss-Quinby, "Visual Representation" (n. 40 above) 7.

[42] For example, a historiated initial from the medical miscellany Harley 3140 features a similar academic exchange to accompany Hippocrates' *Aphorisms* (fol. 21). A marginal illustration from a 13th-c. English copy of Aristotle's *Second Analytics* (Paris, BnF, MS Lat. 17806, fol. 250v) depicts scholars in a similar debating pose. I am grateful to Joyce Coleman for drawing my attention to these images.

and Simon d'Authie, "Maistre Symon, d'un essample nouvel."[43] The piece is one of a number of *jeux-partis* in which the participants were both clerics. Giles served as a clerk to the bishop of Arras between 1224 and 1227, and was a canon of Arras between 1225 and 1232.[44] Giles represented the cathedral chapter of Arras in legal proceedings against the monks of Saint-Vaast, who were represented by his debate partner, Simon d'Authie.[45] Simon was a simple canon of Arras and, from about 1225, also served as a legal counselor to the abbey.[46] Although the precise date of the song's competition is unknown, the contest probably occurred during the second quarter of the thirteenth century, sometime between Simon's arrival in Arras, which occurred between 1228 and 1230, and Giles' death in 1252.[47] The image of the two clerics in the opening miniature is undoubtedly meant to represent Giles and Simon performing their debate. Yet this song is not an obvious choice to begin such a large collection, which features many examples by better-known contestants such as Adam de la Halle, Jehan Bretel, and Thibaut IV.[48] Neither Giles nor Simon was a prolific debater. Giles participated in only two other *jeux-partis*, both against his brother Guillaume le Viniers, a married cleric from Arras.[49] Simon also may have sung in two other debates with Hue le Maronnier, neither of which survives with musical notation.[50]

Whereas the manuscript rubricators often use the title *maistre* to identify trouvères, it is unusual for debaters to do so when addressing one another; this title appears in only seven *jeux-partis*.[51] Only one clerk-trouvère is consistently addressed as *maistre*: Jehan de Marli. Jehan de Grieviler addresses Jehan de Marli as *maistre*;[52] Jehan Bretel identifies Jehan de Marli by the title two debates,[53] and refers to Jehan as *maistre* in one of his debates with Adam de la Halle.[54] Jehan Bretel also debates a trouvère he

calls "Maistre Jehan" who is otherwise unidentified (possibly Jehan de Grieviler),[55] but does not use the title in his many other debates with cleric-trouvères. Although his clerical identity is central to the persona he creates in his *Jeu de la Feuillee*, Adam de la Halle is referred to only once as *maistre* in the corpus of *jeux-partis*, in a contest between Robert and Chopart in which he served as judge.[56] The debate between Giles and Simon is thus unusual in use of the title *maistre* at all, particularly in its use of the title as the song's first word.[57]

The lyrics of the opening song draw further attention to the clerical status of its participants. The question that Simon and Giles debate is whether it is better for a young man to seek the company of an older woman, or whether an older man should pursue a young lover. This theme is common across the *jeux-partis*, and has been interpreted as a parody of courtly lyric.[58] After Giles poses this question, Simon responds, signaling his acceptance of the latter position using an analogy common in the *jeux-partis*: one respects an old man who takes a new chateau or fortress more than a youth who takes an old, abandoned tower. The two singers then exchange six additional strophes of seven verses each, all following the rhyme scheme established by Giles in the opening question, and each trouvère closes with a four-verse *envoi*. In the third strophe, Giles counters that an old man can rarely possess a new tower without treachery or deception, thus an old man rarely obtains a young lover by her will. In the fourth strophe, Simon adds a new objection using two analogies, noting that a tree planted in a deserted land will dry up without aid, and that only a foolish young man attempts to put an old bird in a cage. In the fifth strophe, Giles replies that an old man who takes a young lover will have to endure the pain of jealousy, to which Simon counters that whereas jealousy is a factor in all love affairs, a youthful lover is a rejuvenating force.

In the final two strophes before the trouvères exchange their *envois*, the two emphasize their clerical knowledge and skills. In strophe seven, Giles invokes Ovid's *Ars amatoria*; this is the only citation of Ovid in the surviving corpus of *jeux-partis*. The *Ars amatoria*, along with Ovid's *Remedia amoris*, was used to teach grammar and rhetoric in medieval universities, particularly during the twelfth and thirteenth centuries when Ovid's popularity was at its apex. But Ovid came to represent the primary *auctor* cited in matters concerning love and sex.[59] In the thirteenth century, his influence extended to vernacular literature, where he was invoked as the *magister amoris*,

---

[43] CXXXI.

[44] See Berger, *Littérature et société arrageoises* (n.19 above) 416.

[45] These proceedings also involved the cleric-trouvère Adam de Givenchy, who served as clerk to the bishop of Arras starting in 1230. See ibid.; and Friedrich Gennrich, "Simon d'Authie: Ein pikardischer Sänger," *Zeitschrift für romanische Philologie* 67 (1951) 50–54.

[46] Although it is not known where Giles and Simon were educated, their activities as lawyers would place them in the company of a smaller clerical elite who had moved beyond the basic study of the liberal arts. Jacques Verger distinguishes between the large group of "intermediary intellectuals," who had some training in the liberal arts but may not have possessed academic degrees, and an elite group he calls "men of learning," who had studied the higher disciplines of theology, medicine, or law. See Verger, *Men of Learning* (n. 15 above) 25.

[47] See Berger, *Littérature et société arrageoises* (n. 19 above) 416 and 436.

[48] "Maistre Symon" is transmitted in only one source outside of the *chansonnier d'Arras*, manuscript *b* (Rome, Bibl. Vat. Reg. 1522), which does not provide music notation. It is the only *jeu-parti* in the *chansonnier d'Arras* that has only one surviving notated melody, and is among the minority of examples in the *chansonnier* (5 of the 23 *jeux-partis*) that are transmitted in only two sources.

[49] "Sire frere, faites m'un jugement," CXXIX, and "Frere, ki fait mieus a proisier," CXXX.

[50] "Symon, le quel emploie," CXXXII, and "Symon, or me faites savoir," CXXXIII. No other works by Hue survive. Berger notes that the attribution in these *jeux-partis* is to "Symon d'Athies" and the title "maitre" does not appear in the rubric; further, these two songs are placed next to each other in the manuscript but far from "Maistre Symon," casting doubt on the attribution. See Berger, *Littérature et société arrageois* (n. 19 above) 436.

[51] This analysis is based upon the Lavis/Stasse concordance of *jeux-partis*. See Georges Lavis and M. Stasse, *Lexique des Jeux-Partis: concordances et index* (Liège 1995).

[52] See *jeu-parti* C.

[53] LXXV and LXXXVII.

[54] CXVII.

[55] LXXXVII.

[56] CXI.

[57] There are other debates that refer to clerical status, such as Thibaut de Champagne's debate with a partner he identifies as "Clers" (VI). An individual identified as Robert "li clers" also appears as a judge in a contest between Jehan Bretel and Lambert Ferri (XLVIII).

[58] Joseph Dane interprets parody of the courtly lyric tradition as a subversive literary attack on the bourgeois merchant class in Arras, who frequently expressed their social aspirations through patronage of the arts, and through courtly lyric in particular. See Joseph A. Dane, "Parody and Satire in the Literature of Thirteenth-Century Arras, Part II," *Studies in Philology* 81 (1984) 123–124 and 138–140.

[59] See Ralph J. Hexter, *Ovid and Medieval Schooling: Studies in Medieval School Commentaries on Ovid's "Ars amatoria," "Epistulae ex Ponto," and "Epistulae Heroidum"* (Munich 1986); Peter Allen, *The Art of Love: Amatory Fiction from Ovid to the "Roman de la Rose"* (Philadelphia 1992) 46–58; and Michèle Gally, *L'Intelligence de l'amour d'Ovide à Dante: Arts d'aimer et poésie au Moyen Âge* (Paris 2005) 95–98.

or ultimate authority on love.[60] At the close of his debate with Simon, Giles calls the master of love to his side:

VII.Maistre Ovides, el sens ke vous espel
laissa le moust, si se tint au vin viés
de saige amour n'est nus jalous n'ivrés
saije dame est clers vins en boin vaissel
sans teche de vilounie.
Kien apris de kacherie
ne quangent pas si ke font li kaiel

Maistre Ovid, whose meaning I will expose to you, / left behind the must, preferring aged wine, / [for] in wise love, one is not jealous or drunk. / A wise woman is a clear wine in a good vessel/without fault or wickedness. / Dogs who know about the chase / are not led off the scent like young dogs.[61]

Giles invokes Ovid as an authority to support his position, citing the classical author and loosely paraphrasing and translating two Latin verses from his *Ars amatoria* into his own *picard* dialect of Old French. Giles' phrase "laissa le moust, si se tient au vin vies," is a topical reference to a specific passage from the second book of the *Ars amatoria* in which Ovid advises that men who seek the charms of a mature woman will be rewarded. Ovid draws an analogy between mature lovers and aged wine, proclaiming: "Qui properant, nova musta bibant: mihi fundat avitum / Consulibus prescis condita testa merum" ("Let those who hasten drink the must / for me let a jar put down under ancient consuls pour forth its ancestral wine").[62] The relationship between the quotation and source text is quite close, perhaps unusually so. There are examples in troubadour song of biblical proverbs translated into Occitan with little change in vocabulary.[63] Further, Folquet de Marselha, a cleric-troubadour, included numerous references to classical authors, one of which is a close enough parallel that its source has been located.[64] When Ovid is cited in troubadour song, however, it is more common for the quotation itself to be paraphrased to the point that it is not possible to locate a specific source;[65] Giles' paraphrase and translation is an unusually close *picard* rendering of his classical source text.

The citation of an authority, either classical or biblical, was a conventional form of evidence used in commentaries and in theological debates. Yet by paraphrasing Ovid and translating the textual reference into *picard*, Giles invokes Ovid as a vernacular *auctor*. Further, in the opening verse of this strophe, when Giles announces, "Maistre Ovid, el sens ke vous espel" ("Master Ovid, whose meaning I will explain to you"), he promises to provide a gloss on the quotation to follow, thus positioning himself as a

---

[60] See Minnis, *Magister Amoris* (n. 11 above) 63–80.

[61] All translations from Old French are my own; I am grateful to Amy Heneveld for her assistance.

[62] Translation adapted from vv. 695–696 of *Ovid: The "Art of Love" and Other Poems*, trans. J. H. Mozley (Cambridge 1929) 112–113.

[63] Wendy Pfeffer, *Proverbs in Medieval Occitan Literature* (Gainesville 1997) 32.

[64] In his *canso* "Ben an mort mi e lor," Folquet's "Qui n'aut pueia bas deissen" ("he who climbs high falls low") is an Occitan rendering of Publilius Syrus's phrase "Excelsis multo facilius casus nocet" ("The situation is more easily harmful to those in high places"). See ibid. 44–46.

[65] Personal communication with Sarah Kay, 17 June 2011. On Ovid's role in troubadour song, see Dimitri Scheludko, "Ovid und die Troubadours," *Zeitschrift für romanische Philologie* 54 (1934) 129–174.

---

vernacular exegete: he explains that the wine represents a wise woman. Giles then consolidates his call to authority by ending with a proverb, another source of vernacular wisdom. In her analysis of proverb use in troubadour song, Wendy Pfeffer notes that biblical proverbs were often used to teach elementary Latin; she views vernacular proverb use as an indication of education on the part of both poets and audiences.[66] Rather than adopt the conventional pattern of introducing a proverb with an annunciation or attribution of its source, Giles seamlessly appends the proverb to his gloss. We can infer from this that Giles either assumed his audience was familiar with the proverb, or that they would regard it as his own wisdom.[67] In his final response, Giles thus presents himself as a learned expert in matters of love, pleading his case through vernacular analogs to the argumentation techniques used in academic disputation.

As if in response to Giles's display of learning and his introduction of bookish authority to their vernacular debate about love, Simon's final response also invokes clerical culture by using two different scribal analogies.

VIII. Vielle a d'autres amours plain son tavlel
Gilles, la vostre escrire n'i poriés
En neuve chire et mole emprainderiés
Plus de legier vostre amour k'el seel

An old woman has filled her tablets with lovers; / Gilles, you can never inscribe yours thus. / You will imprint your love more easily / onto soft, new wax than onto a dry, hard, seal.[68]

In his final argument against Giles, Simon invokes scribal implements as a reference to their common milieu as clerics. Moreover, the use of sealing wax as a metaphor for learning is common in medieval pedagogical writing and ultimately derives from classical sources. As Alex Novikoff has recently explained, "The wax represents the malleable material of the mind, which needs study, training, and the flame of truth for it to be impressed. The metaphor of the wax seal is a very old one—that other great writer of dialogues, Plato, described the mind as like a block of wax that would take the impression of our perceptions and thoughts." In a more immediate medieval context, Saint Anselm used the metaphor to describe youthful impressionability in one of his letters, comparing the malleability of wax to a man who was neither too young nor too old for learning: "a piece of wax that is neither too soft nor too hard."[69] Simon offers an off-color vernacular reinterpretation of this pedagogical metaphor, translating it to his argument about seduction.

Giles and Simon's debate resonates with other contests that feature cleric-trouvères. Adam de la Halle, for example, often refers to aspects of clerical life and training in his *jeux-partis*. In Adam de la Halle's contest against Jehan de Grieviler, another de-

---

[66] See Pfeffer, *Proverbs* (n. 63 above) 42–43. She also notes (10) that proverb use is encouraged in the *ars rhetoricae*.

[67] In the *jeux-partis*, it is more common for debaters to begin proverbs with introductions such as *ke, sachiés, savez bien,* or *l'oïr dire*. See Claude Buridant, "Nature et fonction des proverbs dans les *jeux-partis*," *Revue des sciences humaines* 163 (1976) 377–418. For patterns of annunciation in medieval proverb quotation, see also Jacqueline and Bernard Cerquiglini, "L'écriture proverbiale," *Revue des Sciences Humaines* 163 (1976) 359–375.

[68] CXXXI.

[69] Novikoff, "Anselm, Dialogue" (n. 28 above) 415.

bate between two clerics, both contestants make frequent references to learning, instruction, and preaching.[70] Further, in one of his debates against Jehan Bretel, Adam argues that discrete lovers are often behaving hypocritically, comparing the courtier who is silent before his lady to a hypocritical clerk who obtains a canonicate and swells with pride and arrogance.[71] In a different debate against Jehan, Adam argues that it is better to wait a period of many years before achieving the mercy of one's love. One of his arguments is that just as expertise in the law can only be achieved as the reward of long study, a lover must prove his value through years of anticipation before attaining mercy.[72]

To summarize, the illustration and song choice used to open the *jeu-parti* collection of the *chansonnier d'Arras* work together to frame the genre in terms of clerical identity. The collection begins not with the most prolific or aristocratic composers active in the tradition, but instead, with a song contest between two *arrageois* clerics. Their identity is highlighted through the rare use of the title *maistre* and the opening miniature that portrays two clerk-trouvères as partners in a disputation; the citation and vernacular gloss of a classical *auctoritas* and use of scribal metaphors in the text of the debate emphasize skills and knowledge possessed by the two cleric-trouvères. Opening the collection in this way invites readers of the *chansonnier d'Arras* to perceive the *jeu-parti* as a vernacular musical practice with a noticeably scholarly sensibility.

PERFORMANCE AND INSCRIPTION OF THE *JEU-PARTI*

The *jeu-parti* collection in the *chansonnier d'Arras* reminds its readers of the dual role that some clerical authors likely played; many of these composers may have been as comfortable on stage as they were at the writing desk. Representing Simon and Giles as partners engaged in a disputation emphasizes one of the most performative aspects of scholastic culture. Quodlibetal disputations, in particular, were public events involving audiences that included members from outside the university; in the days of Peter Abelard, some quodlibetal disputations were conducted on the streets of the Latin Quarter for assembled crowds.[73] But the evidence Simon and Giles present (quotations of authority, glosses, and scribal analogies) stresses their scribal and exegetical abilities, the dimensions of clerical identity that are tied to writing. The *jeu-parti* section of the manuscript celebrates the dual identity of the cleric-*trouvère* as a figure skilled in both performance and writing.

The preservation of the *jeux-partis* in manuscripts also points to issues involved in inscribing song in writing. Perhaps more than any other late thirteenth-century song genre, the *jeu-parti* is altered dramatically when it is recorded on parchment and transformed from a performance into a written work. The written songs that survive suggest that they may represent traces of an improvisatory practice. Both musicologists

and literary scholars have argued that the surviving songs are made up of modular units designed to facilitate improvisation. In her extensive analysis of *jeu-parti* lyrics, Michèle Gally found that the lyrics were quite formulaic, featuring a common body of metaphors, analogies, and proverbs, and containing repeated lexical formulas. Further, the rhymes used were relatively simple, derived from verb morphology, infinitives, and past participles. All of these textual features, she argued, would facilitate improvisation; she envisioned the *jeu-parti* as a semi-spontaneous improvised practice achieved through the combining and recombining of memorized textual formulae in new and inventive ways by the performers. She came to the conclusion that because of the apparent fluidity of the live performance practice, the genre would have held the greatest interest for the audiences of live performances and became less compelling once removed from the event and inscribed in the codex as a series of written works.[74]

In the only systematic comparative study of the entire corpus of extant melodies, Michelle Stewart argued that much like the texts, the majority of the *jeux-partis* contained a series of modular melodic motifs and conventional gestures that could be combined in a variety of ways to form one melody.[75] More convincingly, she found that the transmission of the extant *jeu-parti* melodies was extremely fluid, indicating that there was rarely a stable relationship between the music and text. Of the 182 surviving examples, only 105 are transmitted with a melody. Of these, more than half (fifty-four) are unique. Because we have no concordant melody to compare these songs to, it is not possible to know whether the surviving melody was always attached to the text in question, or whether it was simply one known version. The latter interpretation is reinforced by the *jeux-partis* for which multiple versions do survive; of these songs (fifty-one), more than half (thirty-seven) have concordances that transmit significantly different melodies, demonstrating that cases in which a single melody was reliably attached to a given text were in the minority.[76] The variability of the song's musical dimension suggests that the *jeux-partis* probably do not represent a fixed body musical works; it is possible that the melody could have changed with each performance.

The outside transmission of the *jeux-partis* in the *chansonnier d'Arras* differs in certain respects from the repertory as a whole. For example, the melodies are significantly more widely transmitted. Nearly all of the *jeux-partis* in the manuscript, twenty-two of the twenty-three, have a melodic concordance in another *chansonnier*, compared with slightly less than half in the repertory overall. However, despite this robust concordance base, there are strikingly few instances in which the other surviving sources transmit the same melody as that found in the *chansonnier d'Arras*; only four of the twenty-two concordances are appear with the same melody in another

---

[70] CXXII.

[71] "Chieus qui devant se dame est amuïs / iert comparés, puis que faire le doi, / au clerc couvert de fause ypocrisie / tant qu'il vient a canesie / et dont est plains d'outrage et de buffoy" (CXI).

[72] "Sire, qui veut estre sire de lois / anchois qu'il ait d'autre scïenche oï / mout petit i monteploie" (CXVII).

[73] See Novikoff, "Toward a Cultural History" (n. 30 above); and Ian P. Wei, "Paris Theologians and Responses to Social Change in the Thirteenth Century," *Tradition, Innovation, Invention*, ed. Hans-Joachim Schmidt (Berlin and New York 2005) 196–197.

[74] Gally, *Parler d'amour* (n. 6 above) 67–79. Bec's view is that it is certainly not impossible that the majority of *jeux-partis* were improvised with some advance preparation. See Bec, *Joute poétique* (n. 4 above) 30. The literature on orality in medieval poetry is too vast to cite in full here. A classic study is Paul Zumthor, *La Lettre et la voix: de la "littérature" médiévale* (Paris 1987).

[75] Michelle F. Stewart, "The Melodic Structure of Thirteenth-Century *Jeux-Partis*," *Acta Musicologica* 51 (1979) 94–97. For literature on orality in medieval music, see the essays in Leo Treitler, *With Voice and Pen: Coming to Know Medieval Song and How it Was Made* (Oxford 2007).

[76] Ibid. 87.

manuscript.[77] These four concordances are particularly strong matches, suggesting copying from a common exemplar or accurate musical memory of a fixed melody.[78] Yet the number of melodic concordances between the *chansonnier d'Arras* and other sources is significantly less than that of the repertory as a whole, where slightly fewer than a third of the melodic concordances were transmitted the same melody. The *jeux-partis* in the *chansonnier d'Arras* seem not have been sung to the same melody with any regularity.

Given the fluidity of these songs, the *jeu-parti* repertory might seem an unlikely choice for preservation in a manuscript. What kind of the life did these songs enjoy after being inscribed in the codex? Symes asserts that the preservation of the *jeux-partis* attests to the growing comfort with scripted theater in Arras, and that the contests would likely have been reenacted like plays, with younger generations of trouvères playing the part of the original debaters. Bec, too, suggests that some *jeux-partis* may have been composed by trouvères and performed later by *jongleurs*.[79] Even given the *arrageois* love of theater, I find it difficult to imagine a performance of this type, which would deny the spontaneity, spectacle, and suspense that the original contest must have held. Moreover, in the two contemporary *arrageois* plays that include music, Adam de la Halle's *Jeu de la Feillée* and *Jeu de Robin et Marion*, multiple sources provide nearly identical melodies for the quoted *rondeaux* and refrain melodies. This stable transmission lies in marked contrast to the melodic variability of the *jeux-partis*.

A different and perhaps equally speculative explanation for the material preservation of the *jeux-partis* is that the manuscript could have been directed toward future study as much as performance. Once preserved in the book, the *jeux-partis* could function as examples for future trouvères to study and imitate while they learned to perform the genre themselves. Indeed, the first line of the debate between Gilles le Vinier and Simon d'Authie suggests this very use. In his opening challenge, Gilles sings: "Maistre Simon d'un essample nouvel" ("Master Simon, give us a new model"). The word *essample* was used to describe standards of weight and measure in Old French, but was also used to identify artistic or literary models that were suitable for imitation. Tellingly, the only other *jeu-parti* in which this word is used is a debate between Jehan de Bretel and Adam de la Halle, which discusses the *Lai d'Aristote* by the Parisian cleric Henri d'Andeli.[80] When Jehan asks whether Adam would allow his lover to ride him like a horse, as Aristotle does in the *Lai*, Adam responds that one cannot blame those who would follow the example (*essample*) of a writer such as Aristotle, who Adam claims has surpassed him in renown, knowledge, and value. The word *essample* underscores the origin of the debate in another work of literature, and it is the strength of Aristotle's legacy in letters that would prompt Adam to assent to so humiliating a model of behavior.[81] The prominent appearance of the word *essample* at opening of

the *jeu-parti* collection in the *chansonnier d'Arras* encourages readers to approach the songs that follow as a repository of models to be imitated in future debates. One might wonder whether the *jeux-partis* could have functioned as a vernacular version of the academic sentences, which students learned and memorized while they prepared to argue in their own disputations; a new generation of trouvères could have similarly honed their craft through study of manuscripts like the *chansonnier d'Arras*. By internalizing the melodic patterns, rhetorical figures, and vernacular authorities stored in these books, readers could acquire the tools necessary to imitate the *arrageois* sung debates.

VERNACULAR AUTHORITY AND THE LEGACIES OF *ARRAGEOIS* SONG

As the first compilations of the extensive and largely retrospective repertory of troubadour and *trouvère* songs in manuscript form, the *chansonnier* projects of the late thirteenth-century did more than provide a blueprint for future performances of favored songs. Bourgeois patrons and the scribe-compilers they hired to create songbooks like the *chansonnier d'Arras* were investing in a legacy for their musical heritage, preserving its best examples for posterity. Given the later prominence of song contests across northern France and England, most known as *puys*, the impact of the *arrageois* song competitions preserved in the *chansonniers* may have been wide-ranging.[82] Poetic societies similar to the *jongleurs'* confraternity were established in Valenciennes, Douai, Amiens, Lille, Tournai, and several other northern French cities throughout the thirteenth and fourteenth centuries, and all of these organizations sponsored their own song competitions.[83] Documents recording the end of a thriving *puy* in London in the late thirteenth century have inspired speculation about its possible influence on Chaucer's poetry.[84] Whether all of these poetic societies and *puys* show the direct influence of Arras is unclear, yet they demonstrate that the traditions of song competition that flourished there endured, and enjoyed lasting cultural significance.

Moreover, the persona of the cleric-trouvère highlighted in the *jeux-partis* of Arras resonates with new literary devices in use in thirteenth-century romance that many have argued contributed to the authorization of the vernacular. Although nineteenth-century philologists originally argued vernacular literature emanated from the popular sphere, contemporary critics have increasingly pointed to the role of clerics in the

---

[77] These are "Cuveliers, vous ameres" (LXIV); "Jehan Bretel, vostre avis" (LXXXV); "De çou, Robert de la Pierre" (CVI); and "Cuvelier, un gugement" (XCIX). The concordant melodies are all found in either the Vatican *chansonnier* or in Siena bibl. Comun H.X:36.

[78] These melodies can be found, although with problematic rhythmic interpretations, in *Trouvère Lyrics with Melodies: Complete Comparative Edition*, ed. Hans Tischler (Ottawa 2006).

[79] See Bec, *Joute poétique* (n. 4 above) 31.

[80] CXVI.

[81] Adam sings: "Sire, qui prent as fais des souffissans / essample et cuer n'en doit ester blamés. / Aris-

---

totes fu de moi plus vaillans / en renommee, en scienche, en bontés ... dont doi je bien faire tel hardement, / qui mains vail, et s'arai alegement."

[82] Some have assumed that in medieval Arras, the *puy* was an aristocratic poetic society in competition with the confraternity, yet unlike the confraternity, no documentation of such a society survives. The term *puy* means podium; it is far more likely that references to the *puy* refer to the poetic contests themselves. See Symes, *A Common Stage* (n. 2 above) 216–227.

[83] Ibid. 138. The foundation myths of the Douai and Amiens organizations include similar elements to that of the confraternity of Arras, suggesting direct influence. See Butterfield, *Poetry and Music* (n. 21 above) 125–138; and eadem, "Puy," *Medieval France: An Encyclopedia*, ed. William W. Kibler and Grover A. Zinn (New York 1995) 771. The large collection of *jeux-partis* that appears in the early 14th-c. Lorraine Bodleian *chansonnier* may preserve a collection of pieces for a *puy*. See Atchison, *The Chansonnier of Oxford* (n. 40 above).

[84] See Anne F. Sutton, "Merchants, Music, and Social Harmony: the London Puy and its French and London Contexts *circa* 1300," *London Journal* 17 (1992) 1–17; and Helen Cooper, "London and Southwark Poetic Companies: 'Si tost c'amis' and the *Canterbury Tales*," *Chaucer and the City*, ed. Ardis Butterfield (Cambridge 2006) 109–128.

emergence of thirteenth-century vernacular literature.[85] In particular, poets of this era crafted a synthesis of authorial perspectives once associated exclusively with either song, composed by trouvères, or narrative romances, written by clerics; this hybrid authorial stance was intimately tied to the rise of French as a literary language.[86] In the twelfth and early thirteenth centuries, the "I" of trouvère song had involved a confluence of three factors: the first person perspective, a personal experience of love, and the oral performance of a song that articulated this experience in the present tense.[87] Romances, in contrast, were narrated by a clerical author figure who drew his material from written sources that he translated into the vernacular for his audience. These two roles were first fused in Guillaume de Lorris's *Roman de la Rose*, where a narrator recounted his personal love experience in the past tense, a transformation that united the voice of the trouvère with that of the clerical narrator.[88] This dual authorial voice that encompassed both the songwriter and the cleric; subsequent clerical authors of romance adopted techniques associated with scholastic commentary such as the citation of authorities and gloss to elevate vernacular poetic works, mingling academic and poetic discourses.[89] The phenomenon has been explored in narrative poetry and lyric interpolated romance, genres within which lyric elements were incorporated into narrative genres. Most studies focus on this confluence of vernacular and clerical expression contexts in which a strong clerical author figure governs the work, such as Richard de Fournival, Jean de Meun, Gautier de Coinci, and, later, Guillaume de Machaut.[90]

Literary accounts tend to pose this development as a migration from song into romance in which lyric elements are appropriated by clerical authors in narrative genres.[91] We have now seen a similar fusion of learned and vernacular modes within a song genre, the *jeu-parti*; the example explored in this article dates from the second quarter of the thirteenth century, predating many of the romances that have been the focus of earlier scholarship on this topic. We have seen that within the learned context of the city of Arras, the *jeu-parti* was dominated by clerics and reflects the strong presence of clerical composers in the city. The clerical *jeux-partis* of Arras encourage us to consider the question of vernacular authority in musical genres. This question

---

[85] See Alain Corbellari, *La Voix des clercs: Littérature et savoir universitaire autour des dits du XIIIe siècle* (Geneva 2005) 13–17. Corbellari (15) asserts that clerics were as important to the emergence of vernacular expression as trouvères and jongleurs.

[86] See Kevin Brownlee, "'Generic Hybrids.' 1225? Guillaume de Lorris Writes the Prologue to the First Part of *Le Roman de la rose*," *A New History of French Literature*, ed. Denis Hollier (Cambridge and London 1989) 88–93.

[87] See Karl Uitti, "The Clerkly Narrator Figure in Old French Hagiography and Romance," *Medioevo Romanzo* 2 (1975) 394–408.

[88] Paul Strohm, "Guillaume as Narrator and Lover in the *Roman de la Rose*," *Romanic Review* 59 (1968) 3–9; Evelyn Birge Vitz, "The *I* of the *Roman de la Rose*," *Genre* 6 (1973) 49–75; and Daniel Poirion, *Le "Roman de la Rose"* (Paris 1973).

[89] See Minnis, *Magister Amoris* (n. 11 above) v–vii and 63–80; and idem, *Medieval Theory of Authorship: Scholastic Literary Attitudes in the Later Middle Ages* (Philadelphia 1988) 160–210.

[90] See Huot, *Song to Book* (n. 11 above) 135–173; Minnis, *Magister Amoris* (n. 11 above); and Kathryn A. Duys, "Minstrel's Mantle and Monk's Hood: The Authorial Persona of Gautier de Coinci in his Poetry and Illuminations," *Gautier de Coinci: Miracles, Music, and Manuscripts*, ed. Kathy M. Krause and Alison Stones (Turnhout 2006) 37–63.

[91] See n. 11 above.

---

has received less attention in musicological circles, but seems apt given that the cleric-trouvère stance was later employed extensively and self-consciously by two of the first and most celebrated composers of vernacular polyphony: Adam de la Halle and Guillaume de Machaut.[92] Adam's identity as a scholar is central to his presentation in the manuscript of his complete works, and to his play, the *Jeu de la feuillée*, where he appears as the cleric-trouvère protagonist.[93] The context explored here suggests that Adam's educated status was not unique or even unusual among the trouvères of Arras, a factor that invites further scrutiny of his authorial persona. It is often noted that Machaut employed his clerical skills to ensure the proper preservation of his authorial legacy, overseeing the compilation of two manuscripts containing his complete works.[94] Musicologists have also highlighted Machaut's clerical sensibilities in his music through allegorical readings of his motets.[95] The broader presence of the cleric-trouvère figure in thirteenth-century music may signal previously unexplored models for the authorial persona Guillaume de Machaut adopted throughout his career.[96] Further study of the relationship between clerical identity and vernacular authorship in the music of the thirteenth and fourteenth centuries would provide an opportunity to understand these two composers as members of broader musical communities that simultaneously embraced learning and vernacular expression.

---

[92] Musicological studies that consider issues of vernacular authority include Emma Dillon, *Medieval Music-Making and the Roman de Fauvel* (Cambridge 2002); Andrew Wathey, "Auctoritas and the Motets of Philippe de Vitry," *Citation and Authority in Medieval and Renaissance Culture: Learning from the Learned*, ed. Suzannah Clark and Elizabeth Eva Leach (Woodbridge 2005) 67–93; and Margaret Switten, "Borrowing, Citation, and Authorship in Gautier de Coinci's *Miracles de Nostre Dame*," *The Medieval Author in Medieval French Literature*, ed. Virginie Greene (New York 2006) 29–60. For a recent account of the history of medieval song in the vernacular, see John Haines, *Medieval Song in Romance Languages* (Cambridge 2010).

[93] See Huot, *Song to Book* (n. 11 above) 66–72; and Joseph A. Dane, *Res/verba: A Study in Medieval French Drama* (Leiden 1985).

[94] See Huot, *Song to Book* (n. 11 above) 242.

[95] Anne Walters Robertson, *Guillaume de Machaut and Reims: Context and Meaning in his Musical Works* (Cambridge 2002).

[96] For recent accounts that explore Machaut's relationship to 13th-c. musical traditions, see Jacques Boogaart, "Encompassing the Past and Present: Quotations and their Functions in Machaut's Motets," *Early Music History* 20 (2000) 1–86; and Butterfield, *Poetry and Music* (n. 21 above) 273–290.